

WEBVTT

NOTE duration:"01:27:03.9170000"

NOTE language:en-us

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:02.430 --> 00:00:05.005 Good evening, welcome to another.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:05.005 --> 00:00:09.219 Session in our program for biomedical ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:09.220 --> 00:00:11.740 Before I introduce our guest speaker,

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:11.740 --> 00:00:12.961 Doctor Matthews Camp,

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:12.961 --> 00:00:16.743 I want to remind you of that we will

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:16.743 --> 00:00:19.718 be having another session in two weeks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:19.720 --> 00:00:21.400 Where are other associate

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:21.400 --> 00:00:23.080 director Doctor Sarah Camp?

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:23.080 --> 00:00:24.760 Well, by the way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:24.760 --> 00:00:26.860 my name is Jack Hughes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:26.860 --> 00:00:29.308 I'm going to associate director of

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:29.308 --> 00:00:31.480 the Program for Biomedical Ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:31.480 --> 00:00:32.440 Doctor Mercurio.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:00:32.440 --> 00:00:36.280 Your usual host is unable to attend tonight.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:00:36.280 --> 00:00:39.087 In two weeks, Doctor Sarah Hall will  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:00:39.087 --> 00:00:42.622 be talking to us about the ethics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:00:42.622 --> 00:00:44.870 ethical considerations in nutrition.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:00:44.870 --> 00:00:49.640 Are we what we eat two weeks after that on,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:00:49.640 --> 00:00:53.192 well, actually a few weeks after  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:00:53.192 --> 00:00:56.270 that on March the 24th?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:00:56.270 --> 00:00:59.882 Max Jordan Tiako will be talking  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:00:59.882 --> 00:01:05.552 to us about the how racism shapes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:01:05.552 --> 00:01:08.687 undergraduate medical education.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:01:08.690 --> 00:01:09.533 Well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:01:09.533 --> 00:01:15.434 the ethical case for structural change so.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:01:15.440 --> 00:01:18.240 Be sure to join us if you can.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:01:18.240 --> 00:01:20.340 It is my pleasure to introduce  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:01:20.340 --> 00:01:23.428 tonight's speaker, Doctor Matthew Camp.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:01:23.430 --> 00:01:26.592 Doctor camp Doctor Decamp is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:26.592 --> 00:01:28.700 graduate of Purdue University.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:28.700 --> 00:01:31.418 He's a graduate of Duke University,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:31.420 --> 00:01:33.892 where he obtained his medical degree  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:33.892 --> 00:01:36.410 and his doctorate in philosophy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:36.410 --> 00:01:38.675 He trained in internal medicine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:38.675 --> 00:01:40.940 at the University of Michigan.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:40.940 --> 00:01:43.484 He did a postdoctoral fellowship at  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:43.484 --> 00:01:45.920 Johns Hopkins University in Baltimore.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:45.920 --> 00:01:49.049 He was a Greenwall fellow in bioethics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:49.049 --> 00:01:51.350 and health policy in general,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:51.350 --> 00:01:52.320 internal medicine,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:52.320 --> 00:01:55.230 and he is currently associate professor.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:55.230 --> 00:01:57.430 In the Center for Bioethics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:57.430 --> 00:01:59.630 and Humanities and the Division  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:01:59.706 --> 00:02:01.870 of General Internal Medicine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:01.870 --> 00:02:03.718 He's a practicing internist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:03.718 --> 00:02:06.490 He's a health services researcher and

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:06.568 --> 00:02:09.050 a philosopher, Doctor Camp employees,

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:09.050 --> 00:02:11.050 both empirical and conceptual

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:11.050 --> 00:02:13.913 methods to identify and solve cutting

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:13.913 --> 00:02:16.493 edge problems at the interface of

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:16.493 --> 00:02:18.459 healthcare policy and bioethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:18.460 --> 00:02:20.825 His research has emphasized specifically

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:20.825 --> 00:02:22.717 engaging patients in healthcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:22.720 --> 00:02:24.175 organizational decision making,

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:24.175 --> 00:02:28.060 ethical decisions in the use of social media.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:28.060 --> 00:02:31.580 Big data and global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:31.580 --> 00:02:34.056 With a particular focus,

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:34.056 --> 00:02:37.770 as will be evidenced tonight on

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:37.881 --> 00:02:41.746 short term global health education.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:41.750 --> 00:02:44.450 And the ethics of saying.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333

00:02:44.450 --> 00:02:44.837 Alright,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:02:44.837 --> 00:02:47.546 so he is currently a Co principal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:02:47.546 --> 00:02:49.350 investigator on Greenwall Foundation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:02:49.350 --> 00:02:51.270 grant examining ethical issues  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:02:51.270 --> 00:02:53.916 arising in mass Drug Administration  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:02:53.916 --> 00:02:55.869 of antibiotics globally.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:02:55.870 --> 00:02:59.209 For the sake of reducing childhood mortality.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:02:59.210 --> 00:03:00.160 In addition,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:00.160 --> 00:03:02.535 with funding from an NIH  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:02.535 --> 00:03:03.485 bioethics supplement,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:03.490 --> 00:03:06.157 he has served as ethics and engagement  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:06.157 --> 00:03:09.007 advisor for the Palliative Care Research  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:09.007 --> 00:03:11.183 Cooperative Group and conducted  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:11.183 --> 00:03:14.440 research on engaging patients and families,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:14.440 --> 00:03:15.018 and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:15.018 --> 00:03:16.752 End of life.

NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:16.752 --> 00:03:18.486 Imperative care research.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:18.490 --> 00:03:21.710 He is also an award winning teacher  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:21.710 --> 00:03:25.439 and mentor as I think will be  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:25.439 --> 00:03:28.254 evidenced by his presentation tonight.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:28.260 --> 00:03:30.066 All right, back to the camp.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:30.070 --> 00:03:31.756 We are delighted to have you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.865993395833333  
00:03:31.756 --> 00:03:33.390 all the way from Denver.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85174125  
00:03:35.500 --> 00:03:36.988 Take it away, please.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85174125  
00:03:36.990 --> 00:03:39.216 Great thank you for that introduction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85174125  
00:03:39.220 --> 00:03:40.830 I really appreciate the opportunity  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85174125  
00:03:40.830 --> 00:03:43.804 to talk to all of you tonight about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85174125  
00:03:43.804 --> 00:03:45.540 short-term global health ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85174125  
00:03:45.540 --> 00:03:48.786 I'm going to. Share my screen.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.81545746  
00:03:50.930 --> 00:03:53.594 Get this going and swap it out for us.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:03:56.640 --> 00:03:58.360 So again, I really appreciate  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:03:58.360 --> 00:04:00.080 the opportunity over the next.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:00.080 --> 00:04:04.170 I guess hour or so and prior to the Q&A.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:04.170 --> 00:04:06.655 I hope that explore a little bit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:06.660 --> 00:04:07.614 The past President,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:07.614 --> 00:04:09.204 future of ethics and short-term

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:09.204 --> 00:04:10.920 global health clinical experiences,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:10.920 --> 00:04:13.370 and I really hope in this presentation

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:13.370 --> 00:04:16.108 as a little something for everyone.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:16.110 --> 00:04:17.670 You know, I hope there's

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:17.670 --> 00:04:18.918 something for philosophers who

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:18.918 --> 00:04:20.867 are interested in conceptual work,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:20.870 --> 00:04:21.890 empirical bioethics researchers,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:21.890 --> 00:04:22.570 medical educators,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:22.570 --> 00:04:24.270 social scientists, and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:24.270 --> 00:04:26.990 Hope to touch on a lot of that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:26.990 --> 00:04:29.300 and I hope that we'll have a

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:29.300 --> 00:04:31.978 good amount of time for questions

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:31.978 --> 00:04:33.589 and answers afterwards.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:33.590 --> 00:04:35.054 Just some housekeeping issues,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:35.054 --> 00:04:37.250 no relevant active conflicts of interest.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:37.250 --> 00:04:39.218 I did receive an honorarium for

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:39.218 --> 00:04:42.115 work on a paper that appears in this

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:42.115 --> 00:04:44.377 presentation from the ACP on this

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:44.453 --> 00:04:46.715 topic and my global health research

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:46.715 --> 00:04:49.328 has been funded by a couple of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:49.328 --> 00:04:51.158 groups that death also mentioned,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:51.160 --> 00:04:54.350 I think in the intro.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:54.350 --> 00:04:56.289 So what I want to do today?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:56.290 --> 00:04:56.538 Well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:56.538 --> 00:04:58.274 I'm hoping to give you a little

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:04:58.274 --> 00:05:00.444 bit of a brief background on what

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942



00:05:00.444 --> 00:05:02.054 short-term global health is or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:02.114 --> 00:05:03.809 how it's typically thought of.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:03.810 --> 00:05:07.095 I'll describe how we got to where we are.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:07.100 --> 00:05:08.592 That is the past.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:08.592 --> 00:05:10.457 I'll spend some time talking  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:10.457 --> 00:05:11.839 about where we are,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:11.840 --> 00:05:13.670 especially in terms of ethics,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:13.670 --> 00:05:15.495 education and our thinking around  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:15.495 --> 00:05:16.590 short-term global ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:16.590 --> 00:05:17.787 And then Lastly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:17.787 --> 00:05:20.580 hint at where we are and where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:20.666 --> 00:05:22.278 we should be going.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:22.280 --> 00:05:23.900 I just as a note,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:23.900 --> 00:05:25.520 I'll frequently use the word  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:25.520 --> 00:05:26.816 trainees in this presentation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:26.820 --> 00:05:28.698 but this isn't really meant to

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:28.698 --> 00:05:30.336 be only about undergraduate or

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:30.336 --> 00:05:31.996 graduate medical trainees per say.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:32.000 --> 00:05:33.975 Think it's important to remember

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:33.975 --> 00:05:35.555 that in global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:35.560 --> 00:05:38.145 Even seasoned practitioners can be

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:38.145 --> 00:05:41.692 trainees in some sense that they are

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:41.692 --> 00:05:44.320 new to the global health setting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:44.320 --> 00:05:46.468 So let's jump right in and

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:46.468 --> 00:05:47.900 talk about this concept.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:47.900 --> 00:05:49.800 Them short-term global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:49.800 --> 00:05:51.700 I think that classicly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:51.700 --> 00:05:54.213 we think of these activities as weeks

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:54.213 --> 00:05:56.743 to months long trips from a high

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:56.743 --> 00:05:58.813 income country to a lower middle

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:05:58.888 --> 00:06:01.028 income country to provide care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:01.030 --> 00:06:03.718 It certainly I was first exposed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:03.718 --> 00:06:05.938 to short-term global health when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:05.938 --> 00:06:08.353 I went to Honduras back in 2001.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:08.360 --> 00:06:10.944 But I think if we look closely at  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:10.944 --> 00:06:13.030 these terms and these concepts,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:13.030 --> 00:06:14.462 reality is more complicated.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:14.462 --> 00:06:16.252 So let's look at short-term.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:16.260 --> 00:06:16.618 Well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:16.618 --> 00:06:18.408 there's no real standard definition  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:18.408 --> 00:06:20.570 of what counts is short term,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:20.570 --> 00:06:22.360 and in fact really interesting.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:22.360 --> 00:06:25.224 Lee, in some of the surveys we've done,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:25.230 --> 00:06:28.452 if you ask people what counts as short term,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:28.460 --> 00:06:30.250 the answer is basically whatever  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:30.250 --> 00:06:32.410 is shorter than what I've done.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942

00:06:32.410 --> 00:06:35.290 So if you've been abroad for a month,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:35.290 --> 00:06:37.438 a couple weeks, a short term,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:37.440 --> 00:06:39.870 six months amonth is short term.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:39.870 --> 00:06:41.067 A year, well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:41.067 --> 00:06:43.860 six months is still a short term  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:43.950 --> 00:06:46.119 global health experience.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:46.120 --> 00:06:48.262 Let's look at the next concept  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:48.262 --> 00:06:49.333 of global Global.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:49.340 --> 00:06:50.424 As you can imagine,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:50.424 --> 00:06:52.550 is also kind of hard to define  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:52.550 --> 00:06:55.124 because we might think about issues  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:55.124 --> 00:06:56.860 abroad versus underserved areas.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:56.860 --> 00:06:59.032 Locally that will come up in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:06:59.032 --> 00:07:00.888 the presentation today and this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:07:00.888 --> 00:07:02.588 mantra of local is global.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8648942  
00:07:02.590 --> 00:07:04.380 How how global is global.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:04.380 --> 00:07:06.528 When we talk about short-term global  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:06.528 --> 00:07:08.674 health activities and Lastly, of course,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:08.674 --> 00:07:10.816 health health is a complicated concept.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:10.820 --> 00:07:12.610 When we talk about engaging  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:12.610 --> 00:07:13.684 in healthy activities,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:13.690 --> 00:07:16.390 is it health care delivery only?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:16.390 --> 00:07:18.560 Is it public health versus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:18.560 --> 00:07:20.296 education and so on.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:20.300 --> 00:07:22.470 So a lot of complexity.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:22.470 --> 00:07:25.176 I think around the definitions of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:25.176 --> 00:07:28.000 short term global health experiences.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:28.000 --> 00:07:30.064 Now, short term global health experiences  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:30.064 --> 00:07:32.316 are sometimes in the news and not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:32.316 --> 00:07:33.942 always for the best of reasons.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:33.950 --> 00:07:35.917 To give you a couple of news  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:35.917 --> 00:07:38.018 stories over the past several years.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:38.020 --> 00:07:39.898 Here's a story about an American

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:39.898 --> 00:07:41.150 with no medical training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:41.150 --> 00:07:43.646 Ran a Center for malnourished kids in Uganda,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:43.650 --> 00:07:46.408 and is accused in the story of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:46.408 --> 00:07:49.329 contributing to the deaths of around 105.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:49.330 --> 00:07:51.718 An article in the Scientific American

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:51.718 --> 00:07:54.204 about the trouble with medical voluntourism

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:54.204 --> 00:07:57.081 one thing that sometimes one term that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:07:57.081 --> 00:08:00.285 is sometimes used to describe this activity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:00.290 --> 00:08:01.154 Or Lastly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:01.154 --> 00:08:03.314 this somewhat cheeky article called

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:03.314 --> 00:08:04.178 #instagramming Africa,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:04.180 --> 00:08:06.340 the narcissism of Global Voluntourism,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:06.340 --> 00:08:10.228 and if you look closely at the lower right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:10.230 --> 00:08:11.140 lower right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:11.140 --> 00:08:13.870 you'll see that the Onion mocks  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:13.870 --> 00:08:16.190 voluntourism joking that a six day  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:16.190 --> 00:08:18.194 visit to a rural African village  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:18.268 --> 00:08:20.758 can quote completely change a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:20.758 --> 00:08:22.750 woman's Facebook profile picture.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:22.750 --> 00:08:25.030 So a lot of controversies sometimes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:25.030 --> 00:08:27.707 bubbling in to the popular press  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:27.707 --> 00:08:29.867 around short-term global health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:29.870 --> 00:08:32.090 Activities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:32.090 --> 00:08:33.750 If we look more academically,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:33.750 --> 00:08:36.025 we can see that there's been somewhat  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:36.025 --> 00:08:38.060 of a meteoric rise of interest  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:38.060 --> 00:08:40.052 in this type of global health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:40.060 --> 00:08:41.746 This is just a graph showing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:41.746 --> 00:08:43.744 citations by year using the medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:08:43.744 --> 00:08:45.368 subject heading medical missions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:08:45.370 --> 00:08:47.694 We might say this is an archaic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:08:47.694 --> 00:08:48.358 subject heading,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:08:48.360 --> 00:08:52.300 but it is what it is and you can see.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:08:52.300 --> 00:08:53.206 Great interest,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:08:53.206 --> 00:08:55.471 increasing interest in short term  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:08:55.471 --> 00:08:57.999 global health over the years with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:08:57.999 --> 00:08:59.829 probably an interesting story to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:08:59.829 --> 00:09:02.301 be told about why there are these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:09:02.301 --> 00:09:04.384 blips around 1970 in the 1990s,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:09:04.384 --> 00:09:06.868 perhaps around HIV AIDS and then  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:09:06.868 --> 00:09:09.228 exploding into the 1st and 2nd  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:09:09.228 --> 00:09:10.968 decade of the 21st century.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:09:10.970 --> 00:09:15.098 So a lot of interest in this topic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:09:15.098 --> 00:09:17.589 interested appears to be growing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685  
00:09:17.590 --> 00:09:19.798 And as many of us know,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685



00:09:19.800 --> 00:09:21.834 we know that many medical students  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:21.834 --> 00:09:23.190 continue to participate in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:23.246 --> 00:09:24.578 global health electives,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:24.580 --> 00:09:27.156 even if we've seen a decline recently.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:27.160 --> 00:09:29.542 These are data from the medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:29.542 --> 00:09:30.733 school Graduation Questionnaire  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:30.733 --> 00:09:32.896 where there is a question about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:32.896 --> 00:09:34.596 activities participated in one of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:34.655 --> 00:09:36.725 which is a global health experience,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:36.730 --> 00:09:39.299 and you can see more than 30%  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:39.300 --> 00:09:40.768 in 2015 reported participating  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:40.768 --> 00:09:42.603 in a global health elective.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:42.610 --> 00:09:44.818 Now that had been actually arise,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:44.820 --> 00:09:48.213 an increase over the past five or ten years.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:48.220 --> 00:09:49.940 In advance of 2015,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:49.940 --> 00:09:52.520 and then we've actually seen a

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:52.607 --> 00:09:55.133 little bit of a decline since

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:55.133 --> 00:09:57.940 2015 down to around one in four.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:09:57.940 --> 00:10:00.300 Now of course, one in four is still.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:00.300 --> 00:10:01.311 One in four.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:01.311 --> 00:10:02.996 And that's a significant number

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:02.996 --> 00:10:04.230 across the country,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:04.230 --> 00:10:06.150 emphasizing why we need to think

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:06.150 --> 00:10:08.150 about ethics in these activities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:08.150 --> 00:10:10.298 Why we're seeing this trend reversal,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:10.300 --> 00:10:12.436 I think it's hard to know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:12.440 --> 00:10:13.728 We'll probably see, again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:13.728 --> 00:10:16.136 a little bit of a decrease in

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:16.136 --> 00:10:17.788 participation because of covid,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:17.790 --> 00:10:20.880 and this is just something we'll

