WEBVTT

00:00:00.000 --> 00:00:03.400 All right, welcome. My name is Mark Mercurio,

00:00:03.400 --> 00:00:05.332 and this is the Program for Biomedical

00:00:05.332 --> 00:00:07.159 Ethics at Yale School of Medicine

00:00:07.160 --> 00:00:10.240 Evening Ethics Seminar series.

00:00:10.240 --> 00:00:12.676 And I'm very pleased tonight to welcome

00:00:12.680 --> 00:00:14.948 Brianna Moore from the University of

00:00:14.948 --> 00:00:17.160 Texas Medical Branch at Galveston.

00:00:17.160 --> 00:00:20.232 Professor Moore is an

00:00:20.232 --> 00:00:21.240 associate assistant professor.

00:00:21.240 --> 00:00:23.599 Excuse me, In the Department of Bioethics.

00:00:23.600 --> 00:00:25.776 What's that? You can give me a promotion up.

00:00:25.776 --> 00:00:27.156 We can right here. Show of hands.

00:00:27.156 --> 00:00:28.600 Wait. Wait till the end of the talk.

00:00:28.600 --> 00:00:29.959 Wait, not, not so fast.

00:00:29.960 --> 00:00:30.720 The end of the talk.

00:00:30.720 --> 00:00:31.748 We'll decide about the

00:00:31.748 --> 00:00:32.519 associate professor thing.

00:00:35.200 --> 00:00:41.000 Professor Moore is here for a

00:00:41.000 --> 00:00:42.600 couple of specific reasons,

00:00:42.600 --> 00:00:43.640 but she has a pH.

00:00:43.640 --> 00:00:45.856 D from Monash in Melbourne, Australia.

00:00:45.856 --> 00:00:48.617 She did fellowships at Children's

00:00:48.617 --> 00:00:51.359 Mercy as well as at Baylor.

00:00:51.360 --> 00:00:52.992 She is the chairman of the

00:00:52.992 --> 00:00:54.080 American Society of Bioethics,

00:00:54.080 --> 00:00:56.960 the pediatric ethics affinity group,

00:00:56.960 --> 00:00:58.535 and she has particular expertise

00:00:58.535 --> 00:01:00.210 in pediatric ethics, but also

00:01:00.210 --> 00:01:02.035 particular expertise and virtue ethics.

00:01:02.040 --> 00:01:02.920 And this is something,

00:01:02.920 --> 00:01:04.490 as a couple of the medical students

00:01:04.490 --> 00:01:06.577 have heard me say as we do that when we

00:01:06.577 --> 00:01:08.117 when we teach and talk about medical

00:01:08.117 --> 00:01:11.400 ethics in a more didactic fashion,

00:01:11.400 --> 00:01:12.695 this is something that I don't think

00:01:12.695 --> 00:01:14.158 gets as much attention as it should.

00:01:14.160 --> 00:01:15.462 And there's only so many hours in

00:01:15.462 --> 00:01:16.791 the curriculum, we recognize that.

00:01:16.791 --> 00:01:19.010 But these evening seminars are a chance

00:01:19.072 --> 00:01:20.880 for us to do a little bit better,

00:01:20.880 --> 00:01:22.238 by all of us, by the students,

00:01:22.240 --> 00:01:22.452 certainly,

00:01:22.452 --> 00:01:24.360 but by everyone else who comes to join us.

00:01:24.360 --> 00:01:26.145 So for that reason and knowing that

00:01:26.145 --> 00:01:27.880 Brianna had an expertise in this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:27.880 --> 00:01:29.458 as well as knowing that she's

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:29.458 --> 00:01:31.159 already a member of the family,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:31.160 --> 00:01:33.380 essentially because of her work with

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:33.380 --> 00:01:35.297 Laurie's program this past summer

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:35.297 --> 00:01:37.157 across campus and other things,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:37.160 --> 00:01:37.822 I'm very,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:37.822 --> 00:01:39.477 very pleased to welcome Professor

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:39.477 --> 00:01:41.448 Brianna Moore to talk to us

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:41.448 --> 00:01:42.676 tonight about virtue ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:42.680 --> 00:01:44.320 This will work the way it usually works,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:44.320 --> 00:01:45.760 which is to say we'll have

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:45.760 --> 00:01:47.672 a talk for about 45 minutes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:47.672 --> 00:01:48.560 plus or minus,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:48.560 --> 00:01:51.236 then we'll have an audience conversation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:51.240 --> 00:01:53.400 So I'll moderate folks who are on Zoom

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:53.400 --> 00:01:55.584 can send in questions via the Q&A portion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:55.584 --> 00:01:57.068 the Q&A function on Zoom and we'll

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:57.068 --> 00:01:58.606 try to get to some of those questions

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:01:58.606 --> 00:02:00.278 as well as the questions in the room.

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:02:00.280 --> 00:02:02.719 And we'll go until 6:30 and then at 6:30,

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:02:02.720 --> 00:02:04.238 we will call it a night.

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:02:04.240 --> 00:02:05.199 So thank you so much for coming.

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:02:05.200 --> 00:02:06.719 And especially thank you for coming up.

NOTE Confidence: 0.75505835

00:02:06.720 --> 00:02:07.040 Brianna,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6705972725

00:02:10.160 --> 00:02:11.900 no vote yet. No vote yet

NOTE Confidence: 0.6705972725

00:02:11.900 --> 00:02:13.320 about these. Thanks. Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:13.320 --> 00:02:16.730 And the pressure just really has risen.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:16.730 --> 00:02:21.160 Can everyone hear me OK? Yes. Great.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:21.160 --> 00:02:22.414 Doctor Mccario, thank you so much

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:22.414 --> 00:02:23.599 for the invitation to come up.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:23.600 --> 00:02:25.390 And thank you to Karen as well for all of

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:25.442 --> 00:02:27.234 your help with the with the arrangements.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:27.240 --> 00:02:28.728 Yeah. These things take a lot

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:28.728 --> 00:02:30.938 of time and energy to arrange.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:30.938 --> 00:02:32.684 I appreciate it. OK.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:32.684 --> 00:02:34.672 So quickly, this is a comic by

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:34.672 --> 00:02:37.119 one of my favorite comic artists.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:37.120 --> 00:02:38.960 If you had a little giggle at this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:38.960 --> 00:02:42.640 Jake likes onions, it's fantastic.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:42.640 --> 00:02:44.020 On my question here,

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:44.020 --> 00:02:45.400 I said we don't.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:45.400 --> 00:02:46.646 It was really exciting to me to

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:46.646 --> 00:02:48.236 come back and get a chance to talk

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:48.236 --> 00:02:49.246 about virtue ethics because we

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:49.291 --> 00:02:50.677 don't really talk about it as much.

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:50.680 --> 00:02:52.577 I think having grown up and kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.754494366

00:02:52.577 --> 00:02:54.040 of trained in Australia,

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:02:56.440 --> 00:02:57.952 we talk about it a little bit more there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:02:57.960 --> 00:02:59.155 I think culturally we talk

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:02:59.155 --> 00:03:00.560 about it less in the US,

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:03:00.560 --> 00:03:04.720 which is just an interesting place to start.

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:03:04.720 --> 00:03:05.628 I'm a humanity scholar.

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:03:05.628 --> 00:03:07.272 No one wants to give us any

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:03:07.272 --> 00:03:08.437 money or glory or riches.

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:03:08.440 --> 00:03:09.920 So no, never. Any conflicts.

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:03:09.920 --> 00:03:11.168 I hope to one day have

NOTE Confidence: 0.897407811111111

00:03:11.168 --> 00:03:12.000 a conflict to disclose.

NOTE Confidence: 0.814888624285714

00:03:14.480 --> 00:03:16.517 These are our learning objectives for today.

NOTE Confidence: 0.853482986666667

00:03:18.600 --> 00:03:19.920 That third one's a little fuzzy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.853482986666667

00:03:19.920 --> 00:03:21.502 I kind of had a case carefully

NOTE Confidence: 0.853482986666667

00:03:21.502 --> 00:03:23.319 written up and I thought we'd

NOTE Confidence: 0.853482986666667

00:03:23.319 --> 00:03:24.759 systematically apply virtue ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.853482986666667

00:03:24.760 --> 00:03:25.960 And then I was sitting there last night.

NOTE Confidence: 0.853482986666667

00:03:25.960 --> 00:03:26.800 I thought, I hate that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.853482986666667

00:03:26.800 --> 00:03:27.880 I don't want to do that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:30.640 --> 00:03:31.668 And a virtual ethicist

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:31.668 --> 00:03:32.953 wouldn't approach it that way.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:32.960 --> 00:03:33.820 So I thought, no.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:33.820 --> 00:03:35.417 So I'm just going to give you

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:35.417 --> 00:03:36.959 some stories a little bit later.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:36.960 --> 00:03:38.730 That's our application.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:38.730 --> 00:03:40.405 So I'm going to start with

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:40.405 --> 00:03:41.273 a question for you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:41.280 --> 00:03:44.516 And when you want to think about someone,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:44.520 --> 00:03:45.794 it can be anyone in your life.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:45.800 --> 00:03:48.334 It can be someone in a professional

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:48.334 --> 00:03:50.860 setting who you look up to and

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:50.860 --> 00:03:52.560 I if anyone's feeling brave,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:52.560 --> 00:03:53.556 brave enough to share,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:53.556 --> 00:03:56.277 who is it and why do you look up to them?

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:56.280 --> 00:03:58.240 Who is someone that that that you respect,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:03:58.240 --> 00:04:00.600 that you that you admire in your life?

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:04:00.600 --> 00:04:01.680 It can be for any reason.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:04:01.680 --> 00:04:04.400 What is it about them

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:04:04.400 --> 00:04:05.424 that so impresses you?

NOTE Confidence: 0.758243946666667

00:04:05.424 --> 00:04:05.680 Diane

NOTE Confidence: 0.72514245

00:04:09.880 --> 00:04:11.998 Hoffman at the University of Maryland.

NOTE Confidence: 0.72514245

00:04:12.000 --> 00:04:18.320 She is a genius but is always put

NOTE Confidence: 0.72514245

00:04:18.320 --> 00:04:20.480 together incredibly hospitable. And.

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:23.760 --> 00:04:25.360 OK, so we had someone,

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:25.360 --> 00:04:30.960 a mentor or colleague who was both and,

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:30.960 --> 00:04:33.672 yeah, kind hospitable, always put together.

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:33.672 --> 00:04:35.288 Just generous, generosity of spirit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:35.288 --> 00:04:38.515 Kind of. Yeah. OK, good. Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:38.515 --> 00:04:41.548 Anyone else want to share? Who is it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:41.548 --> 00:04:43.200 And what do you admire about them?

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:43.200 --> 00:04:46.480 Yeah. Marty Samuels is a

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:46.480 --> 00:04:48.280 neurologist recently passed away.

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:48.280 --> 00:04:51.640 He's famous for going to major

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:51.640 --> 00:04:53.500 national lectures and giving talks

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:53.500 --> 00:04:55.733 about mistakes he made lessons you've

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:55.733 --> 00:04:57.888 drew from the mistakes he made. Yep.

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:04:57.888 --> 00:05:00.192 So in case anyone online couldn't hear that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:05:00.200 --> 00:05:01.726 we had a wonderful example just then

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:05:01.726 --> 00:05:03.279 of someone who owns their mistakes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:05:03.280 --> 00:05:04.720 who was comfortable talking about them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:05:04.720 --> 00:05:06.140 We might call that something

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:05:06.140 --> 00:05:07.571 like humility and honesty. Yep.

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:05:07.571 --> 00:05:09.317 Yep. Anyone else want to share?

NOTE Confidence: 0.912395284

00:05:09.320 --> 00:05:10.000 We'll do one more.

NOTE Confidence: 0.389730565

00:05:15.120 --> 00:05:16.760 I I think Jackie is just

NOTE Confidence: 0.389730565

00:05:16.760 --> 00:05:18.100 sitting right next to him.

NOTE Confidence: 0.389730565

00:05:18.100 --> 00:05:20.400 I I noticed that I was a A

NOTE Confidence: 0.389730565

00:05:20.400 --> 00:05:22.512 fellow and I've always seen him

NOTE Confidence: 0.389730565

00:05:22.512 --> 00:05:24.118 with somebody who has devoted

NOTE Confidence: 0.841753266666667

00:05:24.120 --> 00:05:26.664 his life to medical education

NOTE Confidence: 0.841753266666667

00:05:26.664 --> 00:05:28.080 and medical care. And

NOTE Confidence: 0.30386541

00:05:28.680 --> 00:05:29.079 this is true.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:05:29.720 --> 00:05:32.303 Yep. Yep. So again, a beautiful example

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:05:32.303 --> 00:05:35.038 and a nice one from in the room.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:05:35.040 --> 00:05:36.395 Also, just feeling like there's

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:05:36.395 --> 00:05:38.186 someone in your life that you look

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:05:38.186 --> 00:05:39.800 up to who's devoted to what they do,

00:05:39.800 --> 00:05:40.880 who shows up for people,

00:05:40.880 --> 00:05:43.608 who shows up every day. Yeah, began.

00:05:43.608 --> 00:05:45.088 I heard, like, generosity,

00:05:45.088 --> 00:05:48.927 dedication and integrity. Yeah, good.

00:05:48.927 --> 00:05:50.240 So you can all see where I'm going with this.

00:05:50.240 --> 00:05:51.437 It wasn't kind of a big giveaway.

00:05:51.440 --> 00:05:52.640 Right? But you've naturally started

00:05:52.640 --> 00:05:54.080 framing things in terms of like,

00:05:54.080 --> 00:05:56.280 qualities that people have that,

00:05:56.280 --> 00:05:57.274 you know, don't just make them like,

00:05:57.280 --> 00:05:58.720 oh, they're an OK person to hang with,

00:05:58.720 --> 00:06:01.357 but like really kind of move us to have,

00:06:01.360 --> 00:06:03.088 like, respect and admiration for people

00:06:03.088 --> 00:06:04.820 like these exemplars in our lives who

00:06:04.820 --> 00:06:06.480 we sort of look up to and and try,

00:06:06.480 --> 00:06:09.576 I think a lot of the time to sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:09.576 --> 00:06:11.208 of take a little bit from and carry

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:11.208 --> 00:06:12.478 it forward in our own practice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:12.480 --> 00:06:15.455 So there's my unsubtle Segway

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:15.455 --> 00:06:17.835 into the virtue ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:17.840 --> 00:06:19.624 Has anyone in the room ever taken a

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:19.624 --> 00:06:21.317 philosophy class or an intro to ethics class?

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:21.320 --> 00:06:22.280 And we're getting lots of nods.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:22.280 --> 00:06:22.805 I'm guessing that's.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:22.805 --> 00:06:22.980 Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:22.980 --> 00:06:23.680 Most of you have.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:23.680 --> 00:06:25.520 So you've probably heard about

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:25.520 --> 00:06:27.360 consequentialism and the the ontology,

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:27.360 --> 00:06:30.000 the ontological ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:30.000 --> 00:06:31.836 the three main branches of sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:31.836 --> 00:06:32.754 of normative ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:32.760 --> 00:06:35.330 The branch of ethics that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.772788975333333

00:06:35.330 --> 00:06:37.320 interested in what we should do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:39.520 --> 00:06:40.960 are typically held support

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:40.960 --> 00:06:42.400 to be like consequentialism.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:42.400 --> 00:06:44.296 Ontology, and then virtue ethics is

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:44.296 --> 00:06:46.799 kind of the the murky third branch.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:46.800 --> 00:06:47.400 So as you all know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:47.400 --> 00:06:50.285 consequentialism holds that an action

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:50.285 --> 00:06:53.600 is right if and only if it produces

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:53.600 --> 00:06:55.040 the best possible consequences.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:55.040 --> 00:06:57.710 So utilitarianism is the most well

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:57.710 --> 00:06:59.066 known form of consequentialism.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:06:59.066 --> 00:07:00.576 So maximize the greatest good

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:00.576 --> 00:07:02.000 for the greatest number.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:02.000 --> 00:07:03.368 Basically, the the consequences,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:03.368 --> 00:07:05.078 the outcomes of our actions

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:05.080 --> 00:07:06.400 are really important,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:06.400 --> 00:07:08.160 perhaps the most decisive

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:08.160 --> 00:07:09.944 moral or ethical factor.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:09.944 --> 00:07:11.728 It's sort of contrasted

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:11.728 --> 00:07:13.160 with deontological ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:13.160 --> 00:07:16.517 which holds that an action is right if and

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:16.517 --> 00:07:19.874 only if it adheres with the relevant rules,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:19.874 --> 00:07:20.308 obligations,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:20.308 --> 00:07:22.478 or duties that someone has.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:22.480 --> 00:07:26.164 And it differs from consequentialism

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:26.164 --> 00:07:28.521 in that it says that sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:28.521 --> 00:07:29.928 there are just going to be things

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:29.928 --> 00:07:31.160 that we absolutely can't do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:31.160 --> 00:07:33.340 regardless of how good the

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:33.340 --> 00:07:35.520 consequences of that thing are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:35.520 --> 00:07:37.850 Some things are just absolutely

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:37.850 --> 00:07:39.412 prohibited or or obligatory,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:39.412 --> 00:07:39.776 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:39.776 --> 00:07:41.596 And then there's virtue ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:41.600 --> 00:07:44.554 sort of the weird cousin that people

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:44.554 --> 00:07:46.758 don't really like to look at.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:46.760 --> 00:07:49.600 And I'm looking at my my buddy James,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:49.600 --> 00:07:52.317 who I Yes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:52.317 --> 00:07:55.813 And because in 2015 I have this very

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:55.813 --> 00:07:58.133 distinctive memory of sitting in

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:07:58.133 --> 00:08:00.512 a lecture theater as a student in

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:00.512 --> 00:08:01.802 Yale Summer Institute and bioethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:01.802 --> 00:08:03.119 program and listening to Shell,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:03.120 --> 00:08:04.440 the wonderful Shelley Kagan give

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:04.440 --> 00:08:05.760 a lecture on normative ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:05.760 --> 00:08:08.196 And he didn't once James is laughing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:08.200 --> 00:08:10.084 now mentioned character or

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:10.084 --> 00:08:12.439 dispositions or kind of motives.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:12.440 --> 00:08:13.320 And I remember, like me,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:13.320 --> 00:08:14.517 a little grad student at the time,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:14.520 --> 00:08:16.230 popping my hand up and saying

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:16.230 --> 00:08:18.424 not once mentioned virtue ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:18.424 --> 00:08:21.280 and him saying it's not ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:21.280 --> 00:08:22.384 And then James found me afterwards

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:22.384 --> 00:08:23.120 and he was like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:23.120 --> 00:08:24.653 shout out to virtue ethics and then

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:24.653 --> 00:08:26.040 we decided we'd be best friends.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:26.040 --> 00:08:27.756 But this was back in 2015.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:27.760 --> 00:08:29.404 So not everyone thinks of virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:29.404 --> 00:08:31.157 ethics as a kind of normative

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:31.157 --> 00:08:32.939 ethics because it does have a

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:32.939 --> 00:08:34.879 little bit of a different project.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:34.880 --> 00:08:38.100 It's not sort of a systematic moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:38.100 --> 00:08:40.405 theory that's trying to explain right

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:40.405 --> 00:08:43.080 action in the same way that these

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:43.080 --> 00:08:46.960 other branches of normative ethics are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:46.960 --> 00:08:49.198 What is it trying to do?

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:49.200 --> 00:08:50.492 So it's starting point.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:50.492 --> 00:08:53.517 And what I mean by that is sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:53.517 --> 00:08:55.539 the the the framework through which

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:55.539 --> 00:08:59.480 it looks at like ethical questions

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:08:59.480 --> 00:09:01.958 and sort of just orients itself

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:01.958 --> 00:09:04.440 to ethical problems and conflicts,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:04.440 --> 00:09:06.816 is to start first with character

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:06.816 --> 00:09:08.400 as central to morality.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:08.400 --> 00:09:10.320 It's sort of the guiding thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

18

00:09:10.320 --> 00:09:12.077 So instead of focusing on right action,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:12.080 --> 00:09:13.064 we should think about what kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:13.064 --> 00:09:13.959 of people we want to be,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:13.960 --> 00:09:16.680 what kind of character we want to cultivate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:16.680 --> 00:09:18.360 And maybe right action comes from that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:18.360 --> 00:09:20.824 but it just sort of has a different

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:20.824 --> 00:09:23.633 starting point than something like

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:23.633 --> 00:09:26.557 consequentialism or deontological ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:26.560 --> 00:09:27.532 As I said it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:27.532 --> 00:09:28.990 the slogan is typically that its

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:29.043 --> 00:09:30.835 focus is more in being than doing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:30.840 --> 00:09:31.792 That's a little simplified,

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:31.792 --> 00:09:33.743 but it can be a helpful way of

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:33.743 --> 00:09:34.679 sort of remembering it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:34.680 --> 00:09:36.185 And most people attribute virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.66074981

00:09:36.185 --> 00:09:37.690 ethics back to Aristotle and

NOTE Confidence: 0.833788446666667

00:09:37.745 --> 00:09:39.080 kind of the ancient Greeks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.833788446666667

00:09:39.080 --> 00:09:41.103 And you can Machan ethics is sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.833788446666667

00:09:41.103 --> 00:09:43.028 of typically thought of as like the

NOTE Confidence: 0.833788446666667

00:09:43.028 --> 00:09:44.640 main text on virtue ethics, but

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:09:46.800 --> 00:09:49.440 sort of ancient Eastern Chinese philosophy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:09:49.440 --> 00:09:50.932 Also, Confucius famously did

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:09:50.932 --> 00:09:52.797 talk about virtues as well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:09:52.800 --> 00:09:54.132 particularly familial virtues and

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:09:54.132 --> 00:09:56.836 sort of what it meant to be a

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:09:56.836 --> 00:09:58.436 virtuous actor within your family.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:09:58.440 --> 00:10:03.180 But Aristotle is really kind of the main

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:03.180 --> 00:10:06.600 sort of white male philosopher associated

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:06.600 --> 00:10:09.240 with this particular branch of ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:09.240 --> 00:10:10.576 And I'm not going to say them in

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:10.576 --> 00:10:11.677 Greek because I don't know how to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:11.680 --> 00:10:15.280 But he had three guiding concepts.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:15.280 --> 00:10:17.560 They were sort of excellence,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:17.560 --> 00:10:19.156 human flourishing and practical

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:19.156 --> 00:10:21.948 wisdom that he used to sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:21.948 --> 00:10:23.916 Orient his idea of the virtues,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:23.920 --> 00:10:25.000 what counted as a virtue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:25.000 --> 00:10:25.760 what didn't,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:25.760 --> 00:10:28.339 how it was virtuous and human flourishing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:28.339 --> 00:10:31.570 Really kind of is I think the main one

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:31.570 --> 00:10:33.992 for us to potentially talk about this

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:33.992 --> 00:10:35.908 idea that morally valuable traits were

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:35.908 --> 00:10:38.438 the ones that helped you live a good life,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:38.440 --> 00:10:39.772 that helped you live a good

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:39.772 --> 00:10:40.438 human flourishing life.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:40.440 --> 00:10:41.370 There are all kinds of

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:41.370 --> 00:10:42.114 problems associated with that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:42.120 --> 00:10:44.440 We can dig into them a little bit,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:44.440 --> 00:10:45.595 and the idea is that the virtue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:45.600 --> 00:10:46.052 sort of,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:46.052 --> 00:10:46.956 for Aristotle at least,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:46.960 --> 00:10:48.520 work together in a big web.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:48.520 --> 00:10:50.235 So you can't just kind of think

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:50.235 --> 00:10:51.719 about 1 virtue in isolation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:51.720 --> 00:10:54.712 It's all sort of cultivating a

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:54.712 --> 00:10:56.872 range of virtues and sensitivity

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:56.872 --> 00:10:59.062 to the different situations you're

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:10:59.062 --> 00:11:01.750 in and sort of how to exercise

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:01.750 --> 00:11:03.238 different virtues and balance

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:03.238 --> 00:11:05.513 them in this nice kind of web.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:05.520 --> 00:11:06.624 And that was what he thought

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:06.624 --> 00:11:07.360 of as practical wisdom,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:07.360 --> 00:11:08.753 this idea that you would sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:08.753 --> 00:11:10.256 know how to balance and weigh

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:10.256 --> 00:11:11.681 and act virtuously in different

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:11.681 --> 00:11:12.925 situations by practicing and

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:12.925 --> 00:11:14.480 getting it wrong sometimes right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:14.480 --> 00:11:15.713 And the idea was to live a good life,

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:15.720 --> 00:11:17.896 you have to really kind of strive to

NOTE Confidence: 0.816465133333333

00:11:17.896 --> 00:11:19.400 cultivate habitually virtuous qualities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:27.520 --> 00:11:28.740 There's a nice little quote

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:28.740 --> 00:11:29.960 here from Rosalind Hurst House.

