

WEBVTT

NOTE duration:"01:27:19"

NOTE recognizability:0.851

NOTE language:en-us

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:03.126 I think we should get started.

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:03.130 --> 00:00:06.189 Welcome everyone to the to our final

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:06.189 --> 00:00:09.820 seminar of the Year of the academic year.

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:09.820 --> 00:00:12.676 I should say in the Yale School of

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:12.676 --> 00:00:14.999 Medicine program for biomedical ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:15.000 --> 00:00:17.439 my name is Sarah Hull and I'm one of

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:17.439 --> 00:00:20.159 the associate directors of the program,

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:20.160 --> 00:00:23.317 along with Jack Hughes and on behalf

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:23.317 --> 00:00:27.419 of us and our director Mark Mercurio,

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:27.420 --> 00:00:29.106 who couldn't be with us tonight,

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:29.110 --> 00:00:31.540 I'd like to welcome you all

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:31.540 --> 00:00:32.696 before we get started.

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:32.696 --> 00:00:35.064 I'm I'm sorry that if there's a lot

NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:35.064 --> 00:00:36.774 of ambient noise in the background,
NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:36.780 --> 00:00:39.129 my washing machine is on the spin cycle now,
NOTE Confidence: 0.923384506666667

00:00:39.130 --> 00:00:40.320 very unfortunate.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:42.650 --> 00:00:44.826 I wanted to go over some ground rules
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:44.826 --> 00:00:46.651 before just basic sort of orders
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:46.651 --> 00:00:48.481 of business before we get started.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:48.490 --> 00:00:50.806 I, I think most people are
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:50.806 --> 00:00:52.350 familiar with our format,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:52.350 --> 00:00:54.744 but we usually start with about 45
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:54.744 --> 00:00:57.408 to 50 minutes of discussion tonight.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:57.410 --> 00:00:58.320 We actually have a panel,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:00:58.320 --> 00:01:00.045 so we have two discussions
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:00.045 --> 00:01:01.425 discussions which is wonderful.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:01.430 --> 00:01:03.494 And then we follow with a
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:03.494 --> 00:01:05.270 Q&A session at the end.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:05.270 --> 00:01:07.124 You're welcome to enter any of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:07.124 --> 00:01:08.850 your questions through the Q&A box,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:08.850 --> 00:01:11.405 as the discussants are

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:11.405 --> 00:01:12.938 presenting their material.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:12.940 --> 00:01:14.290 And then we'll go over them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:14.290 --> 00:01:15.583 At the end,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:15.583 --> 00:01:18.818 we're going to start with Doctor Ronit stall,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:18.818 --> 00:01:22.114 who is going to discuss some of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:22.114 --> 00:01:24.499 arguments against the exercise of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:24.499 --> 00:01:26.650 conscientious objection in medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:26.650 --> 00:01:27.640 And then we,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:27.640 --> 00:01:29.950 we will hear from Doctor Mark Siegel,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:29.950 --> 00:01:31.672 who will present some of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:31.672 --> 00:01:33.821 arguments in favor of the exercise

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:33.821 --> 00:01:35.697 of conscientious objection medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:35.700 --> 00:01:37.667 And then we will again open it

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:37.667 --> 00:01:38.510 up for discussion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:38.510 --> 00:01:42.290 and I will moderate that that Q&A session so.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:42.290 --> 00:01:43.550 Without further ado,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:43.550 --> 00:01:46.427 I think we should get started and

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:46.427 --> 00:01:48.628 and I I just to make sure that we're

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:48.628 --> 00:01:50.748 we're clear and on what what we

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:50.748 --> 00:01:52.012 mean by conscientious objection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:52.020 --> 00:01:54.600 In medicine we I've used the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:54.600 --> 00:01:55.890 definition that conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:55.890 --> 00:01:58.308 objection in medicine is the refusal

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:01:58.308 --> 00:02:00.233 to provide requested treatment due

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:00.303 --> 00:02:02.228 to moral convictions that conflict

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:02.228 --> 00:02:04.608 with the action or actions that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:04.608 --> 00:02:06.400 such treatment might entail.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:06.400 --> 00:02:07.652 But you know, I,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:07.652 --> 00:02:09.217 I would encourage our discussants
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:09.217 --> 00:02:10.660 to expound upon that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:10.660 --> 00:02:11.398 And, again, I.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:11.398 --> 00:02:13.840 I hope that we have a rich discussion.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:13.840 --> 00:02:17.200 And our goal is to really explore this.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:17.200 --> 00:02:20.480 This often very complex issue in the practice
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:20.480 --> 00:02:23.164 of medicine in in a in a nuanced way.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:23.170 --> 00:02:27.706 So without further ado Doctor Ronit Stahl,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:27.710 --> 00:02:29.376 pH D is an associate professor of
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:29.376 --> 00:02:31.389 history at the University of California,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:31.390 --> 00:02:31.833 Berkeley,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:31.833 --> 00:02:34.048 and currently a Greenwall Foundation,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:34.050 --> 00:02:35.590 faculty, scholar, and bioethics.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:35.590 --> 00:02:36.745 Her current book,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:36.750 --> 00:02:37.123 project,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:02:37.123 --> 00:02:37.869 troubling conscience,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:37.869 --> 00:02:39.361 religious Freedom and Healthcare
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:39.361 --> 00:02:40.870 in the United States,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:40.870 --> 00:02:42.850 examines the rise and consequences
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:42.850 --> 00:02:44.038 of institutional conscience.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:44.040 --> 00:02:46.010 Rights through a history of
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:46.010 --> 00:02:47.586 religious hospitals and government
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:47.586 --> 00:02:49.176 funding as a postdoctoral fellow
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:49.176 --> 00:02:50.671 in advance biomedical ethics at
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:50.671 --> 00:02:52.397 the Perelman School of Medicine
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:52.397 --> 00:02:54.112 at the University of Pennsylvania,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:54.120 --> 00:02:56.140 she published articles on conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:56.140 --> 00:02:57.756 objection and conscientious provision
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:57.756 --> 00:02:59.918 of care and medicine in the New
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:02:59.918 --> 00:03:01.560 England Journal of Medicine and JAMA.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055
00:03:01.560 --> 00:03:02.960 Her award winning first book,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:02.960 --> 00:03:04.885 enlisting Faith how the military
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:04.885 --> 00:03:06.810 chaplaincy shaped religion and state
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:06.868 --> 00:03:08.974 and modern America was published by
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:08.974 --> 00:03:10.720 Harvard University Press in 2017.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:10.720 --> 00:03:12.840 She earned her pH D in history from
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:12.840 --> 00:03:14.488 the University of Michigan in 2014.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:14.490 --> 00:03:16.772 And I in social sciences and education
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:16.772 --> 00:03:19.570 from Stanford in 2005 and a BA in
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:19.570 --> 00:03:21.334 English from Williams in 2002.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8827076055

00:03:21.334 --> 00:03:23.880 Doctor stall. Take it away.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:23.880 --> 00:03:25.280 Alright, thank you very much.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:25.280 --> 00:03:27.877 Thanks to everyone who's joined us today.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:27.880 --> 00:03:30.148 Thank you for the invitation and
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:30.148 --> 00:03:32.780 thanks to everyone in the background.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:32.780 --> 00:03:36.644 You of course makes zoom events possible,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:36.650 --> 00:03:40.280 so I I want to start today by talking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:40.365 --> 00:03:44.268 the ways in which ethics exist in context.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:44.268 --> 00:03:46.987 We live in 2022 United States,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:46.987 --> 00:03:49.660 or at least that's where I am right now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:49.660 --> 00:03:51.795 And as many of you likely know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:51.800 --> 00:03:53.195 we're also there for living

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:53.195 --> 00:03:55.210 in a in a rapidly changing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:55.210 --> 00:03:57.808 Legal and political landscape in terms

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:03:57.808 --> 00:04:00.060 of healthcare and healthcare ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:00.060 --> 00:04:02.376 and you know there's been recent

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:02.376 --> 00:04:05.370 news about the leak of a Supreme

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:05.370 --> 00:04:07.194 Court decision about abortion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:07.200 --> 00:04:10.392 There are new laws in states

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:10.392 --> 00:04:12.520 about gender affirming care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:12.520 --> 00:04:15.855 There are all sorts of arenas

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:15.855 --> 00:04:17.730 in which healthcare has become

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:17.730 --> 00:04:19.920 political and not just political,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:19.920 --> 00:04:23.040 but partisan, and in this realm,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:23.040 --> 00:04:24.736 1 dimension has been.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:24.736 --> 00:04:28.014 Over the past, about 50 years.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:28.014 --> 00:04:31.354 This question of conscientious objection
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:31.354 --> 00:04:34.407 in healthcare and as was noted,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:34.410 --> 00:04:37.329 I'm here to make an argument against
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:37.329 --> 00:04:39.898 what's often been called conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:39.898 --> 00:04:43.606 objection or religious refusal in medicine,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:43.610 --> 00:04:46.058 and I want to be clear at the outset
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:46.058 --> 00:04:48.173 that sometimes people construe this
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:48.173 --> 00:04:50.837 as an argument that's anti religious
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:50.910 --> 00:04:52.662 or anti morals or anti ethical
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:52.662 --> 00:04:54.838 and I want to be clear that the
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:54.838 --> 00:04:56.350 argument I'm making is an argument.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:56.350 --> 00:04:58.026 About pluralism and power,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:04:58.026 --> 00:05:00.540 an argument that's that's rooted in

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:00.610 --> 00:05:03.781 a deep respect and study of religious

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:03.781 --> 00:05:05.140 institutions and communities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:05.140 --> 00:05:07.798 and also a commitment to studying,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:07.800 --> 00:05:08.680 thinking about,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:08.680 --> 00:05:11.320 and in the context like these,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:11.320 --> 00:05:13.660 perhaps arguing over how they

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:13.660 --> 00:05:16.000 function in public serving spaces.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:16.000 --> 00:05:19.360 And this work emerges from my own

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:19.360 --> 00:05:21.833 research and scholarship as both

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:21.833 --> 00:05:24.198 the historian and a bioethicist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:24.200 --> 00:05:26.405 And so when we talk about conscience.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:26.410 --> 00:05:27.204 In healthcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:27.204 --> 00:05:29.983 we're often talking about values in conflict,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:29.990 --> 00:05:31.610 and so sometimes, as I noted,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:31.610 --> 00:05:34.762 this can be an argument that pits kind
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:34.762 --> 00:05:37.278 of religious freedom or conscience
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:37.278 --> 00:05:40.572 against patient centered care or autonomy.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:40.580 --> 00:05:42.746 And what's tricky about this is
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:42.746 --> 00:05:44.840 that there's no singular religion.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:44.840 --> 00:05:46.872 There's no singular conscience,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:46.872 --> 00:05:50.312 and there's no singular notion of what
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:50.312 --> 00:05:53.434 even patient centered care might look like.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:53.440 --> 00:05:55.988 And so sometimes there are religious and
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:55.988 --> 00:05:58.599 moral views which are in conflict with
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:05:58.599 --> 00:06:01.160 what might be deemed patient centered care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:01.160 --> 00:06:04.358 or in some cases bodily autonomy.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:04.360 --> 00:06:06.118 But that's not always the case,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:06.120 --> 00:06:07.380 and I think that's part of
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:07.380 --> 00:06:08.220 what makes this difficult.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:08.220 --> 00:06:11.020 There's no single notion of what is religion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:11.020 --> 00:06:13.620 For what is conscience and I also therefore

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:13.620 --> 00:06:16.276 want to emphasize that you know, many,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:16.276 --> 00:06:19.118 though not all people hold religious beliefs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:19.120 --> 00:06:21.630 but regardless of religious affiliation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:21.630 --> 00:06:23.778 commitments or belonging in

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:23.778 --> 00:06:25.389 particular religious communities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:25.390 --> 00:06:26.581 everyone has values,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:26.581 --> 00:06:28.169 and everyone wrestles with

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:28.169 --> 00:06:30.249 ethics based on their values.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:30.250 --> 00:06:32.448 And it's that these values can change,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:32.450 --> 00:06:34.778 and some of them come from

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:34.778 --> 00:06:35.942 spaces of religion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:35.950 --> 00:06:38.942 some of them come out of deep notions

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:38.942 --> 00:06:41.448 of morals and ethics which may.

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:41.450 --> 00:06:43.410 Again, be connected to religion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:43.410 --> 00:06:45.534 but aren't necessarily so.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:45.534 --> 00:06:48.864 And of course, within healthcare itself.
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:48.864 --> 00:06:50.598 People bring values,
NOTE Confidence: 0.97418861

00:06:50.600 --> 00:06:52.820 providers bring their own values.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:06:52.820 --> 00:06:54.480 Patients bring their own values,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:06:54.480 --> 00:06:55.851 institutions express values,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:06:55.851 --> 00:07:00.517 so part of the reason I think this is a
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:00.517 --> 00:07:03.241 really complicated domain is that when
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:03.241 --> 00:07:05.887 we're talking about what is, again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:05.887 --> 00:07:07.515 sometimes called conscientious objection
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:07.515 --> 00:07:10.620 and at other times called religious refusal.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:10.620 --> 00:07:12.330 And these. Can be you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:12.330 --> 00:07:15.186 overlapping sets of terms so they also
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:15.186 --> 00:07:17.690 can sometimes have different legal,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:17.690 --> 00:07:21.050 political, or ethical nuances to them,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:21.050 --> 00:07:23.730 but I think some of the challenges we're

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:23.730 --> 00:07:26.293 talking about this is that we can talk

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:26.293 --> 00:07:28.111 about these questions of conscience

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:28.111 --> 00:07:30.247 and relationship to individuals.

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:30.250 --> 00:07:33.176 We can talk about it about in

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:33.176 --> 00:07:34.430 regard to institutions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:34.430 --> 00:07:36.686 and we can think about individuals

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:36.686 --> 00:07:38.190 within institutions and that

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:38.256 --> 00:07:39.866 can be sets of individuals,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:39.870 --> 00:07:41.289 healthcare providers which

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:41.289 --> 00:07:42.708 could be physicians.

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:42.710 --> 00:07:44.636 Nurses physicians assistants,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:44.636 --> 00:07:46.724 but also, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:46.724 --> 00:07:47.528 surgical techs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:47.528 --> 00:07:50.652 All sorts of people in who work

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:50.652 --> 00:07:52.320 within healthcare institutions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:52.320 --> 00:07:53.490 hospitals and clinics,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:53.490 --> 00:07:55.830 and so this question of individuals
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:55.830 --> 00:07:57.522 and institutions they're related
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:07:57.522 --> 00:07:59.994 but different and and sort of.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:00.000 --> 00:08:01.016 As a side note,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:01.016 --> 00:08:02.540 I'm going to be focusing mostly
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:02.595 --> 00:08:03.999 on individuals here today,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:04.000 --> 00:08:05.967 though my book actually looks the book
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:05.967 --> 00:08:07.690 project that I'm currently researching
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:07.690 --> 00:08:09.740 is really focused on institutions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:09.740 --> 00:08:11.852 and the questions that arise around
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:11.852 --> 00:08:13.870 different kinds of religious hospitals.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:13.870 --> 00:08:17.125 And what they therefore express as their
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:17.125 --> 00:08:20.129 values and impose on their employees,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:20.130 --> 00:08:22.162 which does ultimately then
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:22.162 --> 00:08:24.490 affect what patients can access,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:24.490 --> 00:08:26.310 similarly to thinking about
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:26.310 --> 00:08:28.150 individuals and institutions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:28.150 --> 00:08:30.694 we can talk about both beliefs and behaviors.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:30.700 --> 00:08:33.804 And here, too, they're not the same thing.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:33.810 --> 00:08:36.295 People with the same core
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:36.295 --> 00:08:37.786 belief have different,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:37.790 --> 00:08:39.910 often have different behavioral outcomes.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:39.910 --> 00:08:42.134 They can choose to act in different ways,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:42.140 --> 00:08:43.925 and so this question of what's the?
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:43.930 --> 00:08:46.530 Action associated with conscience is,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:46.530 --> 00:08:47.880 I think, central.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:47.880 --> 00:08:48.780 And finally,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:48.780 --> 00:08:50.856 we can also talk about systems
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:50.856 --> 00:08:53.106 and structures or what we might
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092
00:08:53.106 --> 00:08:55.494 call the context and concepts and
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:55.494 --> 00:08:57.595 contingencies that give certain people
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:57.595 --> 00:08:59.650 and certain perspectives more or
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:08:59.650 --> 00:09:01.536 less power within specific spaces.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:01.536 --> 00:09:04.000 Maybe it's in the space of a
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:04.077 --> 00:09:05.888 hospital or a medical school.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:05.888 --> 00:09:07.473 Maybe it's in a clinic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:07.480 --> 00:09:08.647 Maybe it's elsewhere.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:08.647 --> 00:09:11.370 Maybe it's in a courtroom or in
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:11.451 --> 00:09:12.479 a legislature.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:12.480 --> 00:09:14.433 And So what I'm going to now spend the
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:14.433 --> 00:09:16.275 rest of my time talking about again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:16.280 --> 00:09:18.254 I'm going to focus primarily on individuals,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:18.260 --> 00:09:19.550 so I'm happy to address.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:19.550 --> 00:09:21.164 Questions of institutions.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:21.164 --> 00:09:24.800 In the Q&A and as we're seeing in
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:24.800 --> 00:09:26.280 our current moment institutions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:26.280 --> 00:09:27.804 especially hospitals themselves matter,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:27.804 --> 00:09:30.473 I'm also going to focus on behaviors

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:30.473 --> 00:09:32.699 and this really gets it like what.

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:32.700 --> 00:09:34.860 How are we defining conscience?

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:34.860 --> 00:09:37.396 I want to be clear that everyone has

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:37.396 --> 00:09:40.226 their beliefs and I'm when I'm making

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:40.226 --> 00:09:41.926 an argument against conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:41.926 --> 00:09:43.820 objection and religious refusal.

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:43.820 --> 00:09:45.830 It's about the behaviors that

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:45.830 --> 00:09:47.438 stem from that belief,

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:47.440 --> 00:09:49.025 not an argument that someone

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:49.025 --> 00:09:50.293 can't have a belief.

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:50.300 --> 00:09:51.728 It's about what you can or

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:51.728 --> 00:09:52.680 can't do with that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:52.680 --> 00:09:53.069 Belief.

NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:53.069 --> 00:09:53.847 And finally,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:53.847 --> 00:09:56.570 I want to recognize that of course
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:56.649 --> 00:09:58.821 we're talking about conscience
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:09:58.821 --> 00:10:01.536 objection and religious refusal within
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:10:01.540 --> 00:10:04.276 a particular within the United States.
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:10:04.280 --> 00:10:05.168 First of all,
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:10:05.168 --> 00:10:07.240 within the US health care system within
NOTE Confidence: 0.850183092

00:10:07.303 --> 00:10:09.427 US legal structures that have emerged,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:09.430 --> 00:10:12.940 especially over the past 50 years.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:12.940 --> 00:10:15.780 And so because my focus is on the
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:15.780 --> 00:10:17.979 behaviors that arise from beliefs,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:17.980 --> 00:10:21.180 the actions people might take or not take.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:21.180 --> 00:10:24.155 It's also an argument about the structures.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:24.160 --> 00:10:27.094 And systems that enable or privilege
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:27.094 --> 00:10:29.050 certain behaviors over others.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:29.050 --> 00:10:31.165 These are structures and systems

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:31.165 --> 00:10:34.310 with a history and as a historian,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:34.310 --> 00:10:36.446 I'm particularly attentive to

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:36.446 --> 00:10:39.650 how some of these systems are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:39.650 --> 00:10:41.962 We're created and constructed,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:41.962 --> 00:10:46.160 developed, and evolved over over time.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:46.160 --> 00:10:48.518 So when we talked about this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:48.520 --> 00:10:50.116 it's therefore not that it has

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:50.116 --> 00:10:52.170 to be in one particular way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:52.170 --> 00:10:54.024 and I and I hope this is what we'll

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:54.024 --> 00:10:56.179 get to in terms of a discussion is that

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:56.179 --> 00:10:58.139 there are always other possibilities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:10:58.140 --> 00:11:00.318 and I've done some work outside

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:00.318 --> 00:11:01.770 of the US context,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:01.770 --> 00:11:04.594 which also informs my idea that you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:04.600 --> 00:11:06.749 just because we have one system here

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:06.749 --> 00:11:08.977 doesn't mean it has to be the system.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:08.980 --> 00:11:10.400 So when we're talking about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:10.400 --> 00:11:12.535 Health care conscience in the United States?
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:12.540 --> 00:11:16.242 We're often talking about legislation and
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:16.242 --> 00:11:18.710 specifically healthcare conscience clauses,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:18.710 --> 00:11:22.007 which are statutes that have been written
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:22.007 --> 00:11:24.390 that insulate professional in this case,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:24.390 --> 00:11:27.218 healthcare providers from any
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:27.218 --> 00:11:30.046 consequences of performing tasks
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:30.050 --> 00:11:32.370 that they deem personally,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:32.370 --> 00:11:34.690 they personally deem objectionable.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:34.690 --> 00:11:37.224 Which is to say it immunizes them.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:37.230 --> 00:11:40.289 It protects them from facing any harm,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:40.290 --> 00:11:42.350 for refusing to provide.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:42.350 --> 00:11:46.023 Care this has most often been in
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:46.023 --> 00:11:48.938 reproductive healthcare and LGBT healthcare.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:48.940 --> 00:11:50.800 In end of life healthcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:50.800 --> 00:11:54.355 but it can be in other arenas as well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:54.360 --> 00:11:56.496 so I think it's important also

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:56.496 --> 00:11:58.380 to note that you know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:11:58.380 --> 00:12:00.220 Sometimes people will talk about

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:00.220 --> 00:12:02.644 this and again say it's you know

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:02.644 --> 00:12:04.396 it's about it's anti religious or

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:04.396 --> 00:12:06.359 it's about particular perspectives,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:06.360 --> 00:12:07.796 but it's it's really.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:07.796 --> 00:12:09.591 It's about particular domains of

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:09.591 --> 00:12:11.619 healthcare where these arise most often.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:11.620 --> 00:12:14.826 And there are lots of different kinds

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:14.826 --> 00:12:17.155 of healthcare providers and over

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:17.155 --> 00:12:19.335 time these conscience causes have

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:19.335 --> 00:12:22.140 moved from just physicians and nurses

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:22.140 --> 00:12:24.505 directly involved in particular care
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:24.505 --> 00:12:28.044 to a larger array of pharmacists,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:28.044 --> 00:12:28.690 therapists.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:28.690 --> 00:12:32.530 Tax on even janitorial or secretarial
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:32.530 --> 00:12:34.450 Staffs within hospitals,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:34.450 --> 00:12:36.342 but not just hospitals.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:36.342 --> 00:12:38.562 Also insurance companies and other.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:38.562 --> 00:12:42.529 You know the sort of vast kind of octopus,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:42.530 --> 00:12:45.834 the tentacles of healthcare in the United
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:45.834 --> 00:12:49.189 States and and yet within healthcare.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:49.190 --> 00:12:51.787 I think one thing that's really important
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:51.787 --> 00:12:54.055 and important for my thinking about
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:54.055 --> 00:12:56.603 conscience is that this is a profession.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:56.610 --> 00:12:59.470 These are different professional roles.
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:12:59.470 --> 00:13:00.700 Just to take for example,
NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:00.700 --> 00:13:01.552 physicians and nurses.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:01.552 --> 00:13:03.468 These are, you know, and pharmacists.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:03.468 --> 00:13:04.816 These are distinct professions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:04.820 --> 00:13:06.430 but they are all professions

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:06.430 --> 00:13:08.514 and they all come, therefore,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:08.514 --> 00:13:10.896 with professional standards.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:10.896 --> 00:13:13.278 With professional expectations,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:13.280 --> 00:13:16.472 people have to get degrees credentialed

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:16.472 --> 00:13:20.074 accredited to work in these positions and

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:20.074 --> 00:13:23.732 all of them share at least one thing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:23.732 --> 00:13:26.842 which is a notion of a professional.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:26.842 --> 00:13:28.947 The morals of the profession.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:28.950 --> 00:13:30.490 A professional role morality

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:30.490 --> 00:13:32.800 is a sociological term in which

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:32.871 --> 00:13:35.373 patients well being is the primary

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:35.373 --> 00:13:37.041 interest of these professions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:37.050 --> 00:13:41.298 It's it's enhancing patients well being.

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:41.300 --> 00:13:43.756 Despite this common role,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:43.756 --> 00:13:47.280 there's of course debate and discussion

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:47.280 --> 00:13:50.208 over what is a patient's well being,

NOTE Confidence: 0.960992615

00:13:50.208 --> 00:13:52.080 and that's where a lot of

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:13:52.148 --> 00:13:54.378 the issues around conscience arise.

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:13:54.380 --> 00:13:56.543 And in some context, it's who counts

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:13:56.543 --> 00:13:58.920 as the patients and others, it's about

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:13:58.920 --> 00:14:01.475 what counts as a patient's well being.

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:01.480 --> 00:14:03.160 I want to argue, though, that that

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:03.160 --> 00:14:05.290 patients themselves play a role here,

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:05.290 --> 00:14:08.218 and one of the challenges of working this

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:08.218 --> 00:14:11.779 out is that patients understand themselves.

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:11.780 --> 00:14:13.308 Professionals have certain expertise

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:13.308 --> 00:14:15.600 that patients are trying to access,

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:15.600 --> 00:14:18.120 but patients most often they know it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:18.120 --> 00:14:20.364 They know what they want, and especially
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:20.364 --> 00:14:23.256 in these contested arenas of care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:23.260 --> 00:14:25.666 and so these healthcare conscience clauses,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:25.670 --> 00:14:28.030 which again are legislative,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:28.030 --> 00:14:32.499 have been used to create structures that let,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:32.500 --> 00:14:35.372 for the most part it's objectors, to care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:35.372 --> 00:14:38.480 or people who want to refuse to provide care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:38.480 --> 00:14:40.169 Professional medical associations
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:40.169 --> 00:14:41.858 have their own.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:41.860 --> 00:14:43.942 Codes of ethics or the American
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:43.942 --> 00:14:45.758 Medical Association has a code
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:45.758 --> 00:14:47.218 of ethics for physicians.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:47.220 --> 00:14:49.726 There are codes of ethics for specific,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:49.730 --> 00:14:53.015 and there are stances of
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:14:53.015 --> 00:14:55.643 specific subspecialties like the.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:55.650 --> 00:14:57.876 OB GYN or the American Thoracic
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:14:57.876 --> 00:15:00.488 Society nurses have a code of ethics.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:00.490 --> 00:15:02.632 Pharmacists have a code of ethics and
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:02.632 --> 00:15:05.399 all of them have also wrestled with
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:05.399 --> 00:15:07.624 conscientious objection as a legal
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:07.624 --> 00:15:10.276 structure that exists and then kind
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:10.276 --> 00:15:12.987 of tentatively tried to work out what
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:12.987 --> 00:15:15.809 does it mean to provide ethical care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:15.810 --> 00:15:18.066 While people can object and I'm not going
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:18.066 --> 00:15:20.636 to get into all the technicalities here,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:20.640 --> 00:15:22.398 but I think one thing that's
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:22.398 --> 00:15:24.285 interesting is most of these codes
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:24.285 --> 00:15:26.229 of ethics have evolved over time.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:26.230 --> 00:15:28.726 And I think one thing you can track
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:28.726 --> 00:15:30.933 is this wrestling with what does
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:15:30.933 --> 00:15:33.627 it mean to object or refuse care

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:33.627 --> 00:15:36.112 when again in general the duty is
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:36.112 --> 00:15:38.342 to provide care and so again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:38.342 --> 00:15:41.067 my critique of the way conscience is
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:41.067 --> 00:15:43.762 deployed and in fact employed in medicine
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:43.762 --> 00:15:46.567 is about these policies and actions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:46.570 --> 00:15:49.363 not about people's beliefs and my concern
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:49.363 --> 00:15:52.451 with the way conscience is used to deny
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:52.451 --> 00:15:55.231 or refuse care is that it highlights
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:55.231 --> 00:15:58.339 the ways in which there's an incredibly.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:15:58.340 --> 00:16:00.585 Problematic negotiation of power and
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:16:00.585 --> 00:16:03.335 that negotiation of power is both
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:16:03.335 --> 00:16:05.927 within a pluralistic society in which
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:16:05.927 --> 00:16:08.288 peoples beliefs and values differ
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:16:08.288 --> 00:16:11.180 but also within a healthcare system
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:16:11.264 --> 00:16:13.966 that at least ostensibly in 2022,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:13.966 --> 00:16:17.724 claims to be patient, centered and
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:17.724 --> 00:16:21.459 invested in certain ethical ideas,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:21.460 --> 00:16:25.220 especially around patient autonomy,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:25.220 --> 00:16:26.582 beneficence, nonmaleficence,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:26.582 --> 00:16:28.270 and most of all.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:28.270 --> 00:16:30.552 And I think this is really important
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:30.552 --> 00:16:32.851 justice and so the problem of the
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:32.851 --> 00:16:34.729 way conscience has arisen as a
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:34.799 --> 00:16:36.911 system in Healthcare is that this
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:36.911 --> 00:16:38.845 power is lopsided and asymmetrical.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:38.845 --> 00:16:42.520 The law in this sense allows the
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:42.520 --> 00:16:45.584 imposition of personal beliefs on patients
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:45.584 --> 00:16:49.700 in the form of refusing to provide care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:49.700 --> 00:16:52.612 And yet, and this is an argument
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:52.612 --> 00:16:55.116 I've made in in writing,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667

00:16:55.116 --> 00:16:57.000 health care professionals

NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:16:57.000 --> 00:16:59.092 voluntarily chose their profession.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:16:59.092 --> 00:17:01.184 They had choices about
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:01.184 --> 00:17:03.539 what they wanted to enter,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:03.540 --> 00:17:05.510 and so to deny something
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:05.510 --> 00:17:07.086 to deny patients care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:07.090 --> 00:17:09.162 That is part of a standard part
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:09.162 --> 00:17:11.728 of the profession is, in my view,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:11.728 --> 00:17:14.832 a problem, and indeed, to me,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:14.832 --> 00:17:15.370 unethical,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:15.370 --> 00:17:18.170 and this has been allowed for in
NOTE Confidence: 0.828082214666667
00:17:18.170 --> 00:17:20.759 many informally for a very long time.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:17:20.760 --> 00:17:22.066 That formally,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:17:22.066 --> 00:17:25.757 starting in 1973 in 1973, is important.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:17:25.757 --> 00:17:28.871 It's not about Roe versus Wade and the
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:17:28.871 --> 00:17:30.999 legalization of abortion nationally,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333

00:17:31.000 --> 00:17:33.136 but actually about the church amendment,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:33.140 --> 00:17:35.460 which is a federal statute
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:35.460 --> 00:17:37.930 that arose in the context,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:37.930 --> 00:17:39.700 certainly of Roe V Wade,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:39.700 --> 00:17:43.550 but actually was prompted by the denial
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:43.550 --> 00:17:46.545 of of a tubal ligation or sterilization
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:46.545 --> 00:17:49.230 to a woman having a C-section,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:49.230 --> 00:17:51.610 and it was denied because.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:51.610 --> 00:17:53.656 She was in Montana and there
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:53.656 --> 00:17:55.590 had been a hospital merger.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:55.590 --> 00:17:57.575 The only hospital left was
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:57.575 --> 00:17:59.560 a Catholic hospital and they
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:17:59.640 --> 00:18:01.810 said they wouldn't provide it.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:18:01.810 --> 00:18:05.086 And when a Montana judge said actually
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:18:05.086 --> 00:18:06.744 you can't discriminate there,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7752372283333333

00:18:06.744 --> 00:18:08.776 they're at least to a lot of lobbying

NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:08.776 --> 00:18:10.787 and ultimately the church amendment,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:10.790 --> 00:18:12.164 which is named not for the
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:12.164 --> 00:18:13.470 church but for Frank Church.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:13.470 --> 00:18:16.026 The then Democratic senator from Idaho,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:16.030 --> 00:18:17.969 and he thought this was a tidy,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:17.970 --> 00:18:18.912 easy solution.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:18.912 --> 00:18:21.738 A solution to what he thought.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:21.740 --> 00:18:23.818 It's also not a huge problem, he said.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:23.818 --> 00:18:25.930 You know, if you allow in the context
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:25.988 --> 00:18:27.708 of abortion and sterilization,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:27.710 --> 00:18:30.160 the ability to deny care
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:30.160 --> 00:18:32.610 institutions can deny this care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:32.610 --> 00:18:35.620 But providers can deny it
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:35.620 --> 00:18:37.546 without any legal consequences.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:37.546 --> 00:18:40.052 That's like it's a way of kind
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333

00:18:40.052 --> 00:18:42.448 of putting this off to the side,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:42.450 --> 00:18:44.431 and if brackets it so that it
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:44.431 --> 00:18:46.190 won't become a larger issue.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:46.190 --> 00:18:47.538 And in that sense,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:47.538 --> 00:18:48.886 he was very wrong.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:48.890 --> 00:18:51.914 But in the course of working out.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:51.920 --> 00:18:55.046 About his conscience clause would look
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:55.046 --> 00:18:57.910 like one of the arguments that arose then,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:18:57.910 --> 00:19:00.250 and is still often made today.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:00.250 --> 00:19:02.110 Is that conscientious objection
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:02.110 --> 00:19:04.900 in Healthcare is a parallel or
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:04.978 --> 00:19:07.078 an analogous to conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:07.078 --> 00:19:09.270 objection in in the military,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:09.270 --> 00:19:10.790 and I've done that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:10.790 --> 00:19:12.603 Actually a lot of work on conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:12.603 --> 00:19:13.850 objection in the military,

NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:13.850 --> 00:19:15.764 and I think there are some
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:15.764 --> 00:19:16.721 really significant differences
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:16.721 --> 00:19:18.269 between conscientious objection.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:18.270 --> 00:19:20.976 Again as a practice in healthcare
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:20.976 --> 00:19:22.329 and conscientious objection.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:22.330 --> 00:19:24.395 As a practice in the military and
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:24.395 --> 00:19:26.698 I'm just going to quickly list these,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:26.700 --> 00:19:29.885 but happy to talk about them more.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:29.890 --> 00:19:31.426 First conscientious objection as
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:31.426 --> 00:19:34.171 deployed in health care is about an
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:34.171 --> 00:19:36.036 objection to a professional standard
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:36.036 --> 00:19:38.120 of care or professional practice.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:38.120 --> 00:19:40.718 It's not to state mandated conscription,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:40.720 --> 00:19:42.820 so it's an objection to something
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:42.820 --> 00:19:44.220 within the profession itself.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333

00:19:44.220 --> 00:19:46.056 Second, it occurs, as I noted,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:46.060 --> 00:19:48.148 within the context of a freely
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:48.148 --> 00:19:48.844 chosen profession,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:48.850 --> 00:19:50.950 and that is different from conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:50.950 --> 00:19:52.350 objection in the military,
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:52.350 --> 00:19:54.842 which was which was a system that
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:54.842 --> 00:19:57.495 emerged in response to conscription or
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:19:57.495 --> 00:20:00.015 forced participation in military service.
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:20:00.020 --> 00:20:02.590 3rd Conscious an objection in
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:20:02.590 --> 00:20:04.646 Healthcare is incredibly selective
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:20:04.646 --> 00:20:07.244 and allows an individual to
NOTE Confidence: 0.775237228333333
00:20:07.244 --> 00:20:09.248 make very discrete decisions.
NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202
00:20:11.340 --> 00:20:13.120 Two professionally accepted practices,
NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202
00:20:13.120 --> 00:20:15.345 whereas in the military context
NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202
00:20:15.345 --> 00:20:17.197 it was an all or nothing.
NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202
00:20:17.200 --> 00:20:19.580 You objected to war or you didn't,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202

00:20:19.580 --> 00:20:20.432 but you in fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202

00:20:20.432 --> 00:20:21.980 and there are legal cases about this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202

00:20:21.980 --> 00:20:23.445 Could not selectively object and

NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202

00:20:23.445 --> 00:20:25.400 that was and I'll get to this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89442202

00:20:25.400 --> 00:20:27.178 but that was for reasons of equity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:29.480 --> 00:20:30.830 In healthcare, conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:30.830 --> 00:20:33.530 objection is a system that emerged

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:33.530 --> 00:20:35.698 that has no external scrutiny.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:35.700 --> 00:20:38.844 You don't have to prove anything about your

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:38.844 --> 00:20:41.560 objections or that you've held them for a

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:41.560 --> 00:20:44.389 long time or that you apply them evenly.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:44.390 --> 00:20:45.860 It's simply you invoke it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:45.860 --> 00:20:47.660 and you're protected and that again

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:47.660 --> 00:20:49.580 is quite different from draft boards.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:49.580 --> 00:20:53.550 Assessing ones objections to war.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:53.550 --> 00:20:56.798 5th it Shields the objector from all
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:20:56.798 --> 00:21:00.266 repercussions and costs there is by law.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:00.266 --> 00:21:03.380 There is no permitted employment consequences
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:03.469 --> 00:21:06.149 for refusing care for providers.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:06.150 --> 00:21:08.586 The costs are all put on the
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:08.586 --> 00:21:10.890 patients who can't access the care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:10.890 --> 00:21:12.338 and so finally six.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:12.338 --> 00:21:13.424 It's one sided.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:13.430 --> 00:21:15.295 It protects those who refuse
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:15.295 --> 00:21:17.160 to treat who deny care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:17.160 --> 00:21:19.180 but not those whose conscience
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:19.180 --> 00:21:21.200 compels them to provide medically
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:21.268 --> 00:21:23.480 accepted but politically contested.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:23.480 --> 00:21:25.496 There, and I'll note, this wasn't.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:25.500 --> 00:21:27.194 It wasn't supposed to be this way.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:27.200 --> 00:21:30.275 The church amendment does actually

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:30.275 --> 00:21:32.828 include protections for conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:32.828 --> 00:21:36.368 providers of sterilizations and abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:36.370 --> 00:21:38.896 but legally that what's a developed

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:38.896 --> 00:21:41.657 has been a lopsided system in

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:41.657 --> 00:21:43.649 which refusers are protected.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:43.650 --> 00:21:45.098 But providers or not,

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:45.098 --> 00:21:47.660 and so I really want to emphasize

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:47.660 --> 00:21:50.414 that in in a in a space of a

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:50.494 --> 00:21:52.909 voluntary professional choice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:52.910 --> 00:21:55.298 People have accepted who enter this

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:55.298 --> 00:21:57.293 field except a professional obligation

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:57.293 --> 00:21:59.973 to place the well being and the patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:21:59.973 --> 00:22:02.648 at the center of professional practice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:02.650 --> 00:22:06.010 and indeed the sort of notion of

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:06.010 --> 00:22:08.075 patient autonomy as well as a patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:08.075 --> 00:22:10.269 Bill of Rights and the notion of
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:10.269 --> 00:22:11.829 patients having rights and contact
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:11.829 --> 00:22:13.732 in healthcare context is emerging at
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:13.732 --> 00:22:16.324 the same time in the early 1970s,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:16.324 --> 00:22:20.013 and so I think it's central that
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:20.013 --> 00:22:22.808 you know that it really.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:22.810 --> 00:22:25.230 Get punched subjection and healthcare
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:25.230 --> 00:22:28.426 really pits a provider against a patient
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:28.426 --> 00:22:31.218 who has much less power in this system.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:31.220 --> 00:22:34.034 Often an argument is made that these
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:34.034 --> 00:22:36.134 politically contested areas of care
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:36.134 --> 00:22:38.522 like reproductive health, LGBT health,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:38.522 --> 00:22:41.377 are kind of lifestyle choices,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:41.380 --> 00:22:43.396 and so it's not about medical care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:43.400 --> 00:22:45.116 It's about peoples lifestyles.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:22:45.116 --> 00:22:47.261 But I think this substitutes