NOTE Confidence: 0.8684685

00:10:20.880 --> 00:10:22.940 have to follow overtime.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:22.940 --> 00:10:25.370 What about short-term global global health?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:25.370 --> 00:10:26.990 By the broader numbers,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:26.990 --> 00:10:29.015 who really lack precise estimates?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:29.020 --> 00:10:31.444 I think their challenge because of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:31.444 --> 00:10:32.660 disseminated, unregulated nature

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:32.660 --> 00:10:34.685 of many global health activities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:34.690 --> 00:10:36.680 but still most people believe

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:36.680 --> 00:10:38.670 short-term global health activities are

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:38.737 --> 00:10:40.757 completed by hundreds of thousands,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:40.760 --> 00:10:43.820 if not millions of volunteers annually.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:43.820 --> 00:10:46.816 They likely involve hundreds of millions or

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:46.816 --> 00:10:49.577 even several billion dollars US each year.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:49.580 --> 00:10:51.268 They frequently include research

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:51.268 --> 00:10:52.956 and or service activities,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:52.960 --> 00:10:55.590 both clinical and non clinical

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:55.590 --> 00:10:57.694 or public health alike.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:57.700 --> 00:10:59.608 As I mentioned, they range in

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:10:59.608 --> 00:11:01.988 duration from a few weeks to months.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:01.990 --> 00:11:04.566 And they really are a global phenomenon.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:04.570 --> 00:11:06.778 We're talking a lot about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:06.778 --> 00:11:08.928 US pier tonight, but in fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:08.928 --> 00:11:11.350 40% of medical students in the United

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:11.423 --> 00:11:14.535 Kingdom engage in this sort of an experience.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:14.540 --> 00:11:17.508 So it really is a global issue

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:17.508 --> 00:11:19.603 underscoring the importance of making

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:19.603 --> 00:11:21.841 sure we addressed ethics when it

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:21.841 --> 00:11:24.488 comes to short-term global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:24.490 --> 00:11:26.940 That's a super fast overview and summary

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:26.940 --> 00:11:28.950 of what short-term activities are,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:28.950 --> 00:11:32.670 and I want to shift and talk about the past.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:32.670 --> 00:11:35.406 How do we get to where we are today

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:35.406 --> 00:11:38.594 in our thinking in our activities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:38.594 --> 00:11:40.834 around short-term global health?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:40.840 --> 00:11:44.035 Well, we may see this as a new phenomenon,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:44.040 --> 00:11:46.648 but in fact if we trace the history  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:46.648 --> 00:11:48.300 of short-term global health,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:48.300 --> 00:11:50.624 we can quickly get back to medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:50.624 --> 00:11:52.559 missions of the 19th century.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:52.560 --> 00:11:54.690 And while I'm not a historian,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:54.690 --> 00:11:56.460 you look at this literature.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:56.460 --> 00:11:59.300 I think there are three themes that emerged.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:11:59.300 --> 00:12:01.075 One is that these activities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:01.075 --> 00:12:02.495 are frequently values driven.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:02.500 --> 00:12:03.154 That is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:03.154 --> 00:12:05.443 the work is often motivated by appeals  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:05.443 --> 00:12:07.727 to ethical values like need for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:07.727 --> 00:12:11.580 duty or social justice, and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:11.580 --> 00:12:14.196 A second is the concept of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:14.196 --> 00:12:15.068 training involvement,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:15.070 --> 00:12:17.513 really from the 19th century to HIV

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:17.513 --> 00:12:20.568 aids the 20th students and trainees have

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:20.568 --> 00:12:22.988 really always been participating in

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:22.988 --> 00:12:25.968 these sorts of short-term global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:25.970 --> 00:12:27.706 Medical mission type activities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:27.706 --> 00:12:30.760 So although we emphasize the numbers today,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:30.760 --> 00:12:34.180 this really isn't a new phenomenon.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:34.180 --> 00:12:34.880 And Lastly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:34.880 --> 00:12:36.980 a theme of complex and can

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:36.980 --> 00:12:38.270 sometimes conflicting dynamics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:38.270 --> 00:12:40.874 This is a picture of Albert Schweitzer,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:40.880 --> 00:12:43.477 well known for building hospitals in Gabon.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:43.480 --> 00:12:45.664 But if you look closely at some

NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:45.664 --> 00:12:47.665 of the writings of people around  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:47.665 --> 00:12:49.657 this time in this history you  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:49.657 --> 00:12:52.346 can see elements of service with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:52.346 --> 00:12:54.636 undercurrents of racism and colonialism.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:54.640 --> 00:12:57.398 And I circled this just to highlight  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:57.398 --> 00:12:59.847 it because we'll come back to it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:12:59.850 --> 00:13:02.082 Come back to these concepts later  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8623422

00:13:02.082 --> 00:13:03.198 in the talk.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:05.850 --> 00:13:08.250 Now when I summarize the pass,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:08.250 --> 00:13:10.614 I actually like to think that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:10.614 --> 00:13:13.464 I'd like to emphasize what I see  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:13.464 --> 00:13:15.444 as evidence of moral progress.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:15.450 --> 00:13:17.850 A shift in how we think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:17.850 --> 00:13:19.050 about short-term activities,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:19.050 --> 00:13:21.450 from altruism to charity, to justice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:21.450 --> 00:13:23.850 Let's look at this in detail.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:23.850 --> 00:13:25.850 Altruism. We often think of,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:25.850 --> 00:13:29.050 is giving something away at cost to oneself.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:29.050 --> 00:13:30.860 And that's really important right

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:30.860 --> 00:13:33.450 to for something to be altruistic,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:33.450 --> 00:13:37.034 it needs to come at cost to oneself.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:37.040 --> 00:13:39.092 But when it came to short-term

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:39.092 --> 00:13:40.460 global health activities abroad,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:40.460 --> 00:13:43.750 people started to realize wait a minute.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:43.750 --> 00:13:45.358 Individuals benefit from these

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:45.358 --> 00:13:47.368 activities from an education perspective

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:47.368 --> 00:13:49.170 and experiential perspective,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:49.170 --> 00:13:50.565 and attitudinal perspective.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:50.565 --> 00:13:53.820 So maybe what this really is about

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:53.898 --> 00:13:56.406 is something more akin to charity,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:13:56.410 --> 00:14:01.114 which we think of as giving something away.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695



00:14:01.120 --> 00:14:02.775 But then there's another pause  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:02.775 --> 00:14:04.930 when we realized wait a minute,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:04.930 --> 00:14:06.655 and some of these activities  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:06.655 --> 00:14:08.035 as will soon learn.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:08.040 --> 00:14:09.770 Individuals can often cause harm.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:09.770 --> 00:14:12.326 You saw that in some of the news stories  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:12.326 --> 00:14:14.278 about voluntourism in the situation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:14.278 --> 00:14:16.684 of the malnourished kids in Uganda,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:16.690 --> 00:14:18.766 and as individuals can cause harm.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:18.770 --> 00:14:20.846 Maybe we need to think about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:20.846 --> 00:14:22.230 this a little differently,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:22.230 --> 00:14:24.408 as something like justice that is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:24.408 --> 00:14:26.720 giving to others what they are do.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:26.720 --> 00:14:28.772 And I hope to suggest over  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:28.772 --> 00:14:30.530 the next slide or two.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:30.530 --> 00:14:31.508 Is it really?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:31.508 --> 00:14:33.790 We really have made a shift from

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:33.862 --> 00:14:36.057 altruism to charity to justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:36.060 --> 00:14:38.657 and I'll leave as a question mark

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:38.657 --> 00:14:41.149 food for the end of the talk,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:41.150 --> 00:14:44.300 what the next stage of moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:44.300 --> 00:14:45.875 progress might be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:45.880 --> 00:14:46.242 Now,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:46.242 --> 00:14:49.138 if I can convince you of this shift

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:49.138 --> 00:14:52.079 from charity to altruism to justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:52.080 --> 00:14:54.546 this actually could be pretty important.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:54.550 --> 00:14:57.028 From the standpoint of philosophical ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:57.030 --> 00:14:58.995 because we think of obligations

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:14:58.995 --> 00:15:00.567 of charity somewhat different

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:00.567 --> 00:15:02.399 than obligations of justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:02.400 --> 00:15:04.470 obligations of charity are imperfect,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:04.470 --> 00:15:05.240 that is,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:05.240 --> 00:15:07.550 they are not stringent for his  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:07.550 --> 00:15:09.829 obligations of justice are perfect.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:09.830 --> 00:15:13.134 That is, we're fully obliged to do them.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:13.140 --> 00:15:16.068 We tend to have significant discretion.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:16.070 --> 00:15:17.838 Over obligations of charity,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:17.838 --> 00:15:21.000 how much to give what to give,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:21.000 --> 00:15:23.164 but less discretion over  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:23.164 --> 00:15:24.787 obligations of justice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:24.790 --> 00:15:26.366 And then Lastly charity.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:26.366 --> 00:15:28.730 It could be said sometimes sees  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:28.807 --> 00:15:31.045 the recipient or the receiver as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:31.045 --> 00:15:33.317 an object of charity as opposed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:33.317 --> 00:15:35.077 to a subject of justice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:35.080 --> 00:15:37.384 Now here subject is being used  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:37.384 --> 00:15:39.679 in a slightly different way than

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:39.679 --> 00:15:42.066 we might think of as a research

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:42.066 --> 00:15:43.840 subject in research ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:43.840 --> 00:15:46.126 This is subject as a stance

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:46.126 --> 00:15:47.650 of subjects of justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:47.650 --> 00:15:51.410 which is different than being an object now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:51.410 --> 00:15:54.626 As you can imagine, philosophers disagree.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:54.630 --> 00:15:57.590 About this good and my own PhD advisor,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:57.590 --> 00:15:58.330 Alan Buchanan.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:15:58.330 --> 00:16:00.550 Some have said that, in fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:00.550 --> 00:16:02.400 if we institutionalized obligations of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:02.400 --> 00:16:04.990 charity, they would be just as stringent,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:04.990 --> 00:16:07.580 just as perfect as obligation of justice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:07.580 --> 00:16:08.711 But of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:08.711 --> 00:16:11.650 that's not exactly the world we live in,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:11.650 --> 00:16:13.130 and so this shift,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:13.130 --> 00:16:13.870 I think,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:13.870 --> 00:16:16.341 may be important in how we think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:16.341 --> 00:16:18.601 about the ethics of global  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:18.601 --> 00:16:20.287 health short-term activities.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:20.290 --> 00:16:22.901 And I think one simple way of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:22.901 --> 00:16:24.715 viewing this distinction and this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8509695

00:16:24.715 --> 00:16:27.203 progress over the past 20 years is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:27.273 --> 00:16:29.001 rejection of the something  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:29.001 --> 00:16:30.729 is better than nothing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:30.730 --> 00:16:32.600 Approach to global health ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:32.600 --> 00:16:34.838 I think a really important change,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:34.840 --> 00:16:36.604 a change that I've seen when  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:36.604 --> 00:16:38.293 I teach students and trainees  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:38.293 --> 00:16:40.105 and offer training sessions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:40.105 --> 00:16:41.917 about short-term global health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:41.920 --> 00:16:44.293 I feel like I've really seen this

NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:44.293 --> 00:16:46.605 shift away from the idea that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8911417

00:16:46.605 --> 00:16:48.640 something is better than nothing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:16:50.660 --> 00:16:53.159 How about a bit more of history

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:16:53.159 --> 00:16:54.596 and more descriptive history

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:16:54.596 --> 00:16:56.916 of how we got to where we are?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:16:56.920 --> 00:16:58.740 This is an abridged history.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:16:58.740 --> 00:17:01.156 It's not complete, but I think in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:01.156 --> 00:17:03.517 early 1990s and early 2000s there was

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:03.517 --> 00:17:05.755 a clear recognition of ethics related

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:05.755 --> 00:17:08.165 to short-term global health activities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:08.170 --> 00:17:09.618 In especially this concept

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:09.618 --> 00:17:10.704 of unintended harm.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:10.710 --> 00:17:13.614 So if we look at the medical literature,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:13.620 --> 00:17:16.324 you'll see articles in JAMA in the New

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:16.324 --> 00:17:18.697 England Journal articles I contributed to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:18.700 --> 00:17:20.835 Based on my experience in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:20.835 --> 00:17:22.970 Honduras and even Health Affairs.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:22.970 --> 00:17:25.826 And I think this quote on the lower  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:25.826 --> 00:17:27.569 left illustrates it quite well.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:27.570 --> 00:17:30.048 This is from the New England Journal.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:30.050 --> 00:17:31.820 There's profound need in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:31.820 --> 00:17:33.236 community or right now.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:33.240 --> 00:17:35.358 The vast amount of donated time,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:35.360 --> 00:17:37.298 energy, and money does more to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:37.298 --> 00:17:39.610 Stoke the egos of the Americans.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:39.610 --> 00:17:41.380 Clear expression of unintentional harms.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:41.380 --> 00:17:43.150 Questionable motives when it comes,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:43.150 --> 00:17:44.915 their short term global health  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:44.915 --> 00:17:46.327 activities need were appearing,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:46.330 --> 00:17:47.971 I think, importantly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:47.971 --> 00:17:50.706 in the mainstream medical literature.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:50.710 --> 00:17:52.174 What issues were flagged?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:52.174 --> 00:17:52.540 Well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:52.540 --> 00:17:55.102 there were a lot of them differences

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:55.102 --> 00:17:56.200 in cultural norms,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:56.200 --> 00:17:58.355 especially around gender and how

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:17:58.355 --> 00:18:00.510 those should be managed abroad.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:00.510 --> 00:18:02.240 What does consent look like

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:02.240 --> 00:18:03.278 in different cultures?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:03.280 --> 00:18:05.730 What are the unintentional harm such as

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:05.730 --> 00:18:08.496 side effects of medications we might give

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:08.496 --> 00:18:10.974 when it's a clinical experience abroad?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:10.980 --> 00:18:12.590 Is it OK to do things abroad

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:12.590 --> 00:18:13.890 that you wouldn't do at home?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:13.890 --> 00:18:16.378 We'll talk about that a little bit later.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:16.380 --> 00:18:18.977 What are the burdens on the host?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874



00:18:18.980 --> 00:18:21.218 For example, the need for translation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:21.220 --> 00:18:23.080 the need for airport transportation.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:23.080 --> 00:18:25.677 It could take away from the host,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:25.680 --> 00:18:27.123 usual obligations there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:27.123 --> 00:18:29.047 in the local community.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:29.050 --> 00:18:30.880 What about this savior complex?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:30.880 --> 00:18:33.244 The idea of saviors coming from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:33.244 --> 00:18:35.967 a high income country to a lower  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:35.967 --> 00:18:38.109 middle income country to save the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:38.109 --> 00:18:40.395 day and come in and swoop in.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:40.400 --> 00:18:44.657 As some might see a savior complex to be.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:44.660 --> 00:18:45.719 How about sustainability?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:45.719 --> 00:18:48.190 Is this just a one time treatment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:48.253 --> 00:18:49.808 for a longer term problem?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:49.810 --> 00:18:52.738 What happens after the team leaves?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:52.740 --> 00:18:54.828 What about the fungibility of resources?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:54.830 --> 00:18:57.606 Is it better that I went to Honduras,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:57.610 --> 00:18:59.843 or should my plane ticket had been

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:18:59.843 --> 00:19:02.404 spent instead on a donation to an NGO

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:02.404 --> 00:19:04.431 or a local organization that could

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:04.431 --> 00:19:07.005 provide services in the community already?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:07.010 --> 00:19:09.098 What about different standards of care?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:09.100 --> 00:19:09.970 And so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:09.970 --> 00:19:11.710 So lots of issues being flagged

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:11.710 --> 00:19:13.618 in these anecdotal reports,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:13.620 --> 00:19:15.630 case level reports about the ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:15.630 --> 00:19:17.450 of short term global health,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:17.450 --> 00:19:20.573 and let's look at one of these in detail.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:20.580 --> 00:19:23.040 This issue of standards of care.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:23.040 --> 00:19:24.630 A year or two ago,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:24.630 --> 00:19:27.254 a friend of mine actually sent me a

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:27.254 --> 00:19:30.037 text message and this is the way it looked.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:30.040 --> 00:19:32.266 But I tell you I'm in Ethiopia

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:32.266 --> 00:19:33.220 when I respond.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:33.220 --> 00:19:35.439 No, he says anyway, Med group here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:35.440 --> 00:19:37.318 Wondering if we should use expired

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:37.318 --> 00:19:39.579 meds one month old we brought them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:39.580 --> 00:19:41.458 I'm sure you ethics guys have

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:41.458 --> 00:19:43.710 some view on that and I respond.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:43.710 --> 00:19:44.664 So you're asking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:44.664 --> 00:19:46.890 is it OK to use expired medications?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:46.890 --> 00:19:48.610 You could imagine being abroad

NOTE Confidence: 0.9078874

00:19:48.610 --> 00:19:50.330 on the clinical outreach trip

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:19:50.396 --> 00:19:51.656 and you see a patient.

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:19:51.660 --> 00:19:53.826 Maybe they have a bacterial infection.

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:19:53.830 --> 00:19:56.406 You only have one antibiotic with you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:19:56.410 --> 00:19:58.300 but it's expired and the

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:19:58.300 --> 00:20:00.190 question here what are the?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:00.190 --> 00:20:01.862 Yes, I'm using expired  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:01.862 --> 00:20:03.534 medications in this setting.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:03.540 --> 00:20:06.075 Is it only about whether  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:06.075 --> 00:20:07.596 it works technically?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:07.600 --> 00:20:09.544 Is only about whether the community  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:09.544 --> 00:20:11.800 is informed and as chosen or said.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:11.800 --> 00:20:13.176 It's OK to use?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:13.176 --> 00:20:16.520 Or is it about none of these things?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:16.520 --> 00:20:18.500 Now this is a really interesting  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:18.500 --> 00:20:20.672 case because I think it's an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:20.672 --> 00:20:23.024 example of this pervasive problem of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:23.024 --> 00:20:24.939 defining standards in global health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:24.940 --> 00:20:27.130 The historical legacy of HIV trials,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:20:27.130 --> 00:20:28.594 rotavirus vaccine treatment versus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:28.594 --> 00:20:30.424 prevention of HIV in Africa,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:30.430 --> 00:20:31.351 and so on.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:31.351 --> 00:20:33.193 I think weigh heavily in how  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:33.193 --> 00:20:35.190 we think about standards,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:35.190 --> 00:20:37.320 but there are also more recent  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:37.320 --> 00:20:39.652 debates about the use of less  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:39.652 --> 00:20:41.320 expensive or less effective  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:41.320 --> 00:20:43.670 medications to an article in The  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:43.670 --> 00:20:45.798 Lancet from just a few years ago.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:45.800 --> 00:20:47.420 Put on the spectrum.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:47.420 --> 00:20:49.850 No one hand bioethicist appeals to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:49.932 --> 00:20:52.674 the greatest good for the greatest  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:52.674 --> 00:20:55.030 number and perhaps informed choice  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:55.030 --> 00:20:58.180 justifying the use of less expensive or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:20:58.180 --> 00:21:00.202 less effective medications globally.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:00.202 --> 00:21:02.446 On the other hand,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:02.450 --> 00:21:05.264 groups like MSF or Doctors Without Borders,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:05.270 --> 00:21:06.882 criticizing what they described

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:06.882 --> 00:21:08.897 as the ethics of resignation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:08.900 --> 00:21:11.948 that is being too quick to accept the

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:11.948 --> 00:21:14.540 status quo and not demand change.