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:29.960 --> 00:11:34.878 She says excellences of character,

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:34.880 --> 00:11:36.320 qualities that help us to notice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:36.320 --> 00:11:38.368 expect, value, feel, desire,

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:38.368 --> 00:11:41.280 choose, act and react in

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:41.280 --> 00:11:43.080 certain characteristic ways,

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:43.080 --> 00:11:43.992 and that phonesis.

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:43.992 --> 00:11:46.280 In short, practical wisdom is needed

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:46.280 --> 00:11:48.364 to apply duty's rules or principles

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:48.364 --> 00:11:50.520 in in in a morally sensitive way.

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:50.520 --> 00:11:54.168 There are also non Aristotelian branches

NOTE Confidence: 0.769705967

00:11:54.168 --> 00:11:57.839 of virtue ethics famously attributed to

NOTE Confidence: 0.426301813333333

00:12:00.080 --> 00:12:01.919 Soccer Christine Swanton.

NOTE Confidence: 0.825378890909091

00:12:03.960 --> 00:12:05.592 They're not committed to any kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.825378890909091

00:12:05.592 --> 00:12:07.434 of idea of human flourishing in

NOTE Confidence: 0.825378890909091

00:12:07.434 --> 00:12:09.522 the same way that Zionists or

NOTE Confidence: 0.825378890909091

00:12:09.522 --> 00:12:11.040 Aristotelian virtue ethicists are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.825378890909091

00:12:11.040 --> 00:12:13.480 They talk much more just

NOTE Confidence: 0.825378890909091

00:12:13.480 --> 00:12:15.432 generally about moral exemplars,

NOTE Confidence: 0.825378890909091

00:12:15.440 --> 00:12:17.120 target based virtues.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:20.360 --> 00:12:21.970 They just kind of have a bit

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:21.970 --> 00:12:23.558 of a broader lens on things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:23.560 --> 00:12:25.810 They're not trying to explain the

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:25.810 --> 00:12:28.656 the value of of virtues in relation

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:28.656 --> 00:12:31.971 to some other like thing that

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:31.971 --> 00:12:33.653 it's value that virtues, values,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:33.653 --> 00:12:35.318 derivative of like human flourishing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:35.320 --> 00:12:38.425 It's just sort of how are they valuable in

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:38.425 --> 00:12:41.357 other situations or roles that you're in.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:41.360 --> 00:12:43.088 And they just talk much more

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:43.088 --> 00:12:44.240 broadly non Aristotelian virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:44.288 --> 00:12:45.680 ethicists about dispositions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:45.680 --> 00:12:47.865 motives and motions and sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:47.865 --> 00:12:50.840 of how they shape the virtues.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:50.840 --> 00:12:52.796 There's also kind of virtue theory.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:52.800 --> 00:12:54.624 So there's a lot of kind of overlap

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:54.624 --> 00:12:56.370 now and people are talking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:56.370 --> 00:12:58.218 Kantian virtue ethics and sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:58.273 --> 00:12:59.920 consequentialist virtue ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:12:59.920 --> 00:13:01.775 And Sidwick like they're kind of like

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:01.775 --> 00:13:03.652 all these lines between these different

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:03.652 --> 00:13:05.698 branches of normative ethics are very

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:05.698 --> 00:13:07.396 blurry to begin with but are kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:07.396 --> 00:13:08.764 of getting blurrier and people are

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:08.764 --> 00:13:10.428 sort of just want to just like what

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:10.475 --> 00:13:12.239 people call virtue theory going on now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:12.240 --> 00:13:13.840 So sort of everything else that's out there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:13.840 --> 00:13:16.320 Again, not interested necessarily in

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:16.320 --> 00:13:18.732 how the virtues relate to a good life or

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:18.732 --> 00:13:20.797 developing kind of a robust account of that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:20.800 --> 00:13:22.966 but just thinking more generally in

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:22.966 --> 00:13:25.040 psychological terms about virtues and biases,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:25.040 --> 00:13:26.136 social theory,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:26.136 --> 00:13:27.232 moral psychology,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:27.232 --> 00:13:28.876 stuff like that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:28.880 --> 00:13:30.784 This is a very quick and shallow overview

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:30.784 --> 00:13:33.238 of a lot of complex stuff that's going on,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:33.240 --> 00:13:35.256 but it's all to kind of help you

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:35.256 --> 00:13:36.435 understand where did this come

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:36.435 --> 00:13:38.085 from and how do we kind of get

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:38.085 --> 00:13:39.880 to thinking about virtues in in

NOTE Confidence: 0.867832979230769

00:13:39.880 --> 00:13:41.192 healthcare and medical practice?

NOTE Confidence: 0.75125091875

00:13:43.520 --> 00:13:45.200 If you've ever taken any classes on

NOTE Confidence: 0.75125091875

00:13:45.200 --> 00:13:46.520 virtue, I think you've probably seen

NOTE Confidence: 0.75125091875

00:13:46.520 --> 00:13:47.840 something like this kind of list.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:13:50.800 --> 00:13:52.132 It's just kind of a way of for us

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:13:52.132 --> 00:13:53.478 to kind of map out the virtues.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:13:53.480 --> 00:13:54.590 Aristotle in particular was really

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:13:54.590 --> 00:13:56.117 interested in this idea of the golden

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:13:56.117 --> 00:13:57.239 me that you couldn't just say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:13:57.240 --> 00:14:00.296 be honest, you had to really kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:00.296 --> 00:14:01.855 balance or think about honesty through

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:01.855 --> 00:14:03.399 like the situation that you were in.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:03.400 --> 00:14:04.480 And like, man, I could,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:04.480 --> 00:14:06.055 I could really kind of be almost

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:06.055 --> 00:14:07.630 too honest here and and be kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:07.630 --> 00:14:08.865 of rude and callous, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:08.865 --> 00:14:11.175 Or I could not have enough

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:11.175 --> 00:14:12.944 honesty and just be like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:12.944 --> 00:14:13.982 definitely withholding of

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:13.982 --> 00:14:14.841 relevant information. Right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:14.841 --> 00:14:16.129 So it was all about kind of balancing

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:16.129 --> 00:14:17.439 and hitting the target of the virtue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:17.440 --> 00:14:18.436 showing the right amount of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

28

00:14:18.436 --> 00:14:19.619 right thing to the right person in

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:19.619 --> 00:14:20.753 the right way in the right place,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:20.760 --> 00:14:22.440 in the right time. Right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:22.440 --> 00:14:24.756 That was practically listen for him.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:24.760 --> 00:14:25.162 So yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:25.162 --> 00:14:26.368 you'll often see a list like

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:26.368 --> 00:14:27.240 this where it's like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:27.240 --> 00:14:29.158 here's the target of the virtue and

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:29.158 --> 00:14:31.240 then kind of thinking about excess

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:31.240 --> 00:14:32.812 or deficiency of that quality and

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:32.812 --> 00:14:34.440 where that would kind of lead us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:34.440 --> 00:14:36.096 I don't know that all virtues

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:36.096 --> 00:14:37.520 fit into something like this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:37.520 --> 00:14:40.092 So we might justice as one, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:40.092 --> 00:14:41.688 being a just person we typically

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:41.688 --> 00:14:43.352 think of as being a being a virtue.

29

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:43.352 --> 00:14:44.640 You can't really have too much justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:44.640 --> 00:14:44.813 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:44.813 --> 00:14:45.678 This doesn't kind of fit,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:45.680 --> 00:14:47.190 I think necessarily into its

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:47.190 --> 00:14:48.398 deficiency or excess model,

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:48.400 --> 00:14:50.398 but it can be a helpful way of kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:50.398 --> 00:14:52.563 of thinking about different virtues

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:52.563 --> 00:14:54.439 and their corresponding biases.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:54.440 --> 00:14:56.280 So we don't talk about virtue a lot.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:56.280 --> 00:14:57.672 We don't talk about bias very

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:57.672 --> 00:14:59.403 much as well in in healthcare

NOTE Confidence: 0.86927127

00:14:59.403 --> 00:15:00.519 and healthcare ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917846083333333

00:15:03.360 --> 00:15:04.839 Why virtue ethics?

NOTE Confidence: 0.882649695416667

00:15:07.080 --> 00:15:09.166 These are some reasons why I find

NOTE Confidence: 0.882649695416667

00:15:09.166 --> 00:15:11.584 it attractive as a way of kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.882649695416667

00:15:11.584 --> 00:15:13.044 framing and thinking about moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.882649695416667

00:15:13.109 --> 00:15:14.837 problems or ethical problems.

NOTE Confidence: 0.882649695416667

00:15:14.840 --> 00:15:16.646 I think this idea of kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.882649695416667

00:15:16.646 --> 00:15:18.120 just focusing on developing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:20.200 --> 00:15:22.750 I just think like sometimes, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:22.750 --> 00:15:24.355 I work as a clinical ethicist, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:24.355 --> 00:15:25.720 There's so many things in the hospital,

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:25.720 --> 00:15:26.472 in our healthcare system

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:26.472 --> 00:15:27.600 that are out of our control.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:27.600 --> 00:15:28.839 Often I'm like, what do I control?

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:28.840 --> 00:15:30.392 I control me, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:30.392 --> 00:15:33.318 And kind of really focusing on who do I

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:33.318 --> 00:15:35.996 want to be when I walk into the room.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:36.000 --> 00:15:37.148 How do I want to carry myself

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:37.148 --> 00:15:38.238 what I want to care about.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:38.240 --> 00:15:40.656 So for me, I think just focusing on

31

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:40.656 --> 00:15:42.199 cultivating certain kinds of habits,

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:42.200 --> 00:15:43.904 good habits and sensitivity to a

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:43.904 --> 00:15:45.562 range of of situations, that feels,

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:45.562 --> 00:15:47.128 I think sometimes a little more

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:47.128 --> 00:15:48.239 achievable for me at least.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:48.240 --> 00:15:51.960 So This is why I like it as a theory,

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:51.960 --> 00:15:53.120 role ethics and role modelling.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:53.120 --> 00:15:53.768 As I say here,

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:53.768 --> 00:15:54.740 it's just a really common way

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:54.782 --> 00:15:56.000 for us to think about doing good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:56.000 --> 00:15:56.300 So again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:56.300 --> 00:15:57.760 we kind of look at people in our lives.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:57.760 --> 00:15:58.480 How are they doing it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:58.480 --> 00:15:59.476 What do I like about that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:15:59.480 --> 00:16:01.442 What do I not what seems like a good

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:16:01.442 --> 00:16:03.640 kind of admirable way of doing something.

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:16:03.640 --> 00:16:04.991 It's just a common way for us

NOTE Confidence: 0.678288848

00:16:04.991 --> 00:16:05.840 to think about this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:07.920 --> 00:16:09.355 I think this is just a good

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:09.355 --> 00:16:10.720 broad whether we like it or not.

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:10.720 --> 00:16:11.494 Virtue, ethics, virtue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:11.494 --> 00:16:12.784 language is just part of

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:12.784 --> 00:16:14.034 the moral landscape, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:14.034 --> 00:16:15.438 It's part of our you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:15.440 --> 00:16:16.928 assumptions when we interact

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:16.928 --> 00:16:19.160 with other people in the world.

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:19.160 --> 00:16:21.960 And this is all to say, not to say at all,

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:21.960 --> 00:16:23.755 that consequences and and duties

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:23.755 --> 00:16:26.120 or or rules do not matter.

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:26.120 --> 00:16:28.958 So, and very much a pluralist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:28.960 --> 00:16:30.270 I'm not arguing that virtue

33

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:30.270 --> 00:16:32.178 ethics is the one right way of

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:32.178 --> 00:16:33.310 thinking about ethical conflicts,

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:33.310 --> 00:16:35.080 particularly in patient care at all,

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:35.080 --> 00:16:37.000 but just encourage you to think it is

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:37.000 --> 00:16:38.678 another tool to have in your toolbox,

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:38.680 --> 00:16:38.940 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:38.940 --> 00:16:41.280 To kind of whip out and think things through,

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:41.280 --> 00:16:42.708 Which of course ********

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:42.708 --> 00:16:44.136 philosophers won't like very

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:44.136 --> 00:16:45.878 much because they're much more,

NOTE Confidence: 0.720461207142857

00:16:45.880 --> 00:16:46.720 I think, kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

00:16:49.480 --> 00:16:51.503 sensitive to some of the the theoretical

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

00:16:51.503 --> 00:16:53.188 conflicts and the meta ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

00:16:53.188 --> 00:16:54.716 conflicts between these theories.

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

00:16:54.720 --> 00:16:55.917 I think when we work in healthcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

34

00:16:55.920 --> 00:16:57.342 we get comfortable with that messiness

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

00:16:57.342 --> 00:16:58.535 and we're quite comfortable kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

00:16:58.535 --> 00:16:59.560 of just drawing upon different

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

00:16:59.560 --> 00:17:00.920 things that feel good in the moment,

NOTE Confidence: 0.644469479375

00:17:00.920 --> 00:17:02.600 Right. Big fan of that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:04.720 --> 00:17:07.553 OK, so these are these are the I I don't

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:07.553 --> 00:17:08.557 think they're devastating critiques,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:08.560 --> 00:17:10.024 but these are the critiques of virtue ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:10.024 --> 00:17:11.438 that are commonly levelled against it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:11.440 --> 00:17:14.440 There's probably some more.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:14.440 --> 00:17:15.622 Most people, particularly those of us

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:15.622 --> 00:17:16.927 who work in very practical settings

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:16.927 --> 00:17:18.349 and have sort of practical ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:18.349 --> 00:17:19.600 issues that we have to navigate,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:19.600 --> 00:17:21.460 think, you can't just say, be honest,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:21.460 --> 00:17:22.960 that's not action guiding at all.

00:17:22.960 --> 00:17:24.400 Be a good person.

00:17:24.400 --> 00:17:26.258 Like, I want you to tell me what

00:17:26.258 --> 00:17:28.192 to do in concrete terms, right.

00:17:28.192 --> 00:17:30.688 So this is kind of one big critique

00:17:30.688 --> 00:17:33.037 that's levelled against virtue ethics.

00:17:33.040 --> 00:17:34.176 Virtue ethicists have tried

00:17:34.176 --> 00:17:35.880 to respond to this by saying,

00:17:35.880 --> 00:17:42.040 well something a maxim like do the most good,

00:17:42.040 --> 00:17:43.716 that's like create the best consequence,

00:17:43.716 --> 00:17:45.237 that's also you've got to get much

00:17:45.237 --> 00:17:46.412 more concrete and specific, right.

00:17:46.412 --> 00:17:48.428 So that's just to say that other nominee

00:17:48.428 --> 00:17:49.769 theories also struggle with being

00:17:49.769 --> 00:17:51.578 action guiding when it gets messy and

00:17:51.578 --> 00:17:53.162 kind of you have to really dig into

00:17:53.162 --> 00:17:54.949 into the into the specifics of this the

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:54.949 --> 00:17:56.920 case or the situation that you're in.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:56.920 --> 00:17:59.080 And virtue of the system,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:17:59.080 --> 00:18:01.632 well actually like it is quite action guiding

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:01.632 --> 00:18:04.528 to think about something like tell the truth,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:04.528 --> 00:18:04.864 right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:04.864 --> 00:18:05.200 Like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:05.200 --> 00:18:07.762 like a lot of virtues do translate

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:07.762 --> 00:18:09.999 pretty directly into action guidance,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:10.000 --> 00:18:10.728 you know, be brave.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:10.728 --> 00:18:12.062 Obviously we have to think through what

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:12.062 --> 00:18:13.274 that means in a particular situation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:13.280 --> 00:18:14.732 But virtue ethics has kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:14.732 --> 00:18:15.985 said they're actually not that

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:15.985 --> 00:18:17.407 much less action guiding than any

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:17.407 --> 00:18:18.919 other branch of normative ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:18.920 --> 00:18:22.196 Roslyn Hursthouse talks about the rules,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:22.200 --> 00:18:22.824 virtue rules,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:22.824 --> 00:18:24.696 and how they can produce a

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:24.696 --> 00:18:26.200 theory of right action.

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:26.200 --> 00:18:26.395 Again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:26.395 --> 00:18:27.565 it's tricky because I think virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:27.565 --> 00:18:28.991 ethics is just sort of thinking if

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:28.991 --> 00:18:29.996 you're focusing on right action,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:30.000 --> 00:18:31.362 you're maybe not looking at things

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:31.362 --> 00:18:32.998 in the way that we want you to,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:33.000 --> 00:18:35.560 but they sort of tried to respond to

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:35.560 --> 00:18:38.240 that by creating kind of the rules,

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:38.240 --> 00:18:40.105 mapping out virtues and sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:40.105 --> 00:18:42.100 of reframing them in terms of

NOTE Confidence: 0.802665184285714

00:18:42.100 --> 00:18:43.396 more concrete action guidance.

NOTE Confidence: 0.932514158333333

00:18:45.520 --> 00:18:48.280 The next critique is just saying,

NOTE Confidence: 0.932514158333333

00:18:48.280 --> 00:18:49.680 like the right thing to do is

NOTE Confidence: 0.932514158333333

00:18:49.680 --> 00:18:51.000 what a virtuous agent would do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.932514158333333

00:18:51.000 --> 00:18:52.160 That's just kind of circular,

NOTE Confidence: 0.932514158333333

00:18:52.160 --> 00:18:52.958 right? Like, haha,

NOTE Confidence: 0.932514158333333

00:18:52.958 --> 00:18:54.554 we've got you now virtual emphasis.

NOTE Confidence: 0.932514158333333

00:18:54.560 --> 00:18:55.760 It's too circular, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:18:58.480 --> 00:19:00.008 I think it's kind of a problem that

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:00.008 --> 00:19:01.171 virtue ethicists created for themselves by

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:01.171 --> 00:19:02.868 trying to come up with a theory of right

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:02.868 --> 00:19:04.332 action and then linking it back to virtue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:04.332 --> 00:19:05.880 And they did kind of get into this loop.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:05.880 --> 00:19:08.016 So there's some sort of attempts to get

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:08.016 --> 00:19:10.477 out of that in the theoretical debates.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:10.480 --> 00:19:12.216 Again, I think virtue ethicists kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:12.216 --> 00:19:13.930 say like it's not necessarily and less

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:13.930 --> 00:19:15.612 circular than saying the white thing to

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:15.612 --> 00:19:17.117 do is to maximize the best consequence.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:17.120 --> 00:19:19.118 Like, there's sort of a circularity,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:19.120 --> 00:19:20.600 I think, in a lot about ethical theories,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:20.600 --> 00:19:23.728 big meta ethical debate behind that going on

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:23.728 --> 00:19:26.240 that I don't feel qualified to weigh in on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:26.240 --> 00:19:27.170 And I think that's kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:27.170 --> 00:19:28.040 not our focus for today.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:28.040 --> 00:19:30.595 But this is another sort of charge

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:30.595 --> 00:19:32.640 that's levelled against virtue ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:32.640 --> 00:19:34.016 What about conflicting virtues?

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:34.016 --> 00:19:37.786 What do we do when kind of being honest and

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:37.786 --> 00:19:39.836 being compassionate come into conflict,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:39.840 --> 00:19:40.059 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:40.059 --> 00:19:42.030 What are we going to do if we kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:42.088 --> 00:19:43.798 of have to balance these things?

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:43.800 --> 00:19:45.697 The same goes for kind of different

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:45.697 --> 00:19:46.239 different outcomes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:46.240 --> 00:19:48.039 different consequences that we have to weigh,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:48.040 --> 00:19:48.535 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:48.535 --> 00:19:50.515 Or different duties sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:50.515 --> 00:19:52.000 come into conflict.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:52.000 --> 00:19:53.164 So I think virtue ethicists would

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:53.164 --> 00:19:54.348 bite that bullet and say, Yep,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:54.348 --> 00:19:55.716 sometimes you have to make trade-offs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:55.720 --> 00:19:55.972 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:55.972 --> 00:19:57.736 You have to do that complex ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:57.736 --> 00:19:59.488 work of weighing and balancing

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:19:59.488 --> 00:20:01.080 different relevant virtues or

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:01.080 --> 00:20:02.274 or ethical considerations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:02.280 --> 00:20:02.708 Again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:02.708 --> 00:20:05.276 that's not a problem that's unique

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:05.276 --> 00:20:06.772 to virtue ethics. Pretenders.

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:06.772 --> 00:20:08.256 What are we going to do with

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:08.256 --> 00:20:08.680 moral pretenders?