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:22:47.261 --> 00:22:49.143 cultural and political judgments
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:22:49.143 --> 00:22:50.987 for professional medical knowledge
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:22:50.987 --> 00:22:53.510 where there is in fact research.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:22:53.510 --> 00:22:56.387 People do know what people's options are,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:22:56.390 --> 00:22:57.254 and there's been an,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:22:57.254 --> 00:22:57.686 you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:22:57.690 --> 00:23:00.246 a move in particular in a lot of these
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:00.246 --> 00:23:02.508 domains toward nondirective counseling,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:02.510 --> 00:23:05.044 in which the healthcare provider has the
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:05.044 --> 00:23:07.889 expertise to know what the possibilities are,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:07.890 --> 00:23:10.130 but gives the patient the ability to make
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:10.130 --> 00:23:12.208 the choice that's best for themselves,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:12.210 --> 00:23:13.586 and indeed,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:13.586 --> 00:23:15.650 professional standards require
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:15.650 --> 00:23:17.714 conveying accurate information,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:17.720 --> 00:23:19.823 performing professionally accepted
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:19.823 --> 00:23:21.926 and indicated procedures,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:21.930 --> 00:23:23.950 and providing timely referrals.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:23.950 --> 00:23:26.475 To ensure patients receive care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:26.480 --> 00:23:29.222 but the current system of conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:29.222 --> 00:23:31.648 objection in health care as built
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:31.648 --> 00:23:34.074 in through legislatures and through
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:34.074 --> 00:23:36.779 decisions by judges and courts,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:36.780 --> 00:23:39.888 has not enabled patients to access
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:39.888 --> 00:23:41.960 the care they seek.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:41.960 --> 00:23:43.220 And you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:43.220 --> 00:23:46.160 I won't get into extensive detail here,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:46.160 --> 00:23:48.330 but you know one thing that's also
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:48.330 --> 00:23:50.510 happened is the church amendment was
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:50.510 --> 00:23:53.282 really focused on direct provision of care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429

00:23:53.290 --> 00:23:54.630 but it's often been.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:54.630 --> 00:23:56.640 Ancillary provision of care that's affected.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:56.640 --> 00:23:58.690 So there's currently I've been
NOTE Confidence: 0.864688003571429
00:23:58.690 --> 00:24:00.740 talking to doctors in the
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:00.816 --> 00:24:03.160 University of California system,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:03.160 --> 00:24:05.136 where it's a nurse,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:05.136 --> 00:24:08.730 wouldn't even admit a patient to a
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:08.730 --> 00:24:11.820 floor because they didn't, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:11.820 --> 00:24:15.180 approve of a procedure they were getting,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:15.180 --> 00:24:17.098 and they were sort of just left,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:17.100 --> 00:24:21.040 sitting in a wheelchair, in a hallway, or.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:21.040 --> 00:24:24.970 Operating room staff refused to, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:24.970 --> 00:24:27.875 Prep an OR and that delayed care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:27.880 --> 00:24:29.630 So it's not just the
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:29.630 --> 00:24:30.680 immediate people involved,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322
00:24:30.680 --> 00:24:35.020 but really it's become a quite extensive
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:35.020 --> 00:24:38.415 ability to opt out of providing care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:38.420 --> 00:24:40.700 And to me that rejects the
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:40.700 --> 00:24:42.220 fundamental obligation of healthcare,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:42.220 --> 00:24:44.836 the duty to ensure patients continued
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:44.836 --> 00:24:47.810 well being as patients themselves seek
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:47.810 --> 00:24:51.250 to live their life and it places then.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:51.250 --> 00:24:53.764 The individual beliefs of the provider
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:53.764 --> 00:24:56.150 over not only professional standards,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:56.150 --> 00:24:59.072 but also the patients sense of
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:24:59.072 --> 00:25:01.020 themselves and their interests.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:01.020 --> 00:25:01.872 So in that sense,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:01.872 --> 00:25:03.454 I think we can think of it
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:03.454 --> 00:25:04.709 as a conflict of interest,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:04.710 --> 00:25:06.850 not a financial one,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:06.850 --> 00:25:10.755 but a conflict of a conflict of
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:10.755 --> 00:25:13.665 interest over beliefs and so.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:13.670 --> 00:25:15.558 And I really want to emphasize in my

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:15.558 --> 00:25:17.606 final few minutes here that I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:17.606 --> 00:25:19.121 this matters for several reasons.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:19.130 --> 00:25:21.405 I think it matters generally for medical.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:21.410 --> 00:25:23.675 Ethics and where the patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:23.675 --> 00:25:25.034 sits in healthcare.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:25.040 --> 00:25:27.872 I think it matters for notions

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:27.872 --> 00:25:30.300 of professional integrity and the

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:30.300 --> 00:25:32.580 ability of patients to understand

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:32.580 --> 00:25:35.481 and expect that they will get care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:35.481 --> 00:25:37.647 That is up to the accepted

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:37.647 --> 00:25:39.110 professional standards of care,

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:39.110 --> 00:25:42.692 which of course change and evolve over time,

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:42.692 --> 00:25:45.308 but that patients should be able

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:45.308 --> 00:25:48.330 to expect that they are going to

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:48.330 --> 00:25:50.944 see a professional who will offer
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:50.944 --> 00:25:53.770 them the care that the profession.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:53.770 --> 00:25:54.542 Dean's right,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:54.542 --> 00:25:56.858 I think there's a question of
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:56.858 --> 00:25:58.616 institutional trust and just trust
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:25:58.616 --> 00:26:00.758 in providers when people do not get
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:00.827 --> 00:26:02.777 access to information and in the
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:02.777 --> 00:26:04.764 course of working on this project,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:04.764 --> 00:26:07.158 one of the things that has really
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:07.158 --> 00:26:09.280 become clear to me is the way in
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:09.280 --> 00:26:12.050 which people are surprised by moments
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:12.050 --> 00:26:14.570 where they're not getting care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:14.570 --> 00:26:17.146 A big issue arises in the reproductive
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:17.146 --> 00:26:19.070 health around around miscarriage,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:19.070 --> 00:26:20.930 management and expectations that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:20.930 --> 00:26:24.530 Their provider will be able to help them,

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:24.530 --> 00:26:27.230 and then there's a refusal and

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:27.230 --> 00:26:29.872 it creates all sorts of not just

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:29.872 --> 00:26:31.016 challenges for the patient,

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:31.020 --> 00:26:34.236 but real distrust and mistrust in the system.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:34.240 --> 00:26:36.235 And so finally I think it matters

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:36.235 --> 00:26:38.193 for reasons of justice and equity

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:38.193 --> 00:26:39.933 that access to care matters.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:39.940 --> 00:26:42.124 That patient should be able to

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:42.124 --> 00:26:44.426 expect to receive high quality care

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:44.426 --> 00:26:47.121 up again to the standards of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:47.121 --> 00:26:49.299 profession at which the provider is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:49.300 --> 00:26:51.407 The is the expert and the patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:51.407 --> 00:26:53.169 is trying to access that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:53.170 --> 00:26:56.124 Expertise and and so to create a

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:56.124 --> 00:26:58.719 system that doesn't enable patients

NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:26:58.719 --> 00:27:01.829 to get full information necessarily
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:01.829 --> 00:27:03.073 timely referrals.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:03.080 --> 00:27:06.160 But most of all the care they seek
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:06.160 --> 00:27:08.085 that meets professional standards
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:08.085 --> 00:27:11.378 to me is the central problem
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:11.378 --> 00:27:13.076 of conscientious objection,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:13.080 --> 00:27:15.735 especially in a system where
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:15.735 --> 00:27:19.192 people don't always have so many
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:19.192 --> 00:27:23.188 choices and where they have to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:23.190 --> 00:27:25.941 And they're trying to navigate a lot
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:25.941 --> 00:27:28.350 of complexity without full information,
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:28.350 --> 00:27:30.780 and we know about inequities
NOTE Confidence: 0.82984322

00:27:30.780 --> 00:27:33.210 in the healthcare system and
NOTE Confidence: 0.821860080769231

00:27:33.296 --> 00:27:35.534 as the current system exists,
NOTE Confidence: 0.821860080769231

00:27:35.534 --> 00:27:39.264 it allows, in my view, the perpetuation
NOTE Confidence: 0.821860080769231

00:27:39.264 --> 00:27:42.049 of inequities in these domains.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821860080769231
00:27:42.050 --> 00:27:44.682 With that I will turn it over and
NOTE Confidence: 0.821860080769231
00:27:44.682 --> 00:27:47.138 look forward to continued discussion.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:27:48.680 --> 00:27:50.558 Thank you so much doctor stall,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:27:50.560 --> 00:27:53.080 that was a really nice overview of some
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:27:53.080 --> 00:27:55.224 of the issues with with conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:27:55.224 --> 00:27:57.618 objection and in particular you know I'd
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:27:57.618 --> 00:28:00.158 like to bring to light the the question of
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:28:00.158 --> 00:28:02.199 autonomy and the question of of freedom,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:28:02.200 --> 00:28:04.888 because often we hear that term
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:28:04.888 --> 00:28:07.092 freedom or religious freedom used
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:28:07.092 --> 00:28:09.100 to to justify permissive provisions
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:28:09.100 --> 00:28:10.600 for conscientious objection.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:28:10.600 --> 00:28:12.880 But it's noteworthy that you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:28:12.880 --> 00:28:14.605 it's not necessarily a net
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667
00:28:14.605 --> 00:28:15.640 increase in freedom,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:15.640 --> 00:28:17.270 but rather it actually tends
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:17.270 --> 00:28:18.900 to exaggerate the gradient of.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:18.900 --> 00:28:22.008 Of power between clinicians and and patients,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:22.010 --> 00:28:23.948 and and also, as you noted,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:23.950 --> 00:28:27.742 often the cases that that are most commonly
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:27.742 --> 00:28:30.829 contentious from a conscientious objection,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:30.830 --> 00:28:33.294 standpoint or cases involving
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:33.294 --> 00:28:35.066 reproductive care, gender,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:35.066 --> 00:28:37.210 affirming, care and care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:37.210 --> 00:28:40.170 At the end of life and therefore involving
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:40.170 --> 00:28:42.022 particularly vulnerable populations,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:42.022 --> 00:28:44.910 including often you know, women,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:44.910 --> 00:28:47.910 the elderly and LGBTQ plus folks
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:47.910 --> 00:28:49.410 who who already.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:49.410 --> 00:28:51.034 Uh, don't have HealthEquity
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:51.034 --> 00:28:53.064 in in many different domains,

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:53.070 --> 00:28:55.302 so so to your point it's if there's

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:55.302 --> 00:28:57.649 a a justice concern as well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:28:57.650 --> 00:29:00.205 so thank you very much for that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:00.210 --> 00:29:02.385 I'd like to now transition

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:02.385 --> 00:29:04.125 to Doctor Mark Siegel,

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:04.130 --> 00:29:06.914 who's going to argue in in defense of

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:06.914 --> 00:29:10.738 of the the the judicious application or

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:10.738 --> 00:29:13.170 exercise of conscientious objection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:13.170 --> 00:29:14.490 Just as an introduction,

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:14.490 --> 00:29:16.470 although I know many people know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:16.470 --> 00:29:19.610 Doctor Siegel already Mark Siegel.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:19.610 --> 00:29:20.590 Hang on one second.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:20.590 --> 00:29:22.060 I just lost my screen there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:22.060 --> 00:29:23.915 Mark Siegel graduated from the

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:23.915 --> 00:29:25.399 Columbia University of Physicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:25.399 --> 00:29:27.360 and Surgeons in 1988 and completed
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:27.360 --> 00:29:28.910 his residency in internal medicine
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:28.910 --> 00:29:30.921 at the Hospital of the University
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:30.921 --> 00:29:32.250 of Pennsylvania in 1991.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:32.250 --> 00:29:34.230 He was a pulmonary and critical
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:34.230 --> 00:29:36.514 care fellow at Yale from 1992 to
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:36.514 --> 00:29:38.476 1995 and has been a full-time
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:38.476 --> 00:29:40.380 Yale faculty member since then.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:40.380 --> 00:29:42.282 Doctor Siegel is board certified in
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:42.282 --> 00:29:43.846 internal medicine, pulmonary medicine,
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:43.846 --> 00:29:45.698 and critical care medicine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:45.700 --> 00:29:47.932 He was previously Co chair of
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:47.932 --> 00:29:49.420 the Hospital Bioethics Committee.
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:49.420 --> 00:29:51.124 His major clinical focus is in
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:51.124 --> 00:29:52.779 the intensive care unit and he
NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:52.779 --> 00:29:54.396 attends in the MCU and on the

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:54.396 --> 00:29:56.110 general Internal Medicine services.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:56.110 --> 00:29:58.216 Doctor Siegel serves on the editorial

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:29:58.216 --> 00:30:00.549 boards of critical Care Medicine Chest,

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:00.550 --> 00:30:02.517 the Annals of the American Thoracic Society,

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:02.520 --> 00:30:04.506 and the American Journal of Medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:04.510 --> 00:30:05.938 He is the recipient of several

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:05.938 --> 00:30:07.274 teaching awards and has participated

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:07.274 --> 00:30:08.929 in several multi center trials

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:08.929 --> 00:30:10.253 investigating new therapies for

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:10.306 --> 00:30:11.806 the treatment of critical illness.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:11.810 --> 00:30:13.395 He currently serves as program

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:13.395 --> 00:30:14.980 director of the Yale Traditional

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:15.031 --> 00:30:16.479 Internal Medicine Residency and

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:16.479 --> 00:30:18.289 course director of the Internal

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:18.289 --> 00:30:19.459 Medicine sub internship.

NOTE Confidence: 0.936283896666667

00:30:19.460 --> 00:30:20.810 Doctor Siegel take it away.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:23.730 --> 00:30:24.978 OK, thank you Sarah and and

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:24.978 --> 00:30:26.370 thank you for the organizers.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:26.370 --> 00:30:27.513 For this invitation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:27.513 --> 00:30:29.418 I I really appreciated what

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:29.418 --> 00:30:30.930 Doctor Stahl had to say.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:30.930 --> 00:30:32.481 As as expected,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:32.481 --> 00:30:35.314 she is articulate and passionate and

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:35.314 --> 00:30:37.988 I think she has really showed us

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:37.988 --> 00:30:40.661 what can go wrong in this important

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:40.661 --> 00:30:42.549 area in the few minutes that I have,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:42.550 --> 00:30:44.894 I I want to make the case that

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:44.894 --> 00:30:48.097 it is essential to preserve the

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:48.097 --> 00:30:51.267 opportunity for clinicians to maintain

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:51.267 --> 00:30:54.073 conscientious objection and so let me.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:54.073 --> 00:30:56.200 Dive in and before I do that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:56.200 --> 00:30:57.579 let me just give you just a

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:57.579 --> 00:30:58.860 couple of other words of that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:30:58.860 --> 00:31:02.653 My background so is as Doctor Hall said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:02.653 --> 00:31:06.228 I am a medical intensivist so I spend a

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:06.228 --> 00:31:09.280 lot of my life in the intensive care unit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:09.280 --> 00:31:13.720 I was also the Chair of the American

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:13.720 --> 00:31:15.800 Rescue Society Ethics Committee and

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:15.871 --> 00:31:18.576 sat on a committee that created a

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:18.576 --> 00:31:21.416 document providing guidelines for the

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:21.416 --> 00:31:23.980 exercise of conscientious objection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:23.980 --> 00:31:26.619 I am not particularly religious I I

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:26.619 --> 00:31:29.899 come from a Jewish background and I

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:29.899 --> 00:31:32.186 don't consider myself particularly religious,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:32.186 --> 00:31:33.290 really more secular,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:33.290 --> 00:31:34.928 and I just want you to know

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:34.928 --> 00:31:36.390 that I am pro choice.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:36.390 --> 00:31:39.718 I have some views that about end of
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:39.718 --> 00:31:42.602 life care in the ICU and I think
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:42.602 --> 00:31:43.978 that that practical background
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:43.978 --> 00:31:46.003 doesn't form the comments that I'm
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:46.003 --> 00:31:47.869 going to share with you today,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:47.870 --> 00:31:50.970 so I'd like to start with a
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:50.970 --> 00:31:53.290 couple of case scenarios.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:53.290 --> 00:31:54.310 These are made up.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:54.310 --> 00:31:56.480 But but I I think they're realistic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:56.480 --> 00:31:58.420 So scenario number one,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:31:58.420 --> 00:32:00.787 let's imagine it's June 2022.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:00.787 --> 00:32:03.349 You are a Catholic medical student
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:03.349 --> 00:32:05.519 and personally opposed to abortion.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:05.520 --> 00:32:08.777 The Supreme Court has overturned Roe, V.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:08.777 --> 00:32:09.094 Wade,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:09.094 --> 00:32:10.996 and abortion is now legal in
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:10.996 --> 00:32:12.608 the state where you live.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:12.608 --> 00:32:13.912 You've been deciding what
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:13.912 --> 00:32:15.505 specialty to enter and believe
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:15.505 --> 00:32:17.173 OBGYN might be right for you.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:17.180 --> 00:32:18.986 And given the change in abortion laws,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:18.990 --> 00:32:20.850 you're relieved that you can now
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:20.850 --> 00:32:22.785 become an OBGYN without having to
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:22.785 --> 00:32:24.370 be asked to perform abortions.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:24.370 --> 00:32:27.595 Since your religion perfectly firmly
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:27.595 --> 00:32:30.883 opposes your participation in that procedure,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:30.883 --> 00:32:33.589 now imagine it's five years later
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:33.589 --> 00:32:35.870 and it's 2027 and you've graduated
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:35.870 --> 00:32:37.645 from residency and you're entering
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818
00:32:37.645 --> 00:32:39.510 the practice of OBGYN and over
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:39.510 --> 00:32:40.670 the past five years,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:40.670 --> 00:32:42.375 the Supreme Court has suddenly
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:42.375 --> 00:32:43.398 become more liberal,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:43.400 --> 00:32:46.190 and Roe V Wade is reaffirmed,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:46.190 --> 00:32:47.620 so abortion will be allowed.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:47.620 --> 00:32:49.356 And a pregnant woman comes to your
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:49.356 --> 00:32:51.469 clinic and asked you to perform an abortion.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:51.470 --> 00:32:53.130 And the question is,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:53.130 --> 00:32:54.790 are you professionally obligated?
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:54.790 --> 00:32:55.756 To do so,
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:55.756 --> 00:32:58.010 just going to throw that out there
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:58.085 --> 00:32:59.108 as a question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:32:59.110 --> 00:33:01.703 Scenario number two it's June 2022
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:01.703 --> 00:33:03.761 and you're a medical intensivist and
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:03.761 --> 00:33:05.440 you're not religiously affiliated.
NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:05.440 --> 00:33:07.554 You've been in practice for 30 years.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:07.560 --> 00:33:09.513 A patient in the ICU is dying

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:09.513 --> 00:33:10.780 from widely metastatic cancer,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:10.780 --> 00:33:13.167 but death is not imminent on palliative

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:13.167 --> 00:33:15.058 care is helping to treat her,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:15.060 --> 00:33:16.888 but despite their efforts,

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:16.888 --> 00:33:18.259 she remains symptomatic.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:18.260 --> 00:33:20.660 She's cognitively intact and has

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:20.660 --> 00:33:22.100 no psychiatric diagnosis.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:22.100 --> 00:33:23.428 The patient states repeatedly

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:23.428 --> 00:33:26.093 that she wants to die and ask you

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:26.093 --> 00:33:27.905 to inject her with something to

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:27.905 --> 00:33:29.060 enter life quickly.