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:14.540 --> 00:21:15.746 Asking more fundamental

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:15.746 --> 00:21:17.354 structural questions about well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:17.360 --> 00:21:21.360 why is it the case that less effective?

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:21.360 --> 00:21:23.313 Less expensive medications

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:23.313 --> 00:21:25.917 are being used globally.

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:25.920 --> 00:21:26.892 Now of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:26.892 --> 00:21:29.828 for some of us the concern is not is

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:29.828 --> 00:21:32.651 just as much about how we come to a

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:32.651 --> 00:21:34.985 decision and what our actions mean,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:34.990 --> 00:21:37.696 not just what exactly they are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:37.700 --> 00:21:40.292 But if we go back to my friends initial

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:40.292 --> 00:21:42.210 question about expired medications,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:42.210 --> 00:21:44.268 it turns out that guidance has

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:44.268 --> 00:21:46.089 existed from the World Health

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:46.089 --> 00:21:47.999 Organization for many years on

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:47.999 --> 00:21:50.499 exactly this topic in this guidance.

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:50.500 --> 00:21:51.232 Generally speaking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:51.232 --> 00:21:52.696 says that expired medications

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:52.696 --> 00:21:54.160 should not be used.

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:54.160 --> 00:21:56.110 There are some possible exceptions

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:56.110 --> 00:21:58.499 here related to the specific health

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:21:58.499 --> 00:22:00.384 facilities being aware of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:22:00.384 --> 00:22:02.579 limited shelf shelf life and so on,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:22:02.580 --> 00:22:05.188 but this is an example where in some

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:22:05.188 --> 00:22:07.646 ways there can be a disconnect between

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554

00:22:07.646 --> 00:22:10.630 the way we think about things ethically,

NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:10.630 --> 00:22:12.826 the way things are in practice,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:12.830 --> 00:22:14.870 and the fact that there actually  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:14.870 --> 00:22:16.697 has been guidance on this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:16.697 --> 00:22:18.677 particular topic for many years.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:18.680 --> 00:22:20.180 In some cases appealing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:20.180 --> 00:22:21.680 to notions of justice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:21.680 --> 00:22:21.995 Right,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:21.995 --> 00:22:24.200 but it's just wrong to have a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:24.200 --> 00:22:26.490 double standard and to treat people  
NOTE Confidence: 0.860554  
00:22:26.490 --> 00:22:28.480 differently in this particular context.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034  
00:22:30.490 --> 00:22:32.926 So let's go back to that story.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034  
00:22:32.930 --> 00:22:34.988 That story of how we got  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034  
00:22:34.988 --> 00:22:36.770 to being where we are.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034  
00:22:36.770 --> 00:22:39.202 We moved from the 2000s into the 2010  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034  
00:22:39.202 --> 00:22:41.660 where we create now ethics guidance.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034



00:22:41.660 --> 00:22:43.748 So go back to those cases.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:22:43.750 --> 00:22:45.542 Many of the anecdotes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:22:45.542 --> 00:22:47.782 say here are the issues.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:22:47.790 --> 00:22:49.980 We need ethics guidance to help  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:22:49.980 --> 00:22:52.363 us think through how to manage  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:22:52.363 --> 00:22:54.794 these issues abroad, and in fact,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:22:54.794 --> 00:22:56.346 the academic community responded,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:22:56.350 --> 00:22:58.558 so there was guidance promulgated by  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:22:58.558 --> 00:23:01.019 Pinto and Upshur on Global Health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:01.020 --> 00:23:02.910 Ethics for students will talk  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:02.910 --> 00:23:05.300 about that a little bit later.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:05.300 --> 00:23:07.598 Ethics and best practice guidelines for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:07.598 --> 00:23:09.570 training experiences in global health,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:09.570 --> 00:23:11.772 otherwise commonly known as the weight  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:11.772 --> 00:23:13.676 guidelines and then a publication  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:13.676 --> 00:23:15.914 I recently contributed to as well

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:15.914 --> 00:23:18.259 so the academic community responds.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:18.260 --> 00:23:20.594 And create ethics guidance to help

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:20.594 --> 00:23:24.215 us for how to conduct ourselves in

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:24.215 --> 00:23:26.855 short-term global health activities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:26.860 --> 00:23:27.430 In fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:27.430 --> 00:23:29.425 it maybe got to a point where

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:29.425 --> 00:23:31.798 we had too much of a good thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:31.800 --> 00:23:34.520 So in this review of 27 Yes 27

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:34.520 --> 00:23:36.080 published ethics guidelines,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:36.080 --> 00:23:38.282 there was actually need to distill

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:38.282 --> 00:23:40.246 all the guidelines down into

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:40.246 --> 00:23:41.527 five basic principles,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:41.530 --> 00:23:44.246 and this is last year at all,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:44.250 --> 00:23:46.578 and you can see them here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:46.580 --> 00:23:48.136 Appropriate recruitment and preparation

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:48.136 --> 00:23:50.470 host partner that defines the program,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:50.470 --> 00:23:53.518 including the need to be addressed.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:53.520 --> 00:23:54.951 Sustainability and continuity.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:54.951 --> 00:23:57.336 Respect for governance and legal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:57.336 --> 00:23:59.112 standards and regular evaluation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:23:59.112 --> 00:24:01.386 of program impact on the host.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:01.390 --> 00:24:04.561 So five sort of core meta level  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:04.561 --> 00:24:07.578 principles that came out of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:07.578 --> 00:24:09.670 27 published ethics guidelines.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:09.670 --> 00:24:12.390 Now we can go into these in detail.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:12.390 --> 00:24:14.770 Maybe we will on the Q&A period.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:14.770 --> 00:24:16.470 But just to point out,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:16.470 --> 00:24:18.510 I think if you look closely  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:18.510 --> 00:24:19.530 at these principles,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:19.530 --> 00:24:22.197 you see that they look a lot  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:22.197 --> 00:24:24.259 more like obligations of justice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:24.260 --> 00:24:26.198 As I described them earlier and

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:26.198 --> 00:24:28.030 they do obligations of charity,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:28.030 --> 00:24:29.965 so again hoping to convince

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:29.965 --> 00:24:32.440 you that there's been a shift.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:32.440 --> 00:24:35.696 Positive shift in how we think about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:35.696 --> 00:24:39.210 ethics of global health in the short term.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:39.210 --> 00:24:41.230 Setting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:41.230 --> 00:24:42.934 So that's sometimes men

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:42.934 --> 00:24:44.638 talking about the past.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:44.640 --> 00:24:47.601 And now I want to shift gears and talk

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:47.601 --> 00:24:49.920 about the present and and describe

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:49.920 --> 00:24:52.847 a bit more about where I think we

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:52.847 --> 00:24:55.045 are now in our thinking and our

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:55.050 --> 00:24:58.200 education about short-term global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:58.200 --> 00:24:58.676 Well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:24:58.676 --> 00:25:00.580 Fortunately building on these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:00.580 --> 00:25:02.960 ethics guidance documents there is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:03.035 --> 00:25:05.110 now widespread recognition of the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:05.110 --> 00:25:08.054 need to prepare and prepare for the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:08.054 --> 00:25:10.044 ethics in short term experiences.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:10.050 --> 00:25:11.970 This is the World Medical Association  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:11.970 --> 00:25:14.442 which a few years ago landmark  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:14.442 --> 00:25:16.694 statement encouraging and recommending  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:16.694 --> 00:25:18.383 appropriate predeparture briefings,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:18.390 --> 00:25:20.650 which include training and ethics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:20.650 --> 00:25:23.861 and lots of other issues now stated  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:23.861 --> 00:25:26.041 very clearly as a requirement  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:26.041 --> 00:25:28.289 for programs in short term.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:28.290 --> 00:25:30.798 Well will help.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:30.800 --> 00:25:32.740 So the training now exists,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:32.740 --> 00:25:35.844 but we might ask, well, does it work?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:35.844 --> 00:25:37.396 So one systematic review.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:37.400 --> 00:25:40.249 A few years ago identified 17 ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:40.249 --> 00:25:42.532 training resources and it found that

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:42.532 --> 00:25:45.540 most of these eight use case based learning.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:45.540 --> 00:25:47.480 Some of the others included

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:47.480 --> 00:25:48.644 were just guidelines.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:48.650 --> 00:25:50.590 There is really no evaluation

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:50.590 --> 00:25:52.530 above Level 3 evidence which

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:52.604 --> 00:25:54.714 they described as non randomized

NOTE Confidence: 0.86555034

00:25:54.714 --> 00:25:56.824 case series or cross sectional

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:25:56.894 --> 00:25:59.680 studies. And they noted there was an

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:25:59.680 --> 00:26:02.539 ethics emphasis on the following themes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:02.540 --> 00:26:03.848 beneficence and nonmaleficence,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:03.848 --> 00:26:06.028 with the example being exceeding

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:06.028 --> 00:26:07.649 one's level of training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:07.650 --> 00:26:09.674 A theme of respect,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:09.674 --> 00:26:11.698 avoiding posting photographs online.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:11.700 --> 00:26:13.884 Adapting to local culture,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:13.884 --> 00:26:16.614 example being inappropriate dress or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:16.614 --> 00:26:19.327 different cultural norms around dress.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:19.330 --> 00:26:21.346 Issues of justice such as Manageing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:21.346 --> 00:26:23.180 donated resources that I mentioned  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:23.180 --> 00:26:25.325 related to drug donation guidelines.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:25.330 --> 00:26:26.830 So there's a systematic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:26.830 --> 00:26:28.705 review of some of these.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:28.710 --> 00:26:30.240 These ethics training  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:30.240 --> 00:26:32.790 resources that are out there.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:32.790 --> 00:26:34.880 Now, our own systematic qualitative  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:34.880 --> 00:26:36.552 synthesis identified 14 primary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:36.552 --> 00:26:38.757 research studies that examined what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:38.757 --> 00:26:40.489 trainees actually experience abroad.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:40.490 --> 00:26:43.486 So here the question is slightly different.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:43.490 --> 00:26:44.903 The question is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:44.903 --> 00:26:49.309 how much do we really know and from whom?

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:49.310 --> 00:26:50.459 In our study.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:50.459 --> 00:26:53.865 In total there were less than 200 medical

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:53.865 --> 00:26:57.060 trainees represented in the literature.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:57.060 --> 00:26:59.580 Think back to how many hundreds,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:26:59.580 --> 00:27:00.114 thousands,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:00.114 --> 00:27:02.250 10s of thousands people.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:02.250 --> 00:27:04.326 Participate in these sorts of activities

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:04.326 --> 00:27:06.370 and the whole literature appears to

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:06.370 --> 00:27:08.170 be less than 200 medical trainees,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:08.170 --> 00:27:10.108 and there's an asterisk on that

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:10.108 --> 00:27:12.106 bullet because I think this is

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:12.106 --> 00:27:13.721 changing and it's changing rapidly

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249



00:27:13.721 --> 00:27:16.395 as we start to learn more about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:16.395 --> 00:27:18.040 types of ethics challenges that

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:18.040 --> 00:27:19.324 trainees experience abroad that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:19.324 --> 00:27:21.989 at least at this time of very narrow,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:21.990 --> 00:27:24.414 I would say snapshot of who's

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:24.414 --> 00:27:26.030 represented in the literature.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:26.030 --> 00:27:26.423 Now,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:26.423 --> 00:27:28.388 while many ethics themes were

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:28.388 --> 00:27:29.174 well represented,

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:29.180 --> 00:27:31.150 inconsistent with some of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:31.150 --> 00:27:33.173 training resources, others were not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:33.173 --> 00:27:35.228 Sustainability was a concern that

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:35.228 --> 00:27:37.969 tends to be hard to direct to

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:37.969 --> 00:27:39.814 address in an education program.

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:39.820 --> 00:27:41.820 Issues of moral distress were

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:27:41.820 --> 00:27:43.820 trainees know the right thing

NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:27:43.896 --> 00:27:45.726 to do while they're abroad,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:27:45.730 --> 00:27:48.322 but because of internal or external  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:27:48.322 --> 00:27:50.921 constraints or unable to do the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:27:50.921 --> 00:27:52.901 right thing and they experience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:27:52.901 --> 00:27:55.608 distress at that time and afterwards.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:27:55.610 --> 00:27:56.438 Then Lastly,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:27:56.438 --> 00:27:58.508 managing issues of social hierarchy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:27:58.508 --> 00:28:00.606 are real challenge for trainees  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:28:00.606 --> 00:28:02.186 and unfamiliar environments is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:28:02.186 --> 00:28:04.257 how to manage social hierarchies  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:28:04.257 --> 00:28:05.937 while they are abroad.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:28:05.940 --> 00:28:08.136 So a suggestion here that the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:28:08.136 --> 00:28:10.674 literature is not built on a very  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:28:10.674 --> 00:28:12.334 robust evidence based when it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249  
00:28:12.334 --> 00:28:14.647 comes to understanding the precise  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:28:14.647 --> 00:28:16.751 challenges that trainees may  
NOTE Confidence: 0.869249

00:28:16.751 --> 00:28:19.150 experience while they are abroad.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:21.410 --> 00:28:23.858 Now I want to take a moment and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:23.858 --> 00:28:26.700 highlight what I see as three recent  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:26.700 --> 00:28:28.428 efforts around evaluating the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:28.428 --> 00:28:30.198 effectiveness of ethics training,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:30.200 --> 00:28:32.492 and I'm going to start with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:32.492 --> 00:28:34.020 the Wisconsin sugar program.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:34.020 --> 00:28:36.772 This is part of the simulation used for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:36.772 --> 00:28:39.359 global away rotations or sugar program.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:39.360 --> 00:28:41.395 These educators develop 8 paper  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:41.395 --> 00:28:43.023 based simulations that were  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:43.023 --> 00:28:45.088 used in two half day sessions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:45.090 --> 00:28:47.463 They evaluated it with 51 medical residents  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:47.463 --> 00:28:49.679 who found the simulations useful.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:28:49.680 --> 00:28:51.860 You can see scores of.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:28:51.860 --> 00:28:54.303 Nearly four and a half out of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:28:54.303 --> 00:28:57.327 five on a 5 point Likert scale,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:28:57.330 --> 00:28:58.886 they believed the simulations  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:28:58.886 --> 00:29:00.442 would change their preparation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:00.442 --> 00:29:02.745 plans and they were reported  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:02.745 --> 00:29:04.215 experiencing significant emotions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:04.220 --> 00:29:06.950 I think echoing that concept of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:06.950 --> 00:29:09.756 moral distress in this case the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:09.756 --> 00:29:12.438 program was framed around 4 core  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:12.438 --> 00:29:15.359 emotions or four FS of frustration,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:15.360 --> 00:29:17.436 floundering, futility, and failure.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:17.436 --> 00:29:21.884 So here's an example of a valuating a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:21.884 --> 00:29:24.984 ethics education program for resonance.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:24.990 --> 00:29:27.318 Second example comes from the University  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:27.318 --> 00:29:29.570 of California at San Francisco.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:29:29.570 --> 00:29:29.985 Here,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:29.985 --> 00:29:32.060 following a modified current methodology,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:32.060 --> 00:29:34.140 the educators developed simulation training.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:34.140 --> 00:29:37.045 These were 10 minute cases involving actors,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:37.050 --> 00:29:39.962 and they had them in a few  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:39.962 --> 00:29:41.210 different case scenarios.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:41.210 --> 00:29:42.902 Scope of practice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:42.902 --> 00:29:45.158 Responding to corruption being  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:45.158 --> 00:29:48.680 privacy in the setting of HIV  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:48.680 --> 00:29:50.996 and obtaining informed consent,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:51.000 --> 00:29:53.560 this evaluation involved 53  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:53.560 --> 00:29:56.760 participants in 2013 and 14.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:56.760 --> 00:29:58.806 Who believed the simulations were effective,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:29:58.810 --> 00:30:00.166 thought they were used.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:30:00.166 --> 00:30:03.170 Colon made them more aware of ethics issues.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573  
00:30:03.170 --> 00:30:05.444 They reported that simulation training was

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:05.444 --> 00:30:07.950 likely more effective than other approaches,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:07.950 --> 00:30:10.446 and they perceived interesting Lee that

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:10.446 --> 00:30:13.119 the scenarios didn't teach right or wrong,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:13.120 --> 00:30:15.724 but instead were helping them think

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:15.724 --> 00:30:19.123 through a process of decision making rather

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:19.123 --> 00:30:22.279 than teaching one single right answer.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:22.280 --> 00:30:24.506 Our third example comes from Yale.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:24.510 --> 00:30:26.742 I don't know if Tracy is

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:26.742 --> 00:30:28.230 on the seminar today,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:28.230 --> 00:30:30.690 but want to highlight Yale activities

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:30.690 --> 00:30:33.331 in this regard because it is one

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:33.331 --> 00:30:35.487 of the three I think major examples

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:35.557 --> 00:30:36.790 in the literature.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:36.790 --> 00:30:38.202 So in this situation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:38.202 --> 00:30:41.548 a pre post evaluation was done of a 90

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:41.548 --> 00:30:43.858 minute pace based ethics workshop involved.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:43.860 --> 00:30:46.225 82 medical students who undertook

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:46.225 --> 00:30:48.117 electives at 16 different

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:48.117 --> 00:30:50.217 international sites from 2012 to 2015.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:50.220 --> 00:30:51.780 What did they find?

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:51.780 --> 00:30:53.730 Well improve self reported outcomes

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:53.730 --> 00:30:56.262 such as a sense of preparedness and

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:56.262 --> 00:30:58.744 ability to find ethics domains to find

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:30:58.744 --> 00:31:01.159 someone they could contact and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:01.160 --> 00:31:03.260 Nearly 2/3 of those who took the

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:03.260 --> 00:31:05.084 Post Trip survey reported having

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:05.084 --> 00:31:06.800 actually experienced an ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:06.800 --> 00:31:09.010 dilemma while they were abroad.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:09.010 --> 00:31:10.222 Now, of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:10.222 --> 00:31:12.646 some of us look at these

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:12.646 --> 00:31:14.847 data and suggest is 2/3.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:14.850 --> 00:31:16.878 The right number of people that

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:16.878 --> 00:31:18.230 should report having experienced

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:18.284 --> 00:31:19.709 a dilemma should be higher.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:19.710 --> 00:31:22.278 Should it be lower or what do we

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:22.278 --> 00:31:24.249 really expect that answer to be?