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:08.680 --> 00:20:09.584 These kind of fakes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:09.584 --> 00:20:10.940 these phonies out there who sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:10.991 --> 00:20:12.479 of look like they're being virtuous

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:12.479 --> 00:20:13.772 but actually are quite terrible

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:13.772 --> 00:20:14.796 people on the inside,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:14.800 --> 00:20:16.552 how do we know anyone's ever

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:16.552 --> 00:20:17.720 actually really acting virtuously,

NOTE Confidence: 0.856697350333333

00:20:17.720 --> 00:20:18.120 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:20.640 --> 00:20:21.038 That's true.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:21.038 --> 00:20:22.431 We never really know kind of what's

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:22.431 --> 00:20:23.880 going on inside someone's head, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

42

00:20:23.880 --> 00:20:25.000 Or what's motivating them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:25.000 --> 00:20:26.956 I think that's certainly a problem.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:26.960 --> 00:20:28.190 We could have someone who's doing

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:28.190 --> 00:20:29.612 great people, good in the world,

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:29.612 --> 00:20:30.333 But ******** utilitarian,

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:30.333 --> 00:20:32.037 he was just a bit of a rotten

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:32.037 --> 00:20:33.211 human on the inside, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:33.211 --> 00:20:34.084 That's true again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:34.084 --> 00:20:34.957 just true generally.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:34.960 --> 00:20:36.840 I think.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:36.840 --> 00:20:38.250 I think there's a really interesting

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:38.250 --> 00:20:39.453 psychological point in there about

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:39.453 --> 00:20:40.755 if you're going through the motions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:40.760 --> 00:20:42.328 do you start to identify with them

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:42.328 --> 00:20:44.382 and sort of feel different ways about

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:44.382 --> 00:20:46.037 different things that you're doing?

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:46.040 --> 00:20:47.776 I think it's a bullet that Birch

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:47.776 --> 00:20:49.719 worth is just kind of kind of bite.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:49.720 --> 00:20:50.815 And there's some really interesting

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:50.815 --> 00:20:52.342 work in kind of social and moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:52.342 --> 00:20:53.307 psychology coming out about kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:53.307 --> 00:20:54.760 of do we actually have virtues?

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:54.760 --> 00:20:55.440 What do they look like?

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:55.440 --> 00:20:57.732 How do they manifest in different

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:57.732 --> 00:20:59.800 people in different situations as well?

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:20:59.800 --> 00:21:01.240 Again, I'm going to go too far into that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:21:01.240 --> 00:21:02.072 But I don't think,

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:21:02.072 --> 00:21:02.280 again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:21:02.280 --> 00:21:03.705 this is a unique problem

NOTE Confidence: 0.819106014285714

00:21:03.705 --> 00:21:04.560 for virtue ethicists.

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:08.280 --> 00:21:09.064 Yeah, I don't know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:09.064 --> 00:21:10.240 We never really know what's going

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:10.278 --> 00:21:11.640 on in someone else's head, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:11.640 --> 00:21:13.772 Just like this idea, that virtue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:13.772 --> 00:21:14.836 it's just so demanding,

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:14.840 --> 00:21:16.716 trying to be good all the time.

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:16.720 --> 00:21:18.478 Like, who has time for that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:18.480 --> 00:21:21.240 It's training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:21.240 --> 00:21:23.600 Well, maybe it should be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:23.600 --> 00:21:24.880 And I think virtual

NOTE Confidence: 0.898067008

00:21:24.880 --> 00:21:25.840 ethicists are certainly

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:28.480 --> 00:21:33.544 aware of this critique and very quick to

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:33.544 --> 00:21:35.308 acknowledge that yes, it takes practice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:35.308 --> 00:21:37.240 You're going to get it wrong sometimes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:37.240 --> 00:21:39.560 and there's a lot of people do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:39.560 --> 00:21:41.876 So I'm thinking about, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:41.880 --> 00:21:43.600 Jack, Jack, I'm sure you've

45

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:43.600 --> 00:21:45.320 done things where you're like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:45.320 --> 00:21:46.398 we would not say you weren't virtuous,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:46.400 --> 00:21:47.740 but you're like, I made some mistakes, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:47.740 --> 00:21:49.280 That doesn't not make you a virtuous.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:49.280 --> 00:21:53.264 No mistakes, OK, you know what I mean?

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:53.264 --> 00:21:56.232 They would say like this times 2 where

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:56.232 --> 00:21:59.324 it's like we're not going to call someone

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:21:59.324 --> 00:22:01.521 a vicious person overall because they

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:22:01.521 --> 00:22:03.474 perhaps made a mistake or didn't get it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:22:03.480 --> 00:22:04.320 you know, didn't get it right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:22:04.320 --> 00:22:05.508 In that particular situation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:22:05.508 --> 00:22:06.399 it's about practice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:22:06.400 --> 00:22:07.576 It's about cultivation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:22:07.576 --> 00:22:09.144 It's about this accumulation

NOTE Confidence: 0.901251863333333

00:22:09.144 --> 00:22:11.160 of habits and dispositions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:15.000 --> 00:22:15.764 See, I think virtuous.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:15.764 --> 00:22:16.528 There's another bullet that

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:16.528 --> 00:22:17.553 they would bite and say, yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:17.553 --> 00:22:18.518 it is demanding, It's hard.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:18.520 --> 00:22:20.040 It may not be perfect.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:20.040 --> 00:22:21.570 Aristol had sort of a framework

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:21.570 --> 00:22:23.223 where he talked about things like

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:23.223 --> 00:22:24.957 sort of almost like impotent virtue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:24.960 --> 00:22:26.150 where it's like you kind of know

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:26.150 --> 00:22:27.237 what the right thing to do is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:27.240 --> 00:22:28.360 But you have this weakness of will.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:28.360 --> 00:22:29.634 You can't always kind of get there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:29.640 --> 00:22:31.897 And again, kind of just practicing

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:31.897 --> 00:22:33.906 allowing yourself to get it wrong sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:33.906 --> 00:22:35.714 and sort of working on building that up,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:35.720 --> 00:22:37.736 building habits that help you to get

47

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:37.736 --> 00:22:40.400 there if it comes up again in the future.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:40.400 --> 00:22:41.560 And then the situation isn't,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:41.560 --> 00:22:43.576 which is a little bit more

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:43.576 --> 00:22:44.920 of a contemporary critique.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:44.920 --> 00:22:46.954 The Situationists are folks who ran

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:46.954 --> 00:22:48.742 some experiments in social psychology

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:48.742 --> 00:22:50.230 that they thought demonstrated

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:50.230 --> 00:22:52.430 that there's no such thing as

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:52.430 --> 00:22:54.116 sort of a stable character trait.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:54.120 --> 00:22:56.115 They sort of came up with some

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:56.115 --> 00:22:58.168 experiments that they felt showed

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:22:58.168 --> 00:23:00.378 people don't have virtues right

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:00.378 --> 00:23:02.800 by manipulating situations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:02.800 --> 00:23:05.236 That goes out the window real quick.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:05.240 --> 00:23:06.785 Situations have a tremendous amount

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:06.785 --> 00:23:08.760 of influence on how we behave.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:08.760 --> 00:23:10.320 And someone who you know beforehand was like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:10.320 --> 00:23:11.400 I'm a really honest person would

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:11.400 --> 00:23:12.695 straight up lie if we just fixed

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:12.695 --> 00:23:13.757 the situation in a certain way.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:13.760 --> 00:23:15.704 And they thought that when there's

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:15.704 --> 00:23:17.959 no such thing as virtues right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:17.960 --> 00:23:19.934 The methods and the design of their

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:19.934 --> 00:23:21.800 studies have been heavily critiqued.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:21.800 --> 00:23:23.600 And virtue ethicists also, I think,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:23.600 --> 00:23:25.718 took very admirably a lot of,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:25.720 --> 00:23:27.781 a lot of what they did find on board

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:27.781 --> 00:23:30.351 and have been doing a better job of

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:30.351 --> 00:23:32.080 partnering with empirical researchers,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:32.080 --> 00:23:33.415 with social scientists and have

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:33.415 --> 00:23:35.779 sort of come up with a lot of their

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:35.779 --> 00:23:37.231 own experiments as a response to

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:37.284 --> 00:23:38.846 the situation of studies that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:38.846 --> 00:23:39.824 Sure, actually, yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:39.824 --> 00:23:41.454 by nudging situations we can

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:41.454 --> 00:23:43.168 cultivate virtue or make people more

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:43.168 --> 00:23:44.800 inclined to move in certain ways.

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:44.800 --> 00:23:45.600 And actually that's kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:45.600 --> 00:23:46.425 grist to our mill, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:46.425 --> 00:23:47.720 Like we have to think about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:47.720 --> 00:23:48.496 virtues in an environmental

NOTE Confidence: 0.740656406923077

00:23:48.496 --> 00:23:49.600 way and how we sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:23:52.360 --> 00:23:54.328 how we kind of the architects of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:23:54.328 --> 00:23:56.392 spaces that we're in and how to kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:23:56.392 --> 00:23:58.050 of promote and encourage those kinds

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:23:58.050 --> 00:23:59.675 of qualities and their development.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:23:59.680 --> 00:24:01.108 So they've just, again, kind of taken

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:01.108 --> 00:24:02.560 that on board and responded to it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:02.560 --> 00:24:03.840 moving through these really,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:03.840 --> 00:24:04.800 really quickly again.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:04.800 --> 00:24:06.072 But these are sort of some

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:06.072 --> 00:24:06.920 of the main critiques.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:06.920 --> 00:24:08.837 I think there's teeth to a lot of them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:08.840 --> 00:24:10.184 I think virtue ethicists have done a

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:10.184 --> 00:24:11.840 good job of trying to respond to them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:11.840 --> 00:24:13.094 And again, if you're sitting here

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:13.094 --> 00:24:14.539 listening to this and you're like virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:14.539 --> 00:24:16.520 ethics is just not for me, that's OK.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:16.520 --> 00:24:19.040 Take take it or leave it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:19.040 --> 00:24:20.180 There's some really cool work

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:20.180 --> 00:24:21.320 just really quickly going on,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:21.320 --> 00:24:23.054 some sort of overlap between virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:23.054 --> 00:24:24.919 ethics and all of these areas,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:24.920 --> 00:24:27.340 Care ethics, feminist ethics,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:27.340 --> 00:24:30.053 African and indigenous bioethics who

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:30.053 --> 00:24:32.104 talk a lot about relationships to sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:32.104 --> 00:24:34.279 of land and and sort of practices.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:34.280 --> 00:24:35.684 And this is not to say any of these

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:35.684 --> 00:24:37.117 things are derivative of virtual ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:37.120 --> 00:24:39.337 They're not their ethical theories

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:39.337 --> 00:24:40.422 and really important areas of

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:40.422 --> 00:24:41.560 study in their own right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:41.560 --> 00:24:43.312 but just that there's some really

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:43.312 --> 00:24:44.760 cool and interesting synergies here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:44.760 --> 00:24:45.612 Philosophy of emotions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:45.612 --> 00:24:47.316 lots of really cool overlap there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:47.320 --> 00:24:48.370 As I said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:48.370 --> 00:24:50.120 moral and social social psychology.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:50.120 --> 00:24:52.154 Lots of cool collaboration and partnership

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:52.154 --> 00:24:54.080 going on between virtue ethicists,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:54.080 --> 00:24:55.940 virtue theorists and folks

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:55.940 --> 00:24:57.800 working in those areas.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:57.800 --> 00:24:59.260 And then professional and

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:24:59.260 --> 00:25:00.355 institutional ethics too.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:00.360 --> 00:25:02.136 There's sort of some debates going

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:02.136 --> 00:25:04.374 on about at the moment around whether

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:04.374 --> 00:25:06.428 or not organizations have sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:06.428 --> 00:25:08.510 a collective psyche and whether it

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:08.572 --> 00:25:10.720 makes sense to talk about things

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:10.720 --> 00:25:12.560 like institutional virtues and vices.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:12.560 --> 00:25:14.513 We're not going to wade into that that area,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:14.520 --> 00:25:17.680 but it's up there in case you're interested.

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:17.680 --> 00:25:18.072 OK,

NOTE Confidence: 0.821517608

00:25:18.072 --> 00:25:19.640 virtual ethics and healthcare.

NOTE Confidence: 0.765371991111111

00:25:23.400 --> 00:25:24.942 Has anyone in here ever read

NOTE Confidence: 0.765371991111111

00:25:24.942 --> 00:25:25.713 their professional code?

NOTE Confidence: 0.765371991111111

00:25:25.720 --> 00:25:28.480 We've got it. OK good couple.

NOTE Confidence: 0.765371991111111

00:25:28.480 --> 00:25:30.360 Couple. James has gone like, yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:33.240 --> 00:25:35.232 Has anyone here, did anyone here

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:35.232 --> 00:25:37.600 take the Hippocratic Oath? Yes. OK.

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:37.600 --> 00:25:40.583 So we just asked that references

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:40.583 --> 00:25:42.881 to certain kinds of virtues is

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:42.881 --> 00:25:45.359 really common in professional oaths,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:45.360 --> 00:25:46.692 professional codes of ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:46.692 --> 00:25:47.358 Throughout history,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:47.360 --> 00:25:49.000 it's always sort of been embedded in there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:49.000 --> 00:25:51.050 this sort of virtue language

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:51.050 --> 00:25:52.280 and virtue framing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:52.280 --> 00:25:53.240 Also being a good doctor

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:53.240 --> 00:25:54.200 or being a good nurse,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:54.200 --> 00:25:55.300 being a good ethicist,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:55.300 --> 00:25:56.675 being a good speech pathologist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:56.680 --> 00:25:57.758 These are all sort of I think,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:57.760 --> 00:25:59.748 common ways that we think about how

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:25:59.748 --> 00:26:01.426 we're approaching our roles and why

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:26:01.426 --> 00:26:03.239 we're doing the work that we're doing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:26:03.240 --> 00:26:05.538 Frequently cited virtue sort of cutting

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:26:05.538 --> 00:26:07.840 across all fields of healthcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:26:07.840 --> 00:26:10.360 all disciplines, all kind of trainings

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:26:10.360 --> 00:26:12.344 include things like compassion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:26:12.344 --> 00:26:14.888 empathy, benevolence, competence,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:26:14.888 --> 00:26:17.960 trustworthiness, humility, patience,

NOTE Confidence: 0.681579782

00:26:17.960 --> 00:26:19.000 all of these things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:26:22.280 --> 00:26:24.008 Sorry, this is probably not super

55

00:26:24.008 --> 00:26:25.940 easy to read, but this is a little

00:26:25.940 --> 00:26:27.000 bit from the American Medical

00:26:27.000 --> 00:26:29.040 Association's Code of Ethics.

00:26:29.040 --> 00:26:30.880 So I did bold them,

00:26:30.880 --> 00:26:31.678 but you can't really see it.

00:26:31.680 --> 00:26:34.080 But talks about physicians being

00:26:34.080 --> 00:26:36.480 dedicated to providing competent medical

00:26:36.549 --> 00:26:38.719 care with compassion and respect,

00:26:38.720 --> 00:26:43.436 being honest, respect for the law,

00:26:43.440 --> 00:26:45.126 avoiding things that are contrary to

00:26:45.126 --> 00:26:46.879 the best interests of the patient.

00:26:46.880 --> 00:26:48.976 It's as a physician to support shall support

00:26:48.976 --> 00:26:50.917 access to medical care for all people.

00:26:50.920 --> 00:26:52.880 We might frame that as something like,

00:26:52.880 --> 00:26:54.435 you know, them being committed

00:26:54.435 --> 00:26:56.440 to justice or fairness or equity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:26:56.440 --> 00:26:58.904 So again, you can kind of see there's

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:26:58.904 --> 00:27:01.039 some virtue terms embedded in here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:01.040 --> 00:27:01.850 The nursing association

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:01.850 --> 00:27:03.200 code of ethics is wonderful.

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:03.200 --> 00:27:04.016 So again, sorry,

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:04.016 --> 00:27:05.920 it's a little bit hard to read.

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:05.920 --> 00:27:07.531 But again, compassion,

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:07.531 --> 00:27:09.679 respect the inherent dignity,

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:09.680 --> 00:27:11.836 work and unique attributes of every person.

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:11.840 --> 00:27:13.740 So being very person,

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:13.740 --> 00:27:15.640 patient oriented and sensitive,

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:15.640 --> 00:27:16.680 being accountable,

NOTE Confidence: 0.951097403333333

00:27:16.680 --> 00:27:17.720 being responsible,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:19.920 --> 00:27:22.740 being collaborative, there's all kinds

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:22.740 --> 00:27:26.080 of virtue terms embedded in here,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:26.080 --> 00:27:29.360 conferences certainly in there as

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:29.360 --> 00:27:31.440 well-being advocate, working to

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:31.440 --> 00:27:34.456 promote health and safety all in there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:34.456 --> 00:27:37.032 And these are just examples of sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:37.032 --> 00:27:39.307 how it crops up in our professional

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:39.307 --> 00:27:41.357 language and framing of our roles.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:41.360 --> 00:27:43.736 So I was talking to Doctor Mercurio before

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:43.736 --> 00:27:45.801 we started and I asked what would you

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:45.801 --> 00:27:48.317 want me to talk about virtual ethics today?

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:48.320 --> 00:27:49.352 And you said, well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:49.352 --> 00:27:51.520 we talk a lot about principles and rights.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:51.520 --> 00:27:53.352 These are sort of a lot of other

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:53.352 --> 00:27:54.749 concepts and sort of frameworks

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:54.749 --> 00:27:56.513 that we use in healthcare ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:56.520 --> 00:27:59.140 You know, we talk about respect for autonomy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:27:59.140 --> 00:28:01.240 we talk about an efficence,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:01.240 --> 00:28:02.356 normal epicence justice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:02.356 --> 00:28:04.960 we talk about right to bodily integrity,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:04.960 --> 00:28:06.280 right to access to healthcare,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:06.280 --> 00:28:06.880 things like this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:06.880 --> 00:28:08.354 These are all really, really important.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:08.354 --> 00:28:10.039 But as I said earlier,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:10.040 --> 00:28:11.480 we're often pluralists.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:11.480 --> 00:28:12.440 It's messy.

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:12.440 --> 00:28:13.917 We draw on lots of different things

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:13.917 --> 00:28:15.559 to help us think through really,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:15.560 --> 00:28:16.332 really concrete,

NOTE Confidence: 0.812732805454546

00:28:16.332 --> 00:28:17.876 really real practical problems

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:20.000 --> 00:28:22.720 in healthcare. We often disagree.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:22.720 --> 00:28:23.550 I think that's probably true

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:23.550 --> 00:28:24.640 of a lot of other areas.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:24.640 --> 00:28:26.380 Our disagreements probably have a certain

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:26.380 --> 00:28:28.561 kind of flavour to them and certain sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:28.561 --> 00:28:30.400 of sort of effect on certain groups.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:30.400 --> 00:28:32.116 There's often uncertainty in our practice.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:32.120 --> 00:28:35.768 I think that's becoming more and more true

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:35.768 --> 00:28:38.260 with technological advancements and kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:38.260 --> 00:28:40.360 of the political climate that we're in.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:40.360 --> 00:28:42.262 As I said, Healthcare is usually

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:42.262 --> 00:28:43.966 pluralistic and we often adopt

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:43.966 --> 00:28:45.478 A process oriented approach.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:45.480 --> 00:28:47.478 We don't have to agree on values or outcomes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:47.480 --> 00:28:49.397 but we can agree on sort of how we

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:49.397 --> 00:28:51.488 get there and what sorts of processes

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:51.488 --> 00:28:53.320 we employ to resolve conflicts.

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:53.320 --> 00:28:56.448 So that's just to say we reason a lot on a

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:56.448 --> 00:28:59.680 case by case basis and we principles, rules,

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:28:59.680 --> 00:29:04.053 rights and virtues I think are all very,

NOTE Confidence: 0.88394203

00:29:04.053 --> 00:29:06.439 very important and it's messy

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:09.160 --> 00:29:13.496 applications. So I was sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:13.496 --> 00:29:14.656 sitting back thinking like what's

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:14.656 --> 00:29:16.357 what do I want you to to sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:16.357 --> 00:29:17.840 take away from today lots of things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:17.840 --> 00:29:19.688 But I think virtual ethics really is

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:19.688 --> 00:29:21.238 interested in not just in in what

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:21.238 --> 00:29:23.097 we do or what we end up doing or

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:23.097 --> 00:29:24.597 producing or the effect of things,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:24.600 --> 00:29:27.040 but how we do it, how do we get there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:27.040 --> 00:29:27.600 As I said, for me,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:27.600 --> 00:29:30.078 I always think about how how,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:30.080 --> 00:29:31.640 what am I carrying into the room today?

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:31.640 --> 00:29:35.040 How do I want to approach a relationship

61

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:35.040 --> 00:29:37.920 or a conflict or a conversation?

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:37.920 --> 00:29:40.040 How, how am I going to do that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:40.040 --> 00:29:42.008 That's just very, very important for

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:42.008 --> 00:29:44.480 us to think about ethically as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:44.480 --> 00:29:45.048 So as I said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:45.048 --> 00:29:46.758 I was going to do a case and then I go,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:46.760 --> 00:29:47.435 no, just kidding,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:47.435 --> 00:29:49.400 I'm going to give you some stories instead.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79176982

00:29:49.400 --> 00:29:49.560 Mark,

NOTE Confidence: 0.842971379090909

00:29:52.840 --> 00:29:55.243 I'm going to put you on the spot for

NOTE Confidence: 0.842971379090909

00:29:55.243 --> 00:29:57.205 a second. What's sort of a common

NOTE Confidence: 0.842971379090909

00:29:57.205 --> 00:29:58.799 conflict that comes up in the NICU?

NOTE Confidence: 0.443729833636364

00:30:00.760 --> 00:30:02.878 A common conflict that comes up

NOTE Confidence: 0.443729833636364

00:30:02.878 --> 00:30:07.040 with the Nick Do is a child, Sorry.

NOTE Confidence: 0.443729833636364

00:30:07.040 --> 00:30:10.176 A child who is terribly sick and

NOTE Confidence: 0.443729833636364

62

00:30:10.176 --> 00:30:11.929 ventilator dependent and has reached

NOTE Confidence: 0.443729833636364

00:30:11.929 --> 00:30:13.910 the point where many members of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.443729833636364

00:30:13.972 --> 00:30:15.802 staff are concerned that the prognosis

NOTE Confidence: 0.443729833636364

00:30:15.802 --> 00:30:17.920 is very poor and ongoing care is

NOTE Confidence: 0.5160938825

00:30:18.320 --> 00:30:21.200 more cool than kind. And the

NOTE Confidence: 0.5160938825

00:30:21.200 --> 00:30:22.720 conflict between the potential

NOTE Confidence: 0.809846616666667

00:30:22.720 --> 00:30:24.358 between the staff and the parents,

NOTE Confidence: 0.809846616666667

00:30:24.360 --> 00:30:25.908 where the parents want to continue

NOTE Confidence: 0.809846616666667

00:30:25.908 --> 00:30:27.519 all efforts and the staff feels

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:27.520 --> 00:30:29.880 what's going on with the.