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:29.060 --> 00:33:30.872 You tell her that you continue

NOTE Confidence: 0.827422598181818

00:33:30.872 --> 00:33:32.080 to work with palliative

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:32.140 --> 00:33:34.952 care, but you can't enter life because

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:34.952 --> 00:33:37.916 youthanasia is illegal in your state and
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:37.916 --> 00:33:40.716 you are morally opposed to the practice.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:40.720 --> 00:33:43.336 Five years later, 2027,
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:43.336 --> 00:33:44.760 a similar situation arises,
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:44.760 --> 00:33:46.695 but now Connecticut has adopted
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:46.695 --> 00:33:49.040 law laws allowing youth in Asia,
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:49.040 --> 00:33:50.692 modeled on practice in
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:50.692 --> 00:33:52.344 Belgium and the Netherlands,
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:52.350 --> 00:33:55.934 and you remain morally opposed to euthanasia.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:55.940 --> 00:33:58.175 But are you obligated on
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:58.175 --> 00:33:59.069 professionally ethically?
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:33:59.070 --> 00:34:02.346 To offer euthanasia now that it is
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:02.346 --> 00:34:05.049 legal and allowable in your state.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:05.050 --> 00:34:07.836 So I'm just posing those questions which
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:07.836 --> 00:34:11.030 I think are are reasonably realistic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:11.030 --> 00:34:13.830 So what I hope to show is why.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:13.830 --> 00:34:15.906 I believe clinicians should be allowed

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:15.906 --> 00:34:19.087 to opt out of care that conflicts deeply

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:19.090 --> 00:34:21.490 with their deeply held moral beliefs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:21.490 --> 00:34:24.332 I want to address some of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:24.332 --> 00:34:25.550 potential arguments against

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:25.550 --> 00:34:27.685 conscientious objection on many of

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:27.685 --> 00:34:30.510 which back to stolen nicely outlined,

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:30.510 --> 00:34:34.414 and I'd like to conclude at the end

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:34.414 --> 00:34:36.406 by suggesting reasonable compromises

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:36.406 --> 00:34:39.593 that might address the needs of

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:39.593 --> 00:34:41.749 clinicians while protecting patients.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:41.750 --> 00:34:44.270 So what is conscientious objection anyway?

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:44.270 --> 00:34:46.646 For the purposes of my remarks,

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:46.650 --> 00:34:49.812 I consider the refusal to provide

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:49.812 --> 00:34:51.920 standard medical care which

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:52.010 --> 00:34:54.430 conflicts deeply with moral,
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:54.430 --> 00:34:55.962 deeply held moral beliefs.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:55.962 --> 00:34:59.148 So an example might be an OBGYN who
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:34:59.148 --> 00:35:01.983 is opposed to abortion and refuses to
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:01.983 --> 00:35:05.147 perform one or an MD who refuses to
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:05.147 --> 00:35:07.044 participate in physician assisted death.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:07.044 --> 00:35:08.904 That comes in many varieties.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:08.910 --> 00:35:11.230 You've been Asia is 1.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:11.230 --> 00:35:11.861 Example,
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:11.861 --> 00:35:15.016 conscientious objection does not include
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:15.016 --> 00:35:18.860 refusal to provide non standard care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:18.860 --> 00:35:22.900 so it if it's sort of off off the rails.
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:22.900 --> 00:35:25.324 If somebody wants you to inject
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:25.324 --> 00:35:27.665 something that they found at the
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:27.665 --> 00:35:29.621 at the drug store or something
NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:29.621 --> 00:35:31.676 that you don't necessarily hold

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:31.676 --> 00:35:34.116 a deep moral opposition to,

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:34.120 --> 00:35:35.590 it's just a personal opinion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:35.590 --> 00:35:37.240 That's not what we're we're

NOTE Confidence: 0.909152342727273

00:35:37.240 --> 00:35:38.230 talking about today.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:35:40.440 --> 00:35:42.255 So there's a history of

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:35:42.255 --> 00:35:43.707 moral challenges in medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:35:43.710 --> 00:35:47.436 In the past there was a history of eugenics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:35:47.440 --> 00:35:50.966 It was perfectly common for American

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:35:50.966 --> 00:35:54.987 physicians to sterilize people who were

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:35:54.987 --> 00:35:56.996 thought to be unfit to be parents.

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:35:57.000 --> 00:35:59.540 There's a history of matching

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:35:59.540 --> 00:36:01.572 physicians where certain horrendous

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:01.572 --> 00:36:03.816 practices were condoned by physicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:03.816 --> 00:36:06.764 and Nazi Germany and, and, of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:06.764 --> 00:36:09.726 the history of this Kiki study,

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:09.726 --> 00:36:13.806 which withheld care for syphilis
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:13.806 --> 00:36:16.254 from vulnerable individuals,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:16.260 --> 00:36:17.224 and the physicians involved
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:17.224 --> 00:36:18.670 in a lot of that work,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:18.670 --> 00:36:21.366 were highly prominent individuals
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:21.366 --> 00:36:23.388 in American medicine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:23.390 --> 00:36:24.970 In the future, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:24.970 --> 00:36:27.994 there's a lot changing when it comes to
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:27.994 --> 00:36:30.368 whether abortion will be allowed or not.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:30.370 --> 00:36:33.332 Euthanasia and will be will be a latter, not.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:33.332 --> 00:36:36.466 And I, I want to highlight this just to
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:36.466 --> 00:36:38.552 recognize that many of us enter these
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:38.552 --> 00:36:40.533 professions for a very long time, we.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:40.533 --> 00:36:44.194 Enter our professions at a point where
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:44.194 --> 00:36:46.560 certain practices are deemed acceptable,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:36:46.560 --> 00:36:49.440 and then during the course of your career

NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:36:49.440 --> 00:36:51.974 that may change and so the question is,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:36:51.980 --> 00:36:53.532 if standard practices change
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:36:53.532 --> 00:36:55.472 and your moral beliefs don't,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:36:55.480 --> 00:37:00.136 are you obligated to change along with
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:00.136 --> 00:37:03.560 your professional societies expectations?
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:03.560 --> 00:37:06.760 Clinicians are also moral beings.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:06.760 --> 00:37:09.020 Morality is intrinsic to
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:09.020 --> 00:37:10.715 our professional identity.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:10.720 --> 00:37:14.038 We're committed deeply to patient welfare.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:14.040 --> 00:37:16.938 We're committed to honesty and integrity,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:16.940 --> 00:37:19.761 and I hope everybody here agrees that
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:19.761 --> 00:37:22.992 we want clinicians to take their moral
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:22.992 --> 00:37:24.936 and ethical obligations seriously.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:24.940 --> 00:37:26.188 The hazard of though,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778
00:37:26.188 --> 00:37:28.508 is that if you ask clinicians to
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:28.508 --> 00:37:30.398 deliver a morally discordant care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:30.400 --> 00:37:31.240 in other words,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:31.240 --> 00:37:32.920 to do something that they are
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:32.920 --> 00:37:34.160 morally opposed to doing.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:34.160 --> 00:37:36.528 And there is a risk that you would
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:36.528 --> 00:37:38.110 induce severe moral distress,
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:38.110 --> 00:37:40.574 and in turn that might lead to
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:40.574 --> 00:37:42.790 decisions to leave the profession.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:42.790 --> 00:37:45.202 Or perhaps not even enter the
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:45.202 --> 00:37:47.182 profession in the 1st place.
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:47.182 --> 00:37:49.495 And I have to imagine that that
NOTE Confidence: 0.907912257777778

00:37:49.495 --> 00:37:51.640 would not be helpful for patients.
NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:37:54.400 --> 00:37:56.206 You know Doctor Stall was talking
NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:37:56.206 --> 00:37:57.760 before a little bit about
NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:37:57.760 --> 00:37:59.180 religion in the United States.
NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:37:59.180 --> 00:38:00.937 You know this is a some data

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:00.937 --> 00:38:02.739 that I found from far Curlin,

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:02.740 --> 00:38:04.123 published in 2005.

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:04.123 --> 00:38:07.734 Looking at a 1988 survey of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:07.734 --> 00:38:09.958 distribution of religions among

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:09.960 --> 00:38:12.872 physicians in the United States and it's a

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:12.872 --> 00:38:15.077 little different than the US population.

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:15.080 --> 00:38:18.510 But you can see a distribution of

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:18.510 --> 00:38:20.727 Protestants and Catholics and Jews

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:20.727 --> 00:38:22.844 and not affiliated Hindus, Muslims.

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:22.844 --> 00:38:25.520 Etcetera and it it's just to

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:25.599 --> 00:38:27.569 highlight the fact that that

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:27.569 --> 00:38:30.007 physicians like a lot of people

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:30.007 --> 00:38:33.148 in our society come to work with

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:33.148 --> 00:38:35.116 religious backgrounds and beliefs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:35.120 --> 00:38:37.766 which I'm sure to a great extent

NOTE Confidence: 0.836756284545455

00:38:37.766 --> 00:38:38.900 informs their care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:41.560 --> 00:38:45.586 So what's the problem with not
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:45.586 --> 00:38:47.599 allowing conscientious objection?
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:47.600 --> 00:38:49.200 This these questions were
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:49.200 --> 00:38:51.600 raised a number of years ago,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:51.600 --> 00:38:53.420 and an excellent article
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:53.420 --> 00:38:55.695 by by White and Brody,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:55.700 --> 00:38:58.428 and their concern is that if we don't
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:58.428 --> 00:38:59.852 allow conscientious objections that
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:38:59.852 --> 00:39:01.898 it might have a negative influence
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:01.898 --> 00:39:04.435 on the types of persons who enter
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:04.435 --> 00:39:06.230 medicine and a negative influence
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:06.230 --> 00:39:08.366 on the way clinicians attend to
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:08.366 --> 00:39:09.380 their professional obligations.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:09.380 --> 00:39:10.280 You know, if.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:10.280 --> 00:39:12.849 If people have more of a lease start,

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:12.850 --> 00:39:14.810 are thought to be disposable,

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:14.810 --> 00:39:16.390 that would be problematic.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:16.390 --> 00:39:18.758 It could promote callousness.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:18.758 --> 00:39:22.919 If you don't believe that moral that

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:22.919 --> 00:39:25.790 you can practice your your profession

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:25.790 --> 00:39:27.950 in concert with your moral beliefs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:27.950 --> 00:39:29.952 it might be that physicians would become

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:29.952 --> 00:39:32.275 less willing to be sympathetic to and

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:32.275 --> 00:39:34.035 accommodating of patients moral beliefs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:34.040 --> 00:39:34.476 So.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:34.476 --> 00:39:37.528 So if moral beliefs are important for

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:37.528 --> 00:39:39.770 patients, why not for clinicians too?

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:39.770 --> 00:39:40.910 And? And if we don't allow?

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:40.910 --> 00:39:42.394 Clinicians to follow their

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:42.394 --> 00:39:43.878 own core moral beliefs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:43.880 --> 00:39:46.764 how can we expect them to adhere
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:46.764 --> 00:39:48.000 to professional responsibilities?
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:48.000 --> 00:39:51.280 And there are two different
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:51.280 --> 00:39:53.248 types of morality.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:53.250 --> 00:39:55.020 As as Doctor Stoll said,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:55.020 --> 00:39:58.596 you know the federal government has for
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:39:58.596 --> 00:40:02.266 a long time supported conscience rights.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:02.266 --> 00:40:04.330 Among practicing clinicians,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:04.330 --> 00:40:07.834 you can see the website for Health and
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:07.834 --> 00:40:10.528 Human Services on the bottom with the link.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:10.530 --> 00:40:12.914 If anybody wants to look at this in
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:12.914 --> 00:40:15.451 more detail but just to enumerate some
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:15.451 --> 00:40:17.348 of these conscience rights conscience
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:17.348 --> 00:40:18.940 protections apply to healthcare
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:18.940 --> 00:40:20.930 providers who refuse to perform,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:20.930 --> 00:40:22.346 accommodate or assist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:22.346 --> 00:40:24.234 In certain healthcare services

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:24.234 --> 00:40:26.680 on religious or moral grounds,

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:26.680 --> 00:40:28.560 federal statutes protect healthcare

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:28.560 --> 00:40:30.440 provider conscience rights and

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:30.440 --> 00:40:32.321 prohibit recipients certain federal

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:32.321 --> 00:40:34.089 funds from discriminating against

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:34.089 --> 00:40:35.857 healthcare providers refused to

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:35.920 --> 00:40:37.560 participate in these services.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:37.560 --> 00:40:37.963 Again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:37.963 --> 00:40:40.381 based on moral objections or religious

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:40.381 --> 00:40:42.474 beliefs and their instructions on

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:42.474 --> 00:40:44.575 how someone could file a complaint

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:44.575 --> 00:40:46.901 under the Federal health care provider

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:46.901 --> 00:40:48.599 conscience protection statutes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:48.600 --> 00:40:50.946 If you believe that you have

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:50.946 --> 00:40:52.119 been discriminated against,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:52.120 --> 00:40:54.619 either because you refuse to participate in.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:54.620 --> 00:40:56.768 During medical procedures such as abortions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:56.770 --> 00:40:58.442 sterilization were coerced into
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:40:58.442 --> 00:41:00.532 performing procedures that are against
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:00.532 --> 00:41:02.676 your religious or moral beliefs or
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:02.676 --> 00:41:04.726 refused to provide health care items
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:04.726 --> 00:41:06.966 or services for the purposes of causing,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:06.970 --> 00:41:08.490 assisting in or causing
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:08.490 --> 00:41:10.390 the death of an individual,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:10.390 --> 00:41:13.085 such as by assisted suicide or euthanasia.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:13.090 --> 00:41:16.610 So these are baked in to federal statutes.
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:16.610 --> 00:41:18.740 They include the church amendments as
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:18.740 --> 00:41:20.680 Doctor Swallow and into subsequently
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:20.680 --> 00:41:22.496 public Health Service Act,
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:22.500 --> 00:41:24.798 the Weldon Amendment and the Affordable

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:24.798 --> 00:41:26.460 Care Act, and I just want to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:26.460 --> 00:41:29.304 Quote a couple of lines from

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:29.304 --> 00:41:31.200 the Affordable Care Act.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:31.200 --> 00:41:33.615 You know one that no qualified health

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:33.615 --> 00:41:36.030 plan offered through an exchange may

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:36.030 --> 00:41:37.790 discriminate against any individual

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:37.790 --> 00:41:39.932 healthcare provider or health care

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:39.932 --> 00:41:41.832 facility because of its unwillingness

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:41.832 --> 00:41:44.318 to provide pay for provide coverage

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:44.318 --> 00:41:47.636 of or refer for abortions so can't

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:47.636 --> 00:41:49.118 be discriminated against.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:49.120 --> 00:41:50.272 If that's the belief,

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:50.272 --> 00:41:52.000 and also that the federal government,

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:52.000 --> 00:41:54.828 then any state or local government or

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:54.828 --> 00:41:56.486 healthcare provider that receives.

NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:56.486 --> 00:41:58.270 Federal financial assistance under
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:41:58.270 --> 00:42:01.356 this act or under any amendment of
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:42:01.356 --> 00:42:03.708 this act or any healthcare created
NOTE Confidence: 0.847567286666667

00:42:03.708 --> 00:42:06.047 under this act may not be subject
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:06.050 --> 00:42:08.285 an individual or or institutional
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:08.285 --> 00:42:10.520 healthcare facility to discrimination on
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:10.583 --> 00:42:12.903 the basis of the entity that the entity
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:12.903 --> 00:42:15.295 does not provide any health care item
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:15.295 --> 00:42:17.407 or services furnished for the purposes
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:17.407 --> 00:42:19.906 of causing or the purpose of assisting
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:19.906 --> 00:42:22.346 in causing the death of an individual,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:22.350 --> 00:42:24.010 such as by assisted suicide,
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:24.010 --> 00:42:25.382 euthanasia, or mercy killing.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:25.382 --> 00:42:27.097 So that was a mouthful.
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:27.100 --> 00:42:30.036 It's just to say that these are statutes
NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:30.036 --> 00:42:32.544 that are protecting moral objections

NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:32.544 --> 00:42:34.904 to providing abortions or various

NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:34.904 --> 00:42:37.419 forms of physician assisted death,

NOTE Confidence: 0.828687251333333

00:42:37.420 --> 00:42:38.530 including euthanasia.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:42:41.180 --> 00:42:44.848 So I I completely agree with Doctor

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:42:44.848 --> 00:42:47.287 Saul that there are practical

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:42:47.287 --> 00:42:51.676 concerns that we need to account for.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:42:51.680 --> 00:42:55.358 Yes, we do enter into the

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:42:55.358 --> 00:42:57.197 healthcare professions voluntarily.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:42:57.200 --> 00:42:58.620 I I would argue, though,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:42:58.620 --> 00:43:00.984 that that we enter into these

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:00.984 --> 00:43:02.940 professions at an early age,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:02.940 --> 00:43:04.215 not necessarily knowing

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:04.215 --> 00:43:05.915 what we're agreeing to,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:05.920 --> 00:43:08.644 and also recognizing that there is

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:08.644 --> 00:43:11.260 potentially a changing moral landscape.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:11.260 --> 00:43:13.552 There is a real concern about
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:13.552 --> 00:43:15.650 interfering with patient access to care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:15.650 --> 00:43:17.967 and I would argue that any support
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:17.967 --> 00:43:18.960 for conscientious objection
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:19.015 --> 00:43:20.190 has to deal with that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:20.190 --> 00:43:23.472 There is a concern about discrimination
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:23.472 --> 00:43:25.142 against vulnerable patients,
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:25.142 --> 00:43:27.430 including LGBTQ, and again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:27.430 --> 00:43:29.812 I think that any support for
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:29.812 --> 00:43:31.400 conscientious objection has to
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:31.467 --> 00:43:33.347 make sure that vulnerable patients
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:33.347 --> 00:43:36.109 get the care they are entitled to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:36.110 --> 00:43:37.814 There is our concerns about imposition
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:37.814 --> 00:43:39.720 of burden of care on colleagues,
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:39.720 --> 00:43:41.799 so if I were to refuse to.
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:41.800 --> 00:43:43.599 Care for a patient in the ICU?