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:24.250 --> 00:31:25.910 But nevertheless, 2/3 reported,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:25.910 --> 00:31:27.985 having experienced in it dilemma.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:27.990 --> 00:31:30.480 And finally, after this ethics training,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:30.480 --> 00:31:32.555 students felt they were primed

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:32.555 --> 00:31:34.215 to recognize ethics dilemmas.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:34.220 --> 00:31:36.524 So three important examples

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:36.524 --> 00:31:38.828 there in the literature.

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:38.830 --> 00:31:39.092 No,

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:39.092 --> 00:31:40.664 I'm going to share with you

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:40.664 --> 00:31:42.299 something that we haven't published

NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573



00:31:42.299 --> 00:31:44.279 about our own evaluation of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:44.279 --> 00:31:45.467 ethics and globalhealth.org,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:45.470 --> 00:31:47.462 which is a case based series  
NOTE Confidence: 0.84986573

00:31:47.462 --> 00:31:48.790 that I helped develop.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:31:48.790 --> 00:31:52.358 And this is because it's a cautionary tale.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:31:52.360 --> 00:31:55.200 Here are some domains we evaluated in a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:31:55.200 --> 00:31:58.500 pre post format related to this curriculum.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:31:58.500 --> 00:32:01.110 Confidence strategies and knowledge and let's  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:01.110 --> 00:32:04.220 look closely at these answers pre to post.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:04.220 --> 00:32:06.265 You can see participants really  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:06.265 --> 00:32:08.310 felt an increase in confidence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:08.310 --> 00:32:11.158 I know how to deal with ethical issues  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:11.158 --> 00:32:14.037 if they arise nearly doubles right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:14.040 --> 00:32:15.396 Pre to post.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:15.396 --> 00:32:18.108 Almost everyone feels like they have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:18.108 --> 00:32:21.031 confidence in dealing with ethical issues if

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:21.031 --> 00:32:24.590 they arise during a global health experience.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:24.590 --> 00:32:26.012 Look closely below.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:26.012 --> 00:32:29.942 Look at the percentage correct on a five

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:29.942 --> 00:32:33.050 question ethics test that we created.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:33.050 --> 00:32:36.047 Ethics tests are forced hard to create and we

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:36.047 --> 00:32:39.095 can debate what counts as ethics knowledge.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:39.100 --> 00:32:42.116 But in any case, in our own evaluation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:42.120 --> 00:32:43.776 no change in knowledge.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:43.776 --> 00:32:46.877 So what did our curriculum appear to

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:46.877 --> 00:32:49.029 do radically increased confidence.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:49.030 --> 00:32:52.285 Didn't change knowledge and that caused us

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:52.285 --> 00:32:55.887 to really stop and think what's the goal?

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:55.890 --> 00:32:58.557 What exactly are we trying to do?

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:32:58.560 --> 00:33:00.505 We expect confidence to decrease

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:00.505 --> 00:33:03.310 after a simple 10 case curriculum.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:03.310 --> 00:33:05.050 And knowledge to increase or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:05.050 --> 00:33:05.746 remain unchanged.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:05.750 --> 00:33:07.838 What really should be the goal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:07.838 --> 00:33:09.230 of our ethics training?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:09.230 --> 00:33:10.280 What domains matter?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:10.280 --> 00:33:12.380 How do we measure them and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:12.380 --> 00:33:13.748 what should we see?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:13.750 --> 00:33:17.382 So really cause us to pause and are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:17.382 --> 00:33:20.210 thinking about our own case series.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:20.210 --> 00:33:23.036 So what are the gaps that I think come  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:23.036 --> 00:33:25.529 about based on where we are now and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:25.529 --> 00:33:28.149 where we are now in ethics training?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:28.150 --> 00:33:28.428 Well,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:28.428 --> 00:33:30.096 I still think it's true that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:30.096 --> 00:33:31.806 limited numbers of trainees have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:31.806 --> 00:33:33.450 informed the existing literature,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:33.450 --> 00:33:35.874 particularly in light of the many

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:35.874 --> 00:33:38.290 thousands to go abroad each year.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:38.290 --> 00:33:40.474 I think that you probably notice

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:40.474 --> 00:33:42.452 most of the evaluations involve

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:42.452 --> 00:33:44.727 self reported or perceived outcomes

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:44.727 --> 00:33:46.547 rather than hard outcomes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:46.550 --> 00:33:49.035 Do people perceive that they will be

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:49.035 --> 00:33:51.919 able to manage ethics strategies better?

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:51.920 --> 00:33:53.980 Do they like the curriculum?

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:53.980 --> 00:33:55.000 And so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:55.000 --> 00:33:57.040 These are the types of outcomes

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:57.040 --> 00:33:59.079 we've seen in the literature.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:33:59.080 --> 00:34:00.950 And as I mentioned there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:00.950 --> 00:34:03.194 at the end there may actually

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:03.194 --> 00:34:05.128 be some ambivalence about what

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:05.128 --> 00:34:07.288 we should be seeing as outcomes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:07.290 --> 00:34:09.677 Do we want more or less confidence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:09.677 --> 00:34:13.039 as a result of the curricula that we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:13.039 --> 00:34:15.900 develop related to short-term global health?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:15.900 --> 00:34:17.377 So I would say that at best,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:17.380 --> 00:34:19.246 if we took a step back.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:19.250 --> 00:34:21.749 And thought about the levels of evidence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:21.749 --> 00:34:24.539 of where we are in ethics education,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:24.540 --> 00:34:24.918 training.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:24.918 --> 00:34:27.186 I think we're pretty low level,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:27.190 --> 00:34:29.860 probably around the level of a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:29.860 --> 00:34:31.640 case series regarding ethical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:31.719 --> 00:34:34.019 challenges in their management.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:34.020 --> 00:34:36.365 So although to this point in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:36.365 --> 00:34:39.088 story I do want you to remember,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:39.090 --> 00:34:41.617 I think significant progress has been made.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:41.620 --> 00:34:44.398 I think there are some significant

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:44.398 --> 00:34:46.250 questions remaining that we

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:46.328 --> 00:34:48.418 would would help to address.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:48.420 --> 00:34:50.948 And that's where I want to go in

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:50.948 --> 00:34:53.074 this third and last section is

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:53.074 --> 00:34:55.640 the future we started in the past.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:55.640 --> 00:34:57.710 We said where we are now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:57.710 --> 00:34:59.774 The question is where are we

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:34:59.774 --> 00:35:01.150 going in this section?

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:35:01.150 --> 00:35:03.034 I want to describe maybe three

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:35:03.034 --> 00:35:04.739 challenges for the future of

NOTE Confidence: 0.89615124

00:35:04.739 --> 00:35:06.307 short-term global health ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:08.410 --> 00:35:10.300 Challenge number one.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:10.300 --> 00:35:12.820 What counts is success.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:12.820 --> 00:35:15.508 At the moment, I think there's actually

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:15.508 --> 00:35:17.952 little consensus on what would count  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:17.952 --> 00:35:19.987 as success for ethics evaluation.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:19.990 --> 00:35:22.010 Is it ethics knowledge?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:22.010 --> 00:35:24.030 How we describe knowledge?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:24.030 --> 00:35:25.458 What about attitudes?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:25.458 --> 00:35:28.314 What about behaviors do we expect  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:28.314 --> 00:35:31.037 to see different observed behaviors  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:31.037 --> 00:35:34.283 among trainees at home or abroad?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:34.290 --> 00:35:36.880 Are we trying to teach substantive right  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:36.880 --> 00:35:39.804 or wrong or moral decision process like  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:39.804 --> 00:35:42.844 a process of decision making that we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:42.844 --> 00:35:45.336 see in The Who Drug Donation program?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:45.340 --> 00:35:47.380 Or maybe it's something bigger.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:47.380 --> 00:35:50.250 Maybe what we want are actual outcomes  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:50.250 --> 00:35:53.492 of programs that we'd like to think that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:53.492 --> 00:35:56.330 ethics training means that a short term,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:56.330 --> 00:35:58.802 global health or a global health

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:35:58.802 --> 00:36:01.742 program in general turns out to be

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:01.742 --> 00:36:03.767 more successful or more effective

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:03.767 --> 00:36:06.099 at improving global HealthEquity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:06.100 --> 00:36:07.453 Unfortunately, at present,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:07.453 --> 00:36:09.257 there's actually little evidence

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:09.257 --> 00:36:10.610 beyond case reports.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:10.610 --> 00:36:12.925 An important individual case examples

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:12.925 --> 00:36:15.240 that short-term global health actually

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:15.306 --> 00:36:17.376 results in improved global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:17.380 --> 00:36:19.630 This is a systematic review

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:19.630 --> 00:36:21.430 from several years ago,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:21.430 --> 00:36:22.432 or in fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:22.432 --> 00:36:24.436 this was the finding that there

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:24.436 --> 00:36:26.986 was little evidence that short-term

NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087



00:36:26.986 --> 00:36:29.656 medical service trips contributed to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:29.656 --> 00:36:32.257 longer term global health outcomes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:32.260 --> 00:36:33.355 Again to note.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:33.355 --> 00:36:35.545 There are exceptions and we can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:35.545 --> 00:36:38.320 all think of programs that have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:38.320 --> 00:36:39.718 been highly successful,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:39.720 --> 00:36:42.560 but this is of course a systematic review.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.79387087

00:36:42.560 --> 00:36:45.038 It's occurring more at that aggregate level.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:36:47.540 --> 00:36:49.892 Now about 10 years ago there was active  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:36:49.892 --> 00:36:52.650 debate in medical ethics and professionalism.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:36:52.650 --> 00:36:54.725 Many of you probably recall  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:36:54.725 --> 00:36:56.800 this generally about whether we  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:36:56.876 --> 00:36:59.126 should be focusing on behaviors.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:36:59.130 --> 00:37:00.382 Or character or education,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:00.382 --> 00:37:02.575 or apprenticeship, is the focus of medical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:02.575 --> 00:37:04.140 ethics to promote certain behaviors.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:04.140 --> 00:37:06.324 Or is it character? And so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:06.330 --> 00:37:08.367 This slide I have some articles on

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:08.367 --> 00:37:10.897 one side of the line that are more

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:10.897 --> 00:37:13.182 behavioral and on the right side of

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:13.182 --> 00:37:15.401 the line or some articles pushing back

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:15.401 --> 00:37:18.006 and saying no medical ethics really is

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:18.006 --> 00:37:20.627 about character and I think this debate

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:20.627 --> 00:37:23.433 turns out to be relevant for the way

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:23.433 --> 00:37:25.876 we think of ethics and global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:25.880 --> 00:37:27.428 So in some ways,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:27.428 --> 00:37:28.976 the classical bioethics approach,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:28.980 --> 00:37:30.144 I would say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:30.144 --> 00:37:32.472 can be a little bit behavioral,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:32.480 --> 00:37:35.576 and we see this in the weight guidelines.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:35.580 --> 00:37:37.842 We see this in the position

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:37.842 --> 00:37:40.239 paper that I helped Co author,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:40.240 --> 00:37:42.445 where we implement or operationalize  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:42.445 --> 00:37:45.027 these bioethics principles of respect of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:45.027 --> 00:37:47.218 beneficent and a justice of both types,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:47.220 --> 00:37:48.240 distributive and procedural.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:48.240 --> 00:37:50.280 We tend to think of these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:50.280 --> 00:37:51.879 as behavioral outcomes,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:51.880 --> 00:37:54.208 as what is being done maybe  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:54.208 --> 00:37:56.610 a little bit about how it's.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:56.610 --> 00:37:57.428 Being done,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:57.428 --> 00:37:59.882 but certainly around what are risks  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:37:59.882 --> 00:38:02.093 and benefits way our benefits  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:02.093 --> 00:38:03.849 maximized and risk minimize.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:03.850 --> 00:38:05.980 Are we obtaining informed consent?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:05.980 --> 00:38:06.780 How informed,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:06.780 --> 00:38:08.780 understanding and so on sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:08.780 --> 00:38:10.670 of a behavioral approach?

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:10.670 --> 00:38:14.078 I would suggest to the way

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:14.078 --> 00:38:16.350 we think through ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:16.350 --> 00:38:18.204 This is different than what I

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:18.204 --> 00:38:20.220 would describe as this alternative,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:20.220 --> 00:38:21.536 more character based approach,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:21.536 --> 00:38:24.800 and in fact we see this in that publication.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:24.800 --> 00:38:26.858 Global health ethics for students by

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:26.858 --> 00:38:29.386 Pinto and Upshur in within the early

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:29.386 --> 00:38:31.558 stages of guidelines for short term

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:31.558 --> 00:38:33.668 global health training and some of

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:33.668 --> 00:38:36.230 us have started to question this as

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:36.230 --> 00:38:39.275 well in recent writings of our own.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:39.280 --> 00:38:41.254 You can see that the principles

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:41.254 --> 00:38:44.116 here or I should say the concepts

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:44.116 --> 00:38:46.076 here are different introspection.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:46.080 --> 00:38:48.396 Humility in solidarity and so the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:48.396 --> 00:38:51.279 questions that are asked are also different.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:51.280 --> 00:38:54.144 Here the question is why am I engaging  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:54.144 --> 00:38:56.752 in this global health research or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:38:56.752 --> 00:39:00.480 service program versus what am I going to do?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:00.480 --> 00:39:02.670 A why question versus a what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:02.670 --> 00:39:04.880 question or issue of humility?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:04.880 --> 00:39:07.280 What are my own personal and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:07.280 --> 00:39:08.080 professional limitations?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:08.080 --> 00:39:10.740 And am I exceeding them?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:10.740 --> 00:39:12.860 In this particular context.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:12.860 --> 00:39:14.980 Or issues of solidarity?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:14.980 --> 00:39:17.116 How do my actions demonstrate unity  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:17.116 --> 00:39:18.980 independent of their tangible impact?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:18.980 --> 00:39:21.468 Now I said that some of us have

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:21.468 --> 00:39:23.297 started to explore what would

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:23.297 --> 00:39:25.936 it look like to integrate a more

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:26.018 --> 00:39:27.943 character based approach to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:27.943 --> 00:39:30.670 way we tend to think about ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:30.670 --> 00:39:33.470 particularly those of us trained in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:33.470 --> 00:39:35.777 principle based approach to bioethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:35.780 --> 00:39:36.416 In fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:36.416 --> 00:39:38.006 we've wondered if these two

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:38.006 --> 00:39:40.080 approaches may be stronger together.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:40.080 --> 00:39:41.340 Do we may?

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:41.340 --> 00:39:43.860 We may need concepts of introspection,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:43.860 --> 00:39:46.184 humility and so on in order to

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:46.184 --> 00:39:48.819 understand how to apply these basic

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:48.819 --> 00:39:51.419 bioethics principles in unfamiliar places.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:51.420 --> 00:39:53.100 So in other words,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:53.100 --> 00:39:55.620 the below concepts may be foundational

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:55.696 --> 00:39:57.946 to how we interpret the above

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:39:57.946 --> 00:40:00.340 principles and let me illustrate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:40:00.340 --> 00:40:02.092 This with an example.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87900513

00:40:02.092 --> 00:40:04.720 I mentioned that performing outside the

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:04.796 --> 00:40:07.492 scope of training is one of the big

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:07.492 --> 00:40:10.223 issues that trainees of all types

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:10.223 --> 00:40:12.199 report having experienced abroad,

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:12.200 --> 00:40:14.230 and I think this example of being

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:14.230 --> 00:40:17.088 asked to do things outside one scope

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:17.088 --> 00:40:19.488 illustrates nicely how important humility,

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:19.490 --> 00:40:21.022 introspection and so on

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:21.022 --> 00:40:22.554 are to ethical analysis,

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:22.560 --> 00:40:24.480 particularly when if you look

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:24.480 --> 00:40:26.016 at those ethics guidelines,

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:26.020 --> 00:40:28.318 they will say something like this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:28.320 --> 00:40:32.776 It's usually not best to exceed your scope.

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:32.780 --> 00:40:34.580 You might wonder exactly how

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:34.580 --> 00:40:36.380 helpful is that as guidance,

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:36.380 --> 00:40:38.468 but when a principle says what

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:38.468 --> 00:40:40.830 are the risks and benefits of

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:40.830 --> 00:40:43.060 me performing outside my scope?

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:43.060 --> 00:40:45.466 Was the individual aware or informed

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:45.466 --> 00:40:47.968 of my skills when I did that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:47.970 --> 00:40:49.720 Or am I applying my decision the

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:49.720 --> 00:40:51.314 same in all circumstances when

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:51.314 --> 00:40:53.274 the principals say that this

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:53.274 --> 00:40:55.440 character break based approach says

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:55.440 --> 00:40:57.296 something different and emphasizes?

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:40:57.300 --> 00:41:01.296 Am I being humble in assessing my own skills?

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:01.300 --> 00:41:03.491 Or the power imbalance is minimized as

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571



00:41:03.491 --> 00:41:06.127 a matter of solidarity thinking of us,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:06.130 --> 00:41:06.758 not them.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:06.758 --> 00:41:09.764 Nor am I the right person to be making  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:09.764 --> 00:41:12.260 this decision in the 1st place.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:12.260 --> 00:41:13.528 My introspectively thinking about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:13.528 --> 00:41:16.368 why is it I'm in the situation I am,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:16.370 --> 00:41:18.629 and why do I think I should be making  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:18.629 --> 00:41:20.874 a decision about whether to exceed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:20.874 --> 00:41:23.320 my scope of practice abroad or not?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:23.320 --> 00:41:24.900 So again, I think these,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:24.900 --> 00:41:26.908 but these other concepts.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:26.908 --> 00:41:27.410 Introspection,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:27.410 --> 00:41:30.119 humility and so on may be fundamental  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:30.119 --> 00:41:34.194 to the way we should interpret some of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:34.194 --> 00:41:36.454 those classic bioethics principles.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:36.460 --> 00:41:38.716 They shall not highlight this problem.

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:38.720 --> 00:41:40.945 This challenge of performing outside

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:40.945 --> 00:41:43.766 the scope of training abroad I was

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:43.766 --> 00:41:46.342 part of a group that did a study of

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:46.342 --> 00:41:48.868 more than 200 global health individuals.