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:29.880 --> 00:30:30.876 So just for the folks online,

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:30.880 --> 00:30:33.064 in case they couldn't hear that just

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:33.064 --> 00:30:34.870 classic kind of conflict between

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:34.870 --> 00:30:37.045 clinicians and parents about the

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:37.045 --> 00:30:38.755 appropriateness of continuing with

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:38.755 --> 00:30:40.490 sort of invasive life prolonging

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:40.490 --> 00:30:42.142 interventions for a very, very,

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:42.142 --> 00:30:43.940 very sick baby in the neck. You.

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:43.940 --> 00:30:45.260 Yes, that's sort of exactly the

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:45.260 --> 00:30:47.024 the kind of long case that I had

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:47.024 --> 00:30:48.504 written up that I thought we'd

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:48.504 --> 00:30:49.638 work through systematically.

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:49.640 --> 00:30:51.400 But I thought this is sort of typical.

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:51.400 --> 00:30:54.234 I think of a lot of disagreements

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:54.234 --> 00:30:56.358 and cases where there's a little

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:56.358 --> 00:30:58.239 bit of uncertainty in healthcare.

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:58.240 --> 00:30:59.520 And I was thinking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:30:59.520 --> 00:31:01.868 my colleague Ros and I ended up

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:31:01.868 --> 00:31:04.034 writing a paper about virtue ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:31:04.040 --> 00:31:07.100 as it relates to the parental

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:31:07.100 --> 00:31:09.245 role in decisions for children,

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:31:09.245 --> 00:31:11.495 published that last year precisely because

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:31:11.495 --> 00:31:13.716 of these kinds of classic conflicts.

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:31:13.720 --> 00:31:18.557 Right. And we talked a lot about,

NOTE Confidence: 0.449248274

00:31:18.560 --> 00:31:19.760 sorry, this is my first story.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:23.560 --> 00:31:26.684 We talked a lot about walking as

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:26.684 --> 00:31:27.980 the ethicists getting consulted

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:27.980 --> 00:31:30.000 in these kinds of cases after,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:30.000 --> 00:31:32.282 you know, weeks to months of of

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:32.282 --> 00:31:34.039 clinicians meeting with the parents,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:34.040 --> 00:31:35.325 sort of talking to them

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:35.325 --> 00:31:36.353 about the child's prognosis,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:36.360 --> 00:31:38.331 making recommendations about

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:38.331 --> 00:31:40.959 discontinuing some things potentially.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:40.960 --> 00:31:42.624 And as the ethicist, this is sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:42.624 --> 00:31:44.079 funny thing that happens sometimes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:44.080 --> 00:31:46.368 You know, you'll get consulted on the case

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:46.368 --> 00:31:48.676 and you'll talk to say that the attending,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:48.680 --> 00:31:50.318 the neonatologist who consulted you or

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:50.318 --> 00:31:52.039 the nurse practitioner that consulted you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:52.040 --> 00:31:53.300 And they'll say this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:53.300 --> 00:31:54.875 this family loves their kid,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:54.880 --> 00:31:58.200 but they're just not getting where we're at.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:58.200 --> 00:31:59.928 And we need your help kind of getting

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:31:59.928 --> 00:32:01.800 them to understand that there's this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:01.800 --> 00:32:04.600 this isn't going anywhere, right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:04.600 --> 00:32:06.280 It's just hurting the kid at this point,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:06.280 --> 00:32:08.480 the baby at this point.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:08.480 --> 00:32:10.454 And you're going kind of sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:10.454 --> 00:32:12.484 I'll feel kind of nervous just

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:12.484 --> 00:32:15.068 because of some of the things the team

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:15.133 --> 00:32:16.572 has said about the parents being,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:16.572 --> 00:32:18.768 you know, kind of kind of hard headed

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:18.768 --> 00:32:20.226 and not really in denial,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:20.226 --> 00:32:21.398 not really receiving information.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:21.400 --> 00:32:22.665 And I'll leave a conversation

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:22.665 --> 00:32:23.677 with the parents thinking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:23.680 --> 00:32:24.182 wow,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:24.182 --> 00:32:26.692 those what amazing parents they

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:26.692 --> 00:32:28.454 are just an amazing,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:28.454 --> 00:32:30.544 overwhelming sense of just love

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:30.544 --> 00:32:32.320 and dedication to their kid.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:32.320 --> 00:32:34.648 And so sort of coming out of these

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:34.648 --> 00:32:37.004 kinds of consults got me thinking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:37.004 --> 00:32:39.087 virtue ethics a lot because they think

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:39.087 --> 00:32:40.767 we don't necessarily need to agree

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:40.767 --> 00:32:42.797 on what the right thing to do is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:42.800 --> 00:32:45.880 and perhaps we will never agree on that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.910746756666667

00:32:45.880 --> 00:32:47.836 We don't necessarily have to know

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:32:49.960 --> 00:32:52.584 what the babies, what survival

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:32:52.584 --> 00:32:54.540 would look like, what their quality

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:32:54.540 --> 00:32:56.920 of life is going to look like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:32:56.920 --> 00:32:58.537 what their odds of kind of making

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:32:58.537 --> 00:33:00.198 it out of the NICU will be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:00.200 --> 00:33:02.132 We don't necessarily have to know

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:02.132 --> 00:33:04.219 that there's always going to be some

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:04.219 --> 00:33:05.941 element of uncertainty in a lot of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:05.996 --> 00:33:07.796 the the situations that we're in.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:07.800 --> 00:33:08.720 But what we can do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:08.720 --> 00:33:12.048 I think is sort of take a breath

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:12.048 --> 00:33:15.200 and and and recognize and sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:15.200 --> 00:33:17.209 of validate the really admirable

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:17.209 --> 00:33:18.907 qualities that both sort of the

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:18.907 --> 00:33:20.379 clinical team and parents bring

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:20.379 --> 00:33:21.799 to these kinds of disagreements.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:21.800 --> 00:33:22.876 And so for me,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:22.876 --> 00:33:24.221 kind of thinking about parental

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:24.221 --> 00:33:25.403 virtues and sometimes working

NOTE Confidence: 0.8392527

00:33:25.403 --> 00:33:26.833 with the team to reframe

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:29.360 --> 00:33:30.984 these kinds of conflicts to sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:30.984 --> 00:33:32.576 say to my, to my clinical colleagues,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:32.576 --> 00:33:34.039 like, hey, I did talk with the family

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:34.039 --> 00:33:35.515 and what I heard was that they're

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:35.515 --> 00:33:37.153 just trying to be good parents and

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:37.153 --> 00:33:38.398 that's really driving their decisions

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:38.398 --> 00:33:40.885 and why they feel like they cannot

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:40.885 --> 00:33:43.360 discontinue things at this point.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:43.360 --> 00:33:44.424 Have you talked to them about what

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:33:44.424 --> 00:33:45.477 it means to be a good parent?

00:33:45.480 --> 00:33:47.629 Sort of framing things around the parental

00:33:47.629 --> 00:33:49.478 role and thinking that through has,

00:33:49.480 --> 00:33:50.796 at least for me and my practice,

00:33:50.800 --> 00:33:53.460 been a helpful way of sort of

00:33:53.460 --> 00:33:54.600 approaching these disagreements.

00:33:54.600 --> 00:33:57.048 And you don't have to kind of move one

00:33:57.048 --> 00:33:58.280 party to the other's point of view,

00:33:58.280 --> 00:33:59.568 but we can get a little bit closer

00:33:59.568 --> 00:34:00.840 to a shared middle I think.

00:34:00.840 --> 00:34:01.748 So that's one way.

00:34:01.748 --> 00:34:03.450 And again not I don't walk into

00:34:03.450 --> 00:34:05.172 the room thinking what would virtue

00:34:05.172 --> 00:34:06.999 ethics say about this disagreement.

00:34:07.000 --> 00:34:09.520 But kind of thinking often post talk

00:34:09.520 --> 00:34:11.390 about like what were the things I

00:34:11.390 --> 00:34:13.087 heard and how are they reflective of

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:13.087 --> 00:34:15.047 what people think it means to be a

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:15.107 --> 00:34:16.673 good parent or a good neonatologist

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:16.673 --> 00:34:18.512 or a good nurse in this case.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:18.512 --> 00:34:20.360 And how can we recognize and validate

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:20.416 --> 00:34:21.874 those things so that we build

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:21.874 --> 00:34:23.320 a little bit more rapport.

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:23.320 --> 00:34:25.264 So that is certainly one kind of case

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:25.264 --> 00:34:27.712 where I think that this thinking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:27.712 --> 00:34:30.160 virtues and particularly role based virtues,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:30.160 --> 00:34:32.383 what it means as I said to be a

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:32.383 --> 00:34:34.560 good parent and good Commission,

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:34.560 --> 00:34:36.108 good social work and good healthcare

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:36.108 --> 00:34:37.454 administrator or whoever is involved

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:37.454 --> 00:34:39.050 in the console thinking that through

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:39.050 --> 00:34:40.356 those different role based virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.758493921

00:34:40.356 --> 00:34:41.959 lenses has been really helpful for me.

NOTE Confidence: 0.882300289285714

00:34:45.320 --> 00:34:47.576 Anyone in the room ever had

NOTE Confidence: 0.882300289285714

00:34:47.576 --> 00:34:50.060 sort of a conflict with a

NOTE Confidence: 0.882300289285714

00:34:50.060 --> 00:34:51.440 colleague about patient care?

NOTE Confidence: 0.882300289285714

00:34:51.440 --> 00:34:52.640 Yeah, we've got some nods.

NOTE Confidence: 0.882300289285714

00:34:52.640 --> 00:34:54.864 Yeah, not surprised. Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.882300289285714

00:34:54.864 --> 00:34:56.600 So sometimes I think about this too.

NOTE Confidence: 0.882300289285714

00:34:56.600 --> 00:34:58.751 So you know we'll get again a kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.882300289285714

00:34:58.751 --> 00:35:00.480 consult that we'll get sometimes is

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:03.040 --> 00:35:06.686 maybe a consult from a nurse or from

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:06.686 --> 00:35:08.688 a resident or sort of a specialist

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:08.688 --> 00:35:10.353 consultant who's like I don't know

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:10.353 --> 00:35:11.913 what we're doing to this patient,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:11.920 --> 00:35:13.840 like everyone's pulling their

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:13.840 --> 00:35:15.760 care in different directions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:15.760 --> 00:35:16.576 We need you to come in

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:16.576 --> 00:35:17.440 and sort of help us sort,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:17.440 --> 00:35:18.400 sort it through and get on

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:18.400 --> 00:35:19.320 the same page about things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:19.320 --> 00:35:21.280 So this is sort of another role

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:21.280 --> 00:35:24.530 based case where I really think

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:24.530 --> 00:35:26.810 that again we may not ever think

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:26.810 --> 00:35:28.186 or agree upon what the absolute

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:28.186 --> 00:35:30.074 best thing to do is for a patient.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:30.080 --> 00:35:31.958 There may be uncertainty about outcomes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:31.960 --> 00:35:33.472 We may not know what's going to

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:33.472 --> 00:35:35.360 happen if we do X versus one we do Y.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:35.360 --> 00:35:37.544 So again there might be sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:37.544 --> 00:35:38.906 disagreement or uncertainty at

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:38.906 --> 00:35:41.462 the epistemic level about sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:41.462 --> 00:35:43.040 predicted outcomes about what's

73

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:43.040 --> 00:35:44.480 important for this patient.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:44.480 --> 00:35:46.352 But what we can do is sort of again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:46.360 --> 00:35:50.595 adopt that role based lens and recognize

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:50.600 --> 00:35:52.119 why there's a little bit of tension,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:52.120 --> 00:35:52.372 right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:52.372 --> 00:35:53.632 why we're kind of pulling

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:53.632 --> 00:35:54.640 things in different directions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:54.640 --> 00:35:55.050 So again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:55.050 --> 00:35:56.485 sort of just piercing things out and

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:56.485 --> 00:35:57.915 everyone sort of wearing a different hat.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:35:57.920 --> 00:36:00.080 And there's some different commitments,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:00.080 --> 00:36:00.413 different,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:00.413 --> 00:36:01.745 different virtues that people

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:01.745 --> 00:36:03.745 are sort of carrying in based

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:03.745 --> 00:36:05.437 on their role to that situation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

74

00:36:05.440 --> 00:36:07.576 I think it has helped me in these

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:07.576 --> 00:36:10.316 kinds of cases as well to sort of find

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:10.316 --> 00:36:12.260 some shared ground and just try and

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:12.260 --> 00:36:14.319 like take a breath and just be like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:14.320 --> 00:36:15.559 you don't have to like this person.

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:15.560 --> 00:36:16.820 But we can kind of respect that

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:16.820 --> 00:36:17.896 They're trying to be a good

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:17.896 --> 00:36:18.880 nurse or they're trying to be,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:18.880 --> 00:36:19.920 you know, a good clinician,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:19.920 --> 00:36:21.240 a good, a good cardiologist,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:21.240 --> 00:36:21.686 a good,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:21.686 --> 00:36:22.132 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:22.132 --> 00:36:23.470 whoever's in the room involved in

NOTE Confidence: 0.849025664285714

00:36:23.520 --> 00:36:24.876 in the conflict in the consult.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:28.840 --> 00:36:29.572 One more story.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:29.572 --> 00:36:33.160 How am I going for time? OK, perfect.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:33.160 --> 00:36:37.780 So I was in Melbourne in September

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:37.780 --> 00:36:39.608 for a conference on pediatric

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:39.608 --> 00:36:41.360 bioethics with Lynn and the team

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:41.417 --> 00:36:42.877 at Royal Children's Hospital.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:42.880 --> 00:36:45.330 And the theme of the conference was

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:45.330 --> 00:36:47.462 innovation. So we spent 2 1/2 days

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:47.462 --> 00:36:50.004 talking a lot about these amazing

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:50.004 --> 00:36:52.336 technological advances in healthcare.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:52.336 --> 00:36:55.504 You know, cut like cutting edge

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:55.504 --> 00:36:56.845 surgical techniques, devices.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:36:56.845 --> 00:37:01.040 We talked a lot about AI, machine learning,

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:01.040 --> 00:37:02.195 just kind of the brave new world,

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:02.200 --> 00:37:03.785 just kind of everything that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:03.785 --> 00:37:05.053 pulling healthcare in certain

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:05.053 --> 00:37:06.039 directions at the moment,

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:06.040 --> 00:37:07.048 where funding is going,

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:07.048 --> 00:37:08.560 what we're what we're interested in,

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:08.560 --> 00:37:11.520 what we seem to value overall within

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:11.520 --> 00:37:13.680 clinical practice and research.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:13.680 --> 00:37:14.748 And it's really interesting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.917222928888889

00:37:14.748 --> 00:37:16.839 Things started to happen on the second day

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:19.000 --> 00:37:20.998 during the Q&amp;A for the sessions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:21.000 --> 00:37:25.316 People, much to my delight and surprise,

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:25.320 --> 00:37:26.775 really started drawing upon virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:26.775 --> 00:37:28.684 terms to talk about their roles

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:28.684 --> 00:37:30.276 and their professional obligations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:30.280 --> 00:37:32.156 And it was just sort of this

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:32.156 --> 00:37:33.291 really interesting natural thing

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:33.291 --> 00:37:34.929 that sort of happened with a

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:34.929 --> 00:37:36.440 particular group that we had there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:37:36.440 --> 00:37:37.651 And I was talking to my colleague

00:37:37.651 --> 00:37:38.940 John Massey, and we all come.

00:37:38.940 --> 00:37:40.244 This is so interesting, like,

00:37:40.244 --> 00:37:42.792 why are we drawing upon virtue ethics

00:37:42.792 --> 00:37:45.506 so much in the context of this really

00:37:45.506 --> 00:37:46.728 broad philosophical and practical

00:37:46.728 --> 00:37:48.800 discussion about what is innovation and like,

00:37:48.800 --> 00:37:50.480 is it good, is it bad?

00:37:50.480 --> 00:37:52.238 People were really latching onto well,

00:37:52.240 --> 00:37:54.160 well my role is this,

00:37:54.160 --> 00:37:57.290 I feel like I have to do this and you

00:37:57.381 --> 00:37:59.160 know people I think were looking for

00:37:59.160 --> 00:38:00.621 something to grasp onto that felt

00:38:00.621 --> 00:38:01.983 a little more tangible just given

00:38:01.983 --> 00:38:03.599 how much uncertainty and how much

00:38:03.599 --> 00:38:04.994 we're kind of pushing boundaries

00:38:04.994 --> 00:38:08.160 around what's possible in healthcare.

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:38:08.160 --> 00:38:10.435 And we just found that really interesting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.908054723333333

00:38:10.440 --> 00:38:11.917 And So what I've been thinking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:15.120 --> 00:38:16.320 is why are we so drawn to it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:16.320 --> 00:38:17.400 When are we drawn to it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:17.400 --> 00:38:19.152 Who is drawn to this kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:19.152 --> 00:38:20.320 of virtue based framing?

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:20.320 --> 00:38:23.274 And and I think as I said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:23.280 --> 00:38:24.900 where it sort of feels like

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:24.900 --> 00:38:26.545 more solid ground and where it

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:26.545 --> 00:38:28.063 feels like it has more value

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:28.063 --> 00:38:29.641 is often when we're talking

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:29.641 --> 00:38:30.985 about roles and relationships

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:30.985 --> 00:38:32.484 that kind of interpersonal bit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:32.484 --> 00:38:34.178 What are the qualities I want to

NOTE Confidence: 0.8998306925

00:38:34.178 --> 00:38:35.319 approach that interaction with

00:38:37.720 --> 00:38:40.745 and particularly when those roles

00:38:40.745 --> 00:38:42.720 and relationships potentially

00:38:42.720 --> 00:38:45.000 create different epistemic,

00:38:45.000 --> 00:38:48.040 normative or practical commitments?

00:38:48.040 --> 00:38:49.258 So again, recognizing we may not be

00:38:49.258 --> 00:38:50.598 on the same page about something,

00:38:50.600 --> 00:38:52.616 but what I can control is sort of

00:38:52.616 --> 00:38:54.880 how I approach this interaction.

00:38:54.880 --> 00:38:56.236 As I said, when there's disagreement,

00:38:56.240 --> 00:38:58.360 when there's uncertainty about things,

00:38:58.360 --> 00:39:00.320 I think that is a time when

00:39:00.320 --> 00:39:01.160 virtue ethics really,

00:39:01.160 --> 00:39:02.360 I think it always adds something.

00:39:02.360 --> 00:39:04.719 But the the less certain things are,

00:39:04.720 --> 00:39:06.078 the more prone we are to disagreement.

00:39:06.080 --> 00:39:07.816 I think that's really a time when

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:07.816 --> 00:39:09.560 it can help us because again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:09.560 --> 00:39:10.858 you have control over you, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:10.858 --> 00:39:12.664 That's kind of the thing that you

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:12.664 --> 00:39:14.404 can control when you approach and

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:14.404 --> 00:39:16.348 by cultivating those in a personal

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:16.348 --> 00:39:18.920 sort of skills and virtues,

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:18.920 --> 00:39:21.440 I think I've seen it be very

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:21.440 --> 00:39:22.432 powerful in different settings.

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:22.440 --> 00:39:23.730 And it was really interesting at

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:23.730 --> 00:39:24.802 this conference how much people

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:24.802 --> 00:39:26.130 were drawn to it when we were sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:26.130 --> 00:39:27.835 of struggling with like what are we

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:27.835 --> 00:39:28.831 doing as healthcare practitioners

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:28.840 --> 00:39:31.104 and researchers at the moment doing

NOTE Confidence: 0.749488265714286

00:39:31.104 --> 00:39:32.892 all this cool stuff. But like, why?

00:39:32.892 --> 00:39:34.356 What is it we care about?

00:39:34.360 --> 00:39:36.747 How are we kind of thinking about

00:39:36.747 --> 00:39:38.520 the the professional roles that

00:39:38.520 --> 00:39:40.560 we have and who they're helping?

00:39:40.560 --> 00:39:42.360 I'm going to whiz through this.

00:39:45.000 --> 00:39:46.351 The other thing I just whizzed through

00:39:46.351 --> 00:39:47.591 was just some research that we're

00:39:47.591 --> 00:39:49.026 doing at the moment on responses to

00:39:49.064 --> 00:39:50.246 suffering and sort of carrying the

00:39:50.246 --> 00:39:51.664 work and moral and social psychology.

00:39:51.664 --> 00:39:53.536 What actually happens in our brains

00:39:53.536 --> 00:39:55.361 when we when we witness someone

00:39:55.361 --> 00:39:57.479 suffering with some of the virtue ethics

00:39:57.479 --> 00:39:59.199 theory on virtues like compassion,

00:39:59.200 --> 00:40:00.880 mercy, pity, things like that.

00:40:00.880 --> 00:40:02.000 So putting them in conversation,

NOTE Confidence: 0.800970539

00:40:02.000 --> 00:40:02.840 it's going to be really cool.

NOTE Confidence: 0.845069371785714

00:40:06.200 --> 00:40:07.928 We're at 5:45. I'm going to kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.845069371785714

00:40:07.928 --> 00:40:09.705 wrap it up there with just these

NOTE Confidence: 0.845069371785714

00:40:09.705 --> 00:40:11.521 are sort of questions that I had

NOTE Confidence: 0.845069371785714

00:40:11.521 --> 00:40:12.955 for you all coming into tonight.

NOTE Confidence: 0.845069371785714

00:40:12.960 --> 00:40:14.759 I was really sort of thinking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:16.880 --> 00:40:17.798 as I said, where we're at.

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:17.800 --> 00:40:19.438 I know we've got some trainees in the room.

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:19.440 --> 00:40:20.875 How do you think about your role?

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:20.880 --> 00:40:24.037 What kinds of qualities do you think

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:24.040 --> 00:40:25.750 healthcare practitioners need to have

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:25.750 --> 00:40:27.786 this particular moment in history with

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:27.786 --> 00:40:29.436 sort of everything that's going on,

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:29.440 --> 00:40:31.496 all of these conversations

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:31.496 --> 00:40:33.038 questioning medical expertise,

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:33.040 --> 00:40:35.920 authority of clinicians,

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:35.920 --> 00:40:37.198 what sorts of traits feel really,

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:37.200 --> 00:40:38.520 really valuable to you?

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:38.520 --> 00:40:40.920 So it's even something you think about.