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:43.600 --> 00:43:45.124 That would mean that that one

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:45.124 --> 00:43:46.669 of my colleagues would have to

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:46.669 --> 00:43:47.854 take care of that patient,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:47.860 --> 00:43:49.920 and that's potentially a burden.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:49.920 --> 00:43:51.545 There are concerns about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:51.545 --> 00:43:53.170 failure to respond to emergencies,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:53.170 --> 00:43:55.015 and we have heard horrendous

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:55.015 --> 00:43:56.860 stories about women with atopic

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:56.923 --> 00:43:58.547 pregnancies where they couldn't

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:43:58.547 --> 00:44:00.983 get a timely abortion and suffered

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:01.045 --> 00:44:03.260 health consequences because of that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:03.260 --> 00:44:03.686 and that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:03.686 --> 00:44:04.112 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:04.112 --> 00:44:05.694 I think that that is clearly something

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:05.694 --> 00:44:07.218 that we can't allow to happen.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:07.220 --> 00:44:09.608 There is a power differential between
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:09.608 --> 00:44:11.570 clinicians and patients and like.
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:11.570 --> 00:44:14.672 You should acknowledge that that the
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:14.672 --> 00:44:17.635 politicians hold power over patients and
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:17.635 --> 00:44:19.745 we need to recognize patients rights
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:19.745 --> 00:44:21.830 and there's the potential for abuse.
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:21.830 --> 00:44:24.212 I'm using moral objections as a
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:24.212 --> 00:44:25.403 smokescreen for deterioration
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:25.403 --> 00:44:27.579 and I'm just I'm discrimination.
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:27.580 --> 00:44:28.142 It's not.
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:28.142 --> 00:44:29.828 Maybe it's not really moral belief
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:29.828 --> 00:44:31.871 that you just don't want to take care
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:31.871 --> 00:44:33.888 of a person from a vulnerable group,
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:33.890 --> 00:44:35.924 and there are very few mechanisms
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:35.924 --> 00:44:38.646 in place and I'm aware of that
NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:38.646 --> 00:44:40.366 provide the necessary process

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:40.366 --> 00:44:42.658 and oversight to make sure that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:42.658 --> 00:44:44.800 Punches objection is exercised in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:44.872 --> 00:44:47.184 way that is not going to be abused.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:47.190 --> 00:44:49.388 It doesn't mean it can't be done,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:49.390 --> 00:44:52.638 but I think Doctor Stall is right that

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:52.638 --> 00:44:55.160 that at this point the structures

NOTE Confidence: 0.66085138

00:44:55.160 --> 00:44:56.958 are not where they should be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:44:59.100 --> 00:45:00.141 Professional standards evolved.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:00.141 --> 00:45:02.223 Abortion appears to be going from

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:02.223 --> 00:45:04.140 the legal to legal and back again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:04.140 --> 00:45:06.555 and it's likely to vary by state

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:06.560 --> 00:45:08.940 in the years ahead. And of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:08.940 --> 00:45:13.876 people move states as as their lives evolve.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:13.880 --> 00:45:15.700 End of life care is evolving too,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:15.700 --> 00:45:17.908 with growing acceptance of DNR status,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:17.910 --> 00:45:19.458 withdrawal of life support,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:19.458 --> 00:45:20.619 and physician assisted
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:20.619 --> 00:45:22.360 death rules vary by state,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:22.360 --> 00:45:24.040 and certainly rules vary by country.
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:24.040 --> 00:45:27.636 So so to my knowledge in Israel,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:27.636 --> 00:45:28.740 it's still not.
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:28.740 --> 00:45:30.460 And considered appropriate to
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:30.460 --> 00:45:32.180 withdraw life sustaining therapy
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:32.180 --> 00:45:34.415 once it's already been applied so
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:34.415 --> 00:45:36.383 the patient is on a ventilator.
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:36.390 --> 00:45:38.802 Taking them off is a difficult thing to do.
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:38.810 --> 00:45:40.331 And then at the other end of the spectrum
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:40.331 --> 00:45:42.088 in places like Belgium and the Netherlands,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760286826875

00:45:42.090 --> 00:45:44.178 euthanasia is allowed.
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:45:47.150 --> 00:45:49.388 So there was an interesting article
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:45:49.388 --> 00:45:52.665 published back in 2017 by colleagues in in

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:45:52.665 --> 00:45:56.122 critical care and I would encourage anybody

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:45:56.122 --> 00:45:59.746 who's interested to read this article,

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:45:59.750 --> 00:46:02.900 but they were doing is they wanted to get

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:02.900 --> 00:46:06.449 a group together of people with diverse

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:06.449 --> 00:46:10.530 viewpoints on on euthanasia, in the ICU,

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:10.530 --> 00:46:13.666 and they asked 4 core questions and actually

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:13.666 --> 00:46:16.556 we're not able to reach any consensus.

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:16.560 --> 00:46:18.420 On three of these questions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:18.420 --> 00:46:20.480 one was are there patients

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:20.480 --> 00:46:22.540 for whom death is beneficial?

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:22.540 --> 00:46:25.933 So would the patient be better off dead than

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:25.933 --> 00:46:29.250 alive because of their underlying condition?

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:29.250 --> 00:46:32.316 Is physician assisted suicide or euthanasia

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:32.316 --> 00:46:34.934 morally equivalent to withholding or

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:34.934 --> 00:46:36.761 withdrawing life sustaining therapy?

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:36.761 --> 00:46:39.740 So is the act of ending their life the
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:39.818 --> 00:46:42.428 same as simply taking equipment away?
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:42.430 --> 00:46:43.768 And 3rd question,
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:43.768 --> 00:46:46.444 is it morally acceptable for physicians
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:46.444 --> 00:46:50.250 to cause death intentionally so to
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:50.250 --> 00:46:53.260 perform an act where the intent is
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:53.260 --> 00:46:56.932 for the person to die so as opposed
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:56.932 --> 00:46:59.217 to removing equipment and just?
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:46:59.220 --> 00:47:00.670 Letting nature take its course,
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:00.670 --> 00:47:03.078 whatever that might turn out to be.
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:03.080 --> 00:47:05.341 The important point was that this this
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:05.341 --> 00:47:07.722 group of of Intensivists couldn't agree
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:07.722 --> 00:47:10.398 on the answers to those questions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:10.400 --> 00:47:12.002 but there was a fourth question
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:12.002 --> 00:47:14.191 and that was what is a reasonable
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:14.191 --> 00:47:15.961 accommodation between the right of

NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:15.961 --> 00:47:17.614 patient access to physician assisted
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:17.614 --> 00:47:20.666 suicide and you can Asia and the right of
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:20.666 --> 00:47:22.638 conscience conscientious objection and.
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:22.640 --> 00:47:25.520 And this is where the group had consensus.
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:25.520 --> 00:47:28.192 They all supported conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:28.192 --> 00:47:29.840 objection and I want to quote.
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:29.840 --> 00:47:32.264 That we unanimously agree that accommodation
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:32.264 --> 00:47:35.208 for the matter of conscience is necessary
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:35.208 --> 00:47:37.716 on patients should respect the fact
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:37.716 --> 00:47:40.420 that physician assisted suicide in Asia
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:40.420 --> 00:47:43.078 and ethically controversial topic is a
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:43.078 --> 00:47:45.280 controversially as a controversial topic,
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:45.280 --> 00:47:47.877 and they should expect many physicians to
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:47.877 --> 00:47:50.472 be unwilling to provide it upon request
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889
00:47:50.472 --> 00:47:53.240 and to all participants in the position.
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:53.240 --> 00:47:54.968 Patient physician covenant must
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:54.968 --> 00:47:56.696 recognize that conscientious objection
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:56.696 --> 00:47:59.241 is an instrumental means of promoting
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:47:59.241 --> 00:48:00.459 the integrity and.
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:48:00.460 --> 00:48:02.192 Quality of medical care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:48:02.192 --> 00:48:04.357 So a strong endorsement of
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:48:04.357 --> 00:48:05.530 conscientious objection,
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:48:05.530 --> 00:48:07.942 no matter what side of the argument you are
NOTE Confidence: 0.875175008888889

00:48:07.942 --> 00:48:10.658 on with respect to physician assisted death.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:13.000 --> 00:48:15.820 So the American College of Obstetrics
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:15.820 --> 00:48:17.700 and Gynecology has specific
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:17.782 --> 00:48:19.954 recommendations on conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:19.954 --> 00:48:22.190 refusal just to quickly review them.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:22.190 --> 00:48:24.325 That patient well being must be paramount.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:24.330 --> 00:48:26.370 That healthcare providers must impart
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:26.370 --> 00:48:28.002 accurate and unbiased information

NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:28.002 --> 00:48:30.032 that clinicians must provide potential
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:30.032 --> 00:48:31.992 patients with accurate and prior
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:31.992 --> 00:48:33.789 notice of their personal commitments
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:33.789 --> 00:48:35.817 that commissions have the duty to
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:35.820 --> 00:48:37.590 refer patients in a timely manner
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:37.590 --> 00:48:39.635 to other providers if they can
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:39.635 --> 00:48:41.247 provide the standard reproductive
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:41.247 --> 00:48:42.859 services their patients request.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:42.860 --> 00:48:44.425 Setting an emergency where referral
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:44.425 --> 00:48:46.425 is not possible or might negatively
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:46.425 --> 00:48:48.305 affect the patient's physical or
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:48.305 --> 00:48:50.220 mental health that providers have
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:50.220 --> 00:48:51.995 an obligation to provide medically
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:51.995 --> 00:48:53.996 indicated and requested care regardless
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:48:53.996 --> 00:48:56.876 of their personal moral objections.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:56.880 --> 00:48:58.450 That in resource poor areas.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:48:58.450 --> 00:49:01.018 Access to safe and legal reproductive
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:01.018 --> 00:49:03.406 services should be maintained and that
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:03.406 --> 00:49:04.758 lawmakers should advance policies
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:04.758 --> 00:49:06.670 that balance and protect providers.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:06.670 --> 00:49:08.630 Conscience is with the critical
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:08.630 --> 00:49:10.198 goal of ensuring timely,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:10.200 --> 00:49:11.640 effective evidence based and
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:11.640 --> 00:49:13.440 safe medicine to all women.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:13.440 --> 00:49:15.042 Seeking reproductive services.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:15.042 --> 00:49:19.375 So the bottom line is that the ACOG
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:19.375 --> 00:49:22.924 did not object to the notion of
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:22.924 --> 00:49:25.260 conscientious refusal categorically.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:25.260 --> 00:49:27.676 What they wanted to do was to make
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:27.676 --> 00:49:30.236 sure that it was done in a way
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:49:30.236 --> 00:49:32.400 that respected these core concerns,

NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:32.400 --> 00:49:35.450 particularly to make sure that
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:35.450 --> 00:49:38.854 patients still had access to the
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:38.854 --> 00:49:40.814 care that they needed.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:40.820 --> 00:49:45.236 Similarly for the Americans Thoracic Society.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:45.240 --> 00:49:47.408 This is the committee that I said on.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:47.410 --> 00:49:49.660 We recognize that there are important
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:49.660 --> 00:49:51.816 arguments in favor of conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:51.816 --> 00:49:54.156 objection to protect clinicians,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:54.160 --> 00:49:55.230 moral integrity,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:55.230 --> 00:49:56.300 clinicians, autonomy,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:56.300 --> 00:49:58.440 quality of medical care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:49:58.440 --> 00:50:00.993 and the need to be able to change has
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:00.993 --> 00:50:03.058 with professional norms and practices
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:03.058 --> 00:50:05.428 while still recognizing that we need
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:05.428 --> 00:50:07.378 to hunt that their arguments against
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:07.380 --> 00:50:09.473 we need to recognize that their need
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:09.473 --> 00:50:11.040 to honor professional commitments.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:11.040 --> 00:50:12.381 Protect vulnerable patients.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:12.381 --> 00:50:14.616 Prevent excessive hardship for other
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:14.616 --> 00:50:16.530 clinicians or our institutions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:16.530 --> 00:50:19.515 and to avoid invidious discrimination
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:19.515 --> 00:50:21.796 against patients so so.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:21.796 --> 00:50:24.511 This policy statement which we
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:24.511 --> 00:50:27.162 put out back in 2015,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:27.162 --> 00:50:29.930 basically made four recommendations,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:29.930 --> 00:50:31.330 one that conscientious objections
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:31.330 --> 00:50:33.430 in the ICU should be managed
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:33.487 --> 00:50:35.350 through institutional mechanisms.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:35.350 --> 00:50:36.226 In other words,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:36.226 --> 00:50:37.978 it shouldn't be at hoc that
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:50:37.978 --> 00:50:39.140 institutions should accommodate

NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:39.140 --> 00:50:41.185 conscientious objections in the ICU.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:41.190 --> 00:50:43.374 As long as certain criteria are met
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:43.374 --> 00:50:45.479 that it doesn't impede a patient
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:45.479 --> 00:50:47.314 or surrogates access to medical
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:47.314 --> 00:50:49.535 services or information that the
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:49.535 --> 00:50:51.423 accommodation won't create excessive
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:51.423 --> 00:50:53.682 hardships for other clinicians and
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:53.682 --> 00:50:56.208 that it's not based on discrimination.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:56.210 --> 00:50:59.330 The third recommendation was that a
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:50:59.330 --> 00:51:01.398 clinicians consciences objection to
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:51:01.398 --> 00:51:02.922 potentially inappropriate orthopedic
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:51:02.922 --> 00:51:05.970 medical care should not be considered
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:51:06.041 --> 00:51:08.549 a sufficient justification on its own,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:51:08.550 --> 00:51:10.209 So what they were trying to do
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857
00:51:10.209 --> 00:51:11.370 is to distinguish between.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:11.370 --> 00:51:12.714 Request for feudal care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:12.714 --> 00:51:15.170 separate from some of the other topics
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:15.170 --> 00:51:17.070 that we're talking about today,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:17.070 --> 00:51:20.170 such as physician, assisted death,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:20.170 --> 00:51:22.090 and euthanasia, and finally,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:22.090 --> 00:51:23.930 the recommendation that institutions
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:23.930 --> 00:51:26.668 should promote open world dialogue and
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:26.668 --> 00:51:28.753 advanced measures to minimize moral
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:28.753 --> 00:51:31.173 distress and create a culture where
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:31.173 --> 00:51:33.598 diverse values are respected in the
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:33.598 --> 00:51:36.274 critical care setting so you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:36.274 --> 00:51:39.082 just finally the ideas that we
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:39.082 --> 00:51:41.809 should advance identification.
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:41.810 --> 00:51:44.306 Clinicians having an obligation
NOTE Confidence: 0.882452342142857

00:51:44.306 --> 00:51:47.426 to identify and notify others
NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:51:47.430 --> 00:51:49.010 of anticipated conscientious objections

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:51:49.010 --> 00:51:51.848 that should be done in a timely

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:51:51.848 --> 00:51:53.666 manner that they should disclose

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:51:53.666 --> 00:51:55.790 all medical options and make sure

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:51:55.857 --> 00:51:57.441 that patients have uninterrupted

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:51:57.441 --> 00:52:00.252 medical care that there should be a

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:00.252 --> 00:52:02.092 protocol for transferring care from

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:02.092 --> 00:52:03.834 1 physician to another one position

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:03.834 --> 00:52:05.910 to another if there is an objection,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:05.910 --> 00:52:08.108 there should be a process for appeals

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:08.110 --> 00:52:10.126 that there should be consequences for

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:10.126 --> 00:52:11.950 clinicians who refused to provide.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:11.950 --> 00:52:14.330 Medical service when a conscientious

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:14.330 --> 00:52:16.234 objection can't be accommodated,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:16.240 --> 00:52:18.664 so you can't just walk away from the

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:18.664 --> 00:52:21.506 patient and leave them without care and

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:21.506 --> 00:52:25.097 that there should be periodic review of

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:25.097 --> 00:52:27.848 conscientious objective objection cases.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:27.850 --> 00:52:28.855 So in summary,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:28.855 --> 00:52:31.200 I hope I've made an argument that

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:31.271 --> 00:52:33.931 we should allow clinicians to

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:33.931 --> 00:52:35.527 invoke conscientious objection,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:35.530 --> 00:52:37.930 accommodate the the needs of

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:37.930 --> 00:52:39.850 physicians and other providers,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:39.850 --> 00:52:42.202 and we hope that this may improve

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:42.202 --> 00:52:44.829 the quality of medical care provided.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:44.830 --> 00:52:46.792 But to do so, we have to have safeguards,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:46.800 --> 00:52:47.818 including transparency,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:47.818 --> 00:52:49.854 advanced planning and oversight

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:49.854 --> 00:52:52.386 that ensures that that beliefs

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:52.386 --> 00:52:54.506 are deeply held and consistent,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333

00:52:54.510 --> 00:52:57.816 and that patients rights are protected.

NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333
00:52:57.820 --> 00:52:59.787 So with that I will stop and
NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333
00:52:59.787 --> 00:53:01.998 I'll turn it back over to Sarah.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863354190833333
00:53:02.000 --> 00:53:02.470 Thank you.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:03.850 --> 00:53:05.098 Thank you so much.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:05.098 --> 00:53:07.361 That was a really nice overview and
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:07.361 --> 00:53:09.594 I just like to highlight a couple
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:09.594 --> 00:53:13.030 points before we open up to the Q&A.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:13.030 --> 00:53:15.118 You know, I, I think that it's important
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:15.118 --> 00:53:17.226 when we talk about deeply held beliefs
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:17.226 --> 00:53:19.569 to understand the seed of those beliefs.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:19.570 --> 00:53:22.198 Because I I do think it makes a difference
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:22.198 --> 00:53:24.739 whether those are beliefs according to
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:24.739 --> 00:53:26.929 one's personal versus professional morality.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:26.930 --> 00:53:29.225 So you know, sort of as as an an
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304
00:53:29.225 --> 00:53:31.008 example that I've cited before,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:31.010 --> 00:53:32.006 is that you know, it's my.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:32.010 --> 00:53:33.513 It's my personal,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:33.513 --> 00:53:36.519 deeply held belief that that factory
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:36.519 --> 00:53:40.017 farming is deeply unethical and problematic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:40.020 --> 00:53:43.230 And you know that the way that that we eat.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:43.230 --> 00:53:45.930 In this country is is wrong,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:45.930 --> 00:53:46.998 but that's not.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:46.998 --> 00:53:49.134 That really is completely divorced from
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:49.134 --> 00:53:51.708 my professional duties as a physician,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:51.710 --> 00:53:53.324 and therefore it would be unacceptable
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:53.324 --> 00:53:55.808 for me as a cardiologist for example,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:55.810 --> 00:53:57.875 to deny a patient a prescription for
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:53:57.875 --> 00:54:00.003 a statin because I perceive that you
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:00.003 --> 00:54:01.773 know his or her hyperlipidemia is
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:01.837 --> 00:54:03.789 only due to his or her meat eating,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:03.790 --> 00:54:05.438 and I don't want to enable that meat

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:05.438 --> 00:54:07.096 eating that that in my opinion you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:07.100 --> 00:54:08.750 even though that's a very deeply

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:08.750 --> 00:54:09.850 held belief of mine,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:09.850 --> 00:54:11.272 that's a belief that would interfere

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:11.272 --> 00:54:13.180 with my duty to care for my patient.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:13.180 --> 00:54:15.455 According to the best cardiology

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:15.455 --> 00:54:16.820 evidence out there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:16.820 --> 00:54:19.160 and therefore that that would be

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:19.160 --> 00:54:20.720 unacceptable and and similarly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:20.720 --> 00:54:22.260 you know that's not a religious belief.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:22.260 --> 00:54:23.286 But I don't.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:23.286 --> 00:54:24.996 I don't think religion automatically

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:24.996 --> 00:54:26.604 therefore shield someone just because

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:26.604 --> 00:54:28.634 they you know they have a religious

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:28.689 --> 00:54:30.730 belief in my belief is is secular that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:30.730 --> 00:54:32.710 that doesn't allow physicians to sort
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:32.710 --> 00:54:35.039 of force their beliefs upon patients,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:35.040 --> 00:54:36.360 but to your point,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:36.360 --> 00:54:38.340 there are a lot of professionally
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:38.404 --> 00:54:39.985 very contentious topics,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:39.985 --> 00:54:42.810 such as as providing physician
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:42.810 --> 00:54:43.940 assisted suicide.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:43.940 --> 00:54:44.726 For example,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:44.726 --> 00:54:47.084 where it seems very reasonable that
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:47.084 --> 00:54:49.060 someone could hold a professional
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:49.060 --> 00:54:50.930 belief that that hastening the
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:50.930 --> 00:54:53.166 death of a patient violates their
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:53.166 --> 00:54:55.296 professional duty to do no harm
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:55.300 --> 00:54:56.840 because they perceive death as a harm,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:56.840 --> 00:54:58.968 and indeed one of our first comments
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:54:58.968 --> 00:55:01.509 in the Q&A touches upon this point,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:01.510 --> 00:55:02.791 I'm just going to read it because

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:02.791 --> 00:55:04.305 I think it was nicely stated it

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:04.305 --> 00:55:05.679 is worth highlighting that not all

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:05.727 --> 00:55:07.187 health practitioners feel that some

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:07.187 --> 00:55:08.647 legal procedures such as abortion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:08.650 --> 00:55:08.894 euthanasia,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:08.894 --> 00:55:10.358 accord with the doctor's goal of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:10.358 --> 00:55:11.958 working toward a patient's health if

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:11.958 --> 00:55:13.614 inducing death doesn't accord with an

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:13.614 --> 00:55:15.130 orientation of health and it's a misnomer.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:15.130 --> 00:55:18.035 To say that such practitioners refuse care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:18.040 --> 00:55:18.329 Rather,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:18.329 --> 00:55:19.774 such practitioners refuse to participate