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:48.870 --> 00:41:49.932 Remember that asterisk?

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:49.932 --> 00:41:52.056 I said about minimal numbers of

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:52.056 --> 00:41:54.129 trainees represented in the literature.

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:54.130 --> 00:41:56.386 Here's a case where one study

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:56.386 --> 00:41:57.514 nearly doubled that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:57.520 --> 00:41:59.858 but it's in this study more than

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:41:59.858 --> 00:42:01.769 200 global health individuals who

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:01.769 --> 00:42:04.277 were diverse in terms of training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:04.280 --> 00:42:05.784 They were students, residents,

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:05.784 --> 00:42:07.723 postdocs, and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:07.723 --> 00:42:10.849 They recruited by Snowball nearly half.

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:10.850 --> 00:42:13.388 Reported being asked to do something  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:13.388 --> 00:42:15.555 outside their scope of practice  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:15.555 --> 00:42:17.530 and 2/3 actually did it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:17.530 --> 00:42:20.505 What reasons were offered as to why?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:20.510 --> 00:42:23.054 Whether it could be a mismatch  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:23.054 --> 00:42:24.326 with host expectations,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:24.330 --> 00:42:25.180 suboptimal supervision,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:25.180 --> 00:42:26.880 inadequate preparation was noted.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:26.880 --> 00:42:29.010 An absence of alternative options,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:29.010 --> 00:42:31.335 and sometimes the perception that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:31.335 --> 00:42:34.197 a situation was truly an emergency  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:34.197 --> 00:42:36.891 and there was no alternative but  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:36.891 --> 00:42:39.768 to exceed the scope of practice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:39.770 --> 00:42:42.105 Now really interesting Lee trainees  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:42.105 --> 00:42:45.471 in this sample were twice as likely  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:42:45.471 --> 00:42:47.846 to report performing outside their

NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:42:47.846 --> 00:42:51.110 scope compared to licensed practitioners.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:42:51.110 --> 00:42:54.006 I think we have to interpret this cautiously,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:42:54.010 --> 00:42:54.424 right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:42:54.424 --> 00:42:57.322 It could be that the issue is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:42:57.322 --> 00:42:58.620 licensed practitioners perceive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:42:58.620 --> 00:43:00.605 their scope to be bigger.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:00.610 --> 00:43:02.296 And so less things are going  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:02.296 --> 00:43:03.420 to fall outside it,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:03.420 --> 00:43:05.130 but it did seem like trainees  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:05.130 --> 00:43:07.065 could be at least more susceptible  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:07.065 --> 00:43:08.885 to this sort of activity.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:08.890 --> 00:43:11.284 This is a phenomenon that was observed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:11.284 --> 00:43:14.522 in the study for both clinical and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:14.522 --> 00:43:16.666 nonclinical individuals indecisions alike.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571  
00:43:16.670 --> 00:43:17.915 So for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:43:17.915 --> 00:43:20.405 a public health person or an  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:43:20.405 --> 00:43:22.516 education person could perceive  
NOTE Confidence: 0.862887471428571

00:43:22.516 --> 00:43:25.206 themselves to be making decisions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:25.210 --> 00:43:26.600 They were outside their scope.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:26.600 --> 00:43:28.256 Maybe it's not a clinical situation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:28.260 --> 00:43:30.342 but it's a decision that was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:30.342 --> 00:43:32.460 beyond the scope of practice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:32.460 --> 00:43:35.246 And then, like I hinted at before,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:35.250 --> 00:43:37.650 some of the qualitative findings from  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:37.650 --> 00:43:39.800 our open ended questions suggested  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:39.800 --> 00:43:42.220 the potential for lasting distress.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:42.220 --> 00:43:44.468 Lasting moral distress after  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:44.468 --> 00:43:46.154 individuals have performed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8847372

00:43:46.154 --> 00:43:48.820 outside their scope of practice.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:43:52.330 --> 00:43:54.810 So I talked a little bit about the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:43:54.810 --> 00:43:56.629 challenge of defining success.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:43:56.630 --> 00:43:57.701 Would outcomes matter?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:43:57.701 --> 00:43:59.486 How might we measure them?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:43:59.490 --> 00:44:01.996 How are we thinking about the ethics?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:02.000 --> 00:44:04.499 I want to talk about challenge #2,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:04.500 --> 00:44:06.852 which is who decides and this is I

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:06.852 --> 00:44:09.159 think it related ethics question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:09.160 --> 00:44:10.760 Who decides between these

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:10.760 --> 00:44:12.360 competing conceptions of ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:12.360 --> 00:44:15.104 or of what matters most when it

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:15.104 --> 00:44:16.979 comes to outcomes and evaluation?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:16.980 --> 00:44:18.423 Here the literature,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:18.423 --> 00:44:20.828 but perhaps not all programs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:20.830 --> 00:44:22.194 That's true too infrequently

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:22.194 --> 00:44:23.899 asked what local priorities are,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:23.900 --> 00:44:26.189 but if we look closely at some

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:26.189 --> 00:44:28.639 of the examples that are in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:28.639 --> 00:44:30.379 literature major just a few,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:30.380 --> 00:44:32.545 I think there are some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:32.545 --> 00:44:34.277 interesting findings to consider.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:34.280 --> 00:44:36.520 So again, here the evidence is sparse,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:36.520 --> 00:44:38.770 but I think there's a signal  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:38.770 --> 00:44:40.640 in the literature that how.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:40.640 --> 00:44:42.860 Is just as important as what?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:42.860 --> 00:44:45.450 So in a study we did in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:45.450 --> 00:44:46.560 the Dominican Republic,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:46.560 --> 00:44:48.265 we would ask local community  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:48.265 --> 00:44:50.442 members what do you like most  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:50.442 --> 00:44:52.477 about this particular short term,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:52.480 --> 00:44:54.165 global health activity and what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:54.165 --> 00:44:56.285 was interesting is that the first  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:56.285 --> 00:44:58.170 responses from individuals was not

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:44:58.170 --> 00:45:00.250 always about the tangible benefits.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:00.250 --> 00:45:02.470 If you look at these quotes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:02.470 --> 00:45:05.800 I think you can see that the third quote,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:05.800 --> 00:45:07.260 because you are friends,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:07.260 --> 00:45:09.870 you are treating me all this time.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:09.870 --> 00:45:12.456 I'm with you so appealing not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:12.460 --> 00:45:15.316 To the tangible benefits of the program,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:15.320 --> 00:45:16.948 not to the medications,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:16.948 --> 00:45:18.576 not to the education,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:18.580 --> 00:45:20.236 not to the services,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:20.236 --> 00:45:23.335 but instead to how those services and

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:23.335 --> 00:45:26.015 how those activities aren't delivered.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:26.020 --> 00:45:28.364 Similarly, in a survey.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:28.364 --> 00:45:30.708 Asking host communities what

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:30.708 --> 00:45:33.300 competency is most important?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075



00:45:33.300 --> 00:45:35.442 For trainees that come from a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:35.442 --> 00:45:37.969 high income country to a low and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:37.969 --> 00:45:40.027 middle income country to visit you,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:40.030 --> 00:45:41.614 what competency matters most?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:41.614 --> 00:45:43.990 Look at the ones that come  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:44.063 --> 00:45:45.689 to the top of the list.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:45.690 --> 00:45:47.050 Humility and being respectful  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:47.050 --> 00:45:49.486 far down the list is the ability  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:49.486 --> 00:45:51.484 in this case to conduct or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:51.484 --> 00:45:53.120 assist in research programs.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:53.120 --> 00:45:55.649 So I think if we look here we do  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:55.649 --> 00:45:58.429 see less emphasis on the tangibles,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:45:58.430 --> 00:46:00.908 but I always say we have to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:00.908 --> 00:46:01.970 interpret this cautiously.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:01.970 --> 00:46:04.220 We had to be careful because.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:04.220 --> 00:46:06.495 Of power imbalances of structural

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:06.495 --> 00:46:08.770 imbalances that can affect the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:08.849 --> 00:46:10.529 way people answer questions

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:10.529 --> 00:46:13.049 that we shouldn't move too far.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:13.050 --> 00:46:15.480 From a focus on real tangible

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:15.480 --> 00:46:17.810 outcomes and equity focused outcomes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8570075

00:46:17.810 --> 00:46:21.274 even if I think these findings are important.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:24.190 --> 00:46:25.760 And there's a third challenge.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:25.760 --> 00:46:27.330 This is really a methodological

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:27.330 --> 00:46:29.730 challenge in my mind, and that's the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:29.730 --> 00:46:32.010 question of whom should we evaluate?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:32.010 --> 00:46:34.260 A recognized need, or the obligation

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:34.260 --> 00:46:35.760 to evaluate program outcomes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:35.760 --> 00:46:37.635 which is now widely recognized

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:37.635 --> 00:46:38.760 is really complicated.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:38.760 --> 00:46:40.914 In methodological terms by some of

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:40.914 --> 00:46:42.890 these issues we discussed earlier.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:42.890 --> 00:46:44.565 Remember early in the presentation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:44.565 --> 00:46:46.733 I said there are these challenges  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:46.733 --> 00:46:48.888 around what counts as short-term.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:48.890 --> 00:46:50.390 What counts as global?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:50.390 --> 00:46:51.890 What counts is health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:51.890 --> 00:46:54.140 So there's a lack of consensus  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:54.140 --> 00:46:55.640 around these key definitions,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:55.640 --> 00:46:58.408 and this results in the absence of a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:46:58.408 --> 00:47:00.508 clearly defined population of study.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:00.510 --> 00:47:02.158 You need to study.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:02.158 --> 00:47:05.228 NGOs, charities, academic centers and so on.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:05.230 --> 00:47:08.744 How do we draw boundaries around a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:08.744 --> 00:47:11.717 study population in order us for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:11.717 --> 00:47:14.447 us to do a rigorous evaluation?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:14.450 --> 00:47:15.653 It's also complicated,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:15.653 --> 00:47:17.658 oftentimes by lack of funding,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:17.660 --> 00:47:20.467 and as I'll describe in a moment,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:20.470 --> 00:47:22.418 the pressure to sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:22.418 --> 00:47:23.879 localize the global.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:23.880 --> 00:47:26.214 So it's not surprising that many

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:26.214 --> 00:47:28.549 evaluations have tended to be limited

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:28.549 --> 00:47:30.673 to some of these single offices.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:30.680 --> 00:47:33.326 Single site single programs, and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:33.330 --> 00:47:36.146 It's not surprising to me that we are

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:36.146 --> 00:47:39.377 where we are when it comes to evaluation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:39.380 --> 00:47:42.000 Because of these methodological challenges

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:42.000 --> 00:47:45.160 in finding a population of study.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:45.160 --> 00:47:46.965 What do I think about

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:46.965 --> 00:47:47.687 measuring effectiveness?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:47.690 --> 00:47:50.224 These are just some thoughts for discussion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:50.230 --> 00:47:51.678 maybe something we can  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:51.678 --> 00:47:53.850 talk about more in the Q&A.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:53.850 --> 00:47:55.660 I think whatever approach to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:55.660 --> 00:47:57.470 measurement of effectiveness we choose,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:57.470 --> 00:47:59.198 it should be developmental,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:47:59.198 --> 00:48:02.170 meaning that no one size fits all.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:02.170 --> 00:48:04.780 And here it's important to remember  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:04.780 --> 00:48:07.849 that if we emphasize only successful.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:07.850 --> 00:48:09.200 Idealized long-term partnerships.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:09.200 --> 00:48:11.000 This will inevitably leave  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:11.000 --> 00:48:13.059 some places and people out,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:13.060 --> 00:48:16.524 and that is itself an issue of justice,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:16.530 --> 00:48:16.969 right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:16.969 --> 00:48:19.603 If we demand sustainability from the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:19.603 --> 00:48:21.740 outset long-term from the outset,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:21.740 --> 00:48:23.042 and so on,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:23.042 --> 00:48:26.693 there will be places and people that will

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:26.693 --> 00:48:30.326 be left out of this particular activity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:30.330 --> 00:48:32.986 I think our approach has to be collaborative,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:32.990 --> 00:48:33.983 or more importantly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:33.983 --> 00:48:35.638 decided within by local communities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:35.640 --> 00:48:37.796 I think it needs to be progressive

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:37.796 --> 00:48:39.944 where we need to emphasize specific

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:39.944 --> 00:48:42.254 timelines and benchmarks and this is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:42.254 --> 00:48:45.020 a bit of a nod to the human rights

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:45.020 --> 00:48:46.806 contexts and where human rights,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:46.806 --> 00:48:48.816 concepts of timelines and benchmarks

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:48.816 --> 00:48:51.260 really could inform the way we evaluate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:51.260 --> 00:48:51.992 Then Lastly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:51.992 --> 00:48:54.188 evaluation needs to be non exploitative.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:54.190 --> 00:48:56.020 We have to avoid benefiting

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:56.020 --> 00:48:57.118 at others expense.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:48:57.120 --> 00:49:01.458 I want to double click on this concept for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:01.458 --> 00:49:05.537 just a moment in a bit of an interlude.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:05.540 --> 00:49:08.340 Well sometimes see in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:08.340 --> 00:49:10.020 literature this idea.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:10.020 --> 00:49:12.335 The description that have time  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:12.335 --> 00:49:14.187 abroad can improve knowledge,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:14.190 --> 00:49:16.038 skills and attitudes of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:16.038 --> 00:49:17.886 trainees as important outcomes,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:17.890 --> 00:49:20.505 even leading them to careers  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:20.505 --> 00:49:22.597 in serving underserved and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:22.597 --> 00:49:24.740 marginalized populations at home.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:24.740 --> 00:49:26.642 And we might all agree that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:26.642 --> 00:49:27.910 similar ethics concepts apply,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:27.910 --> 00:49:31.086 but I think this raises far more questions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:31.090 --> 00:49:33.065 Then it does justify short-term

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:33.065 --> 00:49:35.040 global health questions like these.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:35.040 --> 00:49:37.600 Why should we go abroad?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:37.600 --> 00:49:40.140 To learn these lessons lessons.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:40.140 --> 00:49:42.012 Can or should we learn them

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:42.012 --> 00:49:43.260 in our own communities?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:43.260 --> 00:49:44.466 Or, more provocatively,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9040952

00:49:44.466 --> 00:49:47.280 is this really a subtle or even

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:49:47.361 --> 00:49:50.216 bizarre form of exploitation of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:49:50.216 --> 00:49:52.500 uniquely global communities where

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:49:52.500 --> 00:49:54.757 exploitation is this idea of making

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:49:54.757 --> 00:49:57.246 use of a situation to gain unfair

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:49:57.246 --> 00:50:00.400 advantage for oneself, and I I, really?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:50:00.400 --> 00:50:03.593 You describe it as somewhat bizarre, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:50:03.593 --> 00:50:06.624 The idea being that even if underserved

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:50:06.624 --> 00:50:08.680 communities are benefiting here,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468



00:50:08.680 --> 00:50:11.662 locali from the types of training  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:50:11.662 --> 00:50:14.830 we do globally is that still.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:50:14.830 --> 00:50:17.776 A subtler, bizarre form of exploitation  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8634468

00:50:17.776 --> 00:50:20.650 of a uniquely global community.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:24.340 --> 00:50:26.895 So I mentioned before this idea of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:26.895 --> 00:50:28.965 rethinking principles or adding even  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:28.965 --> 00:50:31.225 more character based approaches of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:31.225 --> 00:50:34.044 introspection and humility to our more  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:34.044 --> 00:50:36.306 fundamental bioethics principles, and here.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:36.306 --> 00:50:39.337 But here I want to ask another  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:39.337 --> 00:50:41.851 question that is, is thinking beyond  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:41.851 --> 00:50:43.559 these principles radical enough?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:43.560 --> 00:50:45.975 Remember, I showed this graphic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:45.975 --> 00:50:49.399 and I said what's the next step?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:49.400 --> 00:50:51.944 In moral progress, if we've gone  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:51.944 --> 00:50:54.539 from altruism to charity to justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:54.540 --> 00:50:56.032 what exactly is next?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:56.032 --> 00:50:59.359 And here I want to explore the idea

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:50:59.359 --> 00:51:01.379 of decolonizing global health,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:01.380 --> 00:51:02.366 or decolonization,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:02.366 --> 00:51:05.817 as a possible next step with somewhat

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:05.817 --> 00:51:08.739 radical implications for the way we

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:08.739 --> 00:51:11.089 think about global health ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:11.090 --> 00:51:13.106 So recently there has been a

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:13.106 --> 00:51:14.952 building movement under this rubric

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:14.952 --> 00:51:16.700 of decolonizing global health,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:16.700 --> 00:51:19.454 and I think we have to ask what would

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:19.454 --> 00:51:22.308 this mean for short-term global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:22.310 --> 00:51:23.806 Really exciting, energized movement,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:23.806 --> 00:51:24.928 often of students?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:24.930 --> 00:51:27.914 If you look at this snapshot from Twitter,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:27.920 --> 00:51:29.785 look at the comment underneath  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:29.785 --> 00:51:30.904 the Twitter handle.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:30.910 --> 00:51:33.773 It says we're bored of the Gates  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:33.773 --> 00:51:36.520 Foundation telling us what to do with it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:36.520 --> 00:51:36.965 Interesting,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:36.965 --> 00:51:39.190 cheeky response that only students  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:39.190 --> 00:51:41.360 probably can get away with.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:41.360 --> 00:51:43.166 But it could be an important  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:43.166 --> 00:51:45.848 concept for us to explore in the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:45.848 --> 00:51:47.255 hallmarks of decolonization.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:47.260 --> 00:51:49.850 If we go into the decolonization literature,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:49.850 --> 00:51:51.690 had to do with things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:51.690 --> 00:51:52.794 like self determination,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:52.800 --> 00:51:55.626 number one in a political sense.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:55.630 --> 00:51:58.276 And then #2 eliminating other structures,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:51:58.280 --> 00:52:00.490 financial structures and so on

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:00.490 --> 00:52:02.700 that contribute to NEO colonialism.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:02.700 --> 00:52:03.584 That is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:03.584 --> 00:52:06.678 colonialism that exists even when an entity,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:06.680 --> 00:52:10.635 or when a state is politically independent.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:10.640 --> 00:52:14.000 And I think we should ask what would

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:14.000 --> 00:52:15.679 decolonizing global health mean

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:15.679 --> 00:52:18.353 for ethics concepts that we see in