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:40.920 --> 00:40:41.612 How do you see,

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:41.612 --> 00:40:43.202 how do you all see virtue ethics applying

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:43.202 --> 00:40:44.467 to your personal or professional

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:44.467 --> 00:40:46.080 life if you think that they do?

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:46.080 --> 00:40:49.604 And what value do you think it has, if any?

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:49.604 --> 00:40:51.114 What bugs you about it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:51.120 --> 00:40:52.794 These are sort of some questions

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:52.794 --> 00:40:54.830 that I had coming into it that I

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:54.830 --> 00:40:56.475 would love to hear your thoughts on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.707729603333333

00:40:56.480 --> 00:40:58.400 I can leave that up.

NOTE Confidence: 0.902081557142857

00:41:00.560 --> 00:41:01.883 Here's my info. Please feel free to

NOTE Confidence: 0.902081557142857

00:41:01.883 --> 00:41:03.397 reach out if you have any questions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.902081557142857

00:41:03.400 --> 00:41:05.480 I work mostly in pediatric Biomedics as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.902081557142857

00:41:05.480 --> 00:41:06.848 So if you have questions about

NOTE Confidence: 0.902081557142857

00:41:06.848 --> 00:41:07.760 decision making for kids,

NOTE Confidence: 0.902081557142857

00:41:07.760 --> 00:41:09.520 super happy to chat about that, about this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.902081557142857

00:41:09.520 --> 00:41:10.920 about pretty much anything else.

NOTE Confidence: 0.902081557142857

00:41:10.920 --> 00:41:12.920 So thank you all so much. Yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.38384374

00:41:18.160 --> 00:41:18.559 leave that out.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:18.840 --> 00:41:20.080 That's great. Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:20.080 --> 00:41:21.320 Thank you very much.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:21.320 --> 00:41:23.396 An announcement I need to make

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:23.396 --> 00:41:25.499 that Karen reminds me before we

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:25.499 --> 00:41:29.400 get any further for CMA, please.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:29.400 --> 00:41:32.270 And it is this for the folks

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:32.270 --> 00:41:33.320 on Zoom should have this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:33.320 --> 00:41:35.624 But for the folks in the room to get

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:35.624 --> 00:41:37.663 your continuing education credit for

NOTE Confidence: 0.86199502875

00:41:37.663 --> 00:41:40.680 this talk you it's the number is

NOTE Confidence: 0.790740403

00:41:44.360 --> 00:41:45.676 203-442-9435. A lot of folks that yell

NOTE Confidence: 0.790740403

00:41:45.676 --> 00:41:46.920 know this number. It's in your phone

NOTE Confidence: 0.949194054285714

00:41:49.600 --> 00:41:52.239 203-442-9435. And the code you text is

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:41:56.720 --> 00:41:58.320 40965 40965. And if you didn't get that

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:41:58.320 --> 00:42:00.258 if some way at the end of the talk you can

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:00.258 --> 00:42:01.995 come see me and I'll send you that again.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:02.000 --> 00:42:04.118 Or you can ask Karen. She has that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:04.118 --> 00:42:08.160 This was wonderful. Thank you so much.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:08.160 --> 00:42:10.476 I'm going to take the the

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:10.480 --> 00:42:11.860 the moderator's prerogative.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:11.860 --> 00:42:14.760 I've got 1 mic here. I'm going to ask you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:14.760 --> 00:42:16.240 You've got one as well. Terrific.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:16.240 --> 00:42:19.476 OK. So when we go around your talk,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:19.480 --> 00:42:22.000 if you'd be so kind as to raise your hand

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:22.000 --> 00:42:23.760 and I'll indicate who's going to speak next,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:23.760 --> 00:42:24.800 and Karen will bring him, like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:24.800 --> 00:42:27.040 wait till the mic gets to you

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:27.040 --> 00:42:28.720 so that everybody can hear you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:28.720 --> 00:42:30.569 including the folks who are online.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:30.569 --> 00:42:32.032 I want to start by answering what

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:32.032 --> 00:42:34.139 do I think one of the most valuable

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:34.139 --> 00:42:34.958 traits or dispositions?

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:34.960 --> 00:42:36.466 Because I was thinking of things

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:36.466 --> 00:42:38.802 and it might not be one of this is

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:38.802 --> 00:42:40.340 particularly for my student pals who

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:40.340 --> 00:42:41.931 were in the room because, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:41.931 --> 00:42:43.216 everybody's going to talk about

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:43.216 --> 00:42:44.876 kindness and honesty and all that stuff.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:44.880 --> 00:42:46.220 Yeah. Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:46.220 --> 00:42:46.890 Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:46.890 --> 00:42:48.635 So And I think those things

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:48.635 --> 00:42:49.280 are horribly important,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:49.280 --> 00:42:52.348 but I have to say that as someone

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:52.348 --> 00:42:53.918 who works with physicians and

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:53.918 --> 00:42:55.480 for years supervised physicians,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:55.480 --> 00:42:57.496 what I found to be the most

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:57.496 --> 00:42:59.340 valuable trait or the trait that

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:42:59.340 --> 00:43:01.230 was most dangerous when it was

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:01.300 --> 00:43:03.400 missing was reliability.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:03.400 --> 00:43:04.860 And you would touch on trustworthiness

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:04.860 --> 00:43:06.920 and we'll call it the same thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:06.920 --> 00:43:08.462 When I say to someone did

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:08.462 --> 00:43:10.008 you do X and they say yes,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:10.008 --> 00:43:11.880 I did X and then I find out

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:11.880 --> 00:43:13.200 afterwards that they didn't.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:13.200 --> 00:43:14.640 That's a huge problem in

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:14.640 --> 00:43:15.792 the practice of medicine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:15.800 --> 00:43:18.456 The reliability and trustworthiness

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:18.456 --> 00:43:21.630 is is that's a what's the word.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:21.630 --> 00:43:23.380 I'm thinking of a deal breaker when

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:23.429 --> 00:43:24.919 that's not really really solid.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:24.920 --> 00:43:26.285 So that's just my throw in for

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:26.285 --> 00:43:27.670 the for the students and the

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:27.670 --> 00:43:28.920 younger folks in the room.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:28.920 --> 00:43:29.694 But past that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:29.694 --> 00:43:31.500 I actually want to turn it over

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:31.557 --> 00:43:33.486 to others who may have answers to

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:33.486 --> 00:43:34.470 Professor Moore's questions or

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:34.470 --> 00:43:36.080 other things they want to ask her.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:36.080 --> 00:43:37.310 But let's start before we start

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:37.310 --> 00:43:38.759 asking her the really hard questions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:38.760 --> 00:43:42.080 let's try and answer some of her questions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:42.080 --> 00:43:43.240 Can you bring the mic?

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:43.240 --> 00:43:45.240 Do you have the mic?

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:45.240 --> 00:43:46.794 So can you bring it up to

NOTE Confidence: 0.810073078571429

00:43:46.800 --> 00:43:47.720 Mark to start us off?

NOTE Confidence: 0.70839965

00:43:52.360 --> 00:43:52.866 Are you comfortable?

NOTE Confidence: 0.70839965

00:43:52.866 --> 00:43:54.384 Do you want me to grab your chair?

NOTE Confidence: 0.70839965

00:43:54.384 --> 00:43:55.638 Are you good? You're welcome.

NOTE Confidence: 0.70839965

00:43:55.638 --> 00:43:57.000 I'm just sitting at the

NOTE Confidence: 0.464778047142857

00:43:58.200 --> 00:43:59.091 table. I'm good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.464778047142857

00:43:59.091 --> 00:44:00.786 Thank you for an excellent talk.

NOTE Confidence: 0.464778047142857

00:44:00.786 --> 00:44:02.640 So I'll, I'll start with the middle,

NOTE Confidence: 0.464778047142857

00:44:02.640 --> 00:44:04.480 the middle question. So.

NOTE Confidence: 0.464778047142857

00:44:04.480 --> 00:44:07.560 So I was a Co chair of the adult bioethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.970298444

00:44:07.560 --> 00:44:09.896 committee for several years

NOTE Confidence: 0.970298444

00:44:09.896 --> 00:44:12.190 and one thing that struck me

NOTE Confidence: 0.970298444

00:44:12.190 --> 00:44:13.745 is that I was used to wonder

NOTE Confidence: 0.970298444

00:44:13.745 --> 00:44:16.680 why did this case come to us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.970298444

00:44:16.680 --> 00:44:18.890 And and I I regret looking

NOTE Confidence: 0.970298444

00:44:18.890 --> 00:44:20.919 back that you know I I took

NOTE Confidence: 0.78332127625

00:44:20.920 --> 00:44:22.545 sort of a principalist approach

NOTE Confidence: 0.78332127625

00:44:22.545 --> 00:44:24.720 to most of the challenges that

NOTE Confidence: 0.78332127625

00:44:24.720 --> 00:44:27.360 were brought to our our table. But

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:27.360 --> 00:44:30.608 I think that what I'm seeing now

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:30.608 --> 00:44:32.680 particularly this evening is where

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:32.680 --> 00:44:36.380 the the absence of virtue actually

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:36.380 --> 00:44:38.146 might have contributed to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:38.146 --> 00:44:39.720 problem coming up in the 1st place.

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:39.720 --> 00:44:41.430 So not that virtue was going

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:41.430 --> 00:44:43.898 to offer easy solutions,

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:43.898 --> 00:44:46.959 but that the lack of honesty

NOTE Confidence: 0.945617352

00:44:46.960 --> 00:44:49.160 or the lack of integrity

NOTE Confidence: 0.966061758

00:44:49.160 --> 00:44:50.880 or the lack of kindness

NOTE Confidence: 0.837988116666667

00:44:51.360 --> 00:44:53.556 is actually what caused a dissolution

NOTE Confidence: 0.837988116666667

00:44:53.560 --> 00:44:55.880 of the relationship between the

NOTE Confidence: 0.837988116666667

00:44:55.880 --> 00:44:58.279 patients and the and the physicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.837988116666667

00:44:58.279 --> 00:45:00.520 and the and the healthcare team. And.

NOTE Confidence: 0.837988116666667

00:45:00.520 --> 00:45:02.320 And so the lesson was, if you almost think

NOTE Confidence: 0.872517555714286

00:45:02.320 --> 00:45:04.679 about it in like a preventive way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.872517555714286

00:45:04.680 --> 00:45:08.533 right, if if we acted virtuously, maybe,

NOTE Confidence: 0.872517555714286

00:45:08.533 --> 00:45:11.160 maybe the dilemmas that come to us

NOTE Confidence: 0.967603405

00:45:11.560 --> 00:45:13.120 would never have happened in the first place.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:14.920 --> 00:45:16.448 Yeah, I've got like a million things going

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:16.448 --> 00:45:17.960 through my head with a comment like that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:17.960 --> 00:45:19.720 I also think it's an interesting question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

92

00:45:19.720 --> 00:45:22.024 Why? Why this case like something I'm like

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:22.024 --> 00:45:23.716 that you could have got that case weeks

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:23.716 --> 00:45:25.320 ago and it wouldn't have come like it was.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:25.320 --> 00:45:27.102 Interesting trends and questions I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:27.102 --> 00:45:29.425 in there about when that particular

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:29.425 --> 00:45:32.275 mechanism of the committee gets triggered.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:32.280 --> 00:45:35.456 I feel sometimes a little bit wary.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:35.456 --> 00:45:38.502 A lot wary about talking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:38.502 --> 00:45:40.539 vices or kind of thinking about my

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:40.539 --> 00:45:42.120 colleagues or myself being like man,

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:42.120 --> 00:45:44.800 I just I was unkind or like how do how do.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:44.800 --> 00:45:47.161 What I'm asking is kind of how

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:47.161 --> 00:45:48.607 do we balance not being overly

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:48.607 --> 00:45:49.880 judgmental with people or you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:49.880 --> 00:45:51.357 I would never say in a meeting,

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:51.360 --> 00:45:55.222 man that person was like I might

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:55.222 --> 00:45:57.720 think it but like how do we kind of.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:57.720 --> 00:45:58.190 I wouldn't.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:45:58.190 --> 00:46:00.070 I would hate for us to have sort

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:00.128 --> 00:46:02.096 of a virtue ethics lens on a virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:02.096 --> 00:46:04.246 ethics hat on and kind of come out

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:04.246 --> 00:46:05.544 of something thinking like well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:05.544 --> 00:46:07.112 it's just about kind of pointing at

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:07.112 --> 00:46:08.448 people who whack really important

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:08.448 --> 00:46:09.848 qualities And like again that

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:09.848 --> 00:46:11.318 doesn't kind of resolve anything.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:11.320 --> 00:46:13.056 But what I think your comment gets

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:13.056 --> 00:46:15.648 us to is the importance of creating

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:15.648 --> 00:46:17.436 environments and workplace cultures

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:17.440 --> 00:46:19.400 that help us to be kind or help us to

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:19.460 --> 00:46:21.320 have humility or earn our mistakes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:21.320 --> 00:46:22.316 Or if we didn't do something,

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:22.320 --> 00:46:24.120 just be like, I did not do that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:24.120 --> 00:46:25.398 I will do it next time or you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:25.400 --> 00:46:25.937 how do we.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:25.937 --> 00:46:27.011 I think there's a really important

NOTE Confidence: 0.748752315

00:46:27.011 --> 00:46:27.720 point in there about

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:29.800 --> 00:46:31.818 why someone wasn't able to to

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:31.818 --> 00:46:33.108 possess or kind of demonstrate

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:33.108 --> 00:46:34.800 those things in their interactions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:34.800 --> 00:46:36.075 And I think that's particularly

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:36.075 --> 00:46:37.688 important for us to think about

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:37.688 --> 00:46:39.434 what kind of ethical climate of

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:39.434 --> 00:46:40.614 institutions and healthcare practice

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:40.614 --> 00:46:42.354 and training at the moment as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:42.354 --> 00:46:43.439 I don't get any sense.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:43.440 --> 00:46:44.476 Sorry, I feel like I'm battling yell.

NOTE Confidence: 0.90303572

00:46:44.480 --> 00:46:46.320 But yeah, that's yeah, it's

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:46:46.320 --> 00:46:47.400 a lot of sense. You know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:46:47.400 --> 00:46:48.198 you know I think you're right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:46:48.200 --> 00:46:50.012 It's not. It's not that we

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:46:50.012 --> 00:46:51.220 would condemn somebody, but.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:46:51.220 --> 00:46:53.480 But I think that a lot of patients

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:46:53.480 --> 00:46:55.366 feel really lost in a big

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:46:55.366 --> 00:46:57.198 healthcare institution like ours.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:46:57.200 --> 00:47:00.984 And the teams change and you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:00.984 --> 00:47:03.184 mistakes happen and they

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:03.184 --> 00:47:04.400 wonder who's in charge.

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:04.400 --> 00:47:06.786 And and so there are all sorts of

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:06.786 --> 00:47:09.284 of problems that lead to loss of

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:09.284 --> 00:47:12.095 trust that I I think that somehow if

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:12.095 --> 00:47:13.780 we inculcated this notion like what

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:13.780 --> 00:47:15.292 what does the patient really need

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:15.292 --> 00:47:17.434 from us before a problem arises might

NOTE Confidence: 0.811267501666667

00:47:17.434 --> 00:47:19.119 actually keep that from happening.

NOTE Confidence: 0.781281586153846

00:47:19.360 --> 00:47:20.432 Yeah. These little missed

NOTE Confidence: 0.781281586153846

00:47:20.432 --> 00:47:22.040 opportunities to show a little bit

NOTE Confidence: 0.781281586153846

00:47:22.091 --> 00:47:23.483 of kindness or spend some extra

NOTE Confidence: 0.781281586153846

00:47:23.483 --> 00:47:24.740 time or double check something

NOTE Confidence: 0.781281586153846

00:47:24.740 --> 00:47:26.120 to be really meticulous or.

NOTE Confidence: 0.781281586153846

00:47:26.120 --> 00:47:26.874 Yeah, absolutely.

NOTE Confidence: 0.781281586153846

00:47:26.874 --> 00:47:28.880 Thank you for that comment. Yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:47:29.600 --> 00:47:31.497 let's hear from James. Oh, Jack.

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:47:31.497 --> 00:47:33.233 Looks like Jack's geared up to say something.

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:47:33.240 --> 00:47:36.440 I've. I've got the mic.

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:47:36.440 --> 00:47:38.548 You have the talking stick, Dr. Hughes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:47:38.548 --> 00:47:40.886 Ordinarily I'd say never mind but since

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:47:40.886 --> 00:47:44.080 you were named as as one of the most.

00:47:44.080 --> 00:47:45.795 And by the way, by the way,

00:47:45.800 --> 00:47:47.816 I'll go ahead and say this because because

00:47:47.816 --> 00:47:49.695 God would strike me down if it wasn't

00:47:49.695 --> 00:47:52.960 true that that's what I was going to say.

00:47:52.960 --> 00:47:55.372 So Mark and I are of like mind on

00:47:55.372 --> 00:47:56.664 this though I can't for the life of me

00:47:56.664 --> 00:47:57.560 remember why I was going to say it.

00:47:57.560 --> 00:47:59.136 But but that's what I was going to

00:47:59.136 --> 00:48:00.756 say that not I'm talking about Jack

00:48:00.756 --> 00:48:02.400 being the person that you would admire.

00:48:02.400 --> 00:48:02.798 All right.

00:48:02.798 --> 00:48:04.191 So because of that talk to Hughes

00:48:04.191 --> 00:48:05.675 land the next question and then we're

00:48:05.675 --> 00:48:07.280 going to hear from James in the back.

00:48:07.280 --> 00:48:09.800 Go ahead, please.

00:48:09.800 --> 00:48:12.096 With regard to the to the virtues

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:48:12.096 --> 00:48:13.440 what I think,

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:48:13.440 --> 00:48:16.800 and this is building off what Mark said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.605969306

00:48:16.800 --> 00:48:18.480 I I think of

NOTE Confidence: 0.8970808175

00:48:19.560 --> 00:48:20.560 I don't know how

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:20.560 --> 00:48:22.510 to define whether to define this

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:22.510 --> 00:48:25.199 as a virtue or as a skill or both.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:25.200 --> 00:48:27.517 And that is the ability to communicate.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:27.520 --> 00:48:30.202 Because I think so often that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:30.202 --> 00:48:33.266 the the problem that leads to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:33.266 --> 00:48:35.636 mistrust and the and the sense

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:35.636 --> 00:48:38.400 of of loss and bewilderment that

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:38.400 --> 00:48:41.240 results in the ethics consultation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:41.240 --> 00:48:44.600 So but I can. I can see it as a skill,

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:44.600 --> 00:48:47.953 but they it does require a virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:47.953 --> 00:48:51.828 of patience and humility and and a

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:51.828 --> 00:48:53.676 willingness to listen in order to

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:53.676 --> 00:48:56.039 get to the place where you learn

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:56.039 --> 00:48:58.560 that skill and can apply that skill.

NOTE Confidence: 0.924873806

00:48:58.560 --> 00:49:00.760 So that's simply an addendum.

NOTE Confidence: 0.769458865

00:49:08.160 --> 00:49:09.318 Hear from James then. I'm hoping.

NOTE Confidence: 0.769458865

00:49:09.320 --> 00:49:10.320 Oh, thank you very much,

NOTE Confidence: 0.769458865

00:49:10.320 --> 00:49:11.804 because I I wanted to hear from

NOTE Confidence: 0.769458865

00:49:11.804 --> 00:49:12.920 some medical students after that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.769458865

00:49:12.920 --> 00:49:15.545 But we're working our way down

NOTE Confidence: 0.769458865

00:49:15.545 --> 00:49:16.360 to the medical students. We'll

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:16.360 --> 00:49:17.278 talk to a house officer now,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:17.280 --> 00:49:19.200 and then eventually we'll get to you guys.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:19.200 --> 00:49:20.112 Yeah, attendings and residents.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:20.112 --> 00:49:21.480 And you guys will be next.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:21.480 --> 00:49:25.285 Yeah, so Bry already outed me as

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:25.285 --> 00:49:27.520 somebody sympathetic to her 'cause here.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:27.520 --> 00:49:29.736 So hopefully the room will understand that

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:29.736 --> 00:49:32.080 I am teeing her up for a knockout punch.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:32.080 --> 00:49:34.480 Not being critical,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:34.480 --> 00:49:37.476 a common critique I've often heard of.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:37.480 --> 00:49:39.781 Specifically, the Aristotelian

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:39.781 --> 00:49:44.383 framing of virtue ethics is that

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:44.383 --> 00:49:47.915 it is a self defeating framework.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:47.915 --> 00:49:51.395 Because if we think of virtue as this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:51.400 --> 00:49:54.260 you know, classic undergraduate golden

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:54.260 --> 00:49:57.120 mean between excess and deficiency,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:57.120 --> 00:49:59.655 then shouldn't virtue itself also

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:49:59.655 --> 00:50:02.190 be something that it's possible

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:02.277 --> 00:50:03.837 to have too much of?

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:03.840 --> 00:50:05.248 And in my mind,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:05.248 --> 00:50:07.360 I don't think that's the case.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:07.360 --> 00:50:09.845 I don't think that it is possible

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:09.845 --> 00:50:12.640 to be too good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:12.640 --> 00:50:14.327 What would you say to people who

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:14.327 --> 00:50:16.159 would kind of levy that criticism?

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:16.160 --> 00:50:16.800 Would you just say, well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:16.800 --> 00:50:17.670 that's just Aristotle,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:17.670 --> 00:50:19.120 he's an he's an idiot,

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:19.120 --> 00:50:20.920 he's been dead for 2000 years.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831109561666667

00:50:20.920 --> 00:50:21.680 What would you say?

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:23.160 --> 00:50:25.347 Yeah, I would. I would say I was thinking

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:25.347 --> 00:50:27.160 about this earlier like it's kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:27.160 --> 00:50:30.350 like it's the self effacing in many ways.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:30.350 --> 00:50:31.700 Like do you want people to

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:31.700 --> 00:50:32.480 be doing the right thing?