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:19.774 --> 00:55:21.949 in a procedure that doesn't lead to health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:21.950 --> 00:55:22.185 Again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:22.185 --> 00:55:23.360 this is not denying care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:23.360 --> 00:55:24.984 so I I think that's for me.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:24.990 --> 00:55:27.574 That's a very key distinction to be made.
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:27.580 --> 00:55:28.855 You know where that conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:28.855 --> 00:55:29.875 objection is coming from?
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:29.880 --> 00:55:31.120 Is that coming from a seat of a
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:31.120 --> 00:55:32.169 of a personal belief,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:32.170 --> 00:55:33.274 whether religious or secular?
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:33.274 --> 00:55:35.620 Or is that from a professional belief aright,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:35.620 --> 00:55:37.675 arising from the duties that
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:37.675 --> 00:55:39.319 we've sworn to uphold,
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:39.320 --> 00:55:42.085 such as as promoting health
NOTE Confidence: 0.8699320304

00:55:42.085 --> 00:55:44.297 and and promoting flourishing,
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:44.300 --> 00:55:45.452 alleviating suffering?
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:45.452 --> 00:55:48.908 And and avoiding death when possible,
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:48.910 --> 00:55:50.212 and realizing that that there may

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:50.212 --> 00:55:52.189 be a lot of room for debate there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:52.190 --> 00:55:53.940 And and then the the other thing

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:53.940 --> 00:55:55.784 that I would just note that I would

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:55.784 --> 00:55:56.852 highlight that you said that I

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:56.852 --> 00:55:57.867 thought was was really helpful.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:55:57.870 --> 00:56:00.660 There were a few key points of consensus

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:00.660 --> 00:56:02.188 that I think we can all agree upon,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:02.190 --> 00:56:03.480 which is that you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:03.480 --> 00:56:07.281 even that there are certain certain core

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:07.281 --> 00:56:10.068 standards or or baseline standards such

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:10.068 --> 00:56:12.384 as no deceit or withholding information.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:12.390 --> 00:56:13.740 So for example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:13.740 --> 00:56:15.990 even someone who's morally opposed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:15.990 --> 00:56:18.155 To providing an abortion because

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:18.155 --> 00:56:20.320 they have a metaphysical belief.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:20.320 --> 00:56:22.395 Whether that's religiously seated or
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:22.395 --> 00:56:24.875 secularly seated that that that would
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:24.875 --> 00:56:27.227 terminate what they believe is a life
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:27.227 --> 00:56:29.403 they're not allowed to not counsel
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:29.403 --> 00:56:31.563 someone about abortion as an option,
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:31.570 --> 00:56:34.338 and that that they're they're allowed to to
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:34.338 --> 00:56:37.020 decline to participate in that procedure.
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:37.020 --> 00:56:38.555 But they're not allowed to
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:38.555 --> 00:56:40.580 lie to patients or to withhold
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:40.580 --> 00:56:42.690 information to patients about the
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:42.690 --> 00:56:45.090 the possibility of that procedure.
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:45.090 --> 00:56:47.170 And I think that that's an important point.
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:47.170 --> 00:56:49.090 And another point that you made that I
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:49.090 --> 00:56:51.181 think is really critical is the idea
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:51.181 --> 00:56:53.104 that an emergency overrides the the
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:53.104 --> 00:56:54.789 the practice of conscientious objection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:54.790 --> 00:56:56.101 So for example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:56.101 --> 00:56:58.723 someone presenting with an atopic pregnancy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:58.730 --> 00:56:59.543 first of all,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:56:59.543 --> 00:57:00.627 that almost seems silly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:00.630 --> 00:57:02.510 because that's a completely

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:02.510 --> 00:57:03.450 nonviable pregnancy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:03.450 --> 00:57:05.928 and so that there's no way that

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:05.928 --> 00:57:08.240 that pregnancy will end in in in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:08.240 --> 00:57:10.714 a baby in a healthy baby that's born

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:10.714 --> 00:57:13.162 that's independent of of the mother.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:13.170 --> 00:57:13.959 But you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:13.959 --> 00:57:15.800 even let's say that it's a pregnancy

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:15.854 --> 00:57:17.170 that may be questionably.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:17.170 --> 00:57:19.538 Viable if if a if a woman is

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:19.538 --> 00:57:21.471 presenting in extract in distress

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:21.471 --> 00:57:23.608 and bleeding out or I should say

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:23.608 --> 00:57:24.693 potentially viable in the future.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:24.700 --> 00:57:26.695 But before the date of any viability,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:26.700 --> 00:57:29.181 so and you know an earlier pregnancy

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:29.181 --> 00:57:31.988 that that to you know to decline

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:31.988 --> 00:57:34.505 to provide a life saving procedure

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:34.505 --> 00:57:35.735 to that woman,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:35.740 --> 00:57:37.798 I think would would just be

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:37.798 --> 00:57:38.827 pretty clearly unethical.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:38.830 --> 00:57:39.838 Regardless of 1's views.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:39.838 --> 00:57:40.594 And you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:40.600 --> 00:57:42.196 if someone really is going to have

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:42.196 --> 00:57:43.953 a problem with doing a procedure

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:43.953 --> 00:57:44.976 under those circumstances,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:44.980 --> 00:57:46.565 then there needs to be

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:46.565 --> 00:57:47.199 adequate institutional.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:47.200 --> 00:57:49.083 Staffing to ensure that that never happens

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:49.083 --> 00:57:51.237 and that goes to one of your next points,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:51.240 --> 00:57:53.600 which I think is is that rather than

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:53.600 --> 00:57:55.828 being an ad hoc individual basis,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:55.830 --> 00:57:58.240 there should be institutional norms

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:57:58.240 --> 00:58:01.174 and standards to codify what what

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:01.174 --> 00:58:03.629 situations are appropriate for the

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:03.629 --> 00:58:06.309 exercise of conscientious objection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:06.310 --> 00:58:07.310 Because it does sound like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:07.310 --> 00:58:08.766 even though there may not be it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:08.770 --> 00:58:10.800 it sounds like those very areas where

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:10.800 --> 00:58:12.225 there isn't professional consensus as

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:12.225 --> 00:58:14.003 to the morality of a certain action.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:14.010 --> 00:58:16.257 Those are the areas where we need

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:16.257 --> 00:58:17.220 to allow for.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:17.220 --> 00:58:18.044 Different viewpoints,
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:18.044 --> 00:58:20.104 but also have the institutional
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:20.104 --> 00:58:22.062 supports such that patients still
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:22.062 --> 00:58:24.486 receive the care that they need and
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:24.486 --> 00:58:26.716 and that also respects clinicians
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:26.716 --> 00:58:28.054 as moral agents.
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:28.060 --> 00:58:32.500 So I think that was a a really nice summary.
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:32.500 --> 00:58:34.138 I I'd like to allow doctor stall
NOTE Confidence: 0.80315541375

00:58:34.138 --> 00:58:34.840 to offer any
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333

00:58:34.898 --> 00:58:36.614 final thoughts and then offer Doctor
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333

00:58:36.614 --> 00:58:38.723 Siegel a chance to offer final thoughts
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333

00:58:38.723 --> 00:58:40.535 after that just so that everyone
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333

00:58:40.535 --> 00:58:42.388 gets a second chance to quickly do
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333

00:58:42.388 --> 00:58:44.720 a wrap up if they if they desire.
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333

00:58:44.720 --> 00:58:46.320 I think equity in terms of speaking time
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333

00:58:46.320 --> 00:58:47.625 is important and and I want to have.

NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333
00:58:47.630 --> 00:58:48.342 Come back and forth,
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333
00:58:48.342 --> 00:58:50.398 but I I want to get to the questions too.
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333
00:58:50.400 --> 00:58:51.672 And and then we'll open it
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333
00:58:51.672 --> 00:58:53.080 up to some more questions.
NOTE Confidence: 0.826934435333333
00:58:53.080 --> 00:58:54.220 If that sounds good to everyone.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:58:56.390 --> 00:58:58.046 Well, thank you and that's yeah,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:58:58.050 --> 00:58:59.960 sounds like a good plan.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:58:59.960 --> 00:59:01.838 You know, I I, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:59:01.840 --> 00:59:05.300 I really appreciate the.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:59:05.300 --> 00:59:07.424 The the way it actor Siegel
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:59:07.424 --> 00:59:10.988 kind of laid out the A case for
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:59:10.988 --> 00:59:12.539 allowing conscience objection.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:59:12.540 --> 00:59:13.740 And I guess from you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:59:13.740 --> 00:59:15.785 it raises some curiosities and
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
00:59:15.785 --> 00:59:18.838 one is one is like I you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:18.840 --> 00:59:19.611 I think right,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:19.611 --> 00:59:21.153 we do have the shared agreement
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:21.153 --> 00:59:23.126 that like there the system as it
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:23.126 --> 00:59:24.691 currently exists right now, right?
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:24.691 --> 00:59:27.848 It doesn't create a process or oversight
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:27.848 --> 00:59:31.313 or really capacity to to manage
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:31.313 --> 00:59:33.176 conscience objection effectively.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:33.180 --> 00:59:35.230 And I'm I'm just curious.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:35.230 --> 00:59:36.220 From your perspective,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:36.220 --> 00:59:39.250 both just the work in a hospital system but
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:39.250 --> 00:59:41.890 also right from the perspective of you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:41.890 --> 00:59:43.555 you're obviously part of other
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:43.555 --> 00:59:44.887 professional societies and whatnot.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:44.890 --> 00:59:46.570 Do you see spaces where this
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:46.570 --> 00:59:47.690 has been done well?
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:47.690 --> 00:59:48.959 Because the question,

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:48.959 --> 00:59:51.254 like empirically it, is great.

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:51.254 --> 00:59:54.326 What would a vision that allowed

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:54.326 --> 00:59:57.227 this look like that did not?

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:57.230 --> 00:59:59.875 Right that did not compromise patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

00:59:59.875 --> 01:00:02.305 care that didn't offload work on,

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:02.310 --> 01:00:03.214 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:03.214 --> 01:00:04.850 and burden others because.

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:04.850 --> 01:00:05.410 For me,

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:05.410 --> 01:00:07.370 one of the real this really gets

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:07.431 --> 01:00:09.671 at one of the real tensions and

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:09.671 --> 01:00:11.321 challenges between fewer like designing

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:11.321 --> 01:00:13.519 from the ground up a system that

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:13.519 --> 01:00:15.688 allowed this with the commensurate

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:15.688 --> 01:00:18.460 laws that allowed that allowed it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:18.460 --> 01:00:19.996 I think it would look very

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:19.996 --> 01:00:21.579 differently than it does right now,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:21.580 --> 01:00:23.410 and I've been part of conversations.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:23.410 --> 01:00:25.282 People who kind of get to the point
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:25.282 --> 01:00:27.282 of just like throwing up their hands
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:27.282 --> 01:00:29.360 because a lawyer has told them well,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:29.360 --> 01:00:30.896 you can't ask, or you can't do this,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:30.900 --> 01:00:33.035 or you can't do that. So you know.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:33.035 --> 01:00:35.345 And then what does it become?
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:35.350 --> 01:00:37.492 You know there there are real
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:37.492 --> 01:00:39.370 inequities and then and unfairness
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:39.370 --> 01:00:42.370 built into the system so that that's I.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:42.370 --> 01:00:44.435 I mean I'm truly curious if you've
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:44.435 --> 01:00:46.598 seen you know a version of this
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:46.598 --> 01:00:48.915 that and you think functions in a
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:48.915 --> 01:00:51.130 way that is especially seamless
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:00:51.130 --> 01:00:52.902 seamless both operationally internally

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:00:52.910 --> 01:00:55.652 to the clinicians but also that
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:00:55.652 --> 01:01:00.658 does not give patients the the.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:00.660 --> 01:01:02.778 The experience of being, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:02.780 --> 01:01:05.126 refused care or told they're wrong,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:05.130 --> 01:01:06.326 or you know not,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:06.326 --> 01:01:08.885 not even able to have a discussion
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:08.885 --> 01:01:10.958 with accurate information,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:10.960 --> 01:01:12.545 because these are all things
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:12.545 --> 01:01:13.813 that that do happen,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:13.820 --> 01:01:16.276 so that's that's that's one question I have,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:16.280 --> 01:01:18.608 and I'm also curious.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:18.610 --> 01:01:19.708 You know, I.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:19.708 --> 01:01:20.806 I think it's.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:20.810 --> 01:01:24.350 I understand intuitively why the
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321
01:01:24.350 --> 01:01:25.766 argument emerges.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:25.770 --> 01:01:26.086 You know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:26.086 --> 01:01:26.718 as you were saying,
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:26.720 --> 01:01:29.582 people have made the argument that
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:29.582 --> 01:01:32.257 if you prohibit conscience objection
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:32.257 --> 01:01:35.009 that you're negatively influencing
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:35.010 --> 01:01:37.370 who enters the profession and
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:37.370 --> 01:01:39.730 negatively influencing kind of the
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:39.811 --> 01:01:43.171 relationship or connection between a
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:43.171 --> 01:01:45.187 professional integrity professional
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:45.187 --> 01:01:47.270 responsibility and morality.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:47.270 --> 01:01:50.638 But what's curious to me is that it.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:50.640 --> 01:01:52.773 And to me it seems the opposite is true.
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:52.780 --> 01:01:55.980 Is that by allowing kind of a constant
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:55.980 --> 01:01:58.823 sort of unfettered and unsupervised
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:01:58.823 --> 01:02:02.094 opt out situation that's actually
NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:02:02.094 --> 01:02:05.379 harming elements of professional integrity?

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:02:05.380 --> 01:02:09.256 Whereas sort of saying at the

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:02:09.256 --> 01:02:11.840 outset these are expectations,

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:02:11.840 --> 01:02:12.112 doesn't?

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:02:12.112 --> 01:02:13.200 I guess to me,

NOTE Confidence: 0.67089321

01:02:13.200 --> 01:02:14.910 like I understand the intuitive appeal,

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:14.910 --> 01:02:16.520 but on on pushing it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:16.520 --> 01:02:18.739 it doesn't quite strike me as right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:18.740 --> 01:02:19.940 and I guess the analogy

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:19.940 --> 01:02:21.140 because it was brought up.

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:21.140 --> 01:02:23.822 Right, if I sincerely morally opposed

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:23.822 --> 01:02:26.006 eating meat and factory farming

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:26.006 --> 01:02:28.841 and all the rest like I don't get a

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:28.921 --> 01:02:31.302 job at the slaughterhouse, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:31.302 --> 01:02:33.190 But should this slaughterhouse

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:33.190 --> 01:02:36.031 actually want to employ like me

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:36.031 --> 01:02:38.056 feel like anti factory farming,
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:38.060 --> 01:02:40.516 anti meat person in in the sense that
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:40.516 --> 01:02:42.546 the food industry might ultimately
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:42.546 --> 01:02:44.796 benefit and I realized it's,
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:44.800 --> 01:02:48.170 you know, it's a philosophical,
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:48.170 --> 01:02:48.966 philosophical hypothetical,
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:48.966 --> 01:02:51.354 but I do think it gets.
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:51.360 --> 01:02:53.978 But it it's curious to me the
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:53.978 --> 01:02:56.025 way arguments have emerged that
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:56.025 --> 01:02:59.650 tend to assume that refusal
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:02:59.650 --> 01:03:01.906 should be understood to be good,
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:03:01.910 --> 01:03:04.997 and I guess I I don't find
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:03:04.997 --> 01:03:06.320 that particularly compelling
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:03:06.409 --> 01:03:08.215 when empirically we see,
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:03:08.215 --> 01:03:11.185 we see inequities and we see
NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:03:11.185 --> 01:03:13.229 interference with patient care,

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:03:13.230 --> 01:03:14.602 so I just I'm.

NOTE Confidence: 0.798179322

01:03:14.602 --> 01:03:16.317 I'm just curious your answers,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:16.990 --> 01:03:21.380 I think. Is it OK if I go exactly so?

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:21.380 --> 01:03:23.676 So I think you're asking the key questions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:23.680 --> 01:03:26.320 and I'm going to give you an example

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:26.320 --> 01:03:29.559 of a system that I think works well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:29.560 --> 01:03:31.640 I, I know that there are some obstetricians

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:31.640 --> 01:03:34.093 in the audience or at least one that I saw,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:34.100 --> 01:03:36.179 so they can tell me I'm wrong,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:36.180 --> 01:03:38.616 and this may actually be the exception

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:38.616 --> 01:03:42.075 that proves the rule so so a few years ago

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:42.075 --> 01:03:44.438 he owned Heaven Hospital basically merged

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:44.438 --> 01:03:47.236 with a Catholic hospital in New Haven.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:47.236 --> 01:03:49.256 The hospital See Rapids which

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:49.256 --> 01:03:51.800 is now called our same reveals.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:51.800 --> 01:03:59.612 Campus and part of the deal was that for.
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:03:59.620 --> 01:04:02.205 Reproductive care that potentially would
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:02.205 --> 01:04:05.587 interfere with with Catholic law would have
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:05.587 --> 01:04:08.475 to take place on the York Street campus.
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:08.480 --> 01:04:09.740 So even to this day,
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:09.740 --> 01:04:13.206 many years after we merged to my knowledge,
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:13.206 --> 01:04:16.572 if if you need to have a termination
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:16.572 --> 01:04:19.574 of pregnancy or even get birth
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:19.574 --> 01:04:20.188 control prescriptions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:20.188 --> 01:04:22.360 I think it occurs on one campus
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:22.360 --> 01:04:23.436 and not the other.
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:23.440 --> 01:04:25.740 Now this is, I presume,
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:25.740 --> 01:04:27.850 a relatively minor inconvenience when
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:27.850 --> 01:04:30.670 the hospitals are six blocks away from.
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:30.670 --> 01:04:33.070 Each other and the hospital that
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:33.070 --> 01:04:35.766 provides the care and the city is

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:35.766 --> 01:04:38.730 filled with physicians who are able to

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:38.730 --> 01:04:41.010 provide patients with standard care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:41.010 --> 01:04:43.120 But that said, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:43.120 --> 01:04:45.307 there is one local place that has the rules.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:45.310 --> 01:04:47.669 It's well known and and the system

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:47.669 --> 01:04:49.570 has been set up, but I,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:49.570 --> 01:04:51.370 but I think you're right though,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:51.370 --> 01:04:54.958 that that isn't necessarily the way

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:54.958 --> 01:04:57.711 it would normally happen, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:57.711 --> 01:04:58.433 Like you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:04:58.433 --> 01:05:01.160 you could potentially find your way in a.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:01.160 --> 01:05:03.666 In a big you can be in a town where

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:03.666 --> 01:05:06.462 the only hospital is a hospital

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:06.462 --> 01:05:08.992 that refuses to provide reproductive

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:08.992 --> 01:05:11.994 care and the nearest place might

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:11.994 --> 01:05:14.000 be very very far away,
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:14.000 --> 01:05:16.310 and so the question then becomes
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:16.385 --> 01:05:19.100 what do you what do you do now?
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:19.100 --> 01:05:22.232 And and I think that if I take
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:22.232 --> 01:05:24.405 characterize what I think are two
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:24.405 --> 01:05:26.575 arguments are in terms of putting
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:26.575 --> 01:05:29.335 it into a category I I think that
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:29.340 --> 01:05:31.167 I am trying to make the case.
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:31.170 --> 01:05:34.476 That that there's a principle here, right?
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:34.476 --> 01:05:36.972 Like the principle being that if
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:36.972 --> 01:05:40.525 that if a clinician has a a deeply
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:40.525 --> 01:05:43.420 held moral belief that they should,
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:43.420 --> 01:05:46.216 that that belief should be respected,
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:46.220 --> 01:05:49.874 with the caveat that that there are.
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:49.880 --> 01:05:52.328 There are hazards that need to
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:52.328 --> 01:05:53.552 be accounted for.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:53.560 --> 01:05:55.285 And I think you've beautifully

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:55.285 --> 01:05:56.760 outlined those hazards, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:56.760 --> 01:05:59.840 Like all the things that could happen

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:05:59.840 --> 01:06:03.510 if if this whole system is at hoc and

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:03.510 --> 01:06:06.692 and and we don't have a system to monitor it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:06.692 --> 01:06:09.036 and we don't have even commonly

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:09.036 --> 01:06:11.228 accepted definitions of what

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:11.228 --> 01:06:13.910 constitutes a moral belief or what