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:18.353 --> 00:52:20.839 some of these ethics guidelines?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:20.840 --> 00:52:22.540 Terms like mutual benefit,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:22.540 --> 00:52:24.665 sustainability and dare we say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:24.670 --> 00:52:26.370 even those fundamental Western

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:26.370 --> 00:52:27.220 bioethics principles?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:27.220 --> 00:52:30.460 What would it mean to apply

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:30.460 --> 00:52:34.250 decolonization to some of these concepts?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:34.250 --> 00:52:36.450 We should also remember what

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:36.450 --> 00:52:37.770 decolonization is not.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:37.770 --> 00:52:39.120 Decolonizing short-term global  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:39.120 --> 00:52:41.370 health does have rhetorical appeal,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:41.370 --> 00:52:43.874 but we must be clear about what it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:43.874 --> 00:52:47.112 means in the rich literature around  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:47.112 --> 00:52:49.014 decolonization and neocolonialism.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:49.020 --> 00:52:51.720 So decolonizing is not, for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:51.720 --> 00:52:53.520 merely merely political independence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:53.520 --> 00:52:54.870 As I said,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:54.870 --> 00:52:57.306 neocolonialism teaches us that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:57.306 --> 00:52:59.742 financial and other institutional  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:52:59.742 --> 00:53:02.155 structures can matter just as  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:02.155 --> 00:53:04.745 much as far as control and power.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:04.750 --> 00:53:06.450 It's also not about disengagement.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:06.450 --> 00:53:08.490 It's not leaving a place where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:08.490 --> 00:53:09.850 we created a mess.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:09.850 --> 00:53:12.595 We have to still allow for the right kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:12.595 --> 00:53:15.548 of partnerships and engagement to exist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:15.550 --> 00:53:16.717 And of course,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:16.717 --> 00:53:19.051 it's not what some described as

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:19.051 --> 00:53:21.378 fake decolonizing, that is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:21.378 --> 00:53:23.548 restoring ones image without addressing

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:23.548 --> 00:53:25.919 seriously the structural power imbalances.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:25.920 --> 00:53:29.670 Again, that we've often helped create.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:29.670 --> 00:53:30.460 So indeed,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:30.460 --> 00:53:32.830 if we take this concept seriously,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:32.830 --> 00:53:34.805 it might mean rethinking what

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:34.805 --> 00:53:36.385 our traditional principles mean,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:36.390 --> 00:53:37.966 or rethinking them altogether.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:37.966 --> 00:53:38.360 Here,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:38.360 --> 00:53:39.944 I'm showing you again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:39.944 --> 00:53:41.528 those five consensus principles  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:41.528 --> 00:53:43.542 from the Lasker Review around  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:43.542 --> 00:53:45.467 preparation needs and so on.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:45.470 --> 00:53:47.997 In the middle is a lens of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:47.997 --> 00:53:50.069 decolonizing as a new ethics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:50.069 --> 00:53:53.226 lens that we would apply to these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:53.226 --> 00:53:55.736 principles and then we have to ask,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:55.740 --> 00:53:57.948 does it reshape them?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86697394

00:53:57.948 --> 00:54:01.260 This preparation mean educating and analyzing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:01.350 --> 00:54:04.320 cases with attention to colonialism.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:04.320 --> 00:54:06.791 We have to make sure we're eliminating  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:06.791 --> 00:54:08.570 power and structural imbalances.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:08.570 --> 00:54:09.480 Equalized partnerships.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:09.480 --> 00:54:12.210 We have to think about sustainability.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:12.210 --> 00:54:12.988 Important though,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:12.988 --> 00:54:15.322 it is that being separate from

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:15.322 --> 00:54:16.990 dependence or independence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:16.990 --> 00:54:19.294 What does it mean to promote  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:19.294 --> 00:54:20.446 local legal standards,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:20.450 --> 00:54:23.280 not merely replicate northern ones?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:23.280 --> 00:54:24.805 How should evaluation be led  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:24.805 --> 00:54:26.330 and driven by local media?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:26.330 --> 00:54:29.075 So here really I'm asking this as a question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:29.080 --> 00:54:31.520 Again, something we might discuss in the Q&A.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:31.520 --> 00:54:33.650 What would it look like?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:33.650 --> 00:54:35.390 To take decolonization seriously.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:35.390 --> 00:54:38.983 And they use it as a lens to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:38.983 --> 00:54:41.228 rethink some of our principles.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:41.230 --> 00:54:42.970 Important though they are accepted,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:42.970 --> 00:54:46.925 though they are at the present time.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:54:46.930 --> 00:54:49.540 This is just about where I'm going to stop  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333



00:54:49.540 --> 00:54:52.299 and again look forward to some discussion.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:52.300 --> 00:54:56.250 I'll offer three tentative conclusions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:56.250 --> 00:54:57.642 While much work remains,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:57.642 --> 00:54:59.730 I think it's reasonable to suggest.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:54:59.730 --> 00:55:02.202 So we made progress in the policy and

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:02.202 --> 00:55:04.089 practice of short-term global health

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:04.089 --> 00:55:06.489 programs over the past 20 years.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:06.490 --> 00:55:08.962 Progress that sees this is through

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:08.962 --> 00:55:11.310 the ethics lens of justice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:11.310 --> 00:55:12.258 I think Secondly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:12.258 --> 00:55:14.154 there's a real need to evaluate

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:14.154 --> 00:55:15.735 the effectiveness of ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:15.735 --> 00:55:18.135 training with a critical eye toward

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:18.135 --> 00:55:20.087 whether we have the ethics right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:20.090 --> 00:55:22.190 And that's again where concepts

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:22.190 --> 00:55:24.290 of decolonization might come in.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:24.290 --> 00:55:24.954 And arguably,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:24.954 --> 00:55:26.946 perhaps the eventual goal is to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:26.946 --> 00:55:29.167 no longer need short-term global  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:29.167 --> 00:55:30.159 health activities,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:30.160 --> 00:55:34.528 at least not as they are now conceived.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:34.530 --> 00:55:36.302 In two additional thoughts.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:36.302 --> 00:55:38.960 Medical schools do have a critical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:39.040 --> 00:55:41.539 role to play as leaders and they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:41.539 --> 00:55:43.476 have to recognize the trickle  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:43.476 --> 00:55:45.834 down effect of their own policy.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:45.840 --> 00:55:48.052 So one thing that just ever colleague  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:48.052 --> 00:55:50.353 might come to know over the years  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:50.353 --> 00:55:52.285 is emphasized as a concern about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:52.351 --> 00:55:53.725 unintentionally encouraging premed  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333  
00:55:53.725 --> 00:55:56.473 undergrads to do things that make  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:56.473 --> 00:55:59.036 their applications stand out globally.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:55:59.036 --> 00:56:01.656 Do we inadvertently reward things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:01.656 --> 00:56:04.727 like performing outside the scope of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:04.727 --> 00:56:07.869 training only reward applicants who tell us?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:07.870 --> 00:56:10.085 Somewhat grandiose stories of things  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:10.085 --> 00:56:12.664 they've done abroad that arguably they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:12.664 --> 00:56:15.024 would never be allowed to do at home.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:15.030 --> 00:56:15.960 Another major concern,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:15.960 --> 00:56:18.130 but I haven't talked about is the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:18.187 --> 00:56:20.347 advent of so called predatory  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:20.347 --> 00:56:22.075 global health opportunities within  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:22.075 --> 00:56:23.916 organizations that have variable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:23.916 --> 00:56:25.720 financial and charitable efficiencies.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:25.720 --> 00:56:28.716 So that concern here being that there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:28.716 --> 00:56:31.100 are actually some money makers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:31.100 --> 00:56:32.954 Out there in short term global

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:32.954 --> 00:56:35.114 health that verge on being predatory

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:35.114 --> 00:56:37.264 towards students to again give

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:37.264 --> 00:56:39.350 them these opportunities that may

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:39.350 --> 00:56:41.170 make their application stand out.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:41.170 --> 00:56:43.744 And what's our responsibility in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:43.744 --> 00:56:46.379 medical school environment to correct that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:46.380 --> 00:56:47.764 Let's try to close.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:47.764 --> 00:56:49.494 These are just some ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:49.494 --> 00:56:50.520 education resources.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:50.520 --> 00:56:53.520 If anyone wants to learn more about ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:53.520 --> 00:56:55.400 education, and short-term global health,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:55.400 --> 00:56:57.280 I sure appreciate your time.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:57.280 --> 00:56:59.534 And I hope that we have some

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:56:59.534 --> 00:57:01.420 time here for discussion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831724775333333

00:57:01.420 --> 00:57:01.800 thanks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:13.440 --> 00:57:16.470 Set of issues around short-term  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:16.470 --> 00:57:18.894 education and global health.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:18.900 --> 00:57:21.305 We certainly want to entertain  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:21.305 --> 00:57:24.233 questions we have at least 1/2  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:24.233 --> 00:57:26.837 an hour to to provide questions.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:26.840 --> 00:57:31.034 If you will submit your questions to the Q&A,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:31.040 --> 00:57:35.336 type them out and we will.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:35.340 --> 00:57:38.773 And we will. And I can.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:38.773 --> 00:57:39.777 I will read them.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:39.780 --> 00:57:41.271 I wanted to take the opportunity to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:41.271 --> 00:57:43.127 share their to have the first question  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:43.127 --> 00:57:46.210 every couple questions already, but.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:46.210 --> 00:57:49.941 I'm I'm interested that you you talked  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:49.941 --> 00:57:53.174 about the possibility that we might  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:53.174 --> 00:57:56.252 be dealing with forms of exploitation.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:56.260 --> 00:57:58.876 And if you phrase that I took it

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:57:58.876 --> 00:58:01.769 that you phrased that as a question,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:58:01.770 --> 00:58:04.461 so I want to ask you what can you

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:58:04.461 --> 00:58:06.953 unpack that a little further and let

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:58:06.953 --> 00:58:09.738 me further ask is it almost isn't

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:58:09.738 --> 00:58:11.908 it almost inevitable that there's

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:58:11.908 --> 00:58:13.875 going to be some exploitation

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:58:13.875 --> 00:58:15.335 in arrangements like this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:58:15.340 --> 00:58:17.584 where there is all these various

NOTE Confidence: 0.8762254

00:58:17.584 --> 00:58:19.380 asymmetry's that you've pointed out?

NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:20.700 --> 00:58:24.120 Well, see you know, cheer ladder.

NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:24.120 --> 00:58:27.036 Question about the inevitability of it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:27.040 --> 00:58:31.696 Um? They could seem that way. You know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:31.696 --> 00:58:34.774 there are certainly views out there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:34.780 --> 00:58:36.510 That would suggest, for example,

NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:36.510 --> 00:58:39.534 that if we create an ethics calculus.

NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:39.540 --> 00:58:41.750 Of weighing the good and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:41.750 --> 00:58:43.960 the bad of these activities,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:43.960 --> 00:58:46.630 that things like magical educational  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:46.630 --> 00:58:48.766 benefits to our trainees.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:48.770 --> 00:58:52.670 Don't count. Or they can't count  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:52.670 --> 00:58:54.080 because that's exploitation.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:54.080 --> 00:58:56.129 They're getting educational  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:56.129 --> 00:58:59.544 benefit at someone elses expense.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:58:59.550 --> 00:59:01.140 That's one I think extreme view,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:59:01.140 --> 00:59:03.524 and I'm not sure I would actually go  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:59:03.524 --> 00:59:06.108 that far to say that they don't count.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:59:06.110 --> 00:59:10.102 But I think we have to be very  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:59:10.102 --> 00:59:13.180 careful in how we evaluate.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.63689524

00:59:13.180 --> 00:59:14.720 Those risks and benefits.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:16.850 --> 00:59:18.407 To unpack exploitation?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:18.407 --> 00:59:23.537 You know the example I gave is this idea

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:23.537 --> 00:59:27.037 that justifying short-term global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:27.040 --> 00:59:30.960 On the basis of benefit to underserved

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:30.960 --> 00:59:34.171 communities locally is could be seen

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:34.171 --> 00:59:37.045 as a subtle form of exploitation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:37.050 --> 00:59:40.616 Then I don't know what people are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:40.620 --> 00:59:44.316 Not everyone may agree with that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:44.320 --> 00:59:48.406 But it it certainly starts to seem like it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:48.410 --> 00:59:51.077 Um, I think we all hope that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:51.080 --> 00:59:52.428 in an ideal world,

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:52.428 --> 00:59:54.985 and maybe it's years in the future

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:54.985 --> 00:59:57.751 that there aren't power imbalances and

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

00:59:57.751 --> 01:00:00.459 things don't come at other peoples.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:00.460 --> 01:00:04.156 Fences and so on. But it does raise.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:04.160 --> 01:00:06.386 I think this other question because

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:06.386 --> 01:00:08.860 if we think about exploitation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647



01:00:08.860 --> 01:00:13.160 we think about benefiting at others expense.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:13.160 --> 01:00:16.040 That requires us to really know

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:16.040 --> 01:00:18.310 what the others expense is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:18.310 --> 01:00:18.783 Unfortunately.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:18.783 --> 01:00:22.094 Those of us who have engaged in

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:22.094 --> 01:00:24.513 these kinds of activities are

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:24.513 --> 01:00:27.285 often in the least best position.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:27.290 --> 01:00:30.888 To understand what those expenses might be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:30.890 --> 01:00:33.170 So when we talk about benefits

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:33.170 --> 01:00:34.690 and burdens really do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:34.690 --> 01:00:36.590 short-term activities will often talk,

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:36.590 --> 01:00:39.638 draw analogies from full cost accounting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:39.640 --> 01:00:43.033 Right in the nature of we have to really

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:43.033 --> 01:00:45.180 understand what all those potential

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:45.180 --> 01:00:48.529 burdens and expenses might be to even know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:00:48.530 --> 01:00:50.669 Whether or not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:00:50.670 --> 01:00:52.968 There are keruing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:00:52.970 --> 01:00:55.928 And maybe that's the first step.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:00:55.930 --> 01:00:57.074 You know, I I,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:00:57.074 --> 01:00:58.218 I can say personally,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:00:58.220 --> 01:01:00.392 that when I went to Honduras  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:00.392 --> 01:01:02.750 you know now 20 years ago.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:02.750 --> 01:01:05.640 I probably didn't even see.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:05.640 --> 01:01:09.966 The burden of the airport transfers.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:09.970 --> 01:01:10.837 And so on,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:10.837 --> 01:01:13.542 going back and forth to the site I was  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:13.542 --> 01:01:15.966 in the least best position to see that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:15.970 --> 01:01:17.853 And I think until we can understand  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:17.853 --> 01:01:19.650 what those expenses and burns might be,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:19.650 --> 01:01:21.228 it's hard to even have a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647  
01:01:21.228 --> 01:01:22.017 conversation about exploitation.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:01:22.020 --> 01:01:24.116 I don't know if that answers the question,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.855473094117647

01:01:24.120 --> 01:01:26.224 but those are just some thoughts on it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:27.170 --> 01:01:30.398 That's what we wanted.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:30.400 --> 01:01:33.672 Now let me we we have other questions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:33.672 --> 01:01:37.386 coming into only from one from one of my  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:37.386 --> 01:01:40.430 colleagues from the Public Health school.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:40.430 --> 01:01:43.040 Thank you for a wonderful talk.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:43.040 --> 01:01:45.410 How does the presence or absence  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:45.410 --> 01:01:46.990 of an established long-term  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:47.057 --> 01:01:49.262 partnership between the Hi C&LMIC  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:49.262 --> 01:01:51.467 institutions impact the ethics of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:51.535 --> 01:01:53.507 short-term global health work?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:53.510 --> 01:01:57.090 And if you will?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:57.090 --> 01:01:59.325 Unpaid tell us the meaning  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:01:59.325 --> 01:02:01.560 of Hi C&LMIC for everyone.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.78215796

01:02:01.560 --> 01:02:02.450 Oh sorry,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:02.450 --> 01:02:06.671 so high income country versus lower middle

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:06.671 --> 01:02:10.491 income country tends to rely on World

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:10.491 --> 01:02:13.750 Bank definitions about Ian and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:13.750 --> 01:02:15.618 The question about long,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:15.620 --> 01:02:18.360 long term partnerships.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:18.360 --> 01:02:19.910 You know it does change.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:19.910 --> 01:02:23.010 I think the way we we think about the ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:23.010 --> 01:02:25.314 Most people will say that these

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:25.314 --> 01:02:27.300 longer term partnerships are ideal.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:27.300 --> 01:02:29.568 We all say, let me let me add this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:29.570 --> 01:02:31.250 by the way, when I said that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:31.250 --> 01:02:32.783 our approach to evaluating the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:32.783 --> 01:02:34.658 ethics needs to be developmental.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:34.660 --> 01:02:36.490 I'll also be upfront that this

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:36.490 --> 01:02:38.559 really relies in some respects on

NOTE Confidence: 0.8062485

01:02:38.559 --> 01:02:40.529 my original experience in Honduras.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:02:42.720 --> 01:02:45.338 There if you, if I looked only

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:02:45.338 --> 01:02:47.579 at my experience 20 years ago,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:02:47.580 --> 01:02:51.150 that was not a long term partnership.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:02:51.150 --> 01:02:53.100 Lot of the activities from

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:02:53.100 --> 01:02:55.050 the outside probably could be

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:02:55.126 --> 01:02:57.010 looked at as unsustainable.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:02:57.010 --> 01:02:59.850 But that was the start.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:02:59.850 --> 01:03:01.630 And overtime because the organizers

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:01.630 --> 01:03:03.410 were committed to longer term

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:03.469 --> 01:03:04.839 sustainable partnerships,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:04.840 --> 01:03:07.696 it's now grown and developed in

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:07.696 --> 01:03:11.529 such a way that it's entirely run.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:11.530 --> 01:03:13.858 In Honduras by people in Honduras,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:13.860 --> 01:03:16.062 in short term groups come in

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:16.062 --> 01:03:18.813 from time to time as part of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:18.813 --> 01:03:21.207 what we would describe as more

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:21.207 --> 01:03:23.290 mutually beneficial exchange.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:23.290 --> 01:03:25.915 For a program that really is lead.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:25.920 --> 01:03:28.132 By people in Honduras.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:28.132 --> 01:03:30.344 That looks ethically very

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:30.344 --> 01:03:32.458 different than something where

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:32.458 --> 01:03:35.664 a group comes in for two weeks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:35.670 --> 01:03:38.645 Does a lot of service activities or

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:38.645 --> 01:03:40.843 clinical care activities and leaves

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:40.843 --> 01:03:42.968 and there's nothing else there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:42.970 --> 01:03:44.194 So in a way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:44.194 --> 01:03:47.609 I would we want it to be that there

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:47.609 --> 01:03:50.579 is a long term partnership and

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:50.579 --> 01:03:53.772 short-term activities almost become an

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:53.772 --> 01:03:57.022 increasingly small or different part.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:57.030 --> 01:03:59.670 Of the whole picture.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:03:59.670 --> 01:04:01.620 In fact, in that case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:04:01.620 --> 01:04:03.960 go back to the first question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:04:03.960 --> 01:04:05.046 In that case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:04:05.046 --> 01:04:07.580 it may actually be more justifiable that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8899073

01:04:07.650 --> 01:04:10.200 the main benefit there is educational.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:12.370 --> 01:04:14.254 Because the way that program looks  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:14.254 --> 01:04:16.793 as a whole lot less about quote  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:16.793 --> 01:04:18.813 delivering benefits to the community  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:18.813 --> 01:04:21.488 abroad or benefiting at their expense.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:21.490 --> 01:04:24.150 So I think it's a great question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:24.150 --> 01:04:25.290 Long term sustainable  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:25.290 --> 01:04:26.810 partnerships are often idealized.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:26.810 --> 01:04:29.470 We shouldn't expect them in all cases.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:29.470 --> 01:04:31.370 We maybe expect that they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85750735

01:04:31.370 --> 01:04:33.270 grow to that point overtime.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:36.170 --> 01:04:40.280 Alright, thank you. Another question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:40.280 --> 01:04:42.608 How is it possible to quote

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:42.608 --> 01:04:43.772 demonstrate solidarity through

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:43.772 --> 01:04:45.579 global health activities without

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:45.579 --> 01:04:47.387 having a measurable impact?