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:32.480 --> 00:50:34.280 Because it's the right thing to do right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:34.280 --> 00:50:36.320 Like we want a little bit

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:36.320 --> 00:50:38.920 more like if is it Susan Wolf,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:38.920 --> 00:50:40.600 someone has a paper on moral Saints

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:40.600 --> 00:50:42.370 and how they just seem like the

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:42.370 --> 00:50:43.870 most like cringe people that we

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:43.920 --> 00:50:45.700 couldn't stand to be around. Right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:45.700 --> 00:50:48.360 This idea of just like too good,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:48.360 --> 00:50:51.624 like take it down a notch kind of exemplar,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:51.624 --> 00:50:53.544 right? Like there's it's good

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:53.544 --> 00:50:55.302 to be bad sometimes, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:55.302 --> 00:50:57.078 Or kind of to have him put imperfections,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:57.080 --> 00:50:59.040 don't quote me on that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:50:59.040 --> 00:51:01.077 But like to have imperfections or flaws,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:01.080 --> 00:51:01.322 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:01.322 --> 00:51:03.835 Like this is part of of of who we are

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:03.835 --> 00:51:06.035 and how to kind of like balance that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:06.040 --> 00:51:07.048 I think it's valid.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:07.048 --> 00:51:09.631 I think if we were all kind of these

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:09.631 --> 00:51:11.635 virtuous robots that would be awful.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:11.640 --> 00:51:14.026 I don't know where that that

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:14.026 --> 00:51:14.704 balance is exactly.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:14.704 --> 00:51:16.392 I think it would be different for

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:16.392 --> 00:51:17.532 different people and different

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:17.532 --> 00:51:18.957 roles depending what we're doing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:18.960 --> 00:51:19.904 But yeah, I think.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:19.904 --> 00:51:21.320 I think that's an important one.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:21.320 --> 00:51:25.500 And I am not an Aristotelian by any means.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:25.500 --> 00:51:27.800 And I also, I'm a philosopher by training.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:27.800 --> 00:51:29.270 But it's been a long time since

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:29.270 --> 00:51:30.800 I've dug into kind of where the,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:30.800 --> 00:51:31.060 like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:31.060 --> 00:51:32.880 the theoretical debates around this are at.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:32.880 --> 00:51:34.218 So I don't actually know if

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:34.218 --> 00:51:35.400 there's any kind of good.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:35.400 --> 00:51:37.958 I'm sure there are responses to that

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:37.958 --> 00:51:39.626 kind of worry from more contemporary

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:39.626 --> 00:51:41.279 virtue ethicists or virtue theorists.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:41.280 --> 00:51:43.674 But yeah, I think it's an important,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:43.680 --> 00:51:44.446 important one,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:44.446 --> 00:51:44.829 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:44.829 --> 00:51:46.361 Like imperfections and sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:46.361 --> 00:51:48.604 getting it wrong and just having some

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:48.604 --> 00:51:50.718 flaws is really important to the paper

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:50.718 --> 00:51:52.955 on moral Saints is really a fun one.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:52.960 --> 00:51:53.233 Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:53.233 --> 00:51:54.598 If you would recommend it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.687140690476191

00:51:54.600 --> 00:51:54.800 if

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:51:54.800 --> 00:51:56.951 you like. I won't name you when I quote

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:51:56.951 --> 00:51:58.611 this but I'm definitely storing this

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:51:58.611 --> 00:52:00.960 in a way it's good to be bad sometimes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:00.960 --> 00:52:02.884 I mean I'll just say a noted bioethicist

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:02.884 --> 00:52:04.936 and we can leave it at that if you'd rather.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:04.936 --> 00:52:06.480 If you want credit, I'll give it to you

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:06.480 --> 00:52:08.118 and by the way you say you haven't been,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:08.120 --> 00:52:09.744 you've been in the in the clinical arena

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:09.744 --> 00:52:11.708 for a while and and we've talked about this

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:11.708 --> 00:52:13.696 and we were talking about this in terms

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:13.696 --> 00:52:15.432 of our interests here etcetera that you

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:15.432 --> 00:52:17.159 actually run a clinical ethics fellowship.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:17.160 --> 00:52:19.380 And also for the sake of I'm some of you

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:19.439 --> 00:52:21.615 folks know there's no doubt but for those

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:21.615 --> 00:52:24.140 who are less involved in pediatric ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:24.140 --> 00:52:26.520 So places like Melbourne this is

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:26.520 --> 00:52:29.240 this is one of the meccas for PDI,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:29.240 --> 00:52:30.927 this the land of Lynn Gilliam and

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:30.927 --> 00:52:32.519 Trish Prentiss and so many others

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:32.519 --> 00:52:34.157 that's the place for pediatric ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:34.160 --> 00:52:35.600 And in the US,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:35.600 --> 00:52:37.424 places like Children's Mercy and Baylor,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:37.424 --> 00:52:38.359 I mean this, this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:38.359 --> 00:52:40.513 these are so you've not been

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:40.513 --> 00:52:42.712 involved in those heavy, deep,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:42.712 --> 00:52:45.240 pure philosophical conversations lately.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:45.240 --> 00:52:46.656 You have in fact been steeped

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:46.656 --> 00:52:48.328 in other areas that I think can

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:48.328 --> 00:52:49.678 be very helpful to this group.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:49.680 --> 00:52:51.120 Now I've got something online,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:52:51.120 --> 00:52:51.918 but before we get to that,

00:52:51.920 --> 00:52:52.718 I want to hear from Caitlin,

00:52:52.720 --> 00:52:55.954 perhaps one or two other medical students.

00:52:55.960 --> 00:52:56.822 OK, cool.

00:52:56.822 --> 00:52:58.977 So I actually wanted to

00:52:58.977 --> 00:53:01.120 address the third question.

00:53:01.120 --> 00:53:03.040 So in terms of value,

00:53:03.040 --> 00:53:05.154 when you were talking about virtue ethics,

00:53:05.160 --> 00:53:07.300 I actually found myself thinking

00:53:07.300 --> 00:53:10.344 a lot of my classmates and myself,

00:53:10.344 --> 00:53:13.848 just all the mistakes we make

00:53:13.848 --> 00:53:15.600 as we're learning.

00:53:15.600 --> 00:53:19.100 And I I find ourselves looking at each other,

00:53:19.100 --> 00:53:19.835 judging each other,

00:53:19.840 --> 00:53:22.870 even not by like what actually

00:53:22.870 --> 00:53:25.455 happened but the type of people we

00:53:25.455 --> 00:53:27.371 are and being like he really wanted

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:27.371 --> 00:53:28.673 to be honest with the patient,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:28.680 --> 00:53:31.038 but maybe he said too much.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:31.040 --> 00:53:33.216 So I feel like it's a really easy

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:33.216 --> 00:53:35.777 way to approach ethics that we're

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:35.777 --> 00:53:37.235 not necessarily taught.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:37.240 --> 00:53:39.656 One thing I see that can potentially I

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:39.656 --> 00:53:42.089 think this tough is I find that as we

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:42.089 --> 00:53:44.516 spend more and more time in the hospital,

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:44.520 --> 00:53:46.760 the consequences of our accidents

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:46.760 --> 00:53:49.914 matter a lot more than our than what

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:49.914 --> 00:53:52.290 we are trying to do or like who

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:52.362 --> 00:53:54.674 we are trying to be as a person.

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:54.680 --> 00:53:58.480 So I feel like it can get conflated

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:53:58.480 --> 00:54:00.226 like what the right virtues are

NOTE Confidence: 0.901521259130435

00:54:00.226 --> 00:54:01.959 and what you should be doing.

00:54:04.200 --> 00:54:06.195 And as to answer the second part,

00:54:06.200 --> 00:54:10.520 the question what bothers me about.

00:54:10.520 --> 00:54:13.670 I think that when you were talking

00:54:13.670 --> 00:54:15.358 about the situationalist perspective,

00:54:15.360 --> 00:54:17.195 I thought that was really

00:54:17.195 --> 00:54:19.030 interesting because I thought to

00:54:19.102 --> 00:54:21.120 myself that for a situationalist,

00:54:21.120 --> 00:54:24.240 if you nudge a situation, any direction,

00:54:24.240 --> 00:54:26.320 that changes the situation.

00:54:26.320 --> 00:54:28.400 So my question became,

00:54:28.400 --> 00:54:30.662 is someone still virtuous as long

00:54:30.662 --> 00:54:33.137 as they have the same reaction

00:54:33.137 --> 00:54:35.795 to the same situation every time?

00:54:35.800 --> 00:54:38.680 Do they possess the same virtues every time?

00:54:38.680 --> 00:54:41.080 And my one worry with that in the

00:54:41.080 --> 00:54:43.061 hospital is I have encountered so

NOTE Confidence: 0.906769631428571

00:54:43.061 --> 00:54:45.560 little that it feels like I have to

NOTE Confidence: 0.906769631428571

00:54:45.560 --> 00:54:47.588 figure out what my reaction would

NOTE Confidence: 0.906769631428571

00:54:47.588 --> 00:54:49.745 be first to everything before I

NOTE Confidence: 0.906769631428571

00:54:49.745 --> 00:54:51.600 can become someone who's virtuous.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931832645833333

00:54:53.640 --> 00:54:54.456 Excellent points and comments.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931832645833333

00:54:54.456 --> 00:54:56.039 Do you want me to say a little

NOTE Confidence: 0.57059665

00:54:56.080 --> 00:54:56.839 bit? Absolutely. Whatever

NOTE Confidence: 0.57059665

00:54:56.839 --> 00:54:59.240 you're feeling saying, yeah, I

NOTE Confidence: 0.839512443571429

00:55:04.200 --> 00:55:05.327 yeah, I'm thinking about your comment about

NOTE Confidence: 0.839512443571429

00:55:05.327 --> 00:55:06.560 kind of your colleagues and just this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.839512443571429

00:55:06.560 --> 00:55:08.318 again, this judginess worry, I think.

NOTE Confidence: 0.663356131428571

00:55:11.120 --> 00:55:11.904 And I mean, again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.663356131428571

00:55:11.904 --> 00:55:13.415 it does like a big question about

NOTE Confidence: 0.663356131428571

00:55:13.415 --> 00:55:14.736 teachability in here, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.663356131428571

00:55:14.736 --> 00:55:17.460 Like, can we, like, teach people

NOTE Confidence: 0.663356131428571

00:55:17.460 --> 00:55:20.160 to be empathetic or or honest?

NOTE Confidence: 0.663356131428571

00:55:20.160 --> 00:55:21.679 And like, what does that look like?

NOTE Confidence: 0.663356131428571

00:55:21.680 --> 00:55:23.000 You're not going to take an honesty class?

NOTE Confidence: 0.663356131428571

00:55:23.000 --> 00:55:23.840 Like that's kind of weird.

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:25.880 --> 00:55:27.196 But yeah, again, I think role modeling.

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:27.200 --> 00:55:29.120 So for me that was a big one,

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:29.120 --> 00:55:30.560 particularly as a clinical ethics fellow.

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:30.560 --> 00:55:32.240 Watching how my mentors did it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:32.240 --> 00:55:34.655 watching how attending other kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:34.655 --> 00:55:37.813 of clinicians in the space had had

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:37.813 --> 00:55:39.878 conversations or practice these things,

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:39.880 --> 00:55:40.918 really, really watching

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:40.918 --> 00:55:42.994 them and seeing it get done,

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:43.000 --> 00:55:44.920 being done badly a lot of the time.

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:44.920 --> 00:55:46.927 You know, I think we often learn a lot

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:46.927 --> 00:55:48.420 more from that and then sometimes we

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:48.420 --> 00:55:49.964 do when we see it done well, we just,

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:49.964 --> 00:55:50.958 oh man, that was that was good,

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:50.960 --> 00:55:51.944 was a good conversation kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:51.944 --> 00:55:53.039 mop on to the next thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.729124042857143

00:55:53.040 --> 00:55:53.640 So I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:55:56.120 --> 00:55:57.724 not that you asked me for advice, but again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:55:57.724 --> 00:55:59.820 you're doing that important work of kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:55:59.877 --> 00:56:01.737 watching really closely and now thinking

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:01.737 --> 00:56:04.280 about like what was it that happened there,

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:04.280 --> 00:56:06.236 what kind of was done well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:06.240 --> 00:56:09.678 how could I've done things differently?

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:09.680 --> 00:56:11.952 And I think to your point, like getting it

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:11.952 --> 00:56:14.160 wrong a lot that's going to happen, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:14.160 --> 00:56:17.040 And that is not necessarily a bad thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:17.040 --> 00:56:17.836 It's kind of, again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:17.836 --> 00:56:19.412 how we approach getting it wrong and how

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:19.412 --> 00:56:20.920 we kind of talk with each other about it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:20.920 --> 00:56:23.034 I'll be honest about what went wrong.

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:23.040 --> 00:56:23.826 Do we have enough respect for

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:23.826 --> 00:56:24.679 each other to kind of be like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:24.680 --> 00:56:26.440 yeah, that was not great.

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:26.440 --> 00:56:27.565 And I can say that to you because we're

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:27.565 --> 00:56:29.088 in this together kind of thing. So yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:29.088 --> 00:56:31.200 I think this is all sounding very weird.

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:31.200 --> 00:56:32.364 But yes, I think you're thinking

NOTE Confidence: 0.781857482857143

00:56:32.364 --> 00:56:33.440 about all the right things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:35.760 --> 00:56:36.999 And then what bothers you about it?

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:37.000 --> 00:56:38.120 Yeah. So this idea that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:38.120 --> 00:56:39.560 like virtues, character traits

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:39.560 --> 00:56:41.188 should be fairly fixed, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

114

00:56:41.188 --> 00:56:42.316 Like if you're an honest person,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:42.320 --> 00:56:44.750 you should show that pretty consistently

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:44.750 --> 00:56:45.742 across different situations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:45.742 --> 00:56:47.488 But there's also this claim within

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:47.488 --> 00:56:49.167 burst reference that you have to be

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:49.167 --> 00:56:50.217 very sensitive to the particular

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:50.263 --> 00:56:51.595 situation that's in front of you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:51.600 --> 00:56:52.880 So how you're honest,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:52.880 --> 00:56:55.604 like how much of it you sort of demonstrate

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:55.604 --> 00:56:57.520 how what what particular language you use,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:57.520 --> 00:56:58.912 it depends on sort of your

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:58.912 --> 00:56:59.840 role in that particularity.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:56:59.840 --> 00:57:01.640 It's going to come with experience.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:01.640 --> 00:57:04.780 I think I'll tell you too,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:04.780 --> 00:57:05.520 as a clinical ethicist,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:05.520 --> 00:57:06.684 I walk out of conversation sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:06.684 --> 00:57:08.340 and I'm like I did not handle that well

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:08.340 --> 00:57:09.861 or like I there was a really different

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:09.861 --> 00:57:11.352 way I could have asked that question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:11.360 --> 00:57:13.416 And sometimes I'll go back and say, hey,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:13.416 --> 00:57:15.680 if I have a few more minutes of your time,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:15.680 --> 00:57:16.082 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:16.082 --> 00:57:17.288 you just realize like there's something

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:17.288 --> 00:57:18.518 really important I wanted to ask you about.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:18.520 --> 00:57:18.930 So again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:18.930 --> 00:57:20.160 just like it's just it's practice,

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:20.160 --> 00:57:21.390 I think, and giving yourself

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:21.390 --> 00:57:23.079 permission to kind of get it wrong.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:23.080 --> 00:57:26.456 Sometimes I think you're thinking

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:26.456 --> 00:57:27.476 about all the right things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.956778971428571

00:57:27.480 --> 00:57:28.400 And I appreciate your comment.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:29.480 --> 00:57:30.719 If I could just add 1 little

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:30.719 --> 00:57:31.960 thing to to to add to that,

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:31.960 --> 00:57:34.690 which is to say it's not necessarily

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:34.690 --> 00:57:36.648 virtuous or a goal to look back when

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:36.648 --> 00:57:38.160 you're 60 years old and saying,

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:38.160 --> 00:57:39.468 man, I'm doing this exactly the

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:39.468 --> 00:57:41.198 same way I did it when I was 25.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:41.200 --> 00:57:42.744 You know, it's all right that you're a

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:42.744 --> 00:57:44.519 work in progress throughout your career.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:44.520 --> 00:57:45.846 It's not your mission to always

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:45.846 --> 00:57:46.960 do things the same way.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:46.960 --> 00:57:48.836 It's your mission to do your best.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:48.840 --> 00:57:50.598 And that may be different in

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:50.600 --> 00:57:52.142 2024 than it was in 2023.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:52.142 --> 00:57:53.048 That's all right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:53.048 --> 00:57:53.954 That's all right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:53.960 --> 00:57:55.010 This gentleman and this gentleman

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:55.010 --> 00:57:56.060 I've got a couple questions

NOTE Confidence: 0.748518040714286

00:57:56.094 --> 00:57:56.916 online I want to get to.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:57:57.800 --> 00:58:00.000 Hi, thank you for talking to us today.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:00.000 --> 00:58:02.422 I'm curious how you respond to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:02.422 --> 00:58:04.860 critique that virtual ethics is just

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:04.860 --> 00:58:07.035 a way of applying consequentialism

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:07.040 --> 00:58:09.273 and that like the reason we call

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:09.273 --> 00:58:11.048 some qualities virtues is because

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:11.048 --> 00:58:12.556 they have good consequences.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:12.560 --> 00:58:14.840 And you talked about like the golden mean.

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:14.840 --> 00:58:17.000 And if not like consequences,

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:17.000 --> 00:58:17.804 how should we like?

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:17.804 --> 00:58:19.010 What are we drawing on to

NOTE Confidence: 0.93669610875

00:58:19.063 --> 00:58:20.160 strike that balance? Yep,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89570068

00:58:20.600 --> 00:58:21.640 that's such an important question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.89570068

00:58:21.640 --> 00:58:22.608 Hang on to the mic for a SEC

NOTE Confidence: 0.89570068

00:58:22.608 --> 00:58:23.400 because I want to ask you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.89570068

00:58:23.400 --> 00:58:24.835 why does that feel important to you?

NOTE Confidence: 0.89570068

00:58:24.840 --> 00:58:26.394 Why you? Why you kind of asking?

NOTE Confidence: 0.71682966

00:58:28.840 --> 00:58:31.360 I guess I'm worried about people

NOTE Confidence: 0.834424625

00:58:31.360 --> 00:58:34.438 clinging to virtues when the consequences,

NOTE Confidence: 0.834424625

00:58:34.440 --> 00:58:36.036 if they think further about it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.834424625

00:58:36.040 --> 00:58:37.180 would actually be better if they

NOTE Confidence: 0.834424625

00:58:37.180 --> 00:58:38.240 didn't cling to the virtue.

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:38.320 --> 00:58:40.960 Yeah. Yeah. Super important question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:40.960 --> 00:58:42.634 And I think, I think a very valid one.

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:42.640 --> 00:58:44.600 And as I said, I'm not here to kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:44.657 --> 00:58:46.604 virtue ethics is it ethically it's the one

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:46.604 --> 00:58:49.159 all and be all like end of it kind of thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:49.160 --> 00:58:50.726 And I think I hope no one took me

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:50.726 --> 00:58:52.556 as saying consequences don't matter

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:52.556 --> 00:58:54.401 because they matter tremendously, right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:54.401 --> 00:58:57.277 And I was I think about this a lot in the

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:57.277 --> 00:58:59.215 context of pediatric bioethics where we

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:58:59.215 --> 00:59:01.542 we often experience disagreements between

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:59:01.542 --> 00:59:03.634 parents and clinicians and we always

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:59:03.634 --> 00:59:05.120 come back to what's the effect on the child.

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:59:05.120 --> 00:59:07.416 And I think that really is sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:59:07.416 --> 00:59:09.595 sort of an ethically decisive

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:59:09.595 --> 00:59:12.780 factor and it should be how we

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:59:12.780 --> 00:59:14.760 think of them as working together.

NOTE Confidence: 0.780615546

00:59:14.760 --> 00:59:16.680 So I think we have to think about both. And

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:22.720 --> 00:59:25.886 and I'm trying to kind of think

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:25.886 --> 00:59:27.316 about a situation in which,

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:27.320 --> 00:59:28.955 you know, feeling virtuous would

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

120

00:59:28.955 --> 00:59:30.914 come into conflict with what we

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:30.914 --> 00:59:32.480 felt was doing the right thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:32.480 --> 00:59:33.455 Those are the kinds of

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:33.455 --> 00:59:34.235 situations you're interested in,

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:34.240 --> 00:59:35.689 it sounds like like kind of when

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:35.689 --> 00:59:36.960 they would come into conflict,

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:36.960 --> 00:59:38.744 we're like clinging on to the idea of

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:38.744 --> 00:59:40.039 being honest or compassionate would

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:40.039 --> 00:59:41.908 actually have nothing to do with kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:41.962 --> 00:59:43.480 of a good consequence for someone.

NOTE Confidence: 0.790242178333333

00:59:43.480 --> 00:59:43.720 Yeah. I

NOTE Confidence: 0.777441023333333

00:59:43.720 --> 00:59:45.520 mean, I, I, I guess the,

NOTE Confidence: 0.777441023333333

00:59:45.520 --> 00:59:46.624 like you talked about,

NOTE Confidence: 0.777441023333333

00:59:46.624 --> 00:59:48.004 like trying to balance these

NOTE Confidence: 0.777441023333333

00:59:48.004 --> 00:59:50.360 virtues, right? Like being too

NOTE Confidence: 0.88194132

00:59:48.880 --> 00:59:50.360 honest or not honest enough, like

121

NOTE Confidence: 0.8765618275

00:59:50.360 --> 00:59:52.360 if if not just looking to the consequences,

NOTE Confidence: 0.8765618275

00:59:52.360 --> 00:59:53.920 what what else should we be drawing upon?

NOTE Confidence: 0.79251241

00:59:54.200 --> 00:59:55.320 Right. OK. Sorry. That's.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79251241

00:59:55.320 --> 00:59:56.400 Yeah. Got your question now.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:02.800 --> 01:00:03.920 Yeah, that's a good question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:03.920 --> 01:00:05.236 My answer is like, I don't know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:05.240 --> 01:00:06.766 I think, you know, when I'm kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:06.766 --> 01:00:08.199 of weighing and balancing again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:08.200 --> 01:00:09.936 it's rare for me to have a situation

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:09.936 --> 01:00:11.820 where I'm directly like being honest and

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:11.820 --> 01:00:13.120 being compassionate come into conflict.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:13.120 --> 01:00:15.570 Like how will I choose between them. Like

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:15.570 --> 01:00:17.320 that's kind of not typically what happens.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:17.320 --> 01:00:20.984 But certainly thinking about consequences

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:20.984 --> 01:00:23.120 is something that weighing and balancing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:23.120 --> 01:00:25.157 I don't know that. I don't know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:25.160 --> 01:00:27.040 I was kind of going back and kind of reading

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:27.086 --> 01:00:28.838 a little bit of the virtue ethics theory.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:28.840 --> 01:00:30.359 I think it's fair that to say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:30.360 --> 01:00:32.172 like, sometimes it does sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:32.172 --> 01:00:33.078 collapse into consequentialism.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:33.080 --> 01:00:34.520 I think that's fine.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:34.520 --> 01:00:36.102 Again, I'm not kind of a ******** moral

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:36.102 --> 01:00:37.194 theorist that's going to be like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:37.200 --> 01:00:40.040 oh, that's a catastrophe. Like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:40.040 --> 01:00:42.000 I think they probably feed into each other.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:42.000 --> 01:00:42.760 Again, that's the same thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:42.760 --> 01:00:44.699 I think if we were overly focused

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:44.699 --> 01:00:46.119 on consequences in them only,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:46.120 --> 01:00:47.911 that could lead us to kind of a really

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:47.911 --> 01:00:49.960 bad place too. So it's all in there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:49.960 --> 01:00:51.280 That was a very unsatisfactory answer,

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:51.280 --> 01:00:52.360 but it's a very good question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:52.360 --> 01:00:52.760 Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.867308718

01:00:52.760 --> 01:00:53.560 Thank you

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:00:59.080 --> 01:01:00.760 thing. I kind of struggle to grasp

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:00.760 --> 01:01:02.044 a little closer, if you would.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:02.044 --> 01:01:03.172 The thing I kind of struggle

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:03.172 --> 01:01:04.159 to grasp with virtue,

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:04.160 --> 01:01:06.800 Essex is who decides what a virtue is?