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:13.910 --> 01:06:15.614 consequences there would be,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:15.620 --> 01:06:16.144 you know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:16.144 --> 01:06:17.978 And then the the the last thing

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:17.978 --> 01:06:19.560 that I think you mentioned,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:19.560 --> 01:06:21.560 I I I I basically agree with you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:21.560 --> 01:06:24.240 but I I want to get back into the issue.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:24.240 --> 01:06:25.054 Reproductive care,

NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:25.054 --> 01:06:27.496 which again is not my field,
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:27.500 --> 01:06:29.642 but I think it's I think
NOTE Confidence: 0.85333557375

01:06:29.642 --> 01:06:31.070 it's a helpful paradigm
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:31.144 --> 01:06:32.260 to think about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:32.260 --> 01:06:35.963 I think it would be ridiculous for
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:35.963 --> 01:06:39.640 somebody opposed to abortion to try to
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:39.640 --> 01:06:42.620 get a job at Planned Parenthood, right?
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:42.620 --> 01:06:45.319 Knowing that that is fundamentally
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:45.320 --> 01:06:48.290 what that organization is about.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:48.290 --> 01:06:52.482 That that said, I would also think that
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:52.482 --> 01:06:55.859 knowing that we have a sizable portion
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:55.859 --> 01:06:58.913 of our population of physicians who
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:06:58.913 --> 01:07:01.449 are personally opposed to abortion,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:07:01.450 --> 01:07:03.352 that I would hate to think
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:07:03.352 --> 01:07:06.165 that none of them would be able
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:07:06.165 --> 01:07:08.740 to go through OBGYN training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:08.740 --> 01:07:12.772 Because they would not be able to opt out
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:12.772 --> 01:07:16.900 of of having to perform procedures OK,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:16.900 --> 01:07:18.940 and because you say, well,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:18.940 --> 01:07:21.460 you can you even get through OBGYN
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:21.460 --> 01:07:23.819 training at a place like Yale.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:23.820 --> 01:07:24.798 If you're going to say I,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:24.800 --> 01:07:29.360 I'm not willing to to participate
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:29.360 --> 01:07:32.460 in this aspect of training,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:32.460 --> 01:07:33.760 which presumably would be the
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:33.760 --> 01:07:35.356 consequence if you said that they're
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:35.356 --> 01:07:36.820 not allowed to to have doubts.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:36.820 --> 01:07:38.780 So a lot of people would would.
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:38.780 --> 01:07:40.814 Afford not have access to that
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:40.814 --> 01:07:42.953 specialty which which I think in
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769
01:07:42.953 --> 01:07:44.719 turn might hurt patients, right?
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:07:44.719 --> 01:07:47.092 If you knew that that lots of
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:07:47.092 --> 01:07:48.560 people couldn't enter that,
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:07:48.560 --> 01:07:50.312 enter that specialty so so that
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:07:50.312 --> 01:07:52.280 that would be my response to
NOTE Confidence: 0.864085449230769

01:07:52.280 --> 01:07:54.110 the points that you're making.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:07:55.240 --> 01:07:56.672 And thank you both,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:07:56.672 --> 01:07:59.240 you know I I would just add,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:07:59.240 --> 01:08:00.836 I think there are a couple key
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:00.836 --> 01:08:02.420 differences in in sort of teasing
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:02.474 --> 01:08:03.924 apart some of these examples
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:03.924 --> 01:08:05.374 that have been brought up.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:05.380 --> 01:08:08.670 You know first the first one being
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:08.670 --> 01:08:10.850 that that you know abortion is
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:10.850 --> 01:08:12.991 healthcare and I think there's a
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:12.991 --> 01:08:14.796 big difference between someone who
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:14.796 --> 01:08:16.727 would never provide an abortion

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:16.727 --> 01:08:18.415 under any circumstances versus

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:18.415 --> 01:08:21.015 someone who has nuanced views about

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:21.015 --> 01:08:23.925 abortion and say would feel deeply

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:23.925 --> 01:08:26.170 uncomfortable terminating a pregnancy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:26.170 --> 01:08:28.648 That were just because a child of

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:28.648 --> 01:08:30.670 a different gender were desired,

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:30.670 --> 01:08:33.184 for example and and it seems

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:33.184 --> 01:08:35.284 it seems reasonable even even

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:35.284 --> 01:08:37.318 if I don't agree with it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:37.320 --> 01:08:38.145 And you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:38.145 --> 01:08:39.795 I will fully disclose that that

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:39.795 --> 01:08:41.660 I I am staunchly pro choice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:41.660 --> 01:08:44.026 But you know that that there are

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:44.026 --> 01:08:45.851 nuanced opinions out there and

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:45.851 --> 01:08:47.716 that that someone who objected,

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:47.720 --> 01:08:49.296 perhaps to you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:49.296 --> 01:08:51.660 devaluing babies of one or fetuses.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:51.660 --> 01:08:53.928 I should say of 1 gender versus
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:53.928 --> 01:08:56.021 another might might have have a
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:56.021 --> 01:08:57.771 professional a concern that that
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:57.771 --> 01:08:59.705 violates a professional duty of
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:08:59.705 --> 01:09:02.039 theirs to to terminate that fetus.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:02.040 --> 01:09:04.308 That's very different from someone who
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:04.308 --> 01:09:07.270 would be unwilling to terminate a pregnancy.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:07.270 --> 01:09:09.055 When the mother's life is at risk
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:09.055 --> 01:09:10.775 and I actually would argue that
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:10.775 --> 01:09:12.563 that someone who would never be
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:12.563 --> 01:09:14.499 willing to terminate under any
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:14.499 --> 01:09:15.684 circumstances probably isn't,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:15.690 --> 01:09:18.420 isn't best suited to to providing
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:18.420 --> 01:09:20.238 reproductive care because I and and

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:20.238 --> 01:09:21.980 I think again the the intent matters
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:21.980 --> 01:09:23.590 and the consequences matter in.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:23.590 --> 01:09:26.062 In this case, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:26.062 --> 01:09:27.718 and then the the other question
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:27.720 --> 01:09:30.464 about contraception at I I I will
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:30.464 --> 01:09:33.130 say and and I you know this,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:33.130 --> 01:09:33.401 this.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:33.401 --> 01:09:35.027 This may be a hot take,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:35.030 --> 01:09:38.014 but I don't really see any any real.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:38.020 --> 01:09:40.129 Professional duty objection
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:40.129 --> 01:09:42.238 to providing contraception.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:42.240 --> 01:09:44.328 You know if if you have a personal
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:44.328 --> 01:09:46.018 objection to non procreative sex,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:46.020 --> 01:09:46.642 that's fine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:09:46.642 --> 01:09:48.819 You don't have to participate in it,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:48.820 --> 01:09:50.549 but I'm not sure where there's a
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:50.549 --> 01:09:52.096 professional duty in the practice of
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:52.096 --> 01:09:53.608 medicine or nursing that says that
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:53.608 --> 01:09:55.538 you you need to make sure other people
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:55.538 --> 01:09:57.452 don't engage in that, so I don't.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:57.452 --> 01:09:59.680 I don't actually think there's any valid,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:09:59.680 --> 01:10:03.859 conscientious objection to approach to,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:03.859 --> 01:10:06.524 saying to denying someone access
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:06.524 --> 01:10:08.499 to contraception that that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:08.500 --> 01:10:09.920 To me, seems deeply unethical.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:09.920 --> 01:10:10.248 Now,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:10.248 --> 01:10:12.216 if someone requests a method of
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:12.216 --> 01:10:14.119 contraception that could cause them harm,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:14.120 --> 01:10:14.658 for example,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:14.658 --> 01:10:16.272 someone you know with a significant
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:16.272 --> 01:10:18.059 history of venous thromboembolic disease

NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:18.059 --> 01:10:20.054 and they request hormonal contraception,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:20.060 --> 01:10:21.110 that's going to increase their risk.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:21.110 --> 01:10:23.120 That's a different story right now
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:23.120 --> 01:10:25.219 that now you have this professional
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:25.219 --> 01:10:27.295 duty of first do no harm.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:27.300 --> 01:10:29.382 If your concern is that providing
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:29.382 --> 01:10:31.010 a certain medication might put
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:31.010 --> 01:10:32.870 your patient at at grave harm,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:32.870 --> 01:10:33.818 that's very different.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:33.818 --> 01:10:35.398 But just saying I don't.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:35.400 --> 01:10:35.794 You know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:35.794 --> 01:10:37.370 I don't want you to have this because
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:37.415 --> 01:10:39.007 I don't think that it's right to have.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:39.010 --> 01:10:40.410 That's when you're not intending
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364
01:10:40.410 --> 01:10:41.530 to bear a child.
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:41.530 --> 01:10:43.042 I don't frankly think that that's
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:43.042 --> 01:10:44.908 any of our business as as physicians,
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:44.910 --> 01:10:46.410 and there's really no professional
NOTE Confidence: 0.845945393636364

01:10:46.410 --> 01:10:47.910 duty that that can justify
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:10:47.964 --> 01:10:49.870 that, so I think it's really
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:10:49.870 --> 01:10:52.010 important to sort of tease apart.
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:10:52.010 --> 01:10:54.230 You know, again, not where where
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:10:54.230 --> 01:10:55.855 that objection is seated is
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:10:55.855 --> 01:10:57.480 that seated in ones professional
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:10:57.541 --> 01:10:59.436 morality or ones personal morality?
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:10:59.440 --> 01:11:01.582 Because we, we all have a duty to to
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:11:01.582 --> 01:11:03.486 uphold the morals of our profession,
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:11:03.490 --> 01:11:05.374 which sometimes can be interpreted in
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:11:05.374 --> 01:11:07.769 different ways as as doctor Stall stated,
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:11:07.770 --> 01:11:09.900 but. But if it's not,
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546

01:11:09.900 --> 01:11:11.740 if it's seated in our own personal morality,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546
01:11:11.740 --> 01:11:13.959 that really is is very much not
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546
01:11:13.959 --> 01:11:16.300 related to those professional duties.
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546
01:11:16.300 --> 01:11:18.901 I think we have to be very careful not
NOTE Confidence: 0.821186265454546
01:11:18.901 --> 01:11:21.739 to force our beliefs onto onto others.
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:24.200 --> 01:11:26.732 My colleague Doug White, who's written
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:26.732 --> 01:11:29.860 about this topic in a number of places,
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:29.860 --> 01:11:32.420 address one of the important issues that you
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:32.420 --> 01:11:34.868 brought up and he said that conscientious
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:34.868 --> 01:11:37.721 objection should be a shield, not a sword.
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:37.721 --> 01:11:40.650 And what he meant by that is so,
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:40.650 --> 01:11:44.079 so you you you have no right to interfere
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:44.079 --> 01:11:47.369 with the patient's ability to get care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:47.370 --> 01:11:49.255 Even while you might want
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:49.255 --> 01:11:50.754 to recuse yourself, right?
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889
01:11:50.754 --> 01:11:54.949 So so if I wasn't in the business of of
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:11:54.949 --> 01:11:57.430 writing contraception prescriptions,
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:11:57.430 --> 01:11:59.590 I would it would not be appropriate for
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:11:59.590 --> 01:12:01.616 me to to tell to prevent that patient
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:01.616 --> 01:12:03.966 from going to somebody else who who
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:03.966 --> 01:12:06.300 could give them that prescription.
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:06.300 --> 01:12:08.352 And, and I think that's an
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:08.352 --> 01:12:09.036 important distinction.
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:09.040 --> 01:12:11.224 To make right this is this is
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:11.224 --> 01:12:13.790 about you as a clinician who
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:13.790 --> 01:12:15.535 feels personally morally opposed.
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:15.535 --> 01:12:19.090 It's you don't have a right to prevent the
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:19.172 --> 01:12:22.172 patient from getting standard medical care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.838586498888889

01:12:22.172 --> 01:12:24.428 so that's the argument I'm making.
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:12:26.110 --> 01:12:26.872 But it's different.
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:12:26.872 --> 01:12:29.580 You know if it's one thing if someone
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:12:29.580 --> 01:12:31.382 never prescribes contraception, for example.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:31.382 --> 01:12:33.104 So again, as a as a cardiologist,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:33.110 --> 01:12:34.234 I don't prescribe contraception.
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:34.234 --> 01:12:36.630 If a patient asks me to prescribe it,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:36.630 --> 01:12:38.853 I will say no, but that's not because I
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:38.853 --> 01:12:40.866 have a problem with contraception because
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:40.866 --> 01:12:43.310 it's outside of my scope of practice.
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:43.310 --> 01:12:46.068 Just like I say no to antibiotics,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:46.070 --> 01:12:47.480 you know, unless someone has
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:47.480 --> 01:12:48.890 a prosthetic valve and it's,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:48.890 --> 01:12:50.786 you know, before a dental cleaning,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:50.790 --> 01:12:51.794 you know so that,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:51.794 --> 01:12:53.049 but that's very different than.
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:53.050 --> 01:12:55.948 Let's say I'm a PCP and I.
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:55.950 --> 01:12:57.914 Let's say I prescribe
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:12:57.914 --> 01:12:59.878 contraceptives to married people,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:12:59.880 --> 01:13:01.840 but I don't think that I should prescribe

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:01.840 --> 01:13:03.483 them to unmarried people because I

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:03.483 --> 01:13:05.508 don't think that because I I personally

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:05.508 --> 01:13:07.434 object to sex outside of marriage,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:07.440 --> 01:13:09.694 or let's say that you know and

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:09.694 --> 01:13:11.880 and any number of those things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:11.880 --> 01:13:14.898 Those are also very different circumstances,

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:14.900 --> 01:13:16.668 so you know, I think that I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:16.668 --> 01:13:18.237 it's it's important to sort of.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:18.240 --> 01:13:20.358 Keep in mind you know what?

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:20.360 --> 01:13:23.405 What are the duties that play that

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:23.405 --> 01:13:25.720 are informing how how we act.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:25.720 --> 01:13:27.124 Let me I'm going to get into some of

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:27.124 --> 01:13:28.576 the questions just because we're we.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:28.580 --> 01:13:30.596 I do want to make sure that our

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334

01:13:30.596 --> 01:13:32.539 audience has a chance to participate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:13:32.540 --> 01:13:34.180 So our first question,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:13:34.180 --> 01:13:35.000 Doctor Stahl.
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:13:35.000 --> 01:13:35.992 What place does implicit,
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:13:35.992 --> 01:13:37.480 racial or ethnic bias play in
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:13:37.533 --> 01:13:38.781 those who choose to object to
NOTE Confidence: 0.886112215333334
01:13:38.781 --> 01:13:40.020 giving care to a patient?
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:43.290 --> 01:13:45.894 I think this is a great question
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:45.894 --> 01:13:49.113 and also a troubling element of not
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:49.113 --> 01:13:50.528 just contemporary, but you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:50.530 --> 01:13:52.444 historical healthcare in the United States
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:52.444 --> 01:13:54.988 and and I think what's so challenging.
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:54.990 --> 01:13:56.365 Of course about implicit bias
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:56.365 --> 01:13:58.010 is is that people are not,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:58.010 --> 01:13:59.546 of course, standing up and saying,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538
01:13:59.550 --> 01:14:01.410 of course, because I'm racist,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:01.410 --> 01:14:04.497 I will not care for this person
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:04.497 --> 01:14:07.170 or because I'm a homophobic.
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:07.170 --> 01:14:09.907 I'm not going to prescribe prep for,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:09.910 --> 01:14:13.300 you know, to prevent HIV.
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:13.300 --> 01:14:15.829 And so one of the things that I think
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:15.829 --> 01:14:18.330 really tricky and and and Doctor Siegel
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:18.330 --> 01:14:20.528 mentioned is that these kinds of
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:20.528 --> 01:14:22.964 objections can be used as a smokescreen.
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:22.970 --> 01:14:25.378 They can be used as a sword,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:25.380 --> 01:14:26.888 and so you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:26.888 --> 01:14:29.731 as we think about the systems of
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:29.731 --> 01:14:32.683 healthcare and the interlocking ways in
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:32.683 --> 01:14:36.284 which you know professional training,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:36.284 --> 01:14:37.836 professional expectations,
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:37.840 --> 01:14:40.660 and then institutional standards work.
NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:40.660 --> 01:14:43.084 I think we have to be really attentive

NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:43.084 --> 01:14:45.647 to the ways in which implicit bias.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931600548461538

01:14:45.650 --> 01:14:50.950 Is. Often undergirding if not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:14:53.020 --> 01:14:55.456 You know, under girding both some of

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:14:55.456 --> 01:14:57.884 the choices people make and then the

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:14:57.884 --> 01:15:00.179 outcomes that derive from them and and

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:00.179 --> 01:15:02.456 it's why I think we have to be very,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:02.460 --> 01:15:04.595 very careful about assuming that

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:04.595 --> 01:15:07.708 you know any claim that that someone

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:07.708 --> 01:15:10.396 says is moral is inherently moral.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:10.400 --> 01:15:13.040 And because I do think it both has

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:13.040 --> 01:15:15.940 been and continues to be used in ways

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:15.940 --> 01:15:20.480 that are discriminatory and, again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:20.480 --> 01:15:22.530 not necessarily because the person.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:22.530 --> 01:15:24.970 Is ever going to claim it or even realize it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:24.970 --> 01:15:27.556 Which is, of course what makes

NOTE Confidence: 0.867370374666667

01:15:27.556 --> 01:15:29.680 implicit bias even more challenging.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:30.640 --> 01:15:34.649 Absolutely thank you, the next question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:34.649 --> 01:15:36.827 It's actually there are a few
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:36.827 --> 01:15:38.985 questions that I'm going to combine
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:38.985 --> 01:15:40.700 for Doctor Siegel, which is.
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:40.700 --> 01:15:42.740 Could you expound a bit on
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:42.740 --> 01:15:43.420 conscientious objection,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:43.420 --> 01:15:45.256 perceived feudal care?
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:45.256 --> 01:15:46.480 And similarly,
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:46.480 --> 01:15:47.878 I'm wondering your thoughts on cases
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:47.878 --> 01:15:49.652 when the patient is unable to make
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:49.652 --> 01:15:50.982 their own decisions and surrogate
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:50.982 --> 01:15:52.342 decision makers are felt to be
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:52.342 --> 01:15:53.512 pursuing care that is futile and
NOTE Confidence: 0.9530836333333333

01:15:53.520 --> 01:15:55.190 medical providers want to object.
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:15:57.490 --> 01:16:00.122 Yeah, so that that's that's that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:00.122 --> 01:16:01.610 that's dominated important our

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:01.610 --> 01:16:03.470 part of my professional career.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:03.470 --> 01:16:06.846 So I thank the questioner for asking that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:06.850 --> 01:16:08.782 you know, at least from the

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:08.782 --> 01:16:09.748 critical care perspective,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:09.750 --> 01:16:13.033 the approach to request for feudal care

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:13.033 --> 01:16:16.627 have been placed in a a separate category.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:16.630 --> 01:16:20.489 And while I think you could think

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:20.489 --> 01:16:22.584 about this from the perspective

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:22.584 --> 01:16:25.660 of having a deep seated religious.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:25.660 --> 01:16:28.410 Or even secular moral objection

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:28.410 --> 01:16:30.652 to to fetal care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:30.652 --> 01:16:33.436 You know, I don't think that

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:33.436 --> 01:16:35.092 that necessarily stems from

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:35.092 --> 01:16:37.140 a religious or moral belief,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:37.140 --> 01:16:40.299 and as much as it stems from concerns about

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:40.299 --> 01:16:43.230 being asked to provide non standard care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:43.230 --> 01:16:46.368 So for example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:46.370 --> 01:16:49.706 to provide CPR when you know it's not

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:49.706 --> 01:16:53.086 going to work or operate on a patient

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:53.086 --> 01:16:56.810 for cancer when the cancer is incurable.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:56.810 --> 01:16:57.818 And So what?