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:47.390 --> 01:04:49.475 Don't outcomes matter more than

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:49.475 --> 01:04:51.143 both character and actions?

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:51.150 --> 01:04:53.748 Isn't the point of global health

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:53.748 --> 01:04:56.332 activities improving the health of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:56.332 --> 01:04:58.666 communities where they are carried out?

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:04:58.670 --> 01:05:01.178 If these activities do not help,

NOTE Confidence: 0.90605656

01:05:01.180 --> 01:05:02.848 what is the point?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:02.850 --> 01:05:06.586 Yeah, good. This is a question from someone

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:06.586 --> 01:05:10.369 who who is a hardcore outcomes person.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:10.370 --> 01:05:14.486 Um? Maybe? I agree.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523



01:05:14.486 --> 01:05:16.326 Um, although I probably think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:16.326 --> 01:05:18.399 that there's still room for both,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:18.400 --> 01:05:21.190 and if I put on my philosophy hat and came  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:21.260 --> 01:05:23.918 up with a philosophy thought experiment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:23.920 --> 01:05:27.336 I would say that we could certainly imagine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:27.340 --> 01:05:29.928 A top down program.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:29.928 --> 01:05:32.516 That's implemented from above.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:32.520 --> 01:05:34.962 And could be very efficient and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:34.962 --> 01:05:37.450 heavy handed at achieving an outcome.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:37.450 --> 01:05:40.066 But it's not been done through a process  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:40.066 --> 01:05:42.392 of decision making that's engaged or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:42.392 --> 01:05:44.402 involved with the local community  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:44.402 --> 01:05:46.664 where that community is helped define  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:46.664 --> 01:05:49.368 the needs and shapes them overtime and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:49.368 --> 01:05:53.000 really kind of leaves it on their own.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:53.000 --> 01:05:55.574 So I still think that some

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:55.574 --> 01:05:57.290 of these process oriented.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:57.290 --> 01:05:59.390 Outcomes for lack of a better word

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:05:59.390 --> 01:06:01.190 can really matter, and in fact,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:01.190 --> 01:06:02.690 if we thought about it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:02.690 --> 01:06:04.928 we probably could come up with

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:04.928 --> 01:06:06.047 ways to measure.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:06.050 --> 01:06:09.098 Sentiments around solidarity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:09.100 --> 01:06:11.968 Sentiments around respect.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:11.970 --> 01:06:13.830 So again, that's that's that's an.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:13.830 --> 01:06:16.310 I will say that is something we've heard.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:16.310 --> 01:06:17.550 We've done, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:17.550 --> 01:06:18.790 research with local communities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:18.790 --> 01:06:20.960 They seem also to care about this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:20.960 --> 01:06:21.580 Now again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:21.580 --> 01:06:22.510 we don't know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:22.510 --> 01:06:25.527 I wouldn't go too far in that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:25.527 --> 01:06:26.389 direction either.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:26.390 --> 01:06:29.140 But I wouldn't go so far as to say that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:29.220 --> 01:06:32.106 only these more process or decision  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:32.106 --> 01:06:34.030 process oriented metrics matter.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:34.030 --> 01:06:36.973 We still want to have the outcomes in mind,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:36.980 --> 01:06:38.792 but I think.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:38.792 --> 01:06:43.020 If we listen to people from abroad.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:43.020 --> 01:06:45.276 And listen to the people that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:45.276 --> 01:06:46.404 we've talked to.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:46.410 --> 01:06:48.755 At least they seem to suggest that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:48.755 --> 01:06:51.354 some of these more character based  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:51.354 --> 01:06:53.386 treatment based process based.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:53.390 --> 01:06:55.476 Concepts matter just as much to them,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:55.480 --> 01:06:57.864 and I guess for me I just take  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8711523

01:06:57.864 --> 01:06:58.460 that seriously.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:00.900 --> 01:07:05.202 Before I want to follow up a little bit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:05.210 --> 01:07:08.304 By asking I, I think it's admirable

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:08.304 --> 01:07:11.896 that that you and your group have

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:11.896 --> 01:07:14.606 have actually listened to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:14.606 --> 01:07:17.586 recipients of some of these programs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:17.590 --> 01:07:20.560 and it strikes me that that

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:20.560 --> 01:07:22.540 would should be essential.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:22.540 --> 01:07:25.085 How regularly does that happen

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:25.085 --> 01:07:27.121 that people actually seek

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:27.121 --> 01:07:29.590 feedback from the communities that

NOTE Confidence: 0.87353325

01:07:29.590 --> 01:07:31.940 they have been engaged with?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:32.520 --> 01:07:34.865 Yeah, I think it's a great question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:34.870 --> 01:07:38.227 It would be hard to make a statement of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:38.227 --> 01:07:40.577 percentages partly going back to this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:40.580 --> 01:07:43.541 Issue that it's such a disk unregulated

NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:43.541 --> 01:07:46.924 space of charities and NGOs that it's hard  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:46.924 --> 01:07:49.480 to know exactly what's happening where.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:49.480 --> 01:07:52.804 I think that there is increasing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:52.804 --> 01:07:56.210 recognition of the need to do this.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:56.210 --> 01:07:58.499 So I think it's happening more often.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:07:58.500 --> 01:08:01.620 This is a place where I think academic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:01.620 --> 01:08:03.470 institutions can probably lead.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:03.470 --> 01:08:04.794 Right, because academic institutions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:04.794 --> 01:08:06.449 have lead in creating some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:06.449 --> 01:08:08.089 of these guidance documents,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:08.090 --> 01:08:10.075 evaluation and understanding the local  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:10.075 --> 01:08:12.456 community are clearly parts of these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:12.456 --> 01:08:15.128 documents and this is a case where academic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:15.128 --> 01:08:16.960 programs really can take the lead.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:16.960 --> 01:08:18.352 So it is happening.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:18.352 --> 01:08:20.092 I think it's happening more

NOTE Confidence: 0.8936046

01:08:20.092 --> 01:08:22.288 and needs to happen even more.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:24.970 --> 01:08:28.564 Thank you. Here's another question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:28.564 --> 01:08:31.070 I recently had a large grant frozen

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:31.132 --> 01:08:33.208 by Yale because they argue that

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:33.208 --> 01:08:35.340 running a medical training program in

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:35.340 --> 01:08:37.398 East Africa is currently too risky,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:37.400 --> 01:08:40.824 quote due to covid. At the same time,

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:40.830 --> 01:08:42.086 we're allowing medical training

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:42.086 --> 01:08:43.970 programs in the US to continue.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:43.970 --> 01:08:45.880 I personally think this is

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:45.880 --> 01:08:47.408 neither fair nor reasonable.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165445

01:08:47.410 --> 01:08:49.720 Would be interested to hear your thoughts.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8018896

01:08:51.920 --> 01:08:55.628 Right now I don't know the.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8018896

01:08:55.630 --> 01:08:58.970 Yell environment that well but.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8018896

01:08:58.970 --> 01:09:01.189 Yeah, if we abstract from that to

NOTE Confidence: 0.8018896

01:09:01.189 --> 01:09:03.088 the general question, I would say.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:06.130 --> 01:09:08.170 It's and it is an example of this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:08.170 --> 01:09:11.160 question of standards, isn't it?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:11.160 --> 01:09:14.152 You know that the way we think about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:14.152 --> 01:09:16.781 risk and the way institutions often  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:16.781 --> 01:09:20.056 think about risk as well is not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:20.056 --> 01:09:23.044 purely based on some objective number.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:23.050 --> 01:09:25.690 Right that we somehow think that risk is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:25.690 --> 01:09:28.097 different in one setting versus another,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:28.100 --> 01:09:30.410 and we're more tolerant of risk in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:30.410 --> 01:09:32.440 this setting versus another setting,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:32.440 --> 01:09:35.088 so I don't think I can come out  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:35.088 --> 01:09:37.488 whether it's precisely fair or not,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:37.490 --> 01:09:41.202 other than to say that I can at  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:41.202 --> 01:09:43.780 least understand that in my view.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:43.780 --> 01:09:46.496 I don't see risk of a purely

NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:46.496 --> 01:09:49.070 objective matter. Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:49.070 --> 01:09:51.702 Certainly I see that as a clinician

NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:51.702 --> 01:09:54.060 where patients view risk differently.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:54.060 --> 01:09:57.500 Institutions view risk differently.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:57.500 --> 01:09:58.650 That said, it's a tough.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86560816

01:09:58.650 --> 01:09:59.800 That is a tough situation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9364162

01:10:01.850 --> 01:10:02.420 Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8654639

01:10:04.860 --> 01:10:06.870 Here's another, rather briefer question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8654639

01:10:06.870 --> 01:10:10.566 Do you have an example of a medical

NOTE Confidence: 0.8654639

01:10:10.566 --> 01:10:13.282 program that comes the closest

NOTE Confidence: 0.8654639

01:10:13.282 --> 01:10:16.350 to being anti colonial? Who?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8182294

01:10:20.610 --> 01:10:23.312 And you can. You can take that

NOTE Confidence: 0.8182294

01:10:23.312 --> 01:10:26.164 question in any direction you like.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8182294

01:10:26.164 --> 01:10:28.298 I I examples you like

NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:28.300 --> 01:10:30.007 you know that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908



01:10:30.007 --> 01:10:33.990 I don't know that a perfect example.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:33.990 --> 01:10:38.288 Comes to mind. But that's partly a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:38.288 --> 01:10:42.548 reflection of my own limitations in.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:42.550 --> 01:10:45.772 Not being sure that we really  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:45.772 --> 01:10:48.640 know what anti colonial means.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:48.640 --> 01:10:52.850 More its implications for ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:52.850 --> 01:10:55.524 So I think partly my inability or  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:55.524 --> 01:10:58.359 my reluctance to highlight any one  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:10:58.359 --> 01:11:01.034 program reflects that own uncertainty.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:01.040 --> 01:11:04.526 In my thinking about what decolonizing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:04.530 --> 01:11:06.025 Activities really can or should  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:06.025 --> 01:11:07.970 mean you as part is preparing  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:07.970 --> 01:11:09.905 this and then thinking about  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:09.905 --> 01:11:12.356 decolonizing you know there is a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:12.356 --> 01:11:14.036 rich literature around decolonization.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:14.040 --> 01:11:15.608 From the 50s, sixties,

NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:15.608 --> 01:11:19.257 70s like and it's a lot to get into

NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:19.257 --> 01:11:22.410 and I'm excited to learn more about it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:22.410 --> 01:11:23.840 But probably it's that feeling

NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:23.840 --> 01:11:26.191 like I only have that tip of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:26.191 --> 01:11:27.621 iceberg that prevents me from

NOTE Confidence: 0.878433908

01:11:27.621 --> 01:11:29.358 saying more about that question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:31.000 --> 01:11:34.980 Thank you. As it turns out,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:34.980 --> 01:11:37.880 Tracy Raven is in attendance and she has.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:37.880 --> 01:11:39.332 She has commented here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:39.332 --> 01:11:42.260 Thanks so much for a fantastic talk Matt,

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:42.260 --> 01:11:44.030 I really appreciate the way that

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:44.030 --> 01:11:46.133 you laid out the issues with

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:46.133 --> 01:11:48.273 the evidence based around his

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:48.273 --> 01:11:49.557 predeparture ethics training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:49.560 --> 01:11:51.425 I completely agree with your

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:51.425 --> 01:11:52.917 schematic describing the evolution  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:52.917 --> 01:11:54.667 from altruism to charity etc.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:54.670 --> 01:11:57.771 And I also agree that the decolonization  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:57.771 --> 01:11:59.979 movement is the next step.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:11:59.980 --> 01:12:01.784 Harriet my younger mckeary  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:01.784 --> 01:12:03.137 Michelle Berry Ann.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:03.140 --> 01:12:06.311 I just published a piece in academic  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:06.311 --> 01:12:08.584 medicine last month arguing that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:08.584 --> 01:12:11.475 the halt in travel due to COVID-19  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:11.475 --> 01:12:14.785 his coincided well with the rise of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:14.785 --> 01:12:17.592 this new consciousness and gives a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:17.592 --> 01:12:19.436 great opportunity for educational  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:19.436 --> 01:12:22.199 programs to reevaluate the way that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:22.199 --> 01:12:24.329 they interact with global partners.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:24.330 --> 01:12:27.240 Have you seen examples of institutions  
NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:27.240 --> 01:12:29.180 grappling with these issues

NOTE Confidence: 0.92360294

01:12:29.254 --> 01:12:30.650 over the past year?

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:32.150 --> 01:12:34.350 I, I think it's the truth as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:34.350 --> 01:12:36.265 Thanks for the comments to

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:36.265 --> 01:12:38.890 Tracy and Glad I sorta see you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:38.890 --> 01:12:40.378 Glad you saw me like that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:40.380 --> 01:12:43.600 I can see you but.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:43.600 --> 01:12:46.449 I think institutions are grappling with this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:46.450 --> 01:12:49.450 and I'll say this this slide in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:49.450 --> 01:12:52.147 comments about what decolonizing is not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:52.150 --> 01:12:55.168 I think it's also really important.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:12:55.170 --> 01:13:01.127 I I always have fears that when

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:01.127 --> 01:13:05.250 concepts become rhetorically appealing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:05.250 --> 01:13:08.995 We fail. The scrutinize what they mean,

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:09.000 --> 01:13:11.892 or we pick and choose the

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:11.892 --> 01:13:14.859 parts of it that we like.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:14.860 --> 01:13:17.732 And so to give a historical example of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:17.732 --> 01:13:20.878 that in the decolonization literature,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:20.880 --> 01:13:24.024 there was a very clear concern  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:24.024 --> 01:13:26.120 where when decolonizing meant.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:26.120 --> 01:13:28.334 Giving political independence.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:28.334 --> 01:13:31.286 The former colonial states.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:31.290 --> 01:13:33.060 What actually happened?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:33.060 --> 01:13:34.830 Was it justified?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:34.830 --> 01:13:38.620 Colonial powers leaving that state.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:38.620 --> 01:13:40.213 While continuing to  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:40.213 --> 01:13:41.806 extract natural resources,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:41.810 --> 01:13:43.046 economic resources,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:43.046 --> 01:13:47.372 and financial gain now from a former  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:47.372 --> 01:13:51.336 colony over which or for which they  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:51.336 --> 01:13:53.990 had zero responsibility at all.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:53.990 --> 01:13:56.120 And that was picking and choosing

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:56.120 --> 01:13:57.540 a particular we liked.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:57.540 --> 01:13:59.694 The part of decolonization that takes

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:13:59.694 --> 01:14:01.799 us politically out of the state,

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:01.800 --> 01:14:04.537 so long as the financial structures and

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:04.537 --> 01:14:07.193 other parts of the global institutional

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:07.193 --> 01:14:10.483 context allow us to continue to benefit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:10.490 --> 01:14:13.514 So I would say that's probably my.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:13.520 --> 01:14:14.594 Caution about.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:14.594 --> 01:14:17.816 Decolonizing is for us not to

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:17.816 --> 01:14:21.230 pick and choose just the parts.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:21.230 --> 01:14:23.477 That we like that if we're really

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:23.477 --> 01:14:26.079 going to take decolonizing seriously,

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:26.080 --> 01:14:29.368 I think it it means scrutinizing

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:29.368 --> 01:14:31.012 every last part.

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:31.020 --> 01:14:33.364 Of our activities and I maybe didn't say

NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:33.364 --> 01:14:35.560 it clearly enough in the presentation,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:35.560 --> 01:14:39.606 but that also includes the ethics principles.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:39.610 --> 01:14:42.480 That in many ways we have exported  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:42.480 --> 01:14:43.710 Western bioethics principles  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:43.775 --> 01:14:45.683 into places where I'm not quite  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:45.683 --> 01:14:47.420 sure that was the right,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:47.420 --> 01:14:51.506 or is the right thing to do it maybe?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:51.510 --> 01:14:53.330 But it may not be.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:53.330 --> 01:14:55.059 And so I do think institutions are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:55.059 --> 01:14:56.310 starting to grapple with this.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:56.310 --> 01:14:57.857 We just have to be careful with  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:57.857 --> 01:14:59.528 the way we apply the concept.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.76122576

01:14:59.530 --> 01:15:00.518 It's a great question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8911493

01:15:02.560 --> 01:15:03.340 Thank you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8589165

01:15:05.770 --> 01:15:07.624 Now the question so many of  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8589165

01:15:07.624 --> 01:15:09.649 your points or comment so many

NOTE Confidence: 0.8589165

01:15:09.649 --> 01:15:11.803 of your points resonate with my

NOTE Confidence: 0.8589165

01:15:11.803 --> 01:15:13.580 experience working on a micro edit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8589165

01:15:13.580 --> 01:15:15.484 Microcredit project in Kenya.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8589165

01:15:15.484 --> 01:15:19.332 In 2000. I return to the US with

NOTE Confidence: 0.8589165

01:15:19.332 --> 01:15:21.260 many complicated feelings about

NOTE Confidence: 0.8589165

01:15:21.350 --> 01:15:24.700 International Development. Hang on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:27.990 --> 01:15:30.000 Such as you describe about

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:30.000 --> 01:15:31.206 the medical missions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:31.210 --> 01:15:32.710 You see this research applying

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:32.710 --> 01:15:34.925 in the same way to broader

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:34.925 --> 01:15:36.857 International Development projects

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:36.860 --> 01:15:38.870 there. That's a great question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:38.870 --> 01:15:41.345 There are really interesting areas

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:41.345 --> 01:15:44.040 of overlap. Sometimes when I talk

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:44.040 --> 01:15:46.165 to students about short-term global

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475



01:15:46.165 --> 01:15:48.656 health or to audiences that are less.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:48.660 --> 01:15:51.096 Maybe less engaged with short term  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:51.096 --> 01:15:53.649 global health then say it clinical.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:53.650 --> 01:15:56.050 Audience. I will say actually  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:56.050 --> 01:15:59.161 the way we think about short-term  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:15:59.161 --> 01:16:02.875 global health ethics is a microcosm.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:02.880 --> 01:16:05.358 Could be seen as a microcosm for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:05.358 --> 01:16:07.359 global health ethics more broadly.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:07.360 --> 01:16:09.880 And so these concepts are just examples.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:09.880 --> 01:16:12.428 This is 1 setting where we have  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:12.428 --> 01:16:13.840 to wrestle with it,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:13.840 --> 01:16:17.039 but in fact it has intersections and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:17.039 --> 01:16:18.990 connections to humanitarian ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:18.990 --> 01:16:20.616 Developmental, a ethics,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:20.616 --> 01:16:22.784 and oftentimes unfortunately these  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:22.784 --> 01:16:25.468 groups don't talk to each other.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:25.470 --> 01:16:28.806 It's some extent it could be a criticism,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:28.810 --> 01:16:32.572 in fact of the short term of that history,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:32.580 --> 01:16:35.660 I told you of short term global health

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:35.660 --> 01:16:38.010 and development of ethics guidelines.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:38.010 --> 01:16:40.395 I'm sure there are developmental

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:40.395 --> 01:16:42.780 there aid workers and humanitarian

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:42.860 --> 01:16:44.498 organizations that say.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:44.500 --> 01:16:46.936 Why did it take short-term global health

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:46.936 --> 01:16:49.463 ethics this long to come to these

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:49.463 --> 01:16:51.233 principles that we've been thinking

NOTE Confidence: 0.8778475

01:16:51.233 --> 01:16:53.550 about in the aid context for decades?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:16:55.670 --> 01:16:58.136 As an example, as a concrete example of that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:16:58.140 --> 01:17:01.310 one of the best. Crazy fast,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:01.310 --> 01:17:04.790 but one of the frameworks that's out there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:04.790 --> 01:17:07.532 To help understand exceeding scope of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:07.532 --> 01:17:10.238 practice and a decision framework for  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:10.238 --> 01:17:13.414 with whether or how it can be justified  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:13.498 --> 01:17:16.198 is actually found from Matthew Hunt,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:16.200 --> 01:17:18.424 Lisa Schwartz and colleagues  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:18.424 --> 01:17:21.204 in the humanitarian aid world.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:21.210 --> 01:17:23.810 Where in humanitarian disasters this  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:23.810 --> 01:17:26.410 exact situation often comes up.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:26.410 --> 01:17:28.858 And so there are ways in which there  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:28.858 --> 01:17:30.844 should be connection between the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:30.844 --> 01:17:33.009 short term global health context  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:33.009 --> 01:17:34.880 and these other domains,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:34.880 --> 01:17:38.160 including I would say locally.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:38.160 --> 01:17:40.776 Right, it is not uncommon for areas in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:40.776 --> 01:17:43.528 our own communities for us to experience  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8942185

01:17:43.528 --> 01:17:46.339 some of these same kinds of issues.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.86405134

01:17:49.720 --> 01:17:50.890 Alright, great.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89664537

01:17:54.570 --> 01:17:58.354 Another question. Which should

NOTE Confidence: 0.89664537

01:17:58.354 --> 01:18:00.796 give you some room to two.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8598668

01:18:02.930 --> 01:18:05.720 Two to move. What are your thoughts on the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8598668

01:18:05.720 --> 01:18:08.315 ethics of remote based global health work?

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:10.650 --> 01:18:15.186 So that that's an interesting question too.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:15.190 --> 01:18:19.134 Yeah, the first thought that comes to mind,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:19.140 --> 01:18:22.598 of course, is that many remote technologies,

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:22.600 --> 01:18:25.540 AI mobile technologies and so

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:25.540 --> 01:18:28.480 on have have been justified.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:28.480 --> 01:18:31.540 Buy the potential to leapfrog

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:31.540 --> 01:18:34.600 things like the digital divide.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:34.600 --> 01:18:37.484 Or leapfrog some of the challenges that

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:37.484 --> 01:18:40.869 we have in delivering global health.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:40.870 --> 01:18:43.666 Education, health, education and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:43.670 --> 01:18:47.873 But the question here is a little bit more.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:47.880 --> 01:18:52.060 I think service directed. Anne.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:52.060 --> 01:18:53.970 It's probably familiar in my  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:53.970 --> 01:18:56.549 mind is probably a case by case.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:18:56.550 --> 01:19:00.554 Sort of. Analysis For that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:00.554 --> 01:19:03.422 Certainly some of the same principles  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:03.422 --> 01:19:06.258 about making sure that the remote  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:06.258 --> 01:19:09.010 technology meets a community to find  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:09.010 --> 01:19:11.775 need are still going to apply right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:11.780 --> 01:19:14.216 One of the challenges that are  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:14.216 --> 01:19:16.868 one of the ways that challenges  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:16.868 --> 01:19:20.144 in global health can be framed is  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:20.144 --> 01:19:22.999 the idea that we're providing.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:23.000 --> 01:19:24.740 A type of assistance.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:24.740 --> 01:19:26.480 Not because it's needed,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.80774856

01:19:26.480 --> 01:19:28.226 but because we can provide it.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094

01:19:30.330 --> 01:19:33.309 And I think that comes up in the remote

NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:33.309 --> 01:19:35.384 global health context too, right?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:35.384 --> 01:19:37.512 I mean, is it that the community  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:37.512 --> 01:19:39.506 really needs remote phone based  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:39.506 --> 01:19:41.274 diagnosis of diabetic retinopathy?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:41.280 --> 01:19:43.471 Or is it because we on our  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:43.471 --> 01:19:45.322 gadgets developed a really cool  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:45.322 --> 01:19:47.010 app for diabetic retinopathy  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:47.010 --> 01:19:49.310 and think they should have it?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:49.310 --> 01:19:51.500 And that's what those are two?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:51.500 --> 01:19:54.040 Those look very different.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85379094  
01:19:54.040 --> 01:19:56.580 Ethically great.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.77388334  
01:19:59.110 --> 01:20:00.786 And here's a comment from.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.77388334  
01:20:00.786 --> 01:20:02.880 Tom Duffy your description of how  
NOTE Confidence: 0.807904681666667  
01:20:02.950 --> 01:20:05.617 we should behave in these encounters travels  
NOTE Confidence: 0.807904681666667  
01:20:05.617 --> 01:20:08.259 in the territory of Virtue and Medicine.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.807904681666667

01:20:08.260 --> 01:20:10.126 Prudence, Justice, Temperance  
NOTE Confidence: 0.807904681666667

01:20:10.126 --> 01:20:12.614 and Fortitude are enchantment  
NOTE Confidence: 0.807904681666667

01:20:12.614 --> 01:20:15.474 with principle based ethics moves  
NOTE Confidence: 0.807904681666667

01:20:15.474 --> 01:20:18.222 such an ethical engagement to the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.807904681666667

01:20:18.222 --> 01:20:21.089 sidelines or even out of the picture.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.807904681666667

01:20:21.090 --> 01:20:21.830 Could you come in?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:22.810 --> 01:20:27.674 I think that I appreciate the comment and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:27.680 --> 01:20:29.692 Yeah, maybe it wasn't.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:29.692 --> 01:20:34.030 Clear enough, but I I'm hoping to provide.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:34.030 --> 01:20:36.238 Or at least explore a bit  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:36.238 --> 01:20:38.220 of a corrective to that.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:38.220 --> 01:20:40.278 With that, that's where I think  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:40.278 --> 01:20:44.250 that some of these. Concepts of.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:44.250 --> 01:20:45.663 Introspection and humility.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:45.663 --> 01:20:48.018 And in also in that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8989297

01:20:48.018 --> 01:20:50.260 article is social justice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:20:52.410 --> 01:20:54.990 Do you have a different?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:20:54.990 --> 01:20:58.564 A different tenor. And a different

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:20:58.564 --> 01:21:02.110 impact on the way we think about ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:02.110 --> 01:21:05.980 Um, and to me it just really is encapsulated

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:05.980 --> 01:21:10.345 in that distinction of the questions between.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:10.350 --> 01:21:14.706 What is being done? Versus why?

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:14.710 --> 01:21:18.782 Or how? So I I agree with the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:18.782 --> 01:21:22.410 comment and I'm hoping to think.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:22.410 --> 01:21:24.086 About how we can.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:24.086 --> 01:21:27.630 Together promote that kind of a corrective.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:27.630 --> 01:21:30.710 Certainly plenty of of critics

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:30.710 --> 01:21:33.790 of the principles out there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:33.790 --> 01:21:35.505 I know that the authors of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:35.505 --> 01:21:36.833 principles think that the principles

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:36.833 --> 01:21:38.447 capture a common morality and we

NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508



01:21:38.447 --> 01:21:39.901 could get into a philosophical  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:39.901 --> 01:21:41.341 discussion about whether or not  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:41.341 --> 01:21:43.817 that you know is or is not the case,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:43.820 --> 01:21:46.025 but I think I think in the real world  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:46.025 --> 01:21:48.145 there should be space for these other.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:48.150 --> 01:21:49.776 These other concepts and other principles,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:49.780 --> 01:21:50.864 so I don't know.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9302508

01:21:50.864 --> 01:21:52.219 I agree with the comment.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9373139

01:21:53.610 --> 01:21:54.060 Thank you.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8630987

01:21:56.530 --> 01:21:58.198 Given global travel restrictions,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8630987

01:21:58.198 --> 01:22:00.700 many global health programs are currently  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8630987

01:22:00.758 --> 01:22:02.648 on standby or have been shut down.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8630987

01:22:02.650 --> 01:22:05.530 How and when do you think such programs  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8630987

01:22:05.530 --> 01:22:08.410 can resume in a safe and acceptable way?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8630987

01:22:08.410 --> 01:22:10.699 And who will issue guidance on what  
NOTE Confidence: 0.8630987

01:22:10.699 --> 01:22:12.730 counts as safe and acceptable?

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:13.790 --> 01:22:16.230 Yeah, this I probably in that as a

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:16.230 --> 01:22:18.505 factor them as a fact of the matter.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:18.510 --> 01:22:20.550 A lot of these programs.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:20.550 --> 01:22:22.795 That are institutionally based will

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:22.795 --> 01:22:25.040 be decided based on institutional.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:25.040 --> 01:22:26.366 Policies and procedures

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:26.366 --> 01:22:28.576 may be informed by you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:28.580 --> 01:22:30.850 Know national level CDC type

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:30.850 --> 01:22:33.440 guidance around travel and so on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:33.440 --> 01:22:36.068 We certainly talk enough to people

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:36.068 --> 01:22:38.771 in other countries where you know

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:38.771 --> 01:22:40.946 vaccines are just not happening.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:40.950 --> 01:22:43.602 You know, talk about a big

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:43.602 --> 01:22:44.928 ethics issue right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:44.930 --> 01:22:47.576 As much as we want vaccine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:47.580 --> 01:22:50.406 For the US, you know we could have a  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:50.406 --> 01:22:53.139 whole conversation about global vaccine  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:53.139 --> 01:22:56.643 distribution and the fairness or unfairness.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:56.650 --> 01:22:58.794 Of the way the vaccines have been purchased,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:22:58.800 --> 01:23:00.130 but certainly talking to some  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:00.130 --> 01:23:01.760 of the global partners we have,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:01.760 --> 01:23:04.400 there are just no vaccines there.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:04.400 --> 01:23:06.776 But I suspect that would be a major  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:06.776 --> 01:23:08.724 barrier and a question of fairness  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:08.724 --> 01:23:11.230 when it comes to things like vaccine,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:11.230 --> 01:23:13.285 passports and so on that  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:13.285 --> 01:23:14.518 institutions won't like.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:14.520 --> 01:23:16.435 Travelers going to places where  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:16.435 --> 01:23:17.967 there's not been vaccinations,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:17.970 --> 01:23:20.268 I hesitate to make a prediction,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:20.270 --> 01:23:23.210 but gosh, it sure seems like.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:23.210 --> 01:23:25.177 Start imagine some of these programs being

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:25.177 --> 01:23:27.158 back to normal in this calendar year.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:27.160 --> 01:23:28.852 I don't know whether other folks

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:28.852 --> 01:23:31.580 may think differently, but.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:31.580 --> 01:23:35.972 Be hard to imagine before the end of 2021.

NOTE Confidence: 0.85988855

01:23:35.980 --> 01:23:36.450 Alright,

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:36.450 --> 01:23:39.747 well let me ask one last question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:39.750 --> 01:23:42.458 You have indicated your

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:42.458 --> 01:23:44.489 ambivalence about whether.

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:44.490 --> 01:23:45.590 Western ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:45.590 --> 01:23:48.890 or our exporting of our ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:48.890 --> 01:23:51.276 principles are Western ethics was

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:51.276 --> 01:23:55.118 a good idea is a good idea I I've

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:55.118 --> 01:23:57.513 learned from Michelle Berry many

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:23:57.513 --> 01:24:00.396 years ago that it's very different

NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:24:00.396 --> 01:24:03.288 dealing with the community in Africa,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:24:03.290 --> 01:24:06.524 for example, where there is that it  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:24:06.524 --> 01:24:09.480 is understood that the decisions will  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:24:09.480 --> 01:24:12.444 be made by the Community leaders,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:24:12.450 --> 01:24:14.170 The Chieftains and and.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:24:14.170 --> 01:24:16.750 Those it's not only in Africa,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:24:16.750 --> 01:24:21.412 but in been in a number of of societies.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.871664

01:24:21.420 --> 01:24:25.515 Is that how does one deal with all that?  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88872594

01:24:29.080 --> 01:24:30.310 Just to finish up on.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.75219715

01:24:31.640 --> 01:24:33.480 Just just a simple question.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.75219715

01:24:33.480 --> 01:24:34.938 If yes, yes, yes.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.9089496

01:24:37.650 --> 01:24:41.370 There is certainly is room for a correction.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:24:43.460 --> 01:24:46.308 And I'll see why I maybe I wouldn't  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:24:46.308 --> 01:24:49.395 go out like we have to be mindful.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:24:49.400 --> 01:24:52.844 I think of the potential to become.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:24:52.850 --> 01:24:54.227 Moral relativists right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:24:54.227 --> 01:24:57.890 Most of us don't especially like for me

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:24:57.890 --> 01:25:00.842 like part of my background and my PhD

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:00.842 --> 01:25:03.850 training in philosophy was in human rights.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:03.850 --> 01:25:05.794 And so we'd like to think

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:05.794 --> 01:25:07.090 that it's some point.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:07.090 --> 01:25:10.506 At some level there is a substantive.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:10.510 --> 01:25:11.620 Moral principle right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:11.620 --> 01:25:13.840 And so we don't want to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:13.840 --> 01:25:16.060 When we say we decolonize global

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:16.060 --> 01:25:18.735 health ethics, we maybe don't want to

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:18.735 --> 01:25:22.710 go so far as to become relativists.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:22.710 --> 01:25:25.326 About it on the other hand,

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:25.330 --> 01:25:27.647 back to this notion of a corrective.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:27.650 --> 01:25:30.970 It certainly seems to me like there is

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:30.970 --> 01:25:34.418 a there is room for correcting that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:34.420 --> 01:25:36.540 I'll say I've been sceptical,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:36.540 --> 01:25:37.266 for example,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:37.266 --> 01:25:40.170 as a concrete example by the ways in  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:40.248 --> 01:25:43.412 which we have tended to export the  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:43.412 --> 01:25:45.440 Institutional Review Board process,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:45.440 --> 01:25:48.331 and of course its reliance on Belmont  
NOTE Confidence: 0.88286746

01:25:48.331 --> 01:25:50.110 principles for analyzing ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:25:52.210 --> 01:25:53.338 Even if we don't go so  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:25:53.338 --> 01:25:54.740 far as to be relativist,  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:25:54.740 --> 01:25:56.858 there would be much to gain.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:25:56.860 --> 01:26:00.190 From learning about and understanding and  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:00.190 --> 01:26:03.390 thinking through ethics problems differently.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:03.390 --> 01:26:06.300 Through lenses that are different than.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:06.300 --> 01:26:07.476 The principles of bioethics  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:07.476 --> 01:26:08.358 or biomedical ethics.  
NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:08.360 --> 01:26:09.548 As we've learned them,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:09.548 --> 01:26:12.519 so I guess if I if I had to put

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:12.519 --> 01:26:14.053 my money down, so to speak,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:14.053 --> 01:26:16.787 I see it as that kind of a corrective as

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:16.787 --> 01:26:19.237 a new way of learning and understanding,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:19.240 --> 01:26:21.060 only because in the back of my

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:21.060 --> 01:26:23.060 head is this human rights world,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:23.060 --> 01:26:25.418 and there may be some substantive

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:25.418 --> 01:26:27.830 principles that are so important that

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:27.830 --> 01:26:30.504 we would actually hold on to them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:30.510 --> 01:26:32.950 And if I had a whole another hour and a half,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87801665

01:26:32.950 --> 01:26:34.276 I would actually answer your question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027

01:26:36.640 --> 01:26:39.352 Well, we will try to make sure that

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027

01:26:39.352 --> 01:26:41.970 you get another hour and a half

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027

01:26:41.970 --> 01:26:45.089 sometime in the not too distant future.

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027

01:26:45.090 --> 01:26:47.005 Thank you for a superb

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027



01:26:47.005 --> 01:26:48.537 presentation and and talk.

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027

01:26:48.540 --> 01:26:51.258 So this is just been most

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027

01:26:51.258 --> 01:26:53.070 informative an most enjoyable.

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027

01:26:53.070 --> 01:26:55.020 Thank you again and take care

NOTE Confidence: 0.890027

01:26:55.020 --> 01:26:57.650 and we do want you to come back.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8624559

01:26:59.210 --> 01:27:03.916 Thank you thank you alright bye bye.