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:06.800 --> 01:01:08.432 It's like, not like there's this omnival

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:08.432 --> 01:01:10.298 of being who like writes on every

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:10.298 --> 01:01:11.664 single virtue and it's set in stone.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:11.664 --> 01:01:12.760 It seems like it's more

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:12.760 --> 01:01:14.340 like culturally defined.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:14.340 --> 01:01:17.260 And I'm sure there's a bunch of overlap

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:17.260 --> 01:01:18.711 throughout time and through different

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:18.711 --> 01:01:20.559 cultures between what is a virtue.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616495104

01:01:20.560 --> 01:01:22.873 But in those times where there is no overlap,

NOTE Confidence: 0.927093078571429

01:01:23.000 --> 01:01:25.520 I could see that becoming an issue.

NOTE Confidence: 0.927093078571429

01:01:25.520 --> 01:01:27.880 So I guess my question is, how

NOTE Confidence: 0.952405066

01:01:27.880 --> 01:01:31.312 do you reconcile the variances in cultures

NOTE Confidence: 0.952405066

01:01:31.312 --> 01:01:34.040 and like, who defines what virtue is?

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:34.120 --> 01:01:35.926 Yeah, yeah, this kind of worry about

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:35.926 --> 01:01:37.706 cultural or moral relativism, right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:37.706 --> 01:01:39.836 Something that might might be,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:39.840 --> 01:01:41.716 I'm thinking too even about different roles.

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:41.720 --> 01:01:42.960 So like the criminal good,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:42.960 --> 01:01:44.382 the virtuous criminal

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:44.382 --> 01:01:46.278 defense lawyer might indeed,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:46.280 --> 01:01:47.432 perhaps shall we say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:47.432 --> 01:01:48.872 lie for their clients sometimes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:48.880 --> 01:01:50.560 And that is a virtue professionally for them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:50.560 --> 01:01:52.040 So even between roles,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:52.040 --> 01:01:53.890 I think there's sometimes conflicting

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:53.890 --> 01:01:55.438 ideas of what a virtue is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:55.440 --> 01:01:57.435 and then across cultures potentially as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:57.440 --> 01:01:59.760 This is a really good and important question,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:01:59.760 --> 01:02:03.048 but I certainly again also don't have a

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:03.048 --> 01:02:05.310 satisfactory answer to I think unlike any

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:05.310 --> 01:02:07.320 kind of concern about moral relativism.

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:07.320 --> 01:02:08.720 I think we always, like you said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:08.720 --> 01:02:10.448 look for common ground.

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:10.448 --> 01:02:12.272 We look for how kind of things

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:12.272 --> 01:02:13.200 have evolved over time,

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:13.200 --> 01:02:14.560 sort of trends historically as

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:14.560 --> 01:02:15.920 we've moved away from certain

NOTE Confidence: 0.813075420909091

01:02:15.969 --> 01:02:17.237 things towards other things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.860175554545455

01:02:20.760 --> 01:02:22.086 I'm trying to decide like how

NOTE Confidence: 0.860175554545455

01:02:22.086 --> 01:02:23.240 worried I feel about that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.967527514

01:02:26.800 --> 01:02:28.240 I think it would be,

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:30.960 --> 01:02:32.352 like you said, very problematic for

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:32.352 --> 01:02:34.280 someone to be like this is the definitive

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:34.280 --> 01:02:35.732 list of virtues, and everyone now

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:35.732 --> 01:02:37.196 needs to work towards having them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:37.200 --> 01:02:39.648 It would be so weird and terrible, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:39.648 --> 01:02:41.312 And also, who would that person be like?

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:41.320 --> 01:02:43.278 There's a huge issue there about, like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:43.278 --> 01:02:45.224 you know, what if they themselves were

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:45.224 --> 01:02:46.479 not particularly virtuous, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:46.479 --> 01:02:47.196 There's no idea.

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:47.196 --> 01:02:48.630 This is a big meta ethical

NOTE Confidence: 0.898968222941177

01:02:48.683 --> 01:02:50.118 point about what grounds them,

01:02:50.120 --> 01:02:52.720 what makes them virtues.

01:02:52.720 --> 01:02:53.875 I don't know how successful they've been,

01:02:53.880 --> 01:02:55.518 but virtue ethicists have sort of

01:02:55.520 --> 01:02:57.416 tried to identify what counts as

01:02:57.416 --> 01:02:59.931 a virtue relative to a role or a

01:02:59.931 --> 01:03:01.719 relationship or some sort of concrete,

01:03:01.720 --> 01:03:03.228 like particular the situation

01:03:03.228 --> 01:03:04.359 that you're in

01:03:06.880 --> 01:03:07.465 recognizing. Again, though,

01:03:07.465 --> 01:03:08.635 if you're in a different situation,

01:03:08.640 --> 01:03:09.296 in a different place,

01:03:09.296 --> 01:03:10.280 it might not be a virtue.

01:03:10.280 --> 01:03:12.002 So that's sort of how they've

01:03:12.002 --> 01:03:13.720 tried to get out of that.

01:03:13.720 --> 01:03:14.800 James, you were nodding vigorously.

01:03:14.800 --> 01:03:17.880 Did you want to add anything to that?

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:17.880 --> 01:03:20.155 No. OK Yeah, it's a good question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:20.160 --> 01:03:22.590 I think it's a big meta ethical debate about

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:22.590 --> 01:03:25.114 what ground something that makes it a virtue.

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:25.120 --> 01:03:26.260 My, as I said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:26.260 --> 01:03:27.400 was trained in philosophy,

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:27.400 --> 01:03:28.360 but now I'm just very practical.

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:28.360 --> 01:03:28.840 I'm like, well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:28.840 --> 01:03:29.960 it depends on the situation we're in,

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:29.960 --> 01:03:32.000 right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:32.000 --> 01:03:33.518 And part of that is recognizing

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:33.518 --> 01:03:34.872 the social and cultural situation

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:34.872 --> 01:03:36.930 that we're in and kind of checking

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:36.930 --> 01:03:38.399 ourselves depending on that situation.

NOTE Confidence: 0.724343656666667

01:03:38.400 --> 01:03:39.120 Really good question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866102847142857

01:03:39.480 --> 01:03:41.235 Let me let me ask you a couple of

NOTE Confidence: 0.866102847142857

01:03:41.235 --> 01:03:42.480 questions from the folks online.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866102847142857

01:03:42.480 --> 01:03:44.901 If I do it, it seems that virtue ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.866102847142857

01:03:44.901 --> 01:03:47.560 can really inform shared decision making,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866102847142857

01:03:47.560 --> 01:03:50.200 especially when outcomes are unclear.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866102847142857

01:03:50.200 --> 01:03:54.080 Can you speak to how these two are connected

NOTE Confidence: 0.866102847142857

01:03:54.080 --> 01:03:56.480 virtue ethics and shared decision making?

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:03:56.760 --> 01:03:58.720 Yeah. Yeah. And again this

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:03:58.720 --> 01:04:01.135 question I love just because of

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:01.135 --> 01:04:03.397 the uncertainty point like I think

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:03.400 --> 01:04:04.720 consequential think about consequences.

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:04.720 --> 01:04:06.370 Outcomes are so compelling when

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:06.370 --> 01:04:07.784 we know what they are, right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:07.784 --> 01:04:08.704 That's that's when we can

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:08.704 --> 01:04:10.260 kind of really like, yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:10.260 --> 01:04:11.965 we this matters and we really

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:11.965 --> 01:04:13.503 need to do the most good or kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:13.503 --> 01:04:14.513 of optimize things for folks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:14.520 --> 01:04:15.955 Right Where I think as I said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:15.960 --> 01:04:17.670 virtue ethics really adds something

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:17.670 --> 01:04:20.604 as when we don't know and when we can

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:20.604 --> 01:04:22.552 focus on processes and relationships,

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:22.552 --> 01:04:24.160 how and communications,

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:24.160 --> 01:04:27.840 how we speak to each other, how we interact.

NOTE Confidence: 0.874840037647059

01:04:27.840 --> 01:04:29.639 And I haven't seen a lot of

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:32.080 --> 01:04:33.632 discussion of the relationship,

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:33.632 --> 01:04:35.572 perhaps none between virtue ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:35.572 --> 01:04:37.629 and shared decision making in

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:37.629 --> 01:04:39.237 the literature within bioethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:39.240 --> 01:04:41.076 I don't think it's something that

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:41.076 --> 01:04:42.927 we talk about instead of thinking

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:42.927 --> 01:04:44.163 about frameworks for something

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:44.163 --> 01:04:45.440 like shared decision making.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:45.440 --> 01:04:46.676 I don't think I've seen any.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:46.680 --> 01:04:47.922 So it's something that I would

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:47.922 --> 01:04:49.620 love to go away and think more

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:49.620 --> 01:04:50.995 about and potentially write about.

NOTE Confidence: 0.872212965555556

01:04:51.000 --> 01:04:51.160 Well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:04:51.160 --> 01:04:53.576 I'll say to my friend who wrote this

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:04:53.576 --> 01:04:56.520 question, and you know who you are,

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:04:56.520 --> 01:04:59.008 who's here at Yale and a very insightful

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:04:59.008 --> 01:05:00.879 member of the junior faculty,

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:05:00.880 --> 01:05:02.760 that there's a question that maybe we can

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:05:02.760 --> 01:05:05.132 explore maybe with our friend Brianna.

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:05:05.132 --> 01:05:07.800 Another question, please.

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:05:07.800 --> 01:05:09.361 This is from a colleague at NYU

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:05:09.361 --> 01:05:10.957 who says thank you for your talk.

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:05:10.960 --> 01:05:13.472 How have you seen ethics and value work

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:05:13.472 --> 01:05:15.799 practiced or given attention differently

NOTE Confidence: 0.921384811111111

01:05:15.800 --> 01:05:17.795 here in the US and in Australia?

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:20.560 --> 01:05:21.556 Yeah. So I said something earlier

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:21.556 --> 01:05:22.658 about this kind of the cultural

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:22.658 --> 01:05:23.876 differences around what we talk about,

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:23.880 --> 01:05:25.610 particularly in kind of medical

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:25.610 --> 01:05:26.994 education and professional ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:27.000 --> 01:05:29.678 I've, I've been thinking about this a lot.

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:29.680 --> 01:05:34.360 I'm like, I I when I when I moved to the

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:34.360 --> 01:05:36.475 when I moved to the US back in 2018,

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:36.480 --> 01:05:37.944 no one wanted to talk to

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:37.944 --> 01:05:39.080 me about patio ethics.

NOTE Confidence: 0.767791332222222

01:05:39.080 --> 01:05:42.160 I was like, this is weird, except James

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:45.440 --> 01:05:46.680 and there was a lot,

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:46.680 --> 01:05:49.040 I think a lot more chatter about it,

133

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:49.040 --> 01:05:50.162 probably because I was in a

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:50.162 --> 01:05:51.520 bit of a bubble in Australia.

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:51.520 --> 01:05:53.038 I was working with virtue ethicists,

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:53.040 --> 01:05:54.174 right? Like that was kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:54.174 --> 01:05:55.399 what I was doing my PhD on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:55.400 --> 01:05:56.786 So I think I was just surrounded

NOTE Confidence: 0.799268582

01:05:56.786 --> 01:05:57.720 by like minded people.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:05:59.760 --> 01:06:00.462 I think bioethicists,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:00.462 --> 01:06:02.986 I think it's a bit of it is a is a

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:02.986 --> 01:06:04.547 kind of historical like who was working

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:04.547 --> 01:06:06.325 on what and where in a particular

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:06.325 --> 01:06:08.184 time and how that how philosophy

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:08.184 --> 01:06:10.200 departments and sort of law department

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:10.257 --> 01:06:11.709 like certain departments involved

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:11.709 --> 01:06:13.887 in connection with kind of health

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:13.945 --> 01:06:15.680 and medical ethics in Australia.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:15.680 --> 01:06:18.165 I think some of those people were

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:18.165 --> 01:06:20.032 sort of in those debates historically

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:20.032 --> 01:06:21.760 throughout time in a way that

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:21.811 --> 01:06:23.449 perhaps they weren't here in the US

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:23.449 --> 01:06:25.279 This is just me speculating wildly.

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:25.280 --> 01:06:26.800 So I could be completely wrong about this,

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:26.800 --> 01:06:28.760 but I think it was just sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:28.760 --> 01:06:30.629 who was where and working on what

NOTE Confidence: 0.79893156

01:06:30.629 --> 01:06:31.760 at a particular time.

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:34.840 --> 01:06:38.928 I was really, I was really shocked

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:38.928 --> 01:06:40.638 at this conference in September,

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:40.640 --> 01:06:42.852 how drawn to it at least people

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:42.852 --> 01:06:44.719 working in pediatric settings were.

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:44.720 --> 01:06:45.917 I was surprised by, as I said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:45.920 --> 01:06:48.040 how much sort of virtue chatter there was.

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:48.040 --> 01:06:48.940 So I don't know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:48.940 --> 01:06:50.585 I got me thinking about are we

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:50.585 --> 01:06:52.025 are we kind of returning to

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:52.025 --> 01:06:53.889 virtue ethics at the moment is it

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:53.889 --> 01:06:55.515 something that's going to come back?

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:55.520 --> 01:06:58.445 Sorry, I don't know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:06:58.445 --> 01:07:00.960 That was a that was a babbly answer but.

NOTE Confidence: 0.818523733333333

01:07:00.960 --> 01:07:01.120 But

NOTE Confidence: 0.807334111666666

01:07:01.120 --> 01:07:03.096 you think so. It it seems to me

NOTE Confidence: 0.807334111666666

01:07:03.096 --> 01:07:04.931 what you're saying is that perhaps

NOTE Confidence: 0.807334111666666

01:07:04.931 --> 01:07:06.857 those who pay attention to virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.807334111666666

01:07:06.921 --> 01:07:08.845 ethics on a more academic or classic

NOTE Confidence: 0.807334111666666

01:07:08.845 --> 01:07:10.855 level are we're more involved in

NOTE Confidence: 0.807334111666666

01:07:10.855 --> 01:07:12.588 medical ethics in Australia than

NOTE Confidence: 0.807334111666666

01:07:12.588 --> 01:07:14.598 the United States as things evolve.

NOTE Confidence: 0.831517244583333

01:07:14.600 --> 01:07:16.595 So yeah, I think the bioethics community

01:07:16.595 --> 01:07:18.896 is smaller and there are just more

01:07:18.896 --> 01:07:20.631 philosophers working on virtue ethics

01:07:20.631 --> 01:07:22.438 connected to the bioethics community.

01:07:22.440 --> 01:07:24.012 And that means so that these

01:07:24.012 --> 01:07:25.698 things just get brought up in

01:07:25.698 --> 01:07:26.770 discussions there more readily,

01:07:26.770 --> 01:07:28.680 more just more familiar with it. I think

01:07:29.000 --> 01:07:30.518 more credit to the folks in

01:07:30.518 --> 01:07:32.151 Galveston who saw the wisdom of

01:07:32.151 --> 01:07:34.292 bringing you front and center in

01:07:34.292 --> 01:07:37.440 their conversations there. I have.

01:07:39.600 --> 01:07:41.520 Yes, Jen And then the gentleman back there,

01:07:47.400 --> 01:07:50.557 I'm wondering related to your second question

01:07:52.880 --> 01:07:54.320 and your prior mention of the

01:07:54.320 --> 01:07:56.198 article you published last year,

NOTE Confidence: 0.96288032

01:07:56.200 --> 01:07:58.078 we have a lot of clinicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.9751951

01:07:58.080 --> 01:07:59.360 who are also parents

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:00.160 --> 01:08:01.882 and then we have a lot of

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:01.882 --> 01:08:03.637 clinicians who need to do share

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:03.637 --> 01:08:04.917 decision making with parents.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:04.920 --> 01:08:07.608 And so as someone who is neither

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:07.608 --> 01:08:09.560 a clinician nor a parent,

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:09.560 --> 01:08:11.240 I can't answer that question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:11.240 --> 01:08:13.958 But I was wondering if you'd be game to

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:13.958 --> 01:08:16.906 speak a little bit more on what, if any,

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:16.906 --> 01:08:19.535 virtues you found sort of uniquely

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:19.535 --> 01:08:22.600 fitting in the professional space or

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:22.600 --> 01:08:25.790 in the parental space that might help.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:25.790 --> 01:08:28.335 Those of us facilitating ethics

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:28.335 --> 01:08:30.810 councils related to these kinds

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

138

01:08:30.810 --> 01:08:33.439 of disputes could again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:33.439 --> 01:08:35.593 look to the clinicians and appreciate

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:35.593 --> 01:08:37.669 what they're doing there and look

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:37.669 --> 01:08:39.234 to the parents and appreciate

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:39.240 --> 01:08:40.762 what they're doing in that space.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:40.762 --> 01:08:42.540 But then also for the folks who

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:42.598 --> 01:08:44.584 do have and continue or anticipate

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:44.584 --> 01:08:47.000 wearing both hats as both clinician

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:47.000 --> 01:08:50.200 and parent to be able to think through.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:50.200 --> 01:08:52.320 When I take my clinician hat off

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:52.320 --> 01:08:54.160 and put my parent hat on,

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:54.160 --> 01:08:57.240 this is part of the virtue set

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:57.240 --> 01:08:58.960 that I'm switching between.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:08:58.960 --> 01:09:01.152 Or when I take off my parent hat

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:01.152 --> 01:09:03.755 and step into a clinical encounter,

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:03.755 --> 01:09:06.595 this is what I have to leave behind.

139

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:06.600 --> 01:09:08.964 And or are they entirely reconcilable

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:08.964 --> 01:09:11.683 so that you don't in fact need to

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:11.683 --> 01:09:14.120 take a hat off and sort of swap

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:14.120 --> 01:09:15.936 between distinct virtues in one

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:15.936 --> 01:09:16.833 space versus the other?

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:16.833 --> 01:09:18.700 Yeah, thanks for that question, Jen.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:18.700 --> 01:09:20.520 Another great one for the,

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:20.520 --> 01:09:21.480 for the paper that we wrote,

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:21.480 --> 01:09:21.978 we wrote,

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:21.978 --> 01:09:23.721 we really read a lot about just

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:23.721 --> 01:09:24.799 the parental role.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:24.800 --> 01:09:27.992 We were really focused on that and I

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:27.992 --> 01:09:30.040 can tell you a little bit about that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:30.040 --> 01:09:32.084 We were very careful in that paper

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:32.084 --> 01:09:34.194 not to try and present an account

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

140

01:09:34.194 --> 01:09:36.617 of like this is what a good parent

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:36.617 --> 01:09:38.204 is and these are the virtues that

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:38.204 --> 01:09:39.440 any good parent would possess.

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:39.440 --> 01:09:40.856 I would a not ever want to do

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:40.856 --> 01:09:42.570 that and BA don't think it would

NOTE Confidence: 0.931693166470588

01:09:42.570 --> 01:09:43.356 be super constructive

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:09:46.720 --> 01:09:48.760 what what we found and what is out

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:09:48.760 --> 01:09:50.660 there in the literature and Chris

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:09:50.660 --> 01:09:52.480 Fiedner and some some of his colleagues,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:09:52.480 --> 01:09:54.000 they've published some fantastic

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:09:54.000 --> 01:09:56.280 studies and what they've found is

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:09:56.280 --> 01:09:57.336 different parents have different

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:09:57.336 --> 01:09:58.920 ideas about what good parenting is.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:09:58.920 --> 01:10:02.210 But the construct of being a good

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:02.210 --> 01:10:04.240 parent and exercising whatever it is,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:04.240 --> 01:10:05.900 qualities, whatever the content of

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:05.900 --> 01:10:08.202 that good parent belief is that is

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:08.202 --> 01:10:09.954 a very fixed construct that parents

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:09.960 --> 01:10:14.040 explicitly mention when you talk to

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:14.040 --> 01:10:15.895 them about their child being sick

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:15.895 --> 01:10:17.390 and and how they approach decisions

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:17.390 --> 01:10:18.998 and what happens in the hospital.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:19.000 --> 01:10:21.256 So that construct of being a

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:21.256 --> 01:10:23.440 good parent is action guiding.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:23.440 --> 01:10:25.084 Different parents kind of plug in

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:25.084 --> 01:10:26.180 different different values and

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:26.228 --> 01:10:27.598 beliefs and practices into that.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:27.600 --> 01:10:29.760 There are some pretty consistent areas.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:29.760 --> 01:10:31.328 I think this gets back to a really

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:31.328 --> 01:10:32.626 fantastic question we had earlier about

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:32.626 --> 01:10:33.916 kind of cultural relatives and right,

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:33.920 --> 01:10:35.612 we would never want to kind of say this

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:35.612 --> 01:10:37.596 is the only right way to be a good parent.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:37.600 --> 01:10:38.775 It looks different in different

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:38.775 --> 01:10:39.715 places with different families.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:39.720 --> 01:10:43.680 And that messiness I think is a good thing.

NOTE Confidence: 0.866789092307692

01:10:43.680 --> 01:10:43.840 What

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:10:47.160 --> 01:10:48.900 generally things like being

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:10:48.900 --> 01:10:50.640 accepting of your child,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:10:50.640 --> 01:10:52.800 just love, being a loving parent,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:10:52.800 --> 01:10:54.288 being committed, committed,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:10:54.288 --> 01:10:55.280 making sacrifices.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:10:55.280 --> 01:10:57.560 Things like this are kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:10:57.560 --> 01:10:59.080 commonly sighted parental virtues.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:10:59.080 --> 01:11:02.200 Being future oriented so sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:02.200 --> 01:11:03.795 balancing short term and long

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:03.795 --> 01:11:05.071 term considerations about the

01:11:05.071 --> 01:11:06.680 child's interests and flourishing.