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:16:57.818 --> 01:17:00.614 What people in my field have done is

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:00.614 --> 01:17:03.169 they've come up with a really almost

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:03.169 --> 01:17:05.231 a parallel set of recommendations

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:05.231 --> 01:17:08.150 for dealing with what is now often

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:08.150 --> 01:17:10.362 called potentially inappropriate care

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:10.362 --> 01:17:14.010 and and so basically the idea is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:14.010 --> 01:17:17.170 That there would be a system for asking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:17.170 --> 01:17:17.926 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:17.926 --> 01:17:21.169 is the care being provided or

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:21.169 --> 01:17:23.278 being requested standard?

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:23.280 --> 01:17:25.200 And if not then it goes

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:25.200 --> 01:17:26.780 down one pathway if it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:26.780 --> 01:17:28.565 If the care being asked for was

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:28.565 --> 01:17:30.663 standard then it might be more about

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:30.663 --> 01:17:32.258 what we're speaking about tonight.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:32.260 --> 01:17:35.025 So a request for an abortion or

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:35.025 --> 01:17:37.789 or request to have life support

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:37.790 --> 01:17:41.094 withdrawn is is actually well in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:41.094 --> 01:17:43.828 domain of standard care in the in

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:43.828 --> 01:17:45.308 the guidelines from the Americans.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:45.310 --> 01:17:46.948 Ask society I didn't show it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:46.950 --> 01:17:49.254 but there was actually an algorithm

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:49.254 --> 01:17:50.790 that specifically addresses this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:50.790 --> 01:17:52.545 Questioners question OK,

NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:52.545 --> 01:17:56.055 which is step one you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:56.060 --> 01:17:58.220 is the request standard for,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:17:58.220 --> 01:18:00.080 not if it's not standard,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:18:00.080 --> 01:18:01.300 it goes down one pathway,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:18:01.300 --> 01:18:02.860 which is like this utility pathway.
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:18:02.860 --> 01:18:04.056 If it is standard,
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:18:04.056 --> 01:18:05.850 then the question is is the
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:18:05.918 --> 01:18:07.768 objection seated in some moral
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:18:07.768 --> 01:18:10.294 objection so so that would be the
NOTE Confidence: 0.760657498

01:18:10.294 --> 01:18:12.100 the way I would approach that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.826639226666667

01:18:12.960 --> 01:18:16.020 Great thank you. This next question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.826639226666667

01:18:16.020 --> 01:18:18.009 I will throw it out to either of you
NOTE Confidence: 0.826639226666667

01:18:18.009 --> 01:18:20.367 or both of you given the codification
NOTE Confidence: 0.826639226666667

01:18:20.367 --> 01:18:22.380 of rights to conscientious objection.
NOTE Confidence: 0.826639226666667

01:18:22.380 --> 01:18:24.456 Are there currently any states or
NOTE Confidence: 0.826639226666667

01:18:24.456 --> 01:18:25.840 institutions where declaration of

NOTE Confidence: 0.826639226666667
01:18:25.896 --> 01:18:27.472 conscientious objection is part
NOTE Confidence: 0.826639226666667
01:18:27.472 --> 01:18:29.048 of the credentialing process?
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:31.770 --> 01:18:34.538 Well, I'm not 100% sure what sort of
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:34.538 --> 01:18:37.828 part of the credentialing process means,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:37.830 --> 01:18:39.150 but what I will say,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:39.150 --> 01:18:42.094 and this is alluded to in Doctor Siegel's
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:42.094 --> 01:18:44.848 point about the Yale Hospital situation,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:44.850 --> 01:18:47.646 is that in Catholic healthcare and
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:47.650 --> 01:18:49.160 Catholic hospitals are run according
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:49.160 --> 01:18:50.670 to the ethical and religious
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:50.721 --> 01:18:52.349 directives for Catholic Healthcare,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:52.350 --> 01:18:53.960 which is a document that's
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:53.960 --> 01:18:55.570 now in its sixth addition.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:55.570 --> 01:18:57.957 So it too has changed over time,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:18:57.960 --> 01:19:01.902 but it does have very specific rules.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:01.902 --> 01:19:03.470 Not just about abortion,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:03.470 --> 01:19:05.002 but around sterilization around
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:05.002 --> 01:19:08.168 end of life care and it is part
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:08.168 --> 01:19:09.748 of an employment contract,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:09.750 --> 01:19:11.670 so like this gets into the
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:11.670 --> 01:19:12.630 tricky legal terrain,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:12.630 --> 01:19:15.790 which is that a per the church amendment,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:15.790 --> 01:19:17.914 conscientious providers of abortion
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:17.914 --> 01:19:20.038 or sterilization actually should
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:20.038 --> 01:19:22.612 be protected by law in the sense
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:22.612 --> 01:19:24.520 of they shouldn't not be hired.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:24.520 --> 01:19:25.590 They should not be fired.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:25.590 --> 01:19:27.462 They should not be at face any sort of
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:27.462 --> 01:19:29.024 employment repercussions if they were
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:29.024 --> 01:19:30.654 saying moonlighting at Planned Parenthood,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:19:30.660 --> 01:19:31.024 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:31.024 --> 01:19:32.480 They they worked for.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:32.480 --> 01:19:34.410 Saint Vincent's and Moon and,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:34.410 --> 01:19:36.240 you know, took some shifts elsewhere.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:36.240 --> 01:19:37.230 They shouldn't.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:37.230 --> 01:19:40.200 According to federal law face consequences,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:40.200 --> 01:19:42.888 but employment law changes the dynamic
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:42.888 --> 01:19:45.235 and the employment contract which
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:45.235 --> 01:19:47.650 requires adherence to the ethical
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:47.650 --> 01:19:49.820 and religious directives which then,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:49.820 --> 01:19:51.260 and there's a directive.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:51.260 --> 01:19:53.240 One of the directives is
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:53.240 --> 01:19:56.388 about that any sort of.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:56.390 --> 01:19:58.215 Connection with abortion care is
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:19:58.215 --> 01:20:00.730 under this kind of scandal provision,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286
01:20:00.730 --> 01:20:03.817 so so it's multi layered and complicated,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:03.820 --> 01:20:06.643 but that's a space where the
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:06.643 --> 01:20:09.508 requirement to adhere to the
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:09.508 --> 01:20:11.800 ethical and religious directives.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:11.800 --> 01:20:15.983 It is a way of sort of forcing
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:15.983 --> 01:20:18.664 a type of what might in other
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:18.664 --> 01:20:20.804 contexts be conscious objection to
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:20.804 --> 01:20:23.814 a practice or an other you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:23.820 --> 01:20:27.194 or sort of forces a stance on
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:27.200 --> 01:20:29.818 on care that is not tied to
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:29.818 --> 01:20:30.940 the professional standards,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:30.940 --> 01:20:32.960 but rather to the churches.
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:32.960 --> 01:20:36.474 I'm not 100% sure if I understood
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:36.474 --> 01:20:38.284 the question in terms of what
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:38.284 --> 01:20:39.289 the questioner was getting at,
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:39.290 --> 01:20:41.408 but that's a place where we
NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:41.408 --> 01:20:42.820 can see an institution.

NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:42.820 --> 01:20:45.492 Requiring something separate from,

NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:45.492 --> 01:20:46.828 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:46.830 --> 01:20:48.865 being licensed and you know

NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:48.865 --> 01:20:50.900 being board certified or other

NOTE Confidence: 0.914074815714286

01:20:50.900 --> 01:20:54.208 types of employment conditions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:20:56.160 --> 01:20:59.274 You know, I think I can only speak to

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:20:59.274 --> 01:21:02.046 the issue of end of life care in the ICU,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:02.050 --> 01:21:05.954 which is the world that I live in.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:05.960 --> 01:21:08.844 I have no recollection of ever being

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:08.844 --> 01:21:11.852 asked a question of about whether I

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:11.852 --> 01:21:14.510 would ever refuse to withdraw life

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:14.595 --> 01:21:17.192 sustaining therapy from a patient,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:17.192 --> 01:21:19.376 and that is such standard care,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:19.380 --> 01:21:22.590 you know like so, but but I I could at

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:22.680 --> 01:21:26.560 least imagine that somebody on our faculty.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:26.560 --> 01:21:28.276 Could come from a religious background
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:28.276 --> 01:21:30.110 where they would be uncomfortable
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:30.110 --> 01:21:31.366 doing something like that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:31.366 --> 01:21:32.308 Like what if?
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:32.310 --> 01:21:34.970 What if we hired somebody who previously
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:34.970 --> 01:21:37.569 worked in Israel where that was never
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:37.569 --> 01:21:40.066 done and they immigrated to the United
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:40.066 --> 01:21:42.148 States and joined the Yale faculty
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:42.148 --> 01:21:46.045 and and so I actually don't know that
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:46.045 --> 01:21:49.294 we're positioned to ensure that that
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:49.294 --> 01:21:53.425 a a clinician advertises their their
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:53.425 --> 01:21:55.932 potential concerns preemptively in
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:55.932 --> 01:21:57.548 a way that would allow us to plan.
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:57.550 --> 01:21:59.130 Actually think it moreover,
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:21:59.130 --> 01:22:01.410 could become a a crisis, right?
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667

01:22:01.410 --> 01:22:03.810 Like like a patient asked for this and

NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667
01:22:03.810 --> 01:22:06.050 then hopefully one of the other members
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667
01:22:06.050 --> 01:22:08.750 of the team takes over the patients care.
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667
01:22:08.750 --> 01:22:10.628 So it would be, I think,
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667
01:22:10.630 --> 01:22:13.096 a gap in in our system that would need
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667
01:22:13.096 --> 01:22:15.649 to be addressed should that come up.
NOTE Confidence: 0.866204256666667
01:22:15.650 --> 01:22:16.080 Great,
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:16.130 --> 01:22:17.288 I got just to that point.
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:17.290 --> 01:22:19.236 I mean, it's a conversation I've had,
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:19.240 --> 01:22:21.452 particularly with chairs of
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:21.452 --> 01:22:23.664 maternal fetal medicine programs,
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:23.670 --> 01:22:24.432 particularly fellowships,
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:24.432 --> 01:22:26.718 whether or not allowed to ask
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:26.718 --> 01:22:28.389 about views on termination,
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:28.390 --> 01:22:30.889 which comes up in maternal fetal medicine.
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333
01:22:30.890 --> 01:22:31.794 And so you know.
NOTE Confidence: 0.787150403333333

01:22:31.794 --> 01:22:33.465 And this gets that kind of because
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:33.465 --> 01:22:35.561 so much is tied to employment law and
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:35.561 --> 01:22:37.665 then the perception of either you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:37.670 --> 01:22:39.590 hiring or not hiring.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:39.590 --> 01:22:41.030 For these reasons,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:41.030 --> 01:22:42.774 it gleaned the information,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:42.774 --> 01:22:45.390 at least for some hospital lawyers,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:45.390 --> 01:22:47.846 starts to seem like it might get into.
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:47.850 --> 01:22:49.950 You know setting the groundwork for
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:49.950 --> 01:22:51.350 an employment discrimination case,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:51.350 --> 01:22:53.900 so which again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:53.900 --> 01:22:56.050 I think just highlights the
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:56.050 --> 01:22:57.862 complexity of developing an
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:57.862 --> 01:22:59.686 infrastructure where the knowledge
NOTE Confidence: 0.7871504033333333

01:22:59.686 --> 01:23:01.966 and the oversight can actually.
NOTE Confidence: 0.916747835714286

01:23:04.220 --> 01:23:07.448 Emerge in a way that can be effectively.

NOTE Confidence: 0.916747835714286
01:23:07.448 --> 01:23:09.888 Handled like transparent where it
NOTE Confidence: 0.916747835714286
01:23:09.888 --> 01:23:12.986 needs to be transparent and in fact
NOTE Confidence: 0.916747835714286
01:23:12.986 --> 01:23:15.478 shielded where it needs to be shielded.
NOTE Confidence: 0.91442204
01:23:17.320 --> 01:23:20.104 Great, thank you. We have a hard
NOTE Confidence: 0.91442204
01:23:20.104 --> 01:23:22.419 stop at 6:30 so we're that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:22.420 --> 01:23:24.592 Time is rapidly approaching and so
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:24.592 --> 01:23:26.852 I think there's one quick question
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:26.852 --> 01:23:29.066 that I'm going to to address.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:29.070 --> 01:23:31.716 And then there's a final question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:31.720 --> 01:23:33.127 Sort of with an economics focus that
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:33.127 --> 01:23:34.597 I'm going to pose to both of you.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:34.600 --> 01:23:37.486 So one of the questions said,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:37.490 --> 01:23:39.527 could it not be said that physicians
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:39.527 --> 01:23:41.340 must exercise judgment in providing care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:23:41.340 --> 01:23:43.006 but they should never stand as judges
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:43.006 --> 01:23:44.558 on the behaviors of their patients?
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:44.560 --> 01:23:46.709 And well, I think that's very nicely.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:46.710 --> 01:23:48.649 That, and in most cases does apply.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:48.650 --> 01:23:50.450 I will say that you know there are certain
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:50.450 --> 01:23:52.020 patient behaviors that aren't acceptable,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:52.020 --> 01:23:53.785 namely when those those behaviors
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:53.785 --> 01:23:55.550 threaten the autonomy of others.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:55.550 --> 01:23:57.664 So one context in which I've argued
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:57.664 --> 01:23:59.240 that conscientious objection is also
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:23:59.240 --> 01:24:00.468 allowable even though different
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:00.468 --> 01:24:02.422 people may debate whether this really
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:02.422 --> 01:24:03.766 counts as contentious objection
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:03.766 --> 01:24:05.710 versus just general refusal of care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:05.710 --> 01:24:08.610 is that you know if a patient who isn't,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:08.610 --> 01:24:10.380 you know critically ill obviously and
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:10.380 --> 01:24:12.232 and to whom something terrible won't

NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:12.232 --> 01:24:14.409 happen if they aren't cared for urgently,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:14.410 --> 01:24:15.970 or someone who is, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:15.970 --> 01:24:16.966 in a mental health crisis and
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:16.966 --> 01:24:18.149 isn't aware of what they're doing,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:18.150 --> 01:24:18.738 but if.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:18.738 --> 01:24:20.502 If someone comes to the office
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:20.502 --> 01:24:23.081 and for routine visit and is being
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:23.081 --> 01:24:24.617 really abusive and violent,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:24.620 --> 01:24:26.832 I think it's within the rights of
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:26.832 --> 01:24:28.721 that clinician team to to decline
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:28.721 --> 01:24:30.176 to care for that patient.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:30.180 --> 01:24:31.380 Out of this, you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:31.380 --> 01:24:33.756 respect and concern for the safety
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:33.756 --> 01:24:36.650 of the health care team and actually
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:24:36.650 --> 01:24:38.975 violence against against healthcare workers,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:38.980 --> 01:24:39.980 particularly nurses,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:39.980 --> 01:24:43.480 is a huge problem in this country,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:43.480 --> 01:24:45.577 and so I think that you know we do.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:45.580 --> 01:24:47.146 There is certain patient behavior that
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:47.146 --> 01:24:48.888 I think we absolutely can and should.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:48.890 --> 01:24:50.614 Judge and you know,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:50.614 --> 01:24:52.769 violence and and abusive behavior
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:52.769 --> 01:24:54.892 absolutely should not be tolerated
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:54.892 --> 01:24:56.912 and our grounds for dismissal.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:56.920 --> 01:24:58.000 You know again,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:24:58.000 --> 01:25:00.052 with appropriate guardrails such as
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:00.052 --> 01:25:02.272 obviously critical illness and or
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:02.272 --> 01:25:04.562 mental illness that renders patients
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:04.562 --> 01:25:07.214 really unable to understand that what,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:07.220 --> 01:25:09.140 how they're acting is,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:09.140 --> 01:25:12.400 is is not OK, so I I see nodding,

NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:12.400 --> 01:25:13.736 I think that that's I think we can
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:13.736 --> 01:25:15.393 move on because I do want to get to
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:15.393 --> 01:25:16.819 this last question a little bit of time.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:16.820 --> 01:25:17.632 We have.
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:17.632 --> 01:25:19.662 Do you envision any implications
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:19.662 --> 01:25:20.880 of conscientious objection?
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:20.880 --> 01:25:21.669 On payment Slash,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:21.669 --> 01:25:23.510 is there any role for payers to
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:23.566 --> 01:25:25.470 become involved in establishing
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:25.470 --> 01:25:27.374 guidelines for conscientious objection?
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:27.380 --> 01:25:28.004 For example,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:28.004 --> 01:25:30.188 if a patient's PCP refuses to provide
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:30.188 --> 01:25:31.969 contraception on the basis of personal
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:31.969 --> 01:25:33.384 moral convictions and the patient
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556
01:25:33.434 --> 01:25:35.189 therefore must see another clinician
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:35.189 --> 01:25:36.593 and therefore incur additional
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:36.593 --> 01:25:37.703 cost to acquire contraception,
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:37.703 --> 01:25:40.073 is it right that the PCP be allowed to
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:40.073 --> 01:25:42.033 charge full price for the visit despite
NOTE Confidence: 0.863677613055556

01:25:42.033 --> 01:25:43.686 refusing to offer full standard care?
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:25:48.480 --> 01:25:50.660 That's a really good question.
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:25:50.660 --> 01:25:52.205 You know, probably don't have
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:25:52.205 --> 01:25:54.360 time to to do it justice,
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:25:54.360 --> 01:25:56.600 but but I I would keep coming back to that.
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:25:56.600 --> 01:25:58.590 It's not appropriate to place
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:25:58.590 --> 01:26:01.522 the burden on the patient who is
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:01.522 --> 01:26:03.258 simply seeking standard care,
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:03.260 --> 01:26:05.815 and I think the for the physician
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:05.815 --> 01:26:08.700 or other clinician who's looking to
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:08.700 --> 01:26:10.988 exercise conscientious objection rights.
NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:10.990 --> 01:26:12.474 There is certain responsibility

NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:12.474 --> 01:26:15.408 burdens that they have to bear to make

NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:15.408 --> 01:26:17.528 sure that patients don't suffer as.

NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:17.528 --> 01:26:19.964 Doctor still has said many times tonight.

NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:19.970 --> 01:26:22.504 I think the problem is with the

NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:22.504 --> 01:26:24.325 details and and and I could easily

NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:24.325 --> 01:26:25.733 see that this is another issue

NOTE Confidence: 0.921327704

01:26:25.733 --> 01:26:27.018 that needs to be addressed.

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:28.620 --> 01:26:31.200 Great, thank you so much.

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:31.200 --> 01:26:33.072 Well it looks like we are

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:33.072 --> 01:26:34.860 at our time and again.

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:34.860 --> 01:26:36.966 We do have a hard stop at at 6:30

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:36.966 --> 01:26:39.308 so I would like to thank Doctor

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:39.308 --> 01:26:41.066 Stahl and Doctor Siegel for

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:41.066 --> 01:26:43.076 coming tonight to speak with us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:43.080 --> 01:26:45.600 I think this is a really robust

NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:45.600 --> 01:26:47.470 and thoughtful discussion about the
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:47.470 --> 01:26:49.990 pros and cons of the exercise and
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:49.990 --> 01:26:51.350 conscientious objection and medicine
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:51.350 --> 01:26:53.855 and I and on behalf of the program,
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:53.855 --> 01:26:56.200 I'd like to thank everybody for attending,
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:56.200 --> 01:26:58.828 not just this session but also all of our.
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:26:58.830 --> 01:27:01.218 Seminars this academic year I wish
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:27:01.218 --> 01:27:03.723 everyone a very happy and healthy
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:27:03.723 --> 01:27:05.818 summer and hopefully everyone gets
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:27:05.818 --> 01:27:08.642 a little bit of a chance to rest
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:27:08.642 --> 01:27:10.718 and we look forward to seeing you
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:27:10.718 --> 01:27:13.030 in the fall for a new and exciting
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:27:13.103 --> 01:27:14.968 lineup of Evening seminar series
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:27:14.968 --> 01:27:16.833 in in our ethics program.
NOTE Confidence: 0.837937898

01:27:16.840 --> 01:27:19.000 So thank you so much and good night everyone.