01:11:06.680 --> 01:11:09.520 When a child gets sick,

01:11:09.520 --> 01:11:11.760 good parent beliefs tend to kind of

01:11:11.760 --> 01:11:14.521 shift into sort of a handful of major

01:11:14.521 --> 01:11:16.880 themes or categories around being informed.

01:11:16.880 --> 01:11:19.040 So when a child's sick or in the hospital,

01:11:19.040 --> 01:11:20.636 one part of kind of good parent

01:11:20.636 --> 01:11:21.561 beliefs that's pretty consistent

01:11:21.561 --> 01:11:23.137 is the idea like as a good parent

01:11:23.137 --> 01:11:24.709 I have to know as much as possible

01:11:24.709 --> 01:11:27.268 that was at least in the participants

01:11:27.268 --> 01:11:29.328 in these studies pretty consistent

01:11:29.328 --> 01:11:31.316 so and that would lead to certain

01:11:31.316 --> 01:11:32.891 information season behaviors that I

01:11:32.891 --> 01:11:34.757 think clinicians sometimes get frustrated by.

01:11:34.760 --> 01:11:35.882 These parents have gone home and

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:35.882 --> 01:11:37.268 done all their own research, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:37.268 --> 01:11:38.876 But for parents, it was like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:38.880 --> 01:11:40.352 if I'm not sitting up on my computer

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:40.352 --> 01:11:42.178 at 3:00 AM doing a deep dive into this

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:42.178 --> 01:11:43.880 and reading these papers on my orange line,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:43.880 --> 01:11:44.405 I understand it.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:44.405 --> 01:11:45.280 I'm not a good parent.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:45.280 --> 01:11:46.755 I'm not doing everything possible

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:46.755 --> 01:11:48.880 to make myself informed and able to

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:48.880 --> 01:11:50.480 approach decisions, feeling empowered.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:50.480 --> 01:11:51.044 So that was,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:51.044 --> 01:11:52.360 I think for us doing that reading,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:52.360 --> 01:11:54.236 a really nice example of kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:54.240 --> 01:11:55.710 clinician sees like this parent just

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:55.710 --> 01:11:57.573 going off and kind of reading much

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:57.573 --> 01:11:59.235 stuff they don't know about getting

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:11:59.235 --> 01:12:00.851 frustrated sometimes when parents like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:12:00.851 --> 01:12:02.039 well, I rent this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:12:02.040 --> 01:12:02.535 And for us,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:12:02.535 --> 01:12:03.525 kind of looking at the literature

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:12:03.525 --> 01:12:04.438 and listening to parents,

NOTE Confidence: 0.87407186125

01:12:04.440 --> 01:12:04.959 it was like

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:07.120 --> 01:12:08.910 I failed my kid if I'm not up and doing

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:08.963 --> 01:12:10.475 this and pushing myself to kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:10.475 --> 01:12:12.278 find as much information as possible.

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:12.280 --> 01:12:13.549 So it was just a nice moment of what

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:13.549 --> 01:12:14.891 we think of as a tension when actually

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:14.891 --> 01:12:16.408 I think we have the same goal, right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:16.408 --> 01:12:17.560 We're just approaching you

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:17.560 --> 01:12:20.239 wearing different hats,

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

146

01:12:20.240 --> 01:12:24.664 being informed there was some consistency

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:24.664 --> 01:12:27.920 around the idea that a good parent

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:27.920 --> 01:12:30.600 still participates in care activities.

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:30.600 --> 01:12:32.010 There was there's discussion out there

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:32.010 --> 01:12:33.973 of a good parent being someone that kind

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:33.973 --> 01:12:35.709 of keeps the family unit together and

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:35.709 --> 01:12:37.319 functioning in some sort of normal way,

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:37.320 --> 01:12:39.280 whatever that looks like for that family.

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:39.280 --> 01:12:40.540 So this is just a few examples

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:40.540 --> 01:12:41.598 off the top of my head,

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:41.600 --> 01:12:43.328 but it was really interesting to

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:43.328 --> 01:12:44.936 look at the empirical literature

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:44.936 --> 01:12:46.516 on good parent constructs,

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:46.520 --> 01:12:48.440 where the points of overlap were,

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:48.440 --> 01:12:49.085 as I said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:49.085 --> 01:12:50.880 we weren't going to kind of present like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:50.880 --> 01:12:51.820 this is good parenting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:51.820 --> 01:12:53.480 I think good enough parenting is often

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:53.480 --> 01:12:54.880 like kind of or just getting by,

NOTE Confidence: 0.792230620434783

01:12:54.880 --> 01:12:55.320 right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:12:57.560 --> 01:12:58.382 That was kind of what we

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:12:58.382 --> 01:12:59.080 found about the parental law.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:12:59.080 --> 01:13:00.599 I don't, I don't know about clinicians.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:00.600 --> 01:13:02.758 It's not something I've kind of read

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:02.758 --> 01:13:04.426 recently about kind of how clinicians

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:04.426 --> 01:13:06.159 think about virtues and balancing them.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:06.160 --> 01:13:07.882 And I think you've asked some important

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:07.882 --> 01:13:09.832 comment about what do we do when we're

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:09.832 --> 01:13:11.223 wearing multiple different hats and I

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:11.223 --> 01:13:12.736 don't know that we can ever take off.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:12.736 --> 01:13:14.920 I think about the clinician, ethicist.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:14.920 --> 01:13:16.755 I'm, you know, sometimes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:16.755 --> 01:13:18.345 Do you ever really stop being

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:18.345 --> 01:13:19.793 a physician even when you're

NOTE Confidence: 0.616783755454545

01:13:19.793 --> 01:13:21.479 kind of in your ethics role?

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:22.560 --> 01:13:24.080 No, I think. I think.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:24.080 --> 01:13:26.480 I think if I understand where you're going,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:26.480 --> 01:13:27.558 I think I'd go there with you,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:27.560 --> 01:13:29.360 which is to say that that we are who we are.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:29.360 --> 01:13:33.725 But I would say that I would say that as

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:33.725 --> 01:13:36.360 parents there may be more of an emphasis on

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:36.360 --> 01:13:38.720 virtues and as physicians there may be more.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:38.720 --> 01:13:40.827 This is a gross generalization and more

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:40.827 --> 01:13:43.237 of an emphasis on rights and obligations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:43.240 --> 01:13:44.130 And, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:44.130 --> 01:13:46.160 and so I mean one of the smartest things,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:46.160 --> 01:13:48.078 maybe the smartest thing I ever heard

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:48.078 --> 01:13:50.440 of an ethics council was a room full

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:50.440 --> 01:13:52.640 of physicians trying to figure out, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:52.640 --> 01:13:54.400 exactly what the right thing to do was.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:54.400 --> 01:13:55.500 And we were weighing all

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:55.500 --> 01:13:56.160 these various principles.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:56.160 --> 01:13:58.356 And then a friend of mine,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:58.360 --> 01:13:59.720 a woman named Glennis,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:13:59.720 --> 01:14:01.289 who was a chaplain, said,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:01.289 --> 01:14:02.752 why don't we just not worry about

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:02.752 --> 01:14:04.206 that stuff and figure out what the

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:04.206 --> 01:14:05.710 most loving thing to do is and which,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:05.710 --> 01:14:06.880 you know, hit some of us,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:06.880 --> 01:14:07.370 including myself,

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:07.370 --> 01:14:08.595 like a ton of bricks.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:08.600 --> 01:14:10.178 That is something one would hear

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:10.178 --> 01:14:12.108 more likely from a chaplain or from

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:12.108 --> 01:14:13.758 a parent than from a physician.

NOTE Confidence: 0.78192043

01:14:13.760 --> 01:14:15.240 But it is nevertheless insightful

NOTE Confidence: 0.9165234175

01:14:15.240 --> 01:14:15.840 for all of us.

NOTE Confidence: 0.68144192

01:14:17.360 --> 01:14:18.880 We have this gentleman then, Jen upfront.

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:19.480 --> 01:14:22.496 Hi, thank you for the the talk.

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:22.496 --> 01:14:24.440 Amazing, super interesting.

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:24.440 --> 01:14:26.864 I'm wondering how you feel about

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:26.864 --> 01:14:28.226 like this characterization that

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:28.226 --> 01:14:29.798 sort of like I'm understanding.

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:29.798 --> 01:14:34.282 I wonder if we can think of like the virtue

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:34.282 --> 01:14:36.987 ethical approach differently from like

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:36.987 --> 01:14:40.359 the ontological or utilitarian approach,

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:40.360 --> 01:14:44.173 but more as a framework through

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:44.173 --> 01:14:46.238 which to do moral negotiations.

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:46.240 --> 01:14:50.924 So like I'm thinking a lot about like

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:50.924 --> 01:14:53.730 you you might have a certain set of

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:53.730 --> 01:14:56.499 virtues in your head and you aspire

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:56.499 --> 01:14:58.959 to have actions that reflect those.

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:14:58.960 --> 01:15:01.032 And that's like where the room for

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:01.032 --> 01:15:03.040 negotiation between a doctor and a parent.

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:03.040 --> 01:15:05.152 Or like that's where like the

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:05.152 --> 01:15:07.070 the parent is like, Oh no,

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:07.070 --> 01:15:08.855 I have this virtue and this is

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:08.855 --> 01:15:10.799 the action I should be taking.

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:10.800 --> 01:15:14.886 And I wonder in if there is room in

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:14.886 --> 01:15:18.622 there to reason to show the like the,

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:18.622 --> 01:15:21.542 the set of options that exist for

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:21.542 --> 01:15:23.452 the implementation of a certain

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:23.452 --> 01:15:25.394 virtue that taking perhaps a

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:25.394 --> 01:15:27.119 certain different action may not

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:27.119 --> 01:15:29.000 be not embodying that action,

NOTE Confidence: 0.74648324

01:15:29.000 --> 01:15:31.398 that virtue in that moment.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:31.800 --> 01:15:34.176 Yeah, that's a wonderful,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:34.176 --> 01:15:35.958 wonderful question again.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:35.960 --> 01:15:37.238 And I think you're spot on.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:37.240 --> 01:15:39.562 And I think as ethicists sometimes

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:39.562 --> 01:15:42.639 what our role to do is to normalize.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:42.640 --> 01:15:44.082 I'm a little wary of this because

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:44.082 --> 01:15:45.539 I would never want to kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:45.539 --> 01:15:46.721 think that was to convince or

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:46.773 --> 01:15:48.009 kind of shift someone to our

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:48.009 --> 01:15:49.371 idea of what being a good parent.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:49.371 --> 01:15:51.720 But sometimes they'll say, like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:51.720 --> 01:15:53.197 you know, talking to parents will say,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:53.200 --> 01:15:55.440 you know there's no wrong,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:55.440 --> 01:15:57.128 there's no wrong decision.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:57.128 --> 01:15:59.238 Regardless of what we do,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:15:59.240 --> 01:16:01.106 we recognize you were a fantastic

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:01.106 --> 01:16:03.238 parent that loves your child to death.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:03.240 --> 01:16:05.739 Like so we'll do some of that

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:05.739 --> 01:16:07.598 normalizing of different options through

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:07.598 --> 01:16:10.118 that lens of being a good parent.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:10.120 --> 01:16:10.960 Like we'll kind of say like well,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:10.960 --> 01:16:11.368 you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:11.368 --> 01:16:13.000 we we had a similar case maybe and

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:13.052 --> 01:16:14.676 not quite exactly the same but in

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:14.676 --> 01:16:16.387 those parents we talked to them a

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:16.387 --> 01:16:17.592 lot and eventually decided that

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:17.592 --> 01:16:19.088 for them what was right and how

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:19.088 --> 01:16:20.629 they could show the most love for

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:20.629 --> 01:16:21.955 their child was to choose this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:21.960 --> 01:16:23.066 And it might be a little different

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:23.066 --> 01:16:24.318 from say the family in front of us,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:24.320 --> 01:16:24.959 what they're considering.

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:24.959 --> 01:16:25.598 So we will,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:25.600 --> 01:16:28.850 I think often try and use that approach

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:28.850 --> 01:16:31.440 of sort of thinking about that role,

NOTE Confidence: 0.948544408571429

01:16:31.440 --> 01:16:32.080 thinking about

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:34.240 --> 01:16:35.797 what it means for them for someone to be.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:35.800 --> 01:16:37.438 I'm using a good parent example and

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:37.438 --> 01:16:39.121 then kind of trying to introduce

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:39.121 --> 01:16:40.661 some different options through that

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:40.661 --> 01:16:42.600 just to say like these are all OK,

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:42.600 --> 01:16:43.760 regardless of what you choose,

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:43.760 --> 01:16:44.960 you will not be any less

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:44.960 --> 01:16:46.279 of a parent in our eyes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:46.280 --> 01:16:47.930 And I think sometimes that

155

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:47.930 --> 01:16:49.239 can be really effective.

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:49.239 --> 01:16:51.153 I'm thinking about that question and

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:51.153 --> 01:16:52.791 conversation with a question about

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:52.791 --> 01:16:54.356 shared decision making now too,

NOTE Confidence: 0.83978241

01:16:54.360 --> 01:16:55.038 and sort of

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:16:57.400 --> 01:16:59.398 like almost like epistemic virtues too.

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:16:59.400 --> 01:17:01.374 And sort of how we approach negotiation

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:17:01.374 --> 01:17:03.498 or conversations like how to do that

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:17:03.498 --> 01:17:05.038 virtuously and thoughtfully and respectfully.

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:17:05.040 --> 01:17:07.272 I think that's all kind of linked as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:17:07.280 --> 01:17:09.149 How to again, not bludgeon people with

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:17:09.149 --> 01:17:12.020 that kind of negotiation, but how to do

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:17:12.020 --> 01:17:14.495 it sort of carefully and with humility.

NOTE Confidence: 0.627710381666667

01:17:14.495 --> 01:17:16.360 That's a great question. Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.80152105

01:17:17.760 --> 01:17:19.237 And the final question of the evening.

NOTE Confidence: 0.662144856666667

01:17:19.680 --> 01:17:22.464 Oh, no pressure. Make it good

NOTE Confidence: 0.662144856666667

01:17:22.464 --> 01:17:23.840 and then and then yeah, make it

NOTE Confidence: 0.691111197272727

01:17:24.080 --> 01:17:25.150 good. Respond to that and

NOTE Confidence: 0.691111197272727

01:17:25.150 --> 01:17:26.440 wrap up however you see fit.

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:26.720 --> 01:17:29.520 Better sing for my supper.

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:29.520 --> 01:17:30.795 Thank you for your really

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:30.795 --> 01:17:31.560 thought provoking talk.

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:31.560 --> 01:17:34.116 I I'm going to end with a thought provoking,

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:34.120 --> 01:17:35.680 hopefully a thought provoking question.

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:35.680 --> 01:17:37.360 Do you think that love,

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:37.360 --> 01:17:41.120 since Mark brought it up,

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:41.120 --> 01:17:44.120 is fully compatible with virtue ethics?

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:44.120 --> 01:17:45.280 This is why I'm asking.

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:45.280 --> 01:17:46.740 Because virtue ethics in some

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:46.740 --> 01:17:49.000 ways is very navel gazing, right?

NOTE Confidence: 0.766825764

01:17:49.000 --> 01:17:53.573 Was I honest? Was I, you know, reliable?

01:17:53.573 --> 01:17:57.386 Was I? It's very me, me, me.

01:17:57.386 --> 01:18:00.408 Whereas I'm not sure the

01:18:00.408 --> 01:18:03.480 world needs more me and I.

01:18:03.480 --> 01:18:05.860 And so, you know, we might need love.

01:18:05.860 --> 01:18:07.240 Is otherness right?

01:18:07.240 --> 01:18:08.400 Other centeredness and

01:18:08.400 --> 01:18:09.360 seeing the other person,

01:18:09.360 --> 01:18:11.056 recognizing the other person,

01:18:11.056 --> 01:18:13.600 uniting compassion with the other person.

01:18:13.600 --> 01:18:16.099 And do you see a disconnect between

01:18:16.099 --> 01:18:18.240 virtue and the self focus with

01:18:18.240 --> 01:18:20.472 the need for otherness, right.

01:18:20.472 --> 01:18:22.320 And unity. Yeah.

01:18:22.320 --> 01:18:23.720 That would be wonderful question to you.

01:18:23.720 --> 01:18:24.088 Thank you.

01:18:24.088 --> 01:18:24.640 I I don't,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:28.680 --> 01:18:30.237 I don't think I do see them as incompatible.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:30.240 --> 01:18:32.064 But maybe I've drunk the pool

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:32.064 --> 01:18:34.460 aid and I need to rethink this.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:34.460 --> 01:18:37.400 But I think about the virtues as

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:37.400 --> 01:18:39.600 so socially embedded. And again,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:39.600 --> 01:18:41.672 the reason why I think I I am always like,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:41.672 --> 01:18:43.036 well, what do I control? It's me.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:43.040 --> 01:18:46.554 That's kind of how I approach things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:46.560 --> 01:18:47.598 But that's always through the lens,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:47.600 --> 01:18:49.160 like, who am I talking to?

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:49.160 --> 01:18:50.860 What is our relationship?

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:50.860 --> 01:18:52.768 How am I considering them?

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:52.768 --> 01:18:53.600 What can I know?

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:53.600 --> 01:18:55.600 What can I not know about about them,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:55.600 --> 01:18:56.878 the other kind of bad things.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:56.880 --> 01:18:58.830 So I think it's definitely a

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:18:58.830 --> 01:19:01.119 risk and one that I'm aware of,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:01.120 --> 01:19:03.770 but I don't know.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:03.770 --> 01:19:04.520 This may be a circular,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:04.520 --> 01:19:04.906 but yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:04.906 --> 01:19:06.450 I think like part of being virtuous is

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:06.492 --> 01:19:07.914 thinking about other people and really

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:07.914 --> 01:19:09.871 centering that in in how you think about

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:09.871 --> 01:19:11.076 the virtues and your interactions.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:11.080 --> 01:19:14.040 So I don't know if that gets us out of it,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:14.040 --> 01:19:14.736 my body.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:14.736 --> 01:19:16.824 Tyler Tate wrote a fantastic paper

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:16.824 --> 01:19:19.440 about love that got published in

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:19.440 --> 01:19:21.490 the Hastings Center either early

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:21.490 --> 01:19:23.320 this year or late last year.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

160

01:19:23.320 --> 01:19:25.160 But he talks about the ethic of love

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:25.160 --> 01:19:26.537 within medicine and kind of talks

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:26.537 --> 01:19:27.839 about it through a virtue lens.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:27.840 --> 01:19:29.472 So I can't answer,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:29.472 --> 01:19:32.384 but maybe go read Tyler's paper and he

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:32.384 --> 01:19:34.240 will have a more satisfactory answer for you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:34.240 --> 01:19:35.404 But I think it's interesting and

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:35.404 --> 01:19:36.999 people kind of go a bit ick sometimes.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:37.000 --> 01:19:38.632 When we talk about love in

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:38.632 --> 01:19:39.720 healthcare and decision making,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:39.720 --> 01:19:40.680 I don't know, do people,

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:40.680 --> 01:19:42.395 we don't talk about love very much.

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:42.400 --> 01:19:43.660 And I think there's the sense

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:43.660 --> 01:19:45.229 that it's kind of weird like the

NOTE Confidence: 0.904225251111111

01:19:45.229 --> 01:19:46.597 idea of loving your patient but

NOTE Confidence: 0.59221643

01:19:48.920 --> 01:19:49.160 yeah.

161

NOTE Confidence: 0.754654875714286

01:19:51.680 --> 01:19:55.120 Yeah. Yeah. Or or compassion or just. Yeah.

NOTE Confidence: 0.826818206

01:19:55.120 --> 01:19:56.268 We're allowed to we're allowed to say

NOTE Confidence: 0.826818206

01:19:56.268 --> 01:19:57.439 compassion but we're not allowed to say yeah

NOTE Confidence: 0.460854134

01:19:57.440 --> 01:19:58.800 yeah. I think that's something

NOTE Confidence: 0.460854134

01:19:58.800 --> 01:19:59.840 really interesting now about

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:19:59.840 --> 01:20:01.610 but but parents parents will that's

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:01.610 --> 01:20:03.560 that that to to get to Jen's question

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:03.560 --> 01:20:06.276 I think to your point is that and my

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:06.276 --> 01:20:07.666 friend Glennis Chaplin Olshack when

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:07.666 --> 01:20:09.369 our point was that that's really

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:09.369 --> 01:20:11.280 where we should be focused on again.

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:11.280 --> 01:20:13.130 Seth brings in a whole, you know,

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:13.130 --> 01:20:14.720 which we just touched on briefly,

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:14.720 --> 01:20:16.596 the whole feminist ethics approach to things,

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:16.600 --> 01:20:19.570 as well as in the importance

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:19.570 --> 01:20:20.560 of relationships.

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:20.560 --> 01:20:21.918 Any final thoughts you have for us,

NOTE Confidence: 0.738356259166667

01:20:21.920 --> 01:20:22.480 my friend

NOTE Confidence: 0.832053696470588

01:20:22.760 --> 01:20:23.840 that's just got me thinking

NOTE Confidence: 0.832053696470588

01:20:23.840 --> 01:20:25.152 about the psychology of kind of

NOTE Confidence: 0.832053696470588

01:20:25.152 --> 01:20:26.274 how we approach things as well.

NOTE Confidence: 0.832053696470588

01:20:26.280 --> 01:20:27.880 I think that's all kind of in there.

NOTE Confidence: 0.832053696470588

01:20:27.880 --> 01:20:29.992 And I'm not just for an expert in

NOTE Confidence: 0.832053696470588

01:20:29.992 --> 01:20:31.120 psych methods, but I think yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.24840991

01:20:34.640 --> 01:20:34.960 yeah,

NOTE Confidence: 0.2663603

01:20:41.200 --> 01:20:43.480 yeah, I love that. Thank you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.506671746666667

01:20:45.520 --> 01:20:48.518 Well, we thank you very much.

NOTE Confidence: 0.506671746666667

01:20:48.520 --> 01:20:49.240 Yeah. Thank you all.

NOTE Confidence: 0.4417428

01:20:54.120 --> 01:20:54.640 Oh,

NOTE Confidence: 0.6135788675

01:20:55.760 --> 01:20:57.626 the coveted, the coveted White cap.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6135788675

01:20:57.626 --> 01:20:59.480 These are beautiful. All right.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6135788675

01:20:59.480 --> 01:21:01.540 And some other yell swag for you.

NOTE Confidence: 0.6135788675

01:21:01.540 --> 01:21:02.438 Outstanding. Thank you so

NOTE Confidence: 0.6135788675

01:21:02.440 --> 01:21:03.480 much For excellent ease.

NOTE Confidence: 0.462624168333333

01:21:04.200 --> 01:21:06.240 Thank you so much. This was really